AN ETHIC OF CARE IN THE DIALOGICAL SPACE. WHAT DO NGOS LEARN FROM THEIR CONVERSATIONS WITH STATES? CASE STUDIES FROM SCOTLAND AND ZAMBIA

Ashley Cole

A Thesis Submitted for the Degree of PhD
at the
University of St Andrews

2016

An Ethic of Care in the Dialogical Space.

What do NGOs learn from their conversations with states?

Case studies from Scotland and Zambia.

Miss Ashley Cole

Matriculation number: 070011349

University of
St Andrews

This thesis is submitted in partial fulfilment for the degree of PhD at the University of St Andrews

5th May 2016

1. Candidate's declarations:

I, Ashley Cole hereby certify that this thesis, which is approximately 80,000 words in length, has been written by me, and that it is the record of work carried out by me, or principally by myself in collaboration with others as acknowledged, and that it has not been submitted in any previous application for a higher degree.

I was admitted as a research student in [month, year] and as a candidate for the degree of PhD in September 2008; the higher study for which this is a record was carried out in the University of St Andrews between 2008 and 2016.

(*If you received assistance in writing from anyone other than your supervisor/s*):
I, …..., received assistance in the writing of this thesis in respect of [language, grammar, spelling or syntax], which was provided by ……

Date 17/8/16 signature of candidate ………

2. Supervisor's declaration:

I hereby certify that the candidate has fulfilled the conditions of the Resolution and Regulations appropriate for the degree of PhD in the University of St Andrews and that the candidate is qualified to submit this thesis in application for that degree.

Date 17/8/16 signature of supervisor ………

3. Permission for publication: (*to be signed by both candidate and supervisor*)

In submitting this thesis to the University of St Andrews I understand that I am giving permission for it to be made available for use in accordance with the regulations of the University Library for the time being in force, subject to any copyright vested in the work not being affected thereby. I also understand that the title and the abstract will be published, and that a copy of the work may be made and supplied to any bona fide library or research worker, that my thesis will be electronically accessible for personal or research use unless exempt by award of an embargo as requested below, and that the library has the right to migrate my thesis into new electronic forms as required to ensure continued access to the thesis. I have obtained any third-party copyright permissions that may be required in order to allow such access and migration, or have requested the appropriate embargo below.

The following is an agreed request by candidate and supervisor regarding the publication of this thesis:

PRINTED COPY
a)   No embargo on print copy

ELECTRONIC COPY
a)   No embargo on electronic copy

Date 17/8/16 signature of candidate ……   signature of supervisor ………

Please note initial embargos can be requested for a maximum of five years. An embargo on a thesis submitted to the Faculty of Science or Medicine is rarely granted for more than two years in the first instance, without good justification. The Library will not lift an embargo before confirming with the student and supervisor that they do not intend to request a continuation. In the absence of an agreed response from both student and supervisor, the Head of School will be consulted. Please note that the total period of an embargo, including any continuation, is not expected to exceed ten years.
Where part of a thesis is to be embargoed, please specify the part and the reason.

For Mum, Dad and Simon

All my love,

Ash x

Contents

Abstract

The increase in the presence and influence of Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs) locally and internationally is having a noticeable effect on the policy process at a national level. While the NGO sector is more commonly examined at an international level, its impact at the state and sub-state level remains unexplored. This gap in the literature is addressed as a primary problem in this thesis. By exploring the relationship between the NGO and the state, the significance of this relationship is emphasised as a necessary inclusion in International Relations literature.

The NGO sector presents civil society with a road into, and in some cases an alternative to, traditional modes of political advocacy. This increases civil society's ability to impact the policy process by creating, what is identified in this thesis as, a dialogical space. The dialogical space allows for an exchange of ideas and thus influences the decision-making process of the state, if and when it is explored. Furthermore, the dialogical space facilitates, as is shown here, learning through the conversations that take place between NGOs and the state. This thesis asks 'what do NGOs learn from their conversations with states?' and presents the 'lessons learned' from Scottish and Zambian case studies.

NGOs are identified here as civil society in organisation and have a particular relationship with the communities they represent. This relationship is empirically examined and presented here in the Scottish and Zambian case studies. This thesis examines the relationship between the NGO and civil society, and most importantly the relationship between the NGO and the state using the ethic of care as a theoretical lens. Conclusions are

drawn from the interviews conducted during the fieldwork. The ethic of care is located in practice and used as a theoretical lens to examine what the local NGOs learn from their interactions with the state. Both case studies confirm that an ethic of care is a prevalent ethic in NGO practice, as identified by the NGO workers interviewed. Furthermore, when used as an analytical lens the ethic of care is shown to be used as a tool by NGOs to nurture an ethic of care in statesmanship.

The thesis specifically highlights that NGOs have learned from their conversations with states and that, through the creation and use of the dialogical space, an ethic of care in practice can be traced. The greater significance of this thesis is that it addresses the relationship between the NGO and the state at a local and national level; a topic which is lacking in current IR literature, despite being of crucial value for understanding the state's interaction with non-state actors, in this case local NGOs. Furthermore, through the use of the ethic of care both as an exploratory lens and in its identification as a practical ethic, this thesis highlights the importance of an ethic of care in theory and practice.

Keywords: ethic of care; civil society; NGO; Zambia; Scotland; dialogical space

Introduction

International Relations (IR) as a discipline considers the influence of political actors on a local, national and international level. However the rise in the power and influence of non-state actors, especially non-governmental organisations (NGOs), has received relatively little attention despite their increasing impact on and contribution to local, national and international politics. While neo-realist IR literature considers international NGOs (INGOs) and international non-state actors there is a lack of analysis at the local and national level. This thesis acknowledges the direct relationship between local, state and international politics and therefore highlights the importance of understanding the local NGO community and its engagement with the state in which it operates. Furthermore, this thesis challenges many of the generalisations and misunderstandings regarding the NGO community, highlighting the great diversity within the community and the professionalism of these organisations and their personnel.

The ethic of care was identified by NGO personnel and volunteers during the interview process and is central to this thesis. The ethic of care, often described as a feminist or mothering ethic, is understood here in the context of the proximity of the carer to the care recipient, in this case of the NGO or the state to the community it represents, rather than in the context of a mother-child relationship that is traditionally used as a metaphor in feminist literature on an ethic of care. An ethic of care is present in the relationship that NGOs have with their recipients, and is nurtured in the dialogical space. An ethic of care describes a relationship that is direct, sensitive, communicative and attentive. This care-based relationship means that NGOs can gain an acute understanding of the community and its needs. The relationship between the NGO and civil society captures the

essence of an ethic of care which is discussed in the theory and case study chapters. As the ethic of care is defined as relational, rather than as a maternal ethic, this thesis highlights that an ethic of care can be nurtured in those who also participate in the dialogical space, for example the state, as it too has a relational connection to civil society. This is achieved when NGOs are able to work with local and national government to provide advice and a greater understanding of specific community needs. This is achieved through the creation and utilisation of a dialogical space which is conceptualised and analysed here. In this dialogical space the ethic of care is nurtured and many lessons are learned by the NGO community.

This thesis grounds theory and situates knowledge in an empirical context, providing case studies from Zambia and Scotland. Through qualitative interviews those working and volunteering for local and national NGOs were asked to describe their work and their engagement with the community represented by the NGO, and also to describe their engagement, if any, with the state. In these interviews an ethic of care was identified by the interviewees who described their relationship with their community as direct, sensitive, communicative and attentive. What emerged from the research was that the ethic of care resonated in NGO practice; almost as standard. Furthermore, if a dialogical space was created and positive, constructive engagement with the state was established a greater utilisation of the ethic of care was realised. This greater utilisation of the ethic of care was identified by the interviewees who stated that when positive, constructive engagement with the state occurred, projects and policies became more reflective of actual rather than assumed community need.

The dialogical space is dynamic as it can be established in any public space, physical or otherwise; for example through media platforms or digital spaces. It is essentially a space where local and/or national NGOs and the state come together and share expertise, knowledge and practice regarding the needs of civil society. Dialogical spaces can be located in schools, community centres, youth clubs and parks to name a few tangible examples. The key is that these spaces allow for open discussion and equitable contributions from representatives of the state, local community, focus groups, NGOs and any other stakeholders involved with the pertinent issue at hand. Thus dialogical space is not static and obtuse, but holistic in its location and composition. It does not require the formality of local council committees or parliamentary practices. This encourages the involvement of groups who would not usually engage directly with the state, locally or nationally, in the sharing of knowledge regarding community needs and representation. These spaces are described in the context of the ethic of care as they show that communities are not autonomous, and that their needs change and develop, often in ways which are directly and indirectly attributed to one another. As highlighted by Tronto, 'since people are sometimes autonomous, sometimes dependant, sometimes providing care for those who are dependent, humans are best described as interdependent'.[1] This interdependency, as will be shown in the literature review and conceptual chapters, is also true of the relationship between the state and civil society. Empirically the dialogical space was, like the ethic of care, identified by the interviewees. In particular, those from Scotland positively recognised the benefit of this additional opportunity for specific groups and communities to have access to policymakers.

---

[1] Joan Tronto, *Moral Boundaries: A Political Argument for an Ethic of Care* (Routledge: 1993), p.96.

The thesis explores the relationship between the state the NGO community at a national and local level which is recognised here as a concern for the discipline of International Relations (IR) and is problematized in the context of this discipline. The case studies selected show both a positive and a negative relationship between the NGO community and the state in Scotland and Zambia respectively. While the positivity and negativity of the relationship between the NGO and the state are not exclusively or entirely characterised by the presence and use of the dialogical space, this thesis specifically considers this particular aspect of the relationship. A positive relationship is in part characterised by the presence and utilisation of the dialogical space which is present in Scottish politics from the local community to the parliamentary level. By contrast a negative relationship is observed in the Zambian case study, in part characterised by the lack of acknowledgment and utilisation of the potential of the dialogical space. This is of importance and can be problematized in the context of the discipline of IR because the local impacts upon the national, in turn impacting on how a state is perceived and received by the international community. While the antagonistic relationship between state and civil society is traditionally located within liberalist theory literature (as will be discussed in the literature review addressing the state in relation to civil society), it is important to acknowledge the wider context of international relations, and not just a liberalist public and private sphere narrative.

For the discipline of IR this thesis highlights the importance of local, non-state and marginal groups and communities for the state, and also how they influence the relationship between civil society and the state, especially in states where violence and conflict in a traditional realist manner is latent or absent. Rather, the conflict found is often

in the misinterpretation of assumed need and actual need by the government in the absence of the dialogical space which involves the NGO community and civil society groups in discussions which directly impact on the decision-making process. As will be discussed in further depth in the review of the literature on an ethic of care and in the conceptual framework of this thesis, the use of an ethic of care as a lens is important as it 'privileges networks of human interdependencies that challenge the private/public divide and the concomitant role that plays within such relations'.[2] The ethic of care encourages a rejection of the current status quo developed in accordance with a liberalist posture which posits distinct assumptions about society and its members. As Hankivsky highlights in her critique of liberal justice theory, '[t]he objective of this [liberal justice] perspective is that we, as citizens, determine responsibilities and obligations towards others with as little interference with our own liberty, from others or from the state, as is possible'.[3] However, as this thesis will highlight through the use of empirical evidence, the liberal model of citizenship and its assumed relationship between civil society and the state, that of independence and impartiality is 'a narrow and incorrect view of the human condition'[4] and furthermore undermines the role of non-state actors in policy and governance. Thus the use of an ethic of care to analyse the relationship between the NGO community and the state is significant for its critique of the liberal model of the state and citizenship and for its contribution to reframing the importance and prevalence of care in both the public and private sphere.

---

[2] O. Hankivsky, *Social Policy and the Ethic of Care* (UNC Press: 2004), p. 1.
[3] Hankivsky, *Social Policy and the Ethic of Care*, p.5.
[4] Hankivsky, *Social Policy and the Ethic of Care*, p.6.

Thesis Structure

The thesis begins with a methodology chapter highlighting what was done during the fieldwork process and giving descriptions of the methodological approach outlining the rationale behind the use of grounded theory as a tool. The grounded theory approach is described and highlighted for its significance to feminist scholarship, and also as an aid to analyse the empirical evidence gathered during the case study interviews carried out in Scotland and Zambia. Furthermore the methodology chapter highlights that in order to fully appreciate the ethic of care in practice and to validate the theoretical claims made by this thesis, situated knowledge is key. This emphasises the importance of empirical fieldwork for IR scholarship. While the thesis aims to present the ethic of care as a relational rather than a strictly feminist ethic, feminist scholarship and methodology is appreciated for its emphasis on the importance of listening to and including the voices of, in this case, the NGO workers and volunteers. Grounded theory derives from the information gathered during the fieldwork process and is therefore recognised as situated knowledge. While this methodological approach best suited this research project it was not without its limitations which are outlined and discussed in this chapter. By outlining the methodological approach adopted in the first chapter of this thesis the importance of voices as one of the key considerations in the literature on the ethic of care is appreciated. The use of an ethic of care as a lens is also introduced, giving tangibility to the ethic of care in practice rather than as found in the existing literature which confines the ethic to abstract theoretical discourse.

This thesis provides a critical assessment of the literature on an ethic of care that is most commonly identified as feminist theory. Addressing the work of Gilligan, Held,

Sevenhuijsen, Ruddick and Tronto the literature review provides a thorough and focused critique of the limitations and also the value of the work that considers the ethics of care, its location, application and also its emergence in the discourse concerning citizenship, agency and representation. Post-modern theories of civil society and community are also considered with a particular focus placed upon the debate concerning the division between the public and private spheres. Essential to the central argument is that an ethic of care is a relational ethic rather than an abstract maternal ethic. Therefore this thesis locates society as a whole in the public sphere, supporting the claim that 'the personal is political'.[5]

There are three central arguments that unfold in this thesis. The first central argument is that an ethic of care is a practical and relational ethic which deserves to be included in IR discourse. Care, it is argued, is not an exclusively feminist or maternal ethic, nor is it the softer side of politics. Second, the ethic of care can be nurtured through the utilisation of the dialogical space a space where the relationship between the state and civil society can become more direct, sensitive, communicative and attentive. The third argument builds upon the utilisation of the dialogical space and highlights how it becomes a place of learning for those involved, especially the local and national NGO community. The purpose of the conceptual chapters is to give a detailed account of the key conceptual components of this thesis. These are followed by the case study chapters, where the theory is shown to be grounded and knowledge situated in the practice of the NGO workers and in their interaction with the state in the dialogical space.

The case study chapters offer a unique insight into the local and national NGO communities in Scotland and Zambia, and their interactions with their respective national

---

[5] C. Hanisch, 'The Personal is Political', *Notes From the Second Year: Women's Liberation* (1969).

governments. The rationale for the use of the two case studies, Scotland and Zambia was primarily in order to show examples of vibrant and mature local NGO communities in both Western and Sub-Saharan African democracies. As with many misconceptions regarding the NGO community, especially in IR literature, it is often assumed that NGO communities are large, multinational and Western-led. However, the most vibrant and effective NGO communities and groups are at the grass-roots and local levels working directly with and of the communities they seek to represent. NGOs, as will be shown in the conceptual chapters, are often regarded solely as aid givers and actors in foreign policy related missions. However, the diversity and richness of the community and the many different roles and levels of professionalism are often overlooked. Furthermore, in addition to the International NGO dominant in the literature there is often a bias towards exploring and assessing NGO communities and their work in less developed states rather than acknowledging not only the need but the huge impact and contribution local NGOs make in what are believed to be rich welfare states.

The Scottish case study was chosen due to the nature of the devolved Scottish parliament where many of the MSPs (Members of Scottish Parliament) have had previous experience in and with the local and national Scottish 'Third Sector', the sector under which the NGO community is recognised. The devolved parliament prides itself on its accessibility and open door policy and its MSPs, across all of the political parties therein, claim to be informed and aware of the needs and pertinent issues of their constituents. The Scottish case study highlights that an ethic of care is present in the NGO community, self-identified by their workers and recognised by the communities they represent, and that there is a positive and working relationship between the third sector and the Scottish government. As

addressed by the interviews, accessibility to both the parliament and MSPs is key. This availability facilitates discussion, knowledge exchange and effective change which directly benefits the care recipients, those who are represented by the NGOs. Thus, the Scottish case study locates the ethic of care as a relational ethic and an ethic that is present in practice in the NGO community. The case study also identifies that dialogical spaces are created and utilised by the NGOs, and also by the MSPs facilitating the nurturing of an ethic of care, while at the same time creating a positive learning environment for NGOs.

The Zambian case study was selected due to the disjuncture between the Zambian government and civil society. Whereas in the Scottish case study the NGO community are recognised as part of a sector in the Scottish political sphere in the Zambian case study, they are identified as a challenge to the Zambian state and an alternative source of representation and advocacy for civil society. The Zambian case study therefore highlights that while an ethic of care is present in the NGO community, as identified by the NGO workers and volunteers interviewed, its full potential cannot be utilised as there are no examples cited of the creation of a dialogical space where the ethic of care could potentially be nurtured in the ways that were witnessed in the context of the Scottish case study. Furthermore, with the changing legislation regarding the recognition and legality of NGOs and their practices, the Zambian case study highlights the negative impact of recognising the NGO community as a source of direct political opposition, rather than as an additional inroad to representational politics for civil society. As will be shown, the case studies ground the theory that an ethic of care is a relational ethic, not a purely feminist or mothering ethic. They highlight the importance of local and national NGOs and how they directly impact policymaking, which in turn impacts on the international status of the country in question.

In short, just as the private is indeed public, local and national politics are international politics.

This thesis concludes that, through the creation and utilisation of dialogical spaces, an ethic of care can be nurtured. This means that the relationship between the state and civil society becomes more direct, sensitive, communicative and attentive. The dialogical space is also a place of learning for the NGO community as the interviewees highlight; the dialogical space facilitates the continued professionalization of NGOs, breaks down assumptions and barriers between NGO workers and politicians, increases confidence in NGO advocacy, and emphasises that the key stakeholders are civil society and not necessarily the NGOs themselves.

Chapter 1
Methodology

'Actors come in many wonderful forms. Accounts of a "real" world do not, then depend on the logic of "discovery" but on a power-charged social relation of "conversation". The world neither speaks itself nor disappears in favour of a master decoder…In some critical sense that is crudely hinted at by the clumsy category of the social or of agency, the world encountered in knowledge projects is an active entity.'[6]

Introduction

In this chapter, I define certain nomenclature – epistemology, ontology, method, ethics and methodology – in order to make apparent the *raison d'être* of this thesis. In particular, I focus on methodology. By methodology I mean the intellectual process that guides reflections on the relationship between all components of theoretical and practical research, specifically those 'self-conscious reflections on epistemological assumptions, ontological perspectives, ethical responsibilities, and method choices'.[7]

The methodological journey described in this chapter is directly attributed to the findings of a thorough and reflective research project. The project concludes, first, that an 'ethic of care' can be nurtured in the dialogical space through the creation and utilisation of these spaces; second, that NGOs can learn from their conversations with states; and, third, that these conversations can contribute to policymaking and practices which are more amenable to, and reflective of, the needs of their communities, as supported by the findings both in Zambia and in Scotland.

---

[6] D. Haraway, 'Situated Knowledges: The Science Question in Feminism and the Privilege of Partial Perspective' *Feminist Studies,* Vol.14, No.3. (Autumn, 1988), p.593.

[7] B.A. Ackerly, M. Stern and J. True, (eds.), *Feminist Methodologies for International Relations* (Cambridge University Press, 2006), p.6.

This chapter outlines the methodology used, the justification for its use in the context of the research question, and the way in which the observations and knowledge collected during the fieldwork exercise were handled and used in order to arrive at the conclusions presented. This chapter and indeed this thesis as a whole reminds the reader to be conscious that in a state-centric discipline such as International Relations, notorious for its relative lack of critical self-reflection, developing feminist methodologies and conducting feminist research have proved major challenges. With these disciplinary challenges in mind this chapter further illustrates the need for pragmatic change, as well as the normative inclusion of feminist approaches to exploring the socio-political world. This change however is not a 'first wave' attack on the perceived dominance of a binary heterosexual matrix in International Relations nor is it a 'second wave' call to reinvent the wheel. Rather, it is a pragmatic acknowledgment that 'since all power relations are essential to feminist perspectives and to the feminist research process, feminist methodologies are highly relevant for the study of global politics'.[8]

The distinctiveness of feminist methodologies inside and outside IR lies in their reflexivity, which encourages the researcher to re-interrogate continually their own scholarship.[9] Feminist methodological approaches are not only innovative but also raise new ethical and political dilemmas that expand methodological inquiry and in turn facilitate a reflexive choice in IR that had hitherto been shunned by the academic community for its loose, unquantifiable statements about the social and political world.

Methodological diversity in the field of IR honours the natural human habit of enquiry. Different approaches to social enquiry facilitate the exploration and exposure of

---

[8] Ackerly et al, p.1.
[9] Ackerly et al, p.4.

various aspects of human interaction at a community, national and international level. Qualitative research is often considered to be a somewhat enigmatic pursuit, because it conjures up images of an unwieldy process characterised by lone researchers wading through paperwork, but in fact such research seeks to explain and unpack behavioural questions regarding interaction.[10] As shown and justified here, qualitative research makes a significant contribution to knowledge and facilitates the justification of research based on in-depth interviews and observations made in the field.

The use in this thesis of a feminist approach to social enquiry opens up views of interactions between the state, civil society and the local NGO community through the analysis of empirical data collected from the Zambian and Scottish case studies. While this thesis as a whole addresses the interaction between the NGO and the state through the lens of an 'ethic of care', in a methodological sense it further enriches the discipline of IR. In this way I would follow research by Bina D'Costa on the survivors of gender-based violence after the wars of Independence in Bangladesh. D'Costa's work explores the methodological implications of putting otherwise marginalized research subjects at the centre of IR inquiry.[11] The disciplinary community of IR has now started to align itself with neighbouring fields such as anthropology, sociology and associated interdisciplinary modes. Although primarily concerned with a state-centric level of analysis, IR is now, as it must, paying close attention to normative frameworks of analysis which further justifies the inclusion of this thesis as a contribution to knowledge and inquiry in IR. In pursuing research on marginalised and less explored topics and methodologies, current researchers such as myself are part of 'a new generation of IR scholars [who are] gradually daring to pursue

---

[10] M. Henn, M. Weinstien and N. Foard, *A Critical Introduction to Social Research* (SAGE Publications: 2009), p.243.

[11] B. D'Costa in Ackerly et al, p.152.

unconventional projects that bring in people's voices and deploy them within the boundaries of the discipline'.[12]

Planning

The data for this thesis was collected through in-depth interviews over the course of a nine month period from January to August 2010. This time was split into intervals due to logistics and the parliamentary calendar which has a direct impact on both the NGO and civil society groups' activity. It had to be noted for the planning of interviews, particularly in Scotland, that the parliamentary calendar works in parallel with the school academic calendar and as a result so does the main activity of the NGO and third-sector, this is to maximise the reception of their activities, increase their access to institutions and political bodies, and as a result positively influence the impact of their activities. In Zambia much of the NGO work also follows a pattern based upon the parliamentary calendar and also seasonally, due to the adverse conditions during the rainy season which is usually between August and September. Further, the Zambian fieldwork trip had been planned between May and July, during the Zambian winter months to allow full access to some of the more remote areas of the country if necessary. The first two months in Scotland were mostly based in Edinburgh and Glasgow where the main NGO head offices are based as they are in close proximity both to the parliament and to large well-funded city council offices. In Glasgow they are found mostly in the city centre and the West-end. In Edinburgh many are found in a large shared office space situated on Rose Street, within walking distance of Holyrood, home of the Scottish Parliament. A further two months were spent in the Zambian capital of Lusaka

---

[12] D'Costa in Ackerly et al, p.155.

where, as in Scotland, most of the countries national and international NGO head offices are

based in close proximity to government and embassy offices along the city's Independence

Avenue which is dominated by parliament and all the ambassadorial residences and offices.

The final two months were spent in Edinburgh to coincide with the Festival of Scottish

Politics held at Holyrood in mid-August. These final two months differed in that they were

used to observe the festival, how civil society groups and NGOs made use of this

opportunity, and also to transcribe the interviews conducted in the months prior. These two

months allowed me to email interviewees for clarification and also to explore other topics

that had emerged during the interview process. It is these two months of the project that

encapsulate the reflexivity of a feminist methodology as they allowed for a re-interrogation

of the material captured and the observations made.

Securing ethical clearance for fieldwork

As with any social research project, the University of St Andrews' Ethics Committee had to

be consulted and ethical clearance had to be administered prior to the fieldwork taking

place. Ethical considerations and sensitivity in social research is of utmost importance. The

following extract is the application for ethical clearance for my fieldwork project in 2010.

> *Ethical considerations should not be taken for granted within any body of research. Through considering the relative power and control of myself, the researcher, the direction of interaction I will experience with those participating in the research process and most importantly the level of possible 'harms' and benefits which the research may expose the participants to, I must be clear in my intention, display integrity in my work and gain the trust of the subjects under consideration.*

I will therefore be explicit in my aims and will conduct my research in a manner which models the 'Kantian categorical imperative'[13] with its principle respect for human autonomy. Through analysis of the literature surrounding models of fieldwork, consideration of risk and its assessment, the ethics of questioning, hypothesising and publicising compiled data, I am confident that this project will considered and received as an ethically viable contribution to knowledge.

Clarity is of the utmost importance and this will be considered in relation to the following criteria which each stage of the project will be scrutinised against. To ensure ethical practice I will consider each of the three case studies under the following conditions. (1) the relative power of myself, the researcher, as perceived by the participants; (2) the contextual control and design of the research and thus how this effects interaction between myself and the participants; (3) the direction of the research interaction for example the consideration of whether the interaction flows primarily in one direction or two; (4) confidentiality; (5) ensuring that categorical imperative is maintained and that subjects are not used as means to achieve 'revolutionary' or emancipatory goals based upon my personal perception of what these groups 'should' be campaigning for. Point 5 is one of the most important but arguably one of the most difficult to overcome, as will be discussed, due to the nature of social research being about values and interpretations and is thus not exclusively value free, I must be able to explicitly show that my findings are conducted with the understanding that I will regard the participants as ends, not means, and their autonomy will be, first and foremost, respected.[14]

According to the British Sociological Association's (BSA from here onwards) Statement of Ethical Practice, published in 1992, one of the researcher's key priorities is to prevent the distress of participants.[15] Throughout the fieldwork process as explained here I understood that the nature of my research positioned me, in terms of perception of the participant, in a position of power. Through use of interviews and observations made at the locality of the participant rather than in a 'neutral' location I understood that I would be presenting stimuli aimed at participants to reflection upon issues which may be particularly sensitive. The BSA's guidelines stress that researchers should 'consider carefully the possibility that the

---

[13] J. Cassell, 'Ethical Principles for Conducting Fieldwork', *American Anthropologist, New Series*, Vol. 82, No. 1 (Mar., 1980), pp. 28-41.
[14] Application to the Ethics Committee of the School of International Relations, University of St Andrews, Academic year 2009-2010 headed by Dr Jeffery Murer and passed on January 2010.
[15] G. Lee-Treweek, *Danger in the field - risk and ethics in social research* (Routledge: 2000) pp. 14-15.

research experience may be a disturbing one [with regards to] a threat to participants' from having to face self-knowledge or being made to dwell on distressing aspects of social life that they would normally avoid'.[16] These guidelines were used as prescriptive to ensure an ethically robust research project, and as a result also ensured that I, as a researcher, was in the receipt of the trust of each and every participant.

All interviewees were presented with a fully comprehensive interview pack which had a full explanation of the research focus, direction, question and explanation of how data would be collected, shared and stored. The pack also included the ethics committee approval, the consent forms to be signed by the interviewee, a full list of my own and my supervisors' details, as well as an open invitation to contact me for any further discussion or indeed any retraction of information shared in part or in full during the interview process itself. While this was quite a static part of the interview process it was absolutely necessary to comply with the obligation of social research as outlined by the University of St Andrews Arts and Humanities Ethics Committee as of January 2010 when the field work was approved after application to the ethics committee through the thorough outline of the project and its aims through the use of semi-structured interviews in Scotland and Zambia respectively.

As the researcher I ensured confidentiality as both an instrumental and an intrinsic value. As an instrumental value in this context its purpose was to protect participants from the specific 'harms' that might come from disclosure, intrinsically it was as a commitment to respect the participants. As a researcher I had to be highly sensitive to those from the governments and the NGOs interviewed who were naturally cautious about their views,

---

[16] DSA (1992) as cited in Lee-Treweek, p. 14.

answers and accounts being directly attributed to them or indeed their organisation. This is why it was made explicit that there were no third parties funding my research nor had I been asked to research this area or target specific, named NGOs but rather I was looking to gain insight into the sector and its workings. Furthermore, it was highlighted that in terms of publication all information would be anonymous where requested explicitly by the interviewee. Moreover interviewees were made aware that the primary purpose of the data collected in the interviews was for a thesis and not primarily for publication. In the event of publication being considered, participants would be informed immediately and given the choice to read over the proposed publication and decide if their contribution could be included in the publication and how best to proceed in terms of identifying them and/or their organisation.

Titling the Thesis

Arriving at the final thesis title was a conscious process that took place on completing the research and analysis of the findings. The process was threefold in its phases and it is reflective of a traditionally qualitative, inductive approach to social scientific methodology. The three phases of titling the thesis are briefly outlined here as this gives a sense of how the research was conducted. The thesis title, *'An ethic of care in the dialogical space. What do NGOs learn from the conversations with states?'*, was constructed through a self-reflective process of deduction, induction and constructivism throughout the entire process of the PhD. From proposal to the drawing of grounded observations, the title was specifically based around the fieldwork planned and subsequently conducted.

The initial step in establishing the thesis title can be described as 'deductive' as it began, albeit very loosely, with a general hypothesis about communication between the NGO and the state, and the expected consequences of such communicative exchange as explained below in Phase one. 'Inductive' as it used a very general and loose framework to guide the research path. The framework was a guide rather than a prescribed set of binding instructions. As is indicative of qualitative studies, especially those in fitting with a feminist methodological approach, it was necessary to leave room for adaptation and allow the interview to evolve and a conversation emerge, thematically structured through open questioning as is shown in the section of the thesis title , *What do NGOs learn from their conversations with states?',* which reflects these methodological qualities. Rather than explicitly stating an assumption, for example *'NGOs learn from their conversations with states'* as would be the case in a mixed methodological approach where 'learning' would be codified and the extent to which such 'learning' took place would be measured as a value, this approach as outlined in phase two sought guidance rather than codification. Finally, the thesis title is also, for the most part, 'constructive' as it was arrived at as a result of my, the researcher, experience, insight and exposure to situated knowledge throughout the research process. This section of the thesis title was arrived at in the third phase, *'An ethic of care in the dialogical space'* highlighting the findings of the research project in its broadest sense, that an ethic care is present, in practice, in the dialogical space. The title was constructed based on experience and findings and is thus reflective of the project rather than the prescriber of the project.

The primary hypothesis, deduced from IR theory regarding the relation between state and non-state actors, was that states and NGOs communicate with one another. From

this a further idea was deduced that this communicative process would in some way facilitate the establishment of a learning environment, which is referred to as the dialogical space in the theoretical outline of this thesis as explored in the previous chapter on theory and as extended in the chapters discussing the fieldwork, through the sharing of insight, practice and information, something about the other, and those they represented. These ideas, deduced from the general knowledge in IR literature about the communicative process between state and non-state actors, were the only example of deductive reasoning. Thus deductive reasoning was used in the formulation of the research question and subsequent direction of the research, through inductive methodology, and therefore along the research path as it holistically mapped itself out. This culminated in the establishment of the thesis title itself. This is therefore identified as Phase One briefly summarised below.

The second phase of the thesis title was partly established prior to beginning the research. This phase was fully embedded in the design of the research question as the research progressed. This was the 'ethic of care' lens that was firmly established in feminist literature but rarely used as part of an active qualitative research project. The research as a whole set out not only to specifically evaluate the conversations and lessons learned from the conversations between NGOs and the state in Zambia and in Scotland, but on a more general level, the research also sought to explore if in fact the ethic of care could be recognised in IR as a grounded theory, something which to date has not been actively pursued. Thus the thesis is layered in its contribution to the discipline through specific case studies and knowledge induced as a result, but also in that it shows that the ethic of care is not exclusively a feminist concern, and in fact contributes to the theoretical richness of the subject. What is identified as Phase Two of the building of the thesis title is the identification

of the ethic of care as the general lens by which to approach the semi-structured interview process, the formulation of the thematic foci of the interviews, and, in a more general sense, the recognition of the ever-increasing resources of IR as a discipline to describe the social world. Thus the 'ethic of care' inclusion in the title highlights to the reader the lens through which the research was conducted, and verifies the existence of an ethic of care both as a theoretical and a practical concept – a grounded theory – in IR.

The third and final stage of the thesis titling aimed to capture the general findings of the research process as a whole. This was drawn from the observation that states also learn through their conversations with NGOs, when indeed such a place was designated for these conversations. This space, defined as the 'dialogical space' in the chapter on theory, enabled the nurturing of an ethic of care in the dialogical space as an approach to policy research, making and exercise. Thus the element of the title, 'Nurturing an ethic of care in the dialogical space', highlights the nature of the findings and the observations gleaned.

By outlining the actual phases of the titling of this thesis, it has been shown that the feminist methodological underpinnings and constructivist grounding theory established in practice, were not just assumed as an aesthetic but are in fact inherent in the thesis as a whole, adding to its authenticity by showing not just a qualitative practice but also a qualitative outlook to the subject matter at hand, from the initial identification of an area of interest and research to the construction of the different parts of the title – the title itself is a product of interpretive and inductive reasoning, qualitative not only by design, but also as a natural approach to social research from my, the researcher's, ontological perspective.

Phase One – Identifying the area of study. The interaction between the NGOs and the state. This was the starting point and initial question that guided the research process.

Phase Two – Identifying the 'lenses' to be used to look at these interactions which were conceptualised as 'conversations' between NGOs and the state. The 'lens' was an 'ethic of care'. This was due to its general thematic outline that appeared to be a good thematic guide for the interview process. During the interview process, the ethic of care as identified in the literature emerged as an excellent and fitting metaphor to describe one of the predominant characteristics of the NGOs. The use of the ethic of care as a lens gave focus to the research facilitating direction when collecting the data, and the organisation and analysis of this data when the research was in process and completed.

Phase Three – the formulation of a descriptive thesis title. Beginning with an inductive approach it was constructed and arrived at as 'An ethic of care in the dialogical space'

It is important to highlight from the outset that theoretical claims are *as a result of* the in-depth interviews and observations made during the 6 months' of fieldwork. While traditional methodologies in social science seek to parallel that of scientific exploration, beginning with hypotheses before moving onto the testing of the hypotheses, and then the discussion of results after testing, this project had no set hypotheses or expectations (as will be explored and justified here). Rather the project had aims and particular areas of interest to be explored in accordance with the research proposal. As highlighted by Sylvester, '[i]f we do not journey along the learning curve, we end up trying to draw without looking, observing, and reckoning with life'.[17] This is precisely what this project sought to avoid. Rather than imposing and following a set of tight hypotheses through a deductive approach, semi-structured thematic interviews were used. In this way I was able to draw conclusions

---

[17] Sylvester in Ackerly et al, p.9.

based, not on preconceived ideas, but on ideas formulated as a result of experience adhering to an inductive approach to social scientific research. The semi-structured interviews, as will be shown, were thematically consistent. This design was in order to guide the interview process and also acted as conscious cues for me, the researcher. While interviewees were encouraged to give very detailed and personal accounts of their experience in accordance with these themes, their use also enabled me, the researcher, to retain some directive power, and aided me in managing the common situation where the interviewee had the tendency to go off on a tangent about one particular issue which, as the interview progressed, became clear was not directly relevant to the research project. This, as will be discussed in the limitations of the methodological approach, is one of the critiques of the qualitative research process that it has to allow and give room for diversions which are often both time consuming and of little direct value to the research project itself. In defence of this, however, while perceived as limited in terms of a direct contribution to the answering of the research question proper, the time invested, the trust established and the additional themes uncovered through this 'time consuming' element of the qualitative research process were in themselves invaluable components of the research methodology. Without allowing such room for diversions of attention, theme and conversation, the richness of this project would not have been achieved.

The aim of this thesis, then, is to highlight an ethic of care in the dialogical space as introduced by NGOs. Thus the first priority was to establish a working definition of an 'ethic of care' in practice, as hitherto the ethic of care had only been explored in the existing literature. Through the interview process the 'ethic of care' came to be established and understood as a relational ethic that is a condition of sensitive interdependence; this being a

self-conscious relationship, a relationship built upon intuitive understanding, open dialogue and sensitivity to the immediate context [time, place and constituents]. The ethic of care encourages an active recognition and practice of a dialogical exchange between the caregiver and care recipient, facilitating a sensitivity through direct communication and a recognisable unapologetic bias towards the requirements of the particular group it seeks to represent. It is from this description that the 'ethic of care' can be summarised as 'sensitive, intuitive, bias and self-conscious'. This definition was arrived at inductively through the interview process, as the four descriptors were consistently reiterated by the interviewees (as highlighted in the fieldwork chapters). While the ethic of care was a lens for the fieldwork process it was consciously placed in the background as a guide rather than in the foreground as a stipulation of the research, in order to avoid it being superimposed on the fieldwork process. As a researcher, I required this lens as a guide to help formulate the interview themes and to establish where I wanted to begin with the interviews; the rest however was as a result of the interviewee's description of experience, perspective and outlook. All this considered, it is the case that the four key terms highlighted in this thesis' inductive definition of an ethic of care are in line with the theoretical definition of an ethic of care as located within the literature, which highlights the significance of the ethic of care as it resonates in both theory and practice. These areas of discussion are the specific focus of the fieldwork chapters and are also highlighted in the conceptual outline. It is, however, necessary to acknowledge them here for conceptual clarity in this chapter. Thus, in short, the ethic of care is defined as the following: *sensitive, intuitive, bias and self-conscious'* and it is these four traits that are present in practice in the dialogical space as a result of interaction between the state and the NGO.

In the general directional planning and preparation stage it emerged that it was important to interview the NGOs first as the literature had asserted that the NGOs would be the most likely to exhibit, and to be guided by, an ethic of care as discussed in the theoretical framework of this thesis. One of the striking statements which encouraged such an approach was that 'the inquiry process in IR would be fundamentally changed if people's interests gained precedence over state interests'.[18] It was important to showcase one of the emergent areas in IR which is not primarily concerned with the traditional state-centric definition of power relations.

Although the literature does not explicitly state that NGOs display an ethic of care as it is described here, the literature does assert that an ethic of care is visible in circumstances where there is a care receiver and consequently a caregiver who has recognised the required need. The relationship between caregiver and care receiver is sensitive and intuitive, displays a bias toward the need of the care receiver and self-consciously recognises that the relationship is built around a shared interest, which therefore means it can be used as a theoretical example to the explain the relationship between NGOs and those they represent. One example from the fieldwork conducted in Zambia is 'The Corridors of Hope' established to support those specifically dealing with the reality and difficultly of living as a registered HIV sufferer in a community where being HIV positive has a powerful stigma attached. As the thesis title implies, the ethic of care was something that was defined by the NGO and therefore it was important, as a researcher, to find out what the ethic of care meant in its primacy before attempting to locate it, if possible, in the action of the state. Therefore the order of the interviews, interviewing the non-state actors before the state actors, was dictated not through strict hypotheses but more through the pursuit of

---

[18] D'Costa in Ackerly et al, p.152.

an effective and representative definition of the ethic of care. The NGOs, community groups and those representing constituents independent of state funding or direction, were approached and interviewed first in both Zambia and Scotland.

Why this method?

Enquiry has to go beyond the state and between its actors, to encompass and involve agents who interact and contribute to state behaviour and activity having a direct effect upon the lives of citizens. Feminist methodological reflections are often directed at the redesign of methods that have been used to explore non-feminist questions in fields where feminist inquiry is relatively new. While this is the case for many emerging research questions in the discipline of IR in reaction to a state-centric and realist account of interaction, this is not the justification for the use of a feminist methodological application for this thesis. As explored in the theory chapter, and as discussed throughout the thesis, it is the pragmatism and self-conscious reflection that dominates the method and theory of feminist IR that is utilised and appreciated here.

The traditional focus on the state, as the most influential actor on the national (and international) stage, is now beginning to be understood as a narrow perception that impedes the ability of the researcher to integrate and consider the conduct, implementation, culture and attitudes which lie in-between and beyond the state, and also those that have a profound impact on it. Through the use of the static epistemological and ontological to describe socio-political behaviour, tangible effects of wider engagement have been difficult to measure in both a quantitative and qualitative manner and for some time these behaviours and interactions have been regarded as outliers rather than variables to be

considered and integrated into research design and analysis. Traditional research 'tools' limit variables to state-centric concerns such as voting, data analysis from structured census reports, records on birth marriages and deaths, and ideas on legality and sovereignty, all of which are at an institutional level and do not extend below the organisational structure of the state's control and most importantly its centrality. All of these underutilise the value of locally sourced knowledge and information collected and collated by, and about, these groups at the grass roots. The perceived inability to 'measure' is where the feminist methodological and theoretical model seeks to contribute something of considerable value and richness. While many through ignorance, prejudice or misunderstanding believe that the feminist contribution seeks to undermine those disciplines which are traditionally perceived as 'masculine', the introduction of feminist methodology for the purpose of this IR thesis seeks to facilitate the inclusion of what cannot readily be measured, which but nonetheless has a direct impact on the socio-political world, impacting policy and output, and refocusing our lens on the social world we seek to understand.

Providing an account of fieldwork as a linear process is challenging and in the context of this research adds little value to the understanding of the knowledge and insight gained. This is because 'the significance of certain parts of the process became evident only when I could reflect on them afterwards' and in concert with one another. This realisation highlights that if regarded as 'individual' or isolated cases, voices can only actively contribute to a phenomenological account of the social world. Channelling and focussing energy on the singularity of process, breaking it into individual segments of time, fractures the account of the social world and the nuances of interaction that qualitative research

serves to tie together in order to gain a more complete and rich depiction of what is occurring.

Grounding theory, situating knowledge, questioning objectivity

In order to fully appreciate the epistemological nature of this thesis, it is important to explain what the terms *'situated knowledge'* and *'grounded theory'* mean in the context of the project and the thesis as a whole. As alluded to in the opening quotation of this methodology chapter, the project, the host institutions and organisations (states and NGOs); subjects (those interviewed); and when incorporated, the dialogical space, were all *active and dynamic* entities in the process. Entities were *active and dynamic* due to their contribution to the project both as a process and its outcome (as those interviewed helped to initiate, guide and shape the interviews of those who followed them, and subsequently facilitated the emergence of themes analysed and discussed in the fieldwork chapters). The themes that emerged during the analysis of the fieldwork process were; 'locality' and 'centrality', 'care' and 'empathy', 'trust', 'capability' and 'understanding', all of which emerged consistently as themes in the interviews. Conversations were conducted with over 80 different people from the NGO community and state departments in both Scotland and Zambia. The interpersonal and value-centric nature of these themes, the interview initiation through introductions from members of the NGO network and community, the interview set-up and style all meant that *grounding* the theory and arriving at *situated* knowledge occurred naturally. The theory emerged as a result of the interactive interviews conducted and situated observations noted. Therefore the theory is grounded in what it seeks to describe: the knowledge is situated in the context which it emerged from. The theory and

knowledge presented here could not be described had the fieldwork process not occurred. This highlights that in qualitative studies, especially those seeking to explore the relational interactions in the socio-political world, abstract induction provides too general and too broad an account. As such the theory and the conclusions are built upon the foundations laid in the fieldwork which serves to challenge the supremacy of an objective scientific approach.

Theories, rather than being tested in the field which becomes the 'laboratory', emerge and shape the knowledge retrieved into something that describes the social world that it explores. While this thesis does not claim, in its production, to be the final word or the ultimate authority in what it shares as knowledge, it does give a partial insight into and an account of a 'world' (of which there are many) based upon conversations with those encountered in that time and place. With this in mind there is a need for the unpacking of the epistemic and methodological significance of 'situated knowledge' and 'grounded theory' as conceptual and practical tools in the research process.

The knowledge discussed here is a result of localised interactions between me, the researcher, and the interviewee. This means, therefore, that the knowledge is situated. This localised conversational interview builds and constructs a picture of the dialogical space, the space where interactions between the NGO and the state takes place as discussed in the theory chapter and as shown in the chapters analysing the fieldwork findings. The dialogical space is described and observed from the perspective of those interviewed, from the NGO community and those working for the state in Zambia and Scotland, and also, at times, those who have worked for both, giving a multifaceted and nuanced account of the dialogical space, in its presence and absence. From this it is clear, then, that the epistemic

understanding of knowledge, for the purpose of this thesis, is that it is situated.[19] Rather

than claiming to speak as universal and transcendent these interviews are merely small

windows, providing partial insights into a much larger knowledge world. However, that fact

that I have interviewed, worked alongside and witnessed interactions and engagement

between the NGO and the state, and likewise witnessed where there has been no

interaction or interaction that bears little tangible results, does not necessarily mean that I

have captured 'the truth of their experience' as the very nature of this data is that it is

unfixed.[20] Recognizing the unfixed character of this data, what Ackerly et. al. call a

'deliberative moment', highlights that the discipline of international relations, if it is to be

reflective of the social world, must take seriously the 'data' that while difficult to measure is

even more difficult to ignore if we are to understand our socio-political worlds.[21] 'Feminist

objectivity means quite simply *situated knowledges*…The goal is better accounts of the

world, that is, ''science''.'[22] Therefore if the knowledge here is to be recognised as situated,

it is also important to highlight the feminist critique of scientific objectivity as a means of

describing the socio-political world.

Objectivity

Haraway reminds the social researcher, more specifically the social scientist, that even

'objectivity [is] a view from somewhere', and this is certainly true of the epistemological

stance presented here.[23] Understanding and coming to terms with this critique of objectivity

facilitates the analytical address of the data recovered from the interview process and also

---

[19] Haraway, p.581.
[20] D'Costa in Ackerly et al, p.160.
[21] Ackerly et al, p.29.
[22] Haraway, p.581.
[23] Haraway, p. 581.

highlights the significance of the researcher's position in the process as discussed in the address of the Kantian dialogical perspective in the coming sections of this chapter. Knowledge about the socio-political world, due to its dynamics and intricacies is 'partial, personal and situated' which paraphrases Haraway's account of social scientific research and how it should be understood. 'Science' in the social world should be 'enforceable, reliable accounts of things not reducible to power moves and agnostic , high-status games of rhetoric or to scientistic, positivist arrogance'.[24] In essence Haraway's critical discussion of objectivity reinforces the need to move away from the grand narratives of Enlightenment thought. This is important here as the nature of the enquiry regarding the interaction between NGOs and the state cannot be generalised. However, it also should not be criticised as mere relativism which is the flip-side of the debate regarding the type of research described here. Thus, neither objectivity nor relativism accurately describes the position of the researcher's perspective, and this is why much emphasis has been placed on understanding situated knowledge and grounded theory as methodological tools.

In 'Situated Knowledges: The Science Question in Feminism and the Privilege of Partial Perspective', Haraway proposes that feminist objectivity begins with radical constructivism and critical empiricism, from the starting point that science is arguably another ''contestable text''[25] that should be further corroborated in modern projects of humanist rationality. Haraway argues that feminists cannot be content with critiques of positivist and humanist objectivity; and that they need their own doctrines, their own ways to talk about reality: 'it is how to have *simultaneously* an account of radical historical contingency for all knowledge claims and knowing subjects, a critical practice for recognizing

---

[24] Haraway (1988). p.580.
[25] Haraway (1988), p.581.

our own ''semiotic technologies'' for making meanings, and a no-nonsense commitment to accounts of a ''real'' world.'[26] In light of this Haraway proposes an alternative or a feminist conceptualisation of objectivity in her combination of knowledge practices that she asked to be recognised as a 'usable, but not an innocent, doctrine of objectivity' termed 'situated knowledge' which is a 'positioned rationality'. Most significantly this is recognised and understood as 'views from somewhere',[27] which reiterates the importance of understanding the limits of objectivity as a neutral space to be occupied by the researcher. In fact, the theory of situated knowledge reconciles the difficulty of the researcher who cannot be absolutely objective if they are studying human interaction, thus we understand and reconcile the hypocrisy of objective positivism for the social scientist. Haraway's situated objectivity contrasts with the enlightenment doctrines of detached scientific objectivity, it is supported through her epistemological approach and understanding of knowledge as a concept. Her understanding of knowledge moves it away from a grand theory to partial theory that acknowledges, as I do here, that as researchers we can only ever see a partial representation of the social world as we cannot and should not claim to be all-seeing, all-hearing and thus all-knowing. This is an abstraction of reality and a depiction of a world which does not exist.

Haraway's challenge to traditional definitions of objectivity calls into question the distance between subject and object. Rejecting the 'subject-object split', Haraway shows that they are interconnected and provides an alternative to positivist objectivity, encouraging social researchers to understand objects as actors.

---

[26] Haraway, p.579.
[27] Haraway, p.589.

Situated knowledges require that the object of knowledge be pictured as an actor and agent, not a screen or a ground or a resource, never finally as a slave to the master that closes off the dialectic in his unique agency and his authorship of "objective" knowledge. The point is paradigmatically clear in critical approaches to the social and human sciences, where the agency of the people studied itself transforms the entire project of producing social theory. Indeed, coming to terms with the agency of the "objects" studied is the only way to avoid gross error and false knowledge of many kinds.[28]

Indeed, the subjects and objects are all actors in the dialogical space where the state and NGOs meet, share and develop capabilities, the 'subjects' being the members of the NGO and state community and the 'objects' being the policies, issues and concerns they are there to discuss. Thus the subjects (who) and the objects (what) are interconnected and their nature at any given time or place directly influences the outcome (policy) which is outlined in the theory chapter.

Furthering the discussion of the 'subject-object' split, especially in the context methodology, *the researcher* must also be recognised as an 'object' as Haraway defines it, 'as [an] actor'[29]. It is on the basis of this understanding of the researcher as involved and situated that we can appreciate that to be objective is still 'a view from somewhere'. This is important to consider when we address the impact of the researcher on the interviewee. When the researcher understands that they have an impact on the environment it is important that they acknowledge this, not only in their conduct, but also in their analysis of the data collected.

---

[28] Haraway, p.593.
[29] Harawary, p.593.

One of the most obvious examples of this conscious and self-reflective nature of feminist methodology, regarding interviews with NGOs, is how the interview is approached from the very beginning of the process, from the initial email to request an interview to the interview itself, the participants, timing regarding the parliamentary calendar, and the location, be it at the head offices or at a café. As detailed here, as a researcher I was very much aware of the 'power' of my position as enquirer, instigator, interviewer and analyser, described as 'postionality' by anthropological researchers. Therefore to describe myself as 'objective' would, reflecting on the research experience and from a feminist methodological perspective, serve to negate and ignore some of the significant details of the process and the findings, that is, the use of communication and how NGOs perceive themselves through the lens of independent outsiders, governmental organisations and state institutions. This was especially true in the interviews conducted with NGO staff who were very conscious of my presence in their space, observing their work, and also of the potential opportunity they had to give a voice to their organisation that was not serving as a platform for marketing, fund sourcing or activism – a platform they are much more familiar with and also trained to command. Both in the Scottish and Zambian NGO offices, those put forward to be interviewed were very much used to answering, and prepared to answer, pre-outlined questions in order to justify and defend their work, rather than to describe and reflect upon it without having to be concerned about jeopardising the organisation. In most instances, aside from the interviews conducted at Sport In Action (SIA) due to it being my base in Zambia and therefore much more accessible, those whom I interviewed were either top ranking CEOs, Executives and Directors of the NGOs or those involved in the marketing and communication departments of the larger organisations. However, even the very small organisations made sure that they put across a very professional and 'managed' impression.

This insight into the self-consciousness of the NGO sector, especially in Scotland since the 1990s - about 'being taken seriously' - made sense as the fieldwork progressed and more interviews took place. Therefore, it was in this context that I understood myself to be an actor, as I had a direct effect on the workings and the dynamic of the NGO office on the days I was present. While this may seem purely anecdotal, it did have a significant impact on the interview process. While the interview with Dunion was one of the first and was also a reflective interview, as when interviewed Dunion had been appointed as the Scottish Freedom of Information Commissioner and also Rector at the University of St Andrews, it was an important pointer in what to expect and also explained the behaviour observed and encountered in the interviews with NGO workers.

During the initial stages of the interviews with smaller Scottish NGOs, interviewees were extremely self-conscious and some could also be described as being noticeably physically uncomfortable. From the first interview, I found myself in a situation where the interviewee actually interviewed me, something that enabled a relationship to build and therefore further situated the knowledge. Cohn and Stern suggest it is always useful to establish a relationship with the respondents.[30] Extremely sensitive information can be shared within familiar categories[31] and while they signify trust and the comfort of belonging, they also come with certain responsibilities to 'treat the stories not as material from producing knowledge but as a basis for initiating action from that knowledge'.[32] As highlighted in the Zambian and Scottish chapters, the ethic of care present in the NGO is that of a sensitive and relational dialogical engagement which means that they are curious as to who you are and how you happen to be there. Furthermore, it also allows those

---

[30] Ackerly et al.
[31] D' Costa in Ackerly et al, p.148.
[32] D' Costa in Ackerly et al, p.143.

interviewed to relax and this was particularly important in the Scottish case study for a different reason to that in Zambia.

In addition to an unstructured interview , I sought other ways to build a personable relationship with each of the respondents.[33] This required unrestricted time for the interviews which therefore ranged from one hour with more senior policy-making and parliamentary personnel to two hours with members of the civil community directly involved in NGO work as I shadowed some of their activities and we discussed and conducted the interview in parallel to daily routines and work. In order to get the most from the time allotted for interviews, I always went to the interviewee. Observations could therefore be made concerning interactions, space, communication and locality. While outlining the interview would take at least one hour, I allowed them to allocate the time and venue in order to make them as comfortable and familiar as possible in and with their surroundings. As a result, interview locations ranged from cafés, homes, gardens and offices. It was important to let the respondents decide on how formal or informal the interview location was to be. It was important that my availability, especially in Zambia, was flexible and accommodating.

Accessing the NGO community in Zambia was much more fluid than in the Scottish context as the 'business-like' posture assumed in the 1990s in Scotland, as discussed by Kevin Dunion, Linda Dunion, and those who had been working in the Scottish community and charitable sector in the 1980s and 1990s. The reason for this is because, as shown in the theory and in the Zambian chapters, the NGO community works in parallel with the government and municipalities. Tribal chiefs and religious elders, as highlighted by one of

the Lusaka city counsellors. The counsellors had been democratically elected in the city elections. However, they had no exercisable place at a parliamentary level, nor were they consulted regarding the health of their Lusakan constituents. As such, the counsellor's area of representation, health, was also represented by a parliamentary figure; local tribal 'witch doctors'; and the NGO community. All of these organisations, as stated by the counsellor, had no middle ground to talk, while they had one issue and also one goal to make the Zambian nation, especially its children fit and healthy to live and lead, they have no space to sit down and talk about how they can come together and make this happen.[34]

NGOs therefore play a different role in the Zambian context than seen in the Scottish context. Rather than working to specifically target areas where the government is not, as they believe, fulfilling their duties or raising awareness of a particular issue, the NGO community has matured in such a way that, in addition to raising awareness and encouraging change, it takes on the responsibility of filling the gap and providing the service, be this educational, health, human rights awareness and defence, employment and other associated services. This, as highlighted in the theory chapter, is how the absence of the dialogical space becomes apparent: when NGOs fill the service gap, informing a knowledge gap for governments, who then as a result of the service already being 'provided' do not provide it and, as in the case in Zambia, do not address the issue as their responsibility to their citizens. Thus the ethic of care, in the absence of the dialogical space, cannot be nurtured. NGOs when approached assume that you have a common outlook or wish to aid the service provision that they have assumed and are thus much more open and welcoming to those who quite literally knock on their doors. This too impacted on me and my 'power' as a researcher. Again, as outlined in the discussion of what a feminist

---

[34] Counsellor Interview [Lusaka, June 2010].

methodology entails, self-awareness and reflection was key. Furthermore, while I was more objective - or 'distanced', as feminist methodologists prefer to define it when addressing this positionality - in the Zambian context than in the Scottish context, by default of my Scottish nationality, I was more aware of my presence in a different manner than in the Scottish context, as described previously. Rather than there being an expectation regarding my CV, class and status as there was in the Scottish fieldwork experience, in the Zambian context I was a white western educated woman and as a result I was not seen as one who was there to 'question' but often seen as one who could advise. In this situation, both ethically and also in terms of professional experience, I had to be very careful and explicit regarding why I was there and what my interests were, which was one of the ways in which I was able to gain the respect and trust from the interviewees. Explaining that I was not an NGO worker, and even more specifically that I was not a missionary from 'The Church of St Andrews' or 'the Christian college of The University of St Andrews' was often the first priority in order to ensure that it was understood that I was not there to donate funds, services or expertise. While it took more time to get to the interview proper, it painted a clear and transparent picture as to why I was there, why I was interviewing, what my interest was and, most importantly, that I was, while not necessarily objective, an independent researcher who was there to listen and learn.

There was a marked difference in the style, conduct and timing of the interviews with government personnel and this was particularly visible with those interviewed who were in support of or working for the Zambian administration. The difference further illustrated the points made by the interviewees regarding accessibility. As the fieldwork progressed the theory as outlined in thesis emerged and thus a grounded theory developed

that captured the practice and experience of the interviewees and the NGO community in Scotland and Zambia. The ethic of care became even more apparent when contrasted to the ethic of empathy as witnessed at the state level. The dialogical space when present was then seen as a necessary middle ground and when absent was sorely missed and greatly required. In contrast to the open and direct discussions with NGO staff, the interviews conducted in official buildings on Independence Avenue in Lusaka (the main location of the governmental and international embassy buildings) were subject to a strict etiquette that immediately reinforced what many of the interviewees from the NGOs had indicated. Security was high, time was limited, and access was only granted on a minister's allotted time for 'civil society organisations'[35] which I was grouped into. As in the Scottish parliament there was a tight security procedure in place, and this was especially the case in Zambia which made access particularly daunting. It was clear that 'visitors' had to be easily identifiable and accompanied, and that activists were not welcome. As a researcher I was given an insight into the difficulty of logistical 'access' to government ministers, departments and even 'information points' that, according to the signs displayed inside the governmental buildings, were 'open to all'. In spite of this it was very difficult to see how these areas could be accessed by those who were, in Dunion's words, not 'in their Sunday best'.[36] The interview with Tom Carter, the British High Commissioner is an example of this change in interview posture, atmosphere and dialogue. This reinforced the reality that context is as equally as important as the content[37] especially regarding the quality and value that can be derived from the fieldwork context in order to make the analytical content as rich as possible. An awareness of the context of my interaction and appearance on the

---

[35] Tom Carter Interview.
[36] Kevin Dunion interview.
[37] Henn, Weinstein and Foard, p.243.

scene was important in gaining trust, insight, and an understanding of the nature of the NGOs, those who were being interviewed, and, in the context of state interaction, this contextual awareness was key to secure access to the ministers and governmental personnel.

Thus, as this analysis has shown, the methodology during the fieldwork interviews was self-conscious, situated and reflective. Each interview was conducted as part of a series of interviews and each interview added breadth and depth not only to the knowledge gained but also to my skill set as a researcher. The context therefore enabled the appreciation of the content therein and facilitated the analysis during and after the interview stage of the thesis.

A feminist methodological approach was best suited to this project. It facilitated a pragmatic and holistic approach to conversation, dialogue and observation which has resulted in a grounded theoretical account of an, albeit partial, reflective and situated knowledge base. Furthermore, it also highlighted the value of understanding the positionality of the researcher as an actor, rather than as objective and removed from the research. As shown, had objectivity in the scientific sense been sought, it would have subverted and placed significant limitations on the direction and implementation of the fieldwork as a journey.

This approach is however not without its limitations and critique. Gender, ethnicity, class and race, as highlighted by D'Costa, and this thesis, shows that further to these categories, subjects such as ethics, dialogue and interaction between non-traditional actors in International Relations, are now accepted as important areas to look at, but doing so is

often left to the scholars who work in those fields primarily.[38] However, this should not be seen as a barrier to scholarship but should in fact be seen as a positive contribution to the authenticity of the scholarship which results from such research. While D'Costa is sceptical about the reception stating that under-researched locations [in IR] receive scant attention from major scholars in the field of IR, or are left to area specialists, this should not dissuade the pursuit of knowledge about these areas but should in fact encourage the 'new generation' of scholars to push harder for their place in IR nomenclature.[39]

Qualitative data collection serves a purpose for social science in that it takes its cues from the subjects. Expressions and observations noted are as a result of first-hand interaction and while a great deal of trust is invested in the researcher by their target audience, to report observations in an accurate and least-judgemental way, such trust is elicited and recognised through the production and honouring of ethical code, accurate transcription and coding of the data collected, a thorough and contextualised presentation of the themes discussed and an adequate representation of the interview scenario. Through the accurate depiction of all of these elements the rigour, detail and accuracy, which is often subject to criticism and cynicism from the Positivist, upholders of the quantitative tradition of data collection in the social sciences, is highlighted, thus rendering the observations and subsequent analysis, reliable and accurate.

The use of data collected through observational study and in-depth interviews has provided a rich and highly representative body of research concerning the interaction between specific NGOs and the Zambian and Scottish governments, with a specific focus on the ethics of care and empathy as the broad subject area of inquiry. While these ethics

---

[38] D'Costa in Ackerly et al, p. 131.
[39] Henn, Weinstein and Foard, p. 243.

shaped the thematic structure of the interviews and directed the observational focus, they were loosely directive rather than tightly prescribed themes of discussion and exploration, as will be shown in this outline and discussion of the methodological approach of this study.

The context of the fieldwork matters just as much as the content of the findings as both are intertwined and reliant upon each other for clarity and understanding of the project as a whole. Furthermore, the determination of the subjects is as important as the choice of a population in a quantitative statistical study as the aim of all research within the social sciences, be it quantitative or qualitative, is to present a conceptually historically specific topic, subject or target.

As well as the conversational interviews described, observational techniques were used both as part of and in preparation for the field work research. Used as part of the formative, intermittent and summation phases of the research project, the observations made acted as stimuli for conversations, as tools to equip myself as a researcher with some familiar ground between myself and the interviewee, the main strength being that they facilitated the establishment of a common ground before and during the interviews. Furthermore, the observations made the research process more linear as initial observational research allowed for a targeted approach and selection of the initial NGOs. Afterwards NGOs were approached through recommendation and networking which is another example of how I situated myself in the fieldwork process. Rather than contacting many organisations through an impersonal and vague email, contact was made based on observations that affirmed the suitability of the organisation for the project.

The fieldwork itself cannot bestow legitimacy on data and as a result feminist research emphasizes the immediacy and directness of the researcher's fieldwork

experience.[40] Such experience comes as a result of meeting the interviewees in their own

domain, in order to unpack and understand the full context of the experiences that are

documented as situated knowledge about the research project. Removing the interviewee

from the contextual surroundings not only undermines the authenticity of the knowledge

gathered but also changes the dynamic and thus the findings which therefore can

undermine the fieldwork process as a whole. As I did, many feminist field researchers prefer

conversational modes to the structured interview, and use little or no formal

questionnaire.[41] This means that the 'interview' can take place in many different formats

and settings, to a degree as per the interviewees' preference, availability and accessibility at

any given time or place, which as a researcher I was very much open to both in principle and

practice. From my experience, interviews conducted in a very formal sense were the least

productive and this was understood from a very early stage in the field work process. For

these feminists, 'the deliberate non-structured approach is a way of marking the text as

knowledge' rather than as a source of information.

Like D'Costa, 'another related challenge I encountered came from the feminist

discourse of fieldwork which often insists on recording the direct experiences of 'real'

women'.[42] Stephens is critical of feminist researchers who make deliberate attempts to

bypass theoretical frameworks in favour of 'direct experience'. Their arguments are based

entirely on little-known materials documenting the direct experiences of women from the

field, which is in most cases the third world.[43] As a harsh critic of this type of feminist

research, Stephens claims that this is a certain kind of 'image-making', and that the

---

[40] D'Costa, p.139.
[41] D'Costa, p.139.
[42] D'Costa, p.139.
[43] Stephens (1989), pp. 93-94.

effectiveness of the 'I was there so it must be true' position rests on an assumed, unfiltered identity between fieldwork and fieldwork.[44]

Qualitative data sources are rich data sources and act as the foundation for informative research projects in social science. They can be presented as projects based on 'naturally occurring sources'[45] which are observed in their natural condition without any influence from the researcher. These sources can be in the form of media sources, communication between colleagues and subjects without the interference or questioning from the researcher who acts in this context as an observer. Natural sources, while important in the contextualisation of qualitative research projects are just that, contextual, in that they enable the researcher to decide on how they should establish themselves, as they outline the natural flow of communication and interaction of the particular area to be studied. For the purpose of this research project both in the fieldwork conducted in Zambia and Scotland, natural resources were used as contextual pin pointers, namely governmental reports, newspaper and related media, publications from NGOs and civil society groups as well as other types of communicative memo and discourse published in the public domain between the government, NGOs, activist and civil society groups. Such sources were also used during the course of the fieldwork process, again as contextualisation tools as a means of directing discussion to contemporary issues in the interviews examples, which are further explored in the fieldwork chapters. Sources include newspaper reports and propaganda leaflets from Zambia, where there were many public protests calling for transparency and a revision of the voter registration procedures being implemented by the Zambian government in the run up to the Presidential and parliamentary elections. Such natural

---

[44] D'Costa, p.139.
[45] Henn et al, p.243.

sources were consulted and used on a daily basis as they were circulating in the public domain with relatively no prior announcement as a means of ensuring they were not targeted and closed down by governmental officials. It is examples like this which will be used to show the requirement and justification for the methodological approach adopted during the research and fieldwork process.

While feminist researchers make a point of taking each 'story' as unique and do not seek to make cross comparisons this is often one of the limitations and therefore something which the wider IR research community cite as a valid critique of the methodological approach. In analysing and describing her fieldwork D'Costa makes a conscious point of highlighting that she had 'no comparative analysis to conduct and each story was intriguing on its own',[46] which is to assert that in making a comparison the importance of each contribution would be undermined. This is a very stringent adherence to what feminist researchers claim to do, however. As a researcher, I assert that this is slightly exaggerated and wholly impractical in the field. While the researcher can still value each individual interview as 'intriguing on its own', comparisons will occur throughout the process as these act as prompts during the fieldwork process and also facilitate another of the important 'feminist methodological criteria'. That is the self-reflective component which occurs before, during and after every interaction which I speak of during my fieldwork research.

An in-depth interview is a dialogue between researcher and interviewee, the goal being to elicit rich, detailed material that can be used in analysis.[47] The main instrument of enquiry used to collect data for this thesis has been through the use of in-depth interviews.

---

[46] D'Costa in Ackerly et al, p.147.
[47] J. Loftland and L.H. Loftland, *Analysing Social Settings: A Guide to Qualitative Observation and Analysis*, Third Edition (Wadworth: 1995).

These have allowed for an open and thematic conversation between me, the researcher, and the interviewees from NGOs, civil society and community organisations, governmental offices and councils. Kvale defines the qualitative interview as 'an interview whose purpose is to gather descriptions of the life-world of the interviewee with respect to interpretation of the meaning of the described phenomena'.[48] This entails a low degree of structure imposed by the interviewer, a preponderance of open questions, and a focus on 'specific situations and action sequences in the world of the interviewee',[49] rather than abstractions and general opinions[50]. This description captures the goal of the interviews conducted in Zambia and in Scotland. Of particular importance is the emphasis placed on there being a preponderance of open questions, that is, questions which allow room for the interviewee to lead the interviewer through their experience with a limited degree of interference from the interviewer. This enabled the most accurate and intricate details to be obtained. This is achieved through the use of a standardisation of themes rather than the rigid standardisation of scripted questions but required a great deal of intuitive understanding, empathy, patience and time from the interviewer as it was important to allow the interviewee to feel as through all the information they are provided was of value, and appreciated. Furthermore, it reassured the interviewee that a full and accurate picture was being derived from, rather than imposed upon, the interview as a whole. Thematic standardisation was one of the most important tools as it also allowed for manoeuvre and expansion in and around the themes guiding the interview and discussion.

---

[48] N. King, 'Using Interviews in Qualitative Research ', C. Cassell and G. Symon, *Guide to Qualitative Methods in Organizational Research* (London: SAGE Publications Ltd., 2004), p.11.
[49] Kvale in Cassell and Symon, p.11.
[50] N.King in Cassell and Symon, p.11.

Chapter 2
Conceptualising Actors and Spaces

'Tradition does have claims on us, history does limit us. But moral debate, hence political conflict, can and should arise concerning competing ideals of human existence: these may be debated, rethought, overridden so long as debate makes reference to, and builds upon, a necessary moral foundation.'[51]

Conceptualising civil society

The concept of civil society is complex as it encourages an assessment, and at times a reassessment, of the position of the state in relation to its citizens.[52] Contemporary conceptualisations of civil society, and in particular some feminist accounts, question traditional notions of public and private spheres. It is this feminist assessment of civil society, I argue, that poses the greatest challenge to the very premise of an absolute divide between public and private spheres and the reality of the completely autonomous human being - universally understood. Walzer writes that '[c]ivil society is a project of projects; it requires many organizing strategies and new forms of state action. It requires a new sensitivity for what is local, specific, contingent – and, above all a new recognition (to paraphrase a famous sentence) that the good life is in the details'.[53] This chapter addresses the literature on civil society and provides an account of the idea of the state in terms of its relation to civil society.

---

[51] J.B Elshtain, *Power Trips and Other Journeys: Essays in Feminism as Civic Discourse* (University of Wisconsin Press: 1990), p.321.
[52] S. H. Williams, 'A Feminist Reassessment of Civil Society', Indiana Law Journal: Vol. 72, Issue 2, Article 5 (1997).
[53] M. Walzer, 'A Better Vision: The idea if Civil Society' (1990) in *The Society Reader*, eds. V.A. Hodgkinson and M. W. Foley (University Press of New England: 2003), p.321.

This chapter explores the feminist critiques of accounts and conceptualisations of civil society and concludes that a feminist reassessment is both valuable and necessary in light of its rejection of the idea of the autonomous citizen, a citizen that in reality, it is argued, cannot be. The rejection of the autonomous citizen and the understanding that civil society provides a space for community, group and individual engagement, not in the context of state institutionalism, but rather in that of the public sphere, also provides the background for the introduction of the dialogical space, a space in civil society where communities and groups come together and form non-state organisations which are referred to as non-governmental organisations, NGOs. Civil society is defined in the context of constitutive communities,[54] and an example of these communities, the NGO community, is provided. Here civil society is defined in the context of feminist literature and the dialogical space is conceptualised. This section facilitates the thesis to progress onto defining the NGO, civil society in organisation, the state, and the dialogical space. The following chapter introduces and uses the ethic of care as a lens to view the relationship between the NGOs, constitutive communities in civil society, and the state.

From MacKinnon's claim that 'formally, the state is male in that objectivity is its norm',[55] to Walzer's praise of a relationship between state and civil society where 'ideally civil society is a setting of all settings: all are included, none is preferred',[56] the debate addressing the public and private will be assessed, considering and critiquing the liberal tradition of public and private from a feminist perspective. This assessment and the definitions therein are essential in order to establish a profile of the actors central to this thesis. These actors are civil society, NGOs and the state. The definition of the NGO

---

[54] Williams, p. 440.

[55] C.A MacKinnon, *Toward a Feminist Theory of the State* (Harvard University Press: 1989), p.162.

[56] Walzer, p.313.

community is also provided later in this chapter. Civil society, 'sustained by groups much smaller than the demos or the working class or the mass of consumers or the nation…[where] all these are necessarily fragmented and localized as they are fragmented',[57] is one of the primary focal points for this thesis as it is where NGOs, described here as civil society in organisation, are established and practice. The literature and theory addressing civil society suggests that it has historically emerged in the light of a specific societal issue or dilemma, be that fragmentation, alienation, oppression or the under-representation of a specific community or group.[58] As the case study chapters show, this reaction and thus the establishment of civil society has historically been the case particularly in Zambia, but also in Scotland where civil society groups, such as NGOs, have increased in number and presence, with what can be recognised as an increase in civil society participation through an increase in the size and scope of the public sphere.

As Freud asserts in his analysis of the public and private sphere, there is an inter-relational dynamic between public and private sphere. While he maintains that they are two distinctive entities, he highlights the mutual impact that they have upon one another. Acknowledging this mutual impact Freud draws attention to the growth of one at the expense of the other, asserting that as the public and civil sphere grows the private sphere decreases, bringing to public and civic attention those issues formerly relegated to the abstract private. 'The public and the private spheres have been conceived as distinct components of a whole (society), one sphere can increase only at the expense of the other. But the two continually interact: through these relations, the private can call into question the public and then reshape it, while the public can reorganise (occasionally in an innovative

---

[57] Walzer, p. 321.
[58] Williams, p. 418.

manner) the private sphere in a specific domain, or it can regulate activities of this sphere, by helping them develop or by simply absorbing them.[59]

As will be shown in the later chapters discussing the case studies and their findings, the emergence in civil society of groups traditionally relegated to the private sphere has directly impacted on the content, discourse and power of civil society as an area and mechanism of representation. Civil society as a concept is addressed here in order to build a platform upon which to conceptualise the NGO community and, most importantly, to introduce the dialogical space. This is one of the contributions which this thesis makes to the literature on civil society and more generally to the literature regarding the positioning of an ethic of care in the discipline of International Relations.

For the purposes of this thesis civil society is recognised as present in the public space, yet it also has strong links to the private sphere: ultimately the activity which directly influences and shapes civil society takes place in both the public and private sphere. While the public sphere which is most important for this thesis, it is necessary to acknowledge that the private sphere has an influence on the many interlocking communities and groups which are at the heart of civil society in their nature and posture. As will be discussed, there is much criticism of the binary distinction made in liberal theory concerning the public and private spheres. Conceptions of civil society which are born out of liberal theory present civil society on the one hand as something which is posited in the private sphere to protect group and community engagement and activity from the state. On the other hand, also within a liberalist theoretical tradition, civil society is posited in the public sphere in order to

---

[59] A. Sales, *The Private, the Public and Civil Society: Social Realms and Power Structures, International Political Science Review* (October: 1991), p. 299.

act as a mechanism for representation of group and *communitarian activity which is not private nor governed by the state.*

What is political?

Feminist political theory is characterized by its commitment to expanding the boundaries of the political.[60] Feminist political theory, especially in the context of International Relations, is concerned with power relations that shape women's experiences whether these relations be defined in terms of gender, physical state, race , class , culture or sexuality – each aspect, it claims, is of a political nature and thus demands to be treated as such. Feminist political theory challenges norms regarding self, family and the political status quo and asks questions regarding the position of women, their status and the seemingly natural roles that they assume or are expected to assume. In raising these questions feminist theorists have initiated debates and discussions regarding the power relations that are embedded in normative practices of what are regarded as natural institutions. This section outlines what is meant by 'political' in feminist theory, which is important to ascertain in the wider context of this thesis. This thesis, in line with feminist political theory, challenges the normative nature of the political status quo and seeks to understand if the power relations between NGOs and states can be challenged and redefined.

As will be addressed in the following chapters, and also shown in the field work studies, NGOs are often excluded from the policy process as they are normatively placed in a role which challenges rather than complements state understanding of civil society needs and requirements. Feminist theory, for the purpose of this thesis, facilitates the ability of

---

[60] E. Tucker.

this author to critique the exclusion of NGOs from policy discourse. Here a theory that is more inclusive and reflective of the political can be arrived at with a goal of understanding the experiences and values that are excluded in mainstream IR theories of power and position.

As highlighted by Tucker, feminist political theory is a 'rejection of essentialism, the notion that social categories are unchangeable with essences that map onto given characteristics and inequalities'.[61] The political, for feminist writers, is not static, but rather ever-changing and expanding in nature, richness and in volume of categories. Thus, the most characteristic element of feminist political theory is its commitment to enlarge the scope of the political. The famed slogan of the feminist movement, 'the personal is political' points precisely to where politics are to be unearthed in order to challenge the normative assumption of roles which are predominantly subservient and underrepresented publically. The political, therefore, is in the personal, in the private, in women's everyday experiences of subordination and inequality.[62] The political, in its normative conception, has been an area of reason, public reason to be precise, an arena where social institutions were shaped, questioned and changed. However, as Mansbridge and Okin write, Aristotle defined politics as the affairs of the *polis*, simultaneously defining the household as other, as the sphere of the non-political, and thus a sphere that could not be questioned.[63] This description of the *polis* as exclusively public, and thus distinctive of the private sphere, sets firm boundaries around the nature of what is private. If the public sphere is an area of reason, question and pragmatic change, the private is a subordinate area, unquestioned, unchallenged and unchanged. The power relations in the private sphere are those which, according to feminist

---

[61] Tucker.
[62] Tucker.
[63] Mansbridge and Okin (2007), p.335.

theory, are the most political as these are the relations that shape the experience of women, and therefore political analysis is required. 'Feminist political theorists revealed that the private, rather than a realm structured by nature and benevolent paternalism was structured by unjustified political inequalities.'[64]

Civil society as a social contract

The first conception of civil society is the social contract, a contract between the state and its citizens, originating from social contract theorists Locke and Rousseau,[65] which William describes as 'distinct from the human condition in some hypothetical state of nature. In this version, civil society is fundamentally public and stands in contrast to the essentially private institution of the family, the primary form of social organisation'.[66] Social contract theory regards citizens as a homogenised group, equal in their individuality and need. However, their 'need' as citizens is, and is limited to, the removal of man from the Hobbesian 'state of nature',[67] a state of 'continuall feare, and danger of violent death'.[68] Locke and Rousseau present civil society as a means of taking man out of the state of nature, which is ultimately a state of war. Entering into civil society, out of both a state of nature and the particularities of family life in the private sphere, it is universally the citizen's concern to ensure that the state supports their right to property. Thus the relationship between citizens and the state is purely contractual, with a set of rules and regulations by means of a constitution or recognised a sovereign, which manages expectations and establishes public norms. Those

---

[64] Tucker.

[65] T.P Peardon, ed., J. Locke, *The Second Treatise of Government* (1690) 44, 50 (Liberal Arts Press: 1952); J. Rousseau, 'The Social contract' (1762) in *The essential Rousseau 9* (Lowell Bair: 1974).

[66] Williams, p. 417.

[67] T. Hobbes, *Leviathan*, Chapter 14 (Yale University Press: 2010).

[68] Hobbes, Chapter 14.

without a claim to property have little or no relationship with the state, and the state has little or no obligation to them. Thus, they are silenced in the private sphere as Pateman[69] and Elshtain[70] highlight. Citizens are equal individuals rather than 'very particular and fundamentally unequal members of families'.[71]

The first conception presents family in contrast to, or in tension with, the public sphere, which as Pateman has suggested further relegates women to the private sphere by undermining their labour as mothers and homemakers. This is one of the main focuses of Pateman's work which, taken in a wider feminist context is an analysis of the dichotomy between private and public which in essence, Pateman asserts, is 'what the feminist movement is all about'.[72] The family unit is perceived as emotive and particular rather than objective and universal in its demarcation of equality and justice. Furthermore, it produces bonds which are often unquestionable where objective jurisprudence has neither precedence, nor is applicable in an objective manner. The family is set off from the rest of society as a sphere in which the liberal ideas of equality and liberty are presumed not to apply.[73]

A further problem with this first conception of society is the question of how we arrive at a liberal articulation of the public sphere, community and justice, if we do not acknowledge what is learned in the family unit as we grow and mature into members of civil society. Family is the first community we encounter were we negotiate power relations, understand authority, take on responsibility and obligations, engage in conflict and

---

[69] C. Pateman, *The Disorder of Women: Democracy, Feminism and Political Theory* (Polity Press, Cambridge; 1989), p. 20.
[70] Elshtain, p. 20.
[71] Elshtain, p. 20.
[72] Pateman (1983), p. 281.
[73] Williams, p. 420.

reconciliation, and negotiate our position through an understanding of the contribution we

and other family members make to the establishment and maintenance of the family unit

itself. Some families grow in strength while other family units breakdown or change in ways

that this conception of the family, relegated as it is to the private sphere, cannot

accommodate or deal with effectively.

Okin, theorist in family justice and gender, has highlighted that 'the possibility of

justice in the public sphere is fundamentally dependent on learning and living justice in the

family. If the family – the private sphere of women – is defined as beyond political concern,

the ability to instil a sense of justice in future citizens is seriously compromised.[74] While the

central focus of this thesis and this chapter is not this debate regarding justice, Okin's

critique of liberal theorist John Rawls is important to acknowledge when considering the

inclusion of the family in the conceptualisation of civil society. Okin's analysis of the liberal

public sphere and the authors which she includes in her literature review highlights one of

the central claims of feminist theorists with regard to the liberal conception of civil society,

that liberal political theory, as well as liberal jurisprudence, has been found by many

feminist theorists to be 'male' or 'masculine.'[75] This is also identified in MacKinnon's

rejection of the state, which follows later in this section. Okin, in her critique of Rawl's

Theory of Justice, highlights the way in which Rawls refers to the family unit as an institution

that contributes to the construct of the liberal notion of justice. According to Okin, Rawls

appears to acknowledge the monogamous family as a major social institution which forms

part of the basic structure of society.[76] However, Rawls does not continue to explain the

---

[74] S.M Okin, 'Gender, Justice and Gender: An Unfinished Debate', *Fordham Law Review*, Article 9 Volume 7, Issue 5 (2004), p. 1541.
[75] Okin, pp. 1541-1543.
[76] Okin, p. 1542.

richness of the family as an institution, and how its and teachings impact upon civil society and its location in the public and private sphere. Simply, as highlighted by Okin, Rawls assumes families are *just*[77] and thus negates their relevance and contribution to the forming of civil society and the principles of justice. Okin comes from the feminist perspective that 'the law embodies a masculine perspective in emphasizing autonomy and the individual over interdependency and the community. Liberalism has been viewed as inextricably masculine in its model of separate, atomistic, competing individuals establishing a legal system to pursue their own interests and to protect them from others' interference with their rights to do so. Hence, it is said that liberal, masculine jurisprudence has exalted rights over responsibilities, separateness over connection, and the individual over the community'.[78]

Okin's work undermines this first concept of civil society, as does the analysis of civil society and the NGO community presented in this thesis. Okin's critique of the absence of the family in the conceptualisation of the public sphere supports the claim that it is difficult in both a feminist reassessment of civil society, and also when empirically assessing civil society, to locate a completely autonomous human being. Furthermore, to assert that the family is exempt from civil society and thus only present in the private sphere also creates a false notion of the family unit as something homologous and universal. Thus, this first notion of civil society is rejected by feminist theorists. As in the context of the existing theories of justice, gender and the family have been largely ignored. As Okin asserts, the neglect of the power of the family for the building of civil society and the creation of active

---

[77] Okin, p. 1542.
[78] Okin, citing Linda McClain, '"Atomistic Man" Revisited: Liberalism, Connection, and Feminist Jurisprudence', 65 *S. Cal. L. Rev.* 1171 (1992), pp. 1173-1174. p. 1542.

citizens is unacceptable as it neglects the power and contribution of women. 'Women must be fully included in any satisfactory theory of justice.'[79]

Civil society in the private sphere

The second conceptualisation of civil society represents a contrast with the first conception in terms of its position in the public-private debate. Whereas in the social contract, civil society was created as a public domain, in this second conception of civil society 'public' is read as a synonym for 'government', and therefore anything in the public domain belongs to or is directly controlled by government.[80] An approach to the threat of totalitarianism, civil society as conceptualised by Berger and Neuhaus in their work *'To empower people: the role of mediating structures'*[81], provides an area free from state coercion and interference. Civil society is created as an addition to the private sphere, where individuals have an equal right to property. Berger and Neuhaus' definition of civil society describes the mediating power of something between the state and the citizen: 'those institutions that stand between the private world of individuals and the large impersonal structures of modern society. They 'mediated' by constituting a vehicle by which personal beliefs and values could be transmitted into the mega-institutions. They were thus 'Janus-faced' institutions, facing both 'upward' and 'downward'.[82] This conceptualisation of civil society represents individuals, however, as highlighted by one of the interviewees from Stop Climate Chaos. Essentially the concept of the private citizen is an 'oxymoron' in that individuals, when

---

[79] Okin, p. 1543.
[80] Williams, p. 418.
[81] P. Berger and R. J Neuhaus , *'To Empower the people: the role of mediating structures in public policy'* (1977, *as cited in* Williams, p. 418.
[82] P. L. Berger and R.J Neuhaus, 'Response,' in *To Empower People: From State to Civil Society*, ed. M. Novak (Washington D.C, American Enterprise Institute: 1996), pp. 148-49.

engaging with the state, reap greater representative 'rewards' when acting as a collective: 'voices are louder in concert; agendas are understood as common and thus necessary of attentive action'.[83] This is also further explored in the critique of the third conception of civil society.

Positioning civil society in the private sphere maintains the inviolability of the individual and undermines the position of women by identifying them exclusively with non-governmental concerns belonging to the private, non-state sphere. 'Designating the non-governmental area of the social world as private is advantageous to those who wish to maintain the existing distribution of power, including gender hierarchy. The label and the valorisation of personal freedom that accompanies it, help to immunize institutions like the family from public scrutiny under public norms from regulation'.[84] This is highlighted by Olsen who further warns of the implications of placing civil society private action in reaction to state coercion. While this thesis advocates that there is a place for the private sphere, the main concern is that civil society not be private but public in its location. Olson, in advocating that the state is required to intervene in some situations highlights that gender hierarchy is maintained if the state is completely removed conditionally from civil society. The 'coercion used to maintain gender hierarchies within "private" institutions will not itself be subject to attack under constitutional norms (like equal protection) because the Constitution applies only to action. Second, the designation as private may well lead to

---

[83] Interview with *Scottish Coalition on 'Stop Climate Chaos'* (Edinburgh, February 2010) <http://www.stopclimatechaos.org/scotland> [Accessed February 1st 2010]
[84] F. Olsen, 'Constitutional Law: Feminist Critiques of the Public/Private Distinction'*, Journal of Constitutional Commentary*, Article 10, volume 319 (1993), pp. 320-321.

seeing the coercive action itself as a matter of right protected by the Constitution against state regulation'.[85]

The significance of Olsen's cautionary observations regarding the second conception of civil society is that she highlights that the private sphere is not necessarily a place of freedom but in fact can further coerce those who are unable to fully exercise free will as a citizen in either the public or the private sphere. Often it is not the state per say but the social hierarchy of power that is established and the recognition of who is found therein that is the primary problem for feminism. Olsen, as a feminist theorist, makes particular reference to women and their place in the private sphere as mothers and homemakers, highlighting that the locating of civil society in the private sphere silences them further. For the purposes of this thesis, this is important as it also opens up discourse for the analysis of other ostracised groups who would also face further marginalisation if the complete constitutional privatisation of civil society were to occur. 'The continuing categorization of civil society as "private" in contrast to the government is thus not merely conceptually flawed but also politically pernicious'[86] in that it causes the family unit to be further alienated from, often necessary, public and state scrutiny and further asserts that the family is 'just' by virtue of being a family.

Civil society as constitutive communities

The third conception of civil society comes from communitarian thinking. The premise of this conception of civil society is that 'participation in certain types of communities may lead

---

[85] Olsen *as citied in* Williams, footnote 26, p. 422.
[86] Williams, p. 422.

people to develop an understanding of and a sense of connection to their fellow citizens',[87] placing particular emphasis on the sense of shared connection established, and as Seligman suggests this capacity for understanding and connection exists in all people.[88] This conception of civil society is one in which the private and the public sphere are seen to merge, and it is assumed that identity is shaped by community where a common understanding of self is achieved. This undermines the existence of the autonomous human being which was presented in the second concept as it asserts that identity is shaped in community. Furthermore, this identity is what establishes civil society. The idea of this concept and its revision of civil society is, as Seligman identifies, to highlight and critique the neglect of the idea of civil society as a central concern,[89] the idea of civil society is being revived to provide an answer to the question of how individuals can pursue their own interests while preserving the greater good of society and, similarly, how society can advance the interests of the individuals who comprise it.[90] This concept of civil society thus straddles the divide between the public and the private sphere.

As Williams highlights, 'certain communities so deeply shape their members that they are constitutive of their identities'.[91] While this is true of any community, a meeting of, and connection made between people, can elicit an exchange of ideas and therefore possibly a change in their identities. The specific connection of civil society asserted here goes further in its sense of communality, as Sandel cited by Williams emphasises: 'these communities represent not just what [members] have as fellow citizens but also what they are, not a relationship they choose (as in a voluntary association) but an attachment they

---

[87] Williams, p. 419.
[88] A.B. Seligman, *The Idea of Civil Society* (Princeton University Press: 1992), pp. 25-36.
[89] Seligman, p. 28.
[90] Seligman, p. 26.
[91] Williams, p. 419.

discover, not merely an attribute but a constituent of their identity'. [92] This shared identity is perceived as a useful mechanism through which to achieve a common understanding and empathy among communities. Furthermore such understanding facilitates a removal of barriers and increases understanding between the members of a community, 'thus I can know you, and we can both know the same reality despite our different perspectives, because this knowledge flows from the identity that we share'.[93]

The result of this shared identity is, in theory, the establishment of a firm foundation of knowledge in a moral, political and social sense, granting a uniformity and a clear set of rules and regulations to the civil society established. Furthermore, this shared identity posits our fellow citizens as extended versions of ourselves who we naturally extend care towards. 'I care about you...so I will address you not as a competitor for scarce resources, but as part of the self whose interest we jointly pursue.'[94] Civil society therefore serves as an identity generator, bridging the gap between the public and the private spheres through a shared identity which, as Held describes in her work on *Non-Contractual Society*, can be described as being both free from state coercion and, as it pertains to the particulars of specific communities and is not therefore universal, therefore attaining to the private sphere. Likewise, as they are based upon a concept of shared rather than individual identity all in the contexts of relative equality it is argued that this is in the context of a version of public interest, therefore attaining to the public sphere.[95] As Williams concludes, '[i]ndeed, they

---

[92] Sandel as cited by Williams, p. 419.
[93] Williams, p. 419.
[94] Williams, p. 419.
[95] V. Held, 'Non-contractual Society: A Feminist View', in Weiss and Friedman (eds.), *Feminism and Community* 209, Vol. 222, 1995.

are a kind of existential refutation of the relevance or the importance of the public/private distinction itself.'[96]

The third conception of civil society is important for the significance it places on constitutive communities, communities that collectively produce a form of common and shared identity through the bond and connections fostered between their members. As highlighted by Matsuda, this is very attractive to some feminists because it seems to capture the more connected sense of self that many women experience and that liberal political theory has generally ignored or rejected.[97] However this sense of connection comes at the cost of possibly retreating from the particularity of the citizens' sense of self. While the connection between the private and public spheres is important, the blurring of the public and private spheres can also be problematic. The use of communal forms of civil society which blur lines between the private and public sphere serves as a bridge between one side to the other, rather than reconciling the problems in the institutions which uphold this divide. Rather than assessing the position of women and marginalised groups in both the public and private spheres, and the norms which prevail in each situation, constitutive communities reinforce hierarchical structures and trends. Indeed, the example of the most robust and common communities which are recognised as constitutive communities are those which often reinforce or have been historically held responsible for the establishment of historically oppressive norms as 'agents of oppression towards "outsiders", for example, families rejecting non heterosexual members or neighbourhoods excluding people based on race or ethnicity.'[98] Such communities include socially segregated communities which can

---

[96] Williams, p. 420.

[97] M.J. Mutsuda, *Liberal Jurisprudence and Abstracted Visions of Human Nature: A Feminist Critique of Rawls' Theory of Justice*, as cited by Williams, p. 422.

[98] Williams, p. 423.

be families, religious groups, ideological and geopolitical groups, all of which shows a bias towards historically dominant forms of hierarchical and patriarchal community. Furthermore when considering these example of constitutive communities the idea of choice must also be questioned. As the potential for oppression can be part of the shared identity established in these communities, feminists reject this conceptualisation of civil society: 'this model of community may privilege the accounts and interpretations of those with influence and authority: because of the demand for homogeneity, multiple interpretations become difficult to tolerate'.[99] The shared identity required to construct the communities described here threatens to weaken our sense of empathy and our ability to accept and embrace difference.

The final requirement, one which is central to this thesis, is the need for pluralism in civil society encouraged by constitutive communities, as identified previously and further emphasised here. '[T]he tensions and contradiction between communal norms that generate both the space for criticising our communities and the vocabularies in which to do so. Our membership in multiple communities allows, sometimes even forces us to confront and challenge the assumptions given to us by one of those communities.'[100] As will be shown in the case study chapters, constitutive communities, NGOs, form multiple and overlapping communities in the form of coalitions. Examples that will be discussed in the Scottish case study are 'Stop Climate Chaos'[101] and *The Long Term Conditions Alliance*,[102] umbrella organisations where members choose to join a wider community to share, confront and challenge ideas regarding one common part of their identity, which is their

---

[99] Williams, p.424.
[100] Friedman as cited in Hague, p.246.
[101] http://www.stopclimatechaos.org/ [Accessed 10th May 2010, 12.32 GMT]
[102] http://www.alliance-scotland.org.uk [Accessed 20/1/2011, 18.15 GMT]

work on climate change. This acts as an example of the type of constitutive community described above, one that is formed through narrative autonomy, one that is chosen and one that is plural. Each NGO has the choice to fully participate in some aspects of the group's activities and at other times may choose to me less 'personally' involved. The example of *Stop Climate Chaos* and *The Long Term Conditions Alliance* expanded upon in the Scottish case study chapter, both illustrate that 'insisting on multiple, overlapping communities is one way of incorporating the permanence and value of difference in the foundation of civil society. Because each of us has multiple associations, even within a given community the members will differ in their other associations and communal identities'.[103]

This section has revised literature exploring the concept of civil society and reassessed the main conceptualisations of civil society in order both to arrive at a working, tangible definition and also to consider a feminist perspective on subject. The importance of this was to make sense of the idea of civil society as a public entity, an entity that is pragmatic and inclusive and also accessible to a multiplicity of groups. The definition of civil society arrived at here is one which is based upon the formative processes associated with constitutive communities, those who embrace a plurality of perspectives and encourage the narrative autonomy of their members. This section has helped to identify the civil sphere and civil society as an array of projects within projects. The next section introduces one example of civil society group, the NGO, and then the dialogical space which is where civil society groups can meet, discuss and appreciate their similarities and differences. The chapter which follows makes sense of the actors and spaces defined here, it assesses their interaction through the lens on of an ethic of care. After defining the dialogical space, a

---

[103] M. Friedman, 'Feminism and Modern Friendship: Dislocating the Community', *Journal of Ethics* (1989), p.206.

space where civil society and the state can meet, converse and exchange experiences, perspectives and ideas, the utilisation or lack of utilisation of the dialogical space is described through the case study examples.

The NGO: civil society in organisation

This section provides an example of a constitutive community, the NGO, a community which members have joined asserting their narrative autonomy. The NGO, present in the civil sphere is identified as civil society in organisation by this author. The focus on NGOs is due to the nature of the thesis and the research conducted addressing the local and national NGO community in Scotland and Zambia. As will be described, the NGO as a singular entity is made up of members of civil society who have chosen to work together on a particular issue or project due to shared philosophy, outlook or belief. These individuals are seeking to promote change, raise awareness, or change the nature of representation of an issue or group. This section defines the NGO for the purpose of this thesis in the context of the research findings.

The term NGO, the universally recognised abbreviation of Non-Governmental Organisations, has been used as a normative term since the end of the Second World War and the introduction of the United Nations (UN) Charter adopted in 1945.[104] As stipulated in Article 71, NGOs were officially recognised in their consultative capacity and worth to the UN in the years preceding the devastating experience of the second world war.[105] While non-governmental organisations were not new in their existence, ethos and work, this

---

[104] *Charter of the United Nations and Statute of the International Court of Justice* (San Francisco, 1945), https://treaties.un.org/doc/publication/ctc/uncharter.pdf [Accessed 1ST March 2012; 12.03 GMT]
[105] UN Charter, Article 71.

official recognition of their consultative capacity to the UN was one of the initial steps

towards the recognition of the value of their knowledge, practice and capacity to facilitate

the delivery of vital agency, voice and recognition to those communities at the periphery of,

or expelled from, the political domain. Initially, due to the recognition and endorsement by

the UN, academia and political institutions directly assimilated the term NGO only to those

groups directly engaging with the UN. However, in contemporary discourse the term NGO

has become broadly used to describe societal groups and actors working independently of

the UN framework at both an international and national, localised level.[106]

While its breadth can be somewhat contentious, the term NGO is widely recognised

and used to distinguish in a legal sense societal organisations made up of civil society

communities from the state and profitable organisations that have a specific political

agenda. NGO Monitor defines NGOs as 'autonomous non-profit and non-party/politically-

unaffiliated organizations that advance a particular cause or set of causes in the public

interest. The range of causes on which an NGO can focus is unlimited, but a cardinal

principle is that NGOs operate in a manner consistent with the objectives for which they

receive funds'.[107] This description is one which is reiterated at the national and international

level and highlights due diligence, in terms of organisational objectives, concerning the use

and generation of funds.[108] However, this is the juridical definition of the NGO and while it is

important to highlight it as such, the legal interpretation is much more stringent and less

open to interpretation than the sociological depiction of the community.[109]

---

[106] See S. Ahmed and D.M. Porter, 'NGOs in International Politics' (Kumarian Press, Inc., USA: 2006).

[107] *What is an NGO?* ,NGO Monitor, http://www.ngo-monitor.org/article/what_is_an_ngo_ [Accessed March 2 2010]

[108] See *European Convention on the Recognition of the Legal Personality of International Non-Governmental Organisations* ; http://conventions.coe.int/Treaty/en/Reports/html/124.htm [Accessed 20 December 2013]

[109] See Hilhorst.

The sociological interpretation of the NGO community provides a much more pragmatic, nuanced and critical analysis of what is often regarded as a homogenous and transnational community. 'With rare exceptions, the social sciences, as reinforced by UNESCO (which has a mandate in this area), have never been able to treat nongovernmental organizations as a phenomenon in their own right. Consequently, there is no sense of the variety of organizations falling under this label or of the complex social (eco)system which they constitute. Ironically most of the social sciences are admirably represented through a whole range of international NGOs reflecting their various disciplinary concerns. Such bodies have never considered the social function or setting of what they are.'[110]

What is in a name?

Due to the vague juridical definition of NGOs partnered with an equally vague sociological definition, NGOs are often cited in a negative fashion as 'anti-government'.[111] In some countries, the term NGO is even translated as 'against the government'. In Chinese, for example, NGO is translated as 'anti-government'.[112] Therefore, discourse has considered and argued that the term NGO should be substituted by a more positive label.[113] Scholars such as Brett, Weisberg and Meyers suggest that if the acronym NGO cannot be abandoned, it should be given new positive content: NGO could therefore stand for 'Necessary to Governance Organization'.[114] However, changing the content of the acronym does not

---

[110]A Judge, *NGOs and Civil Society: Union of International Associations* (December 1994) https://www.globalpolicy.org/component/content/article/177/31597.html [Accessed 21st December 2013]
[111] R. Brett, '*The role and limits of human rights NGOs at the United Nations*'.,*Political Studies 43* (1995) 9, p. 96.
[112] Brett, p. 96.
[113]H. Weyers, 'Co-operation between non-governmental volunteer services and the United Nations Volunteer Programme', *The International Journal of Comparative Sociology*, Volume 21 (1980), p. 228.
[114] Martens, p. 278.

necessarily give any clearer a definition of NGO be it 'non' or 'necessary' governmental organisation.

General juridical labels not only act as mere symbolic recognition but they also mask diversity and attach vague generality to what is a heterogeneous community who are assumed to be similar due to the legal status they have 'in common'.[115] Rather than being organisations that have their own localised and specific particularities, much of the knowledge base presented aims to construct a list of characteristics which are common to all, but applicable to very few. Furthermore, and most critically, due to the difficulty of assigning a clear and accurate description of the NGO community as a phenomenon, the term NGO has been criticized for being the 'rubbish bin' or 'catch-all word' for everything that is simply not governmental,[116] which further undermines its reputation and also acts as a barrier to furthering the discourse and understanding of the significant role that NGOs offer in their differing capacities and expertise.

While the juridical definition of non-governmental organisation does little to aid the understanding of their actions, equally, other attempts to define NGOs have failed to capture, adequately and positively, the rich diversity of the NGO. For example, a 'non-governmental organization (NGO) is any non-profit, voluntary citizens' group which is organized on a local, national or international level'.[117] Given the diversity not only found between NGOs themselves, but also the diversity of focus, be it local, national, transnational, international, the issue is that the same general label is applied to all, a label which tends to paint the community as unorganised representative groups, existing and

---

[115] Hilhorst, p.8.
[116] Martens, p.278.
[117] 'Defining an NGO', http://www.ngo.org/ngoinfo/define.html, [Accessed November 2012]

establishing themselves in an ad-hoc manner, dissolved quickly and, most crucially for this

thesis, lacking expertise and sustainable forward planning. This is also reiterated by Princen

and Finger who highlight how difficult it is to characterise the community for both legal and

scholarly communities alike. 'The difficulty of characterizing the entire phenomenon results

in large part from the tremendous diversity found in the global NGO community. That

diversity derives from differences in size, duration, range and scope of activities, ideologies,

cultural background, organizational culture, and legal status'.[118]

As a result of the debate regarding the applicability of the term NGO, scholars such

as Judge, Pricen, Finger and Willetts do not necessarily attempt to define what an NGO *is*

but rather what an NGO *is not*, and in doing so to reiterate how difficult is the task of

defining an NGO. Willetts prefers therefore to describe NGOs as 'any non-profit-making,

non-violent, organized group of people who are not seeking governmental office'.[119] This is

also considered by Judge who considers a re-thinking of the name. 'But if it is impossible to

abandon the initials "NGO", perhaps it is possible the reframe their significance in a more

positive light. One candidate might be "Necessary Governance Organizations" (in French

"Organisations Necessaires í la Gouvernance" (ONGs)). The corresponding reframing of

"IGO" might then be "Insufficient Governance Organizations" (which again is better in

French as "Organisations insuffisantes pour la gouvernance")'.[120] Whereas Schnoener

asserts that, '[f]irst and foremost, local NGOs should be regarded in terms of the self-

designated objectives they pursue'.[121] While this pre-empts the futility of generalisation,

---

[118] T. Princen, M. Finger, 'Environmental NGOs in World Politics: Linking the Local and the Global', (London, Routledge: 1994), p. 165.
[119] P. Willetts (ed.), *"The Conscience of the World". The Influence of Non-Governmental Organisations in the UN System* (London, Hurst: 1996), p. 6.
[120] Judge, Section 5.
[121] W. Schoener, 'Non-governmental organizations and global activism: Legal and informal approaches', *Global Legal Studies* (1997) Journal 4: 537-569, p. 538.

NGOs in terms of their focus have generalizable characteristics - a self-centred bias, an ethos to serve, and, as will be shown here, they also embody an ethic of care further strengthened as a result of their proximity and relationship with those they are representing.

While scholars such as Mawlawski highlight that there is a shared and combined direction in terms of 'skills, means, and energies in the service of shared ideals',[122] he describes those who are working for these organisations as 'activists'[123] which is a serious point of contention within the sector. By labelling those working for NGOs as 'activists' social stigma and negative connotations regarding their approach to work, professional conduct and expertise is guaranteed from both inside and outside of these organisations. As expressed by the interviewees, especially those in Scotland, the negative connotations of the term activist is not so much about vanity, rather it is about its implications for access: access to Ministers, meetings, parliament, and also being taken seriously by the wider community.[124] Much the same as 'feminist' is regarded as a 'dirty word',[125] 'activist' in mainstream discourse is also regarded as a 'dirty word' and conjures up, from the perception of both accuser and accused, ideas of non-professionalised, *ad hoc* societal groups, reactionary in their nature with little in terms of an organised, robust and sustainable developmental focus. Another term associated with NGOs is 'voluntary organisations'.[126] This is also rejected by some who work in the sector as professionals, as

---

[122] F. Mawlawski, 'The evolving role of non-governmental actors' *Journal of International Affairs*, Volume 46 (1993), p. 392.
[123] Mawlawski, p. 392.
[124] Jackie Purves, International Voluntary Organisation, Scotland, http://ivsgb.org/info/ [Interview, April 2010]
[125] Martens, p. 280.
[126] Judge, Section 4.

they feel that they are being undermined in their professionalism as people who engage for idealist purposes and 'good' causes in their free time.[127]

Such discourse frustrates NGO workers as it undermines the value of the work which is carried out professionally and by experts trained in the specific area which the particular NGO seeks to represent. NGOs are referred to as 'civil society in organisation' because, as will be outlined here, the NGO, while being a civil society community on many occasions, takes on the posture of a professional organisation.[128] They are accountable to their members, appoint boards of directors, apply for funding which requires recognition from professional bodies, often have a constitution or mission statement, and have a recognised duty of care towards their members, stakeholders and recipients.[129] NGOs are not just groups of likeminded people in the public sphere, they are more organised in their approach and format, and also in the way in which they command their business and activity. Furthermore, as highlighted by this thesis and the research conducted, NGOs are often regarded as mere interest or pressure groups and, as will be shown, NGOs are not given the recognition that they deserve for their professional approach to civil society issues and concerns. Thus by recognising the NGO community as groups of civil society in organisation, this author seeks to emphasise and show that the NGO community should also be recognised for its organisation, skill set and expertise, which is usually overlooked or underplayed. The NGO groups in Scotland and Zambia, interviewed and observed during the research process, were inclusive groups of citizens and represented a multiplicity of ideas, perspectives and causes, but did so in a professional and focused manner. These were not pressure groups but organisations in and of themselves. NGOs, in short, are more organised

---

[127] Martens, p. 280.
[128] Judge, Section 6 and Conclusion.
[129] Judge, Section 6.

and are less *ad hoc* than many civil society interest groups. While many NGOs have their roots in the social movement domain, as formerly unstable groups which have gradually developed permanent structures,[130] the criterion 'organisation' distinguishes NGOs from spontaneous forces or movements.[131] It is due to such organisation that NGOs as groups distinguish themselves from activist groups who, in terms of collective action, are more likely to act spontaneously and sporadically. In the interviews NGO workers specifically sought to distinguish themselves from activists and while they did this sensitively, understanding that activist groups have a role to play in the democratic process, they, as emphasised by Gorenker and Weiss, do not want to be, and should not be, categorised as *ad hoc* entities, as they are in fact marked by a certain durability.[132]

Traditionally NGOs were commonly referred to as philanthropic organisations and assumed a role as instruments to meet community needs, defend interests or promote new policies.[133] Currently, at the international level thousands of these organisations are active and according to estimates some 25,000[134] now qualify as international NGOs, which leaves to the imagination the possibility of how many NGOs there are at the local level only. The variety, size, location and focus of the NGO community continues to increase in diversity and expertise. NGOs have developed their organisational capacity and are recognised as professional, accountable and respected vehicles of change and representation.[135]

During the Scottish fieldwork study the NGO staff interviewed were from local NGOs with a local focus dealing with issues that were on the agenda for Scottish civil society.

---

[130] Martens, p. 281.
[131] Martens, p. 281.
[132] T.G. Weiss, L. Gordenker, eds., *NGOs, the UN, and Global Governance* (Political Science: 1996), p. 289.
[133] Judge, 'Introduction'.
[134] According to UN official statistics, 2010, http://www.ngo.in/united-nations.html
[135] Shelley Gray interview.

Examples of such local NGO communities were intercity unemployed youth; environmental groups; mental health awareness groups; and a vast array of community focus NGOs. Many of the NGOs interviewed acted in coalition to increase access and opportunity to education, health and welfare provisions. The Zambian NGOs, mostly local Lusakan NGOs, reported that they were mostly dealing specifically with issues that had failed to become part of the governmental representative agenda at a state, provincial and council level. The research presented here focuses specifically on local level NGOs, NGOs working directly with and for the community that they represent. Furthermore the majority of NGO personnel interviewed, in both Scotland and Zambia, had a vested interest in the organisation, be that through their own experience as an unrepresented citizen or through another personal connection. Such a connection, the personal relativity, is a central component of local NGOs, indicative of a constitutive community which encourages autonomous narrative from its members.

The changing role of NGOs

The changing role of NGOs is due to their increasing interaction with the state, as well as a broadening of the normative understanding of their value in the political sphere by the discipline of IR and its associated disciplines. While as highlighted by Ahmed and Potter, 'the crucial problem in studying NGOs within the framework of International Relations is that they organise for action in ways that are not readily seen in traditional political science terms',[136] the discipline has also manoeuvred in a way that power is appreciated in the form of transnationalism, which facilitates a means through which we understand that 'effective

---

[136] Ahmed and Potter, p.11.

power is increasingly being organised in a non-hierarchical manner'.[137] Furthermore an emphasis on constructivism and the value of the knowledge derived from this approach to research also has the potential to help clarify the place and activity of NGOs in local and international politics, 'this approach to international politics argues that interests, identities and roles are socially defined'.[138]

The significance of the NGO as both a transnational and non-state actor has garnered much attention and inquiry. Lawson highlights change not only in the role of NGOs but also in other societal spaces, but instead of highlighting how states handle such change he highlights how states pursue a resilient posture: 'international public opinion, transnational NGOs, and revolutions in telecommunications and the mass media have all begun to erode the traditional boundaries and prerogatives' such that '[g]overnments worry that these additions will slowly force change to the political system, and this often causes official actors to resist cooperation with NGOs'.[139] Lawson's emphasis on the change of public opinion is also discussed by Price who implicitly alludes to the idea of the NGO community having limited *actual* power due to the reluctance of the state to incorporate their involvement, whether direct or in some cases tacit, in the policymaking process. What Lawson and Price allude to is an absence of a dialogical space which is, as discussed in this thesis, the space where the state and the NGO engage and converse, well aware of their respective biases and responsibilities to civil society. Price however, like Lawson, continues the trend of the NGO versus the state embedded in the early and emerging discourse about NGO and state engagement highlighting a very close relationship between the NGO and public society in contrast to the tense relationship between the transnational NGO and the

---

[137] Weiss and Jacobsen as cited in Ahmed and Potter, p.13.
[138] Ahmed and Potter, p. 13.
[139] Lawson in Fitzduff and Church, p. 10.

state: '…the greater freedom NGOs enjoy often means that they can mobilize public or media opinion in a way that governments and IGOs cannot, and such access decreases the capacity of the state to monopolize information and increases the power of the NGOs to create pressure on governments'.[140]

So, what is an NGO? Or, how '"NGO-ing" is done'[141]

The previous sections have shown how difficult it is to arrive at one single definition of the NGO community. While this is problematic for discourse as competing and sometimes contradictory definitions are presented, it reinforces the definition presented here that the NGO community is but one example of a constitutive community in civil society. An NGO is an example of a constitutive community which has been established through autonomous narrative, recognised as civil society in organisation. The literature assessed in the sections above has defined NGOs as an entity in an attempt to provide a structured overview of these organisations and how they are defined juridical, internationally and in academic discourse. However, what these attempts at definition lack is the voices of the NGO community who can and do define themselves in the context of the work they do, the constitutive communities they identify as, and with the impact they have on civil society and the state. 'Rather than taking organisations at face value, we have to ask and observe how the claims and performances of NGOs acquire meaning in practice. NGOs are not things, but

---

[140] Price in Fitzduff and Church, p.10.
[141] D.Hilhorst, *'The Real World of NGOs: Discourse, Diversity and Development'* (Zed Books: 2003), p. 5.

processes and instead of asking what an NGO is, the more appropriate question then becomes how "NGO-ing" is done.'[142]

There is a trend in NGO literature to define and classify NGOs along a number of static dimensions however little attention is paid to the everyday work which defines NGOs. This is what Hilhorst describes as 'NGO-ing'. In her work she explicitly appeals to the need to study their everyday practices in order to establish a greater understanding of 'the real world of NGOs', as per the title of her book. This is adopted here in order to establish an understanding of the NGO communities, in Scotland and in Zambia. In adopting Hilhorst's method of examining NGO-ing, 'we must observe the way NGO actors deal with NGO-ing…focusing on the linkages and networks that develop between individuals or parties at points where different, and often conflicting , life worlds or social fields intersect, such as in interactions between different stakeholders of NGOs'.[143]

This final section seeks to detail what an NGO came to be recognised as by me, the researcher, as defined by NGO workers themselves during the fieldwork process. As advocated by Law, 'we should abandon a correspondence theory of representation. Instead of asking ourselves whether a representation corresponds to reality, we should be concerned with the workability and legitimacy of a representation'.[144] Through describing the knowledge gained by engaging directly with these organisations, their workers, their recipients and their supporters the aim here is to provide a partial yet empirically grounded account of what NGO-ing is.

---

[142] Hilhorst, p. 5.
[143] Hilhorst, pp. 213-214.
[144] J. Law, *Organizing Modernity* (Blackwell Publications: 1994), p. 26.

NGO workers were asked an unambiguous question, 'What is an NGO?', and below

are four examples of their responses. This shows how NGO communities describe

themselves, and how they describe and perceive their community.

> *Michael Marra, Oxfam Scotland; 'The fundamental tenants of the organization really, and all this is set down in mission statements, is to overcome suffering and poverty by working with others, so in that respect its a very much kinda* [sic] *a partnership way for people to be seen from the top, so its not, its not, it shouldn't be seen to be a kind of a top down kind of relationship it should be driven by need but it should be working in partnership with people'.*[145]

> *Gillian Morgan, NIDOS; 'I think the main role of an NGO is to support advocacy for changing policies or for improving civic participation in some way and I think NGO's are doing that and they may do both… as well as provide a mechanism for civil society to put forward to advocate for themselves'.*[146]

> *Jackie Purves, IVS Scotland; 'we're a NGO not a government organization, so it was called International Voluntary Service and it's been going since 1931 and its worked its way over this time solidly on promoting inter-cultural and disbanding, working on the basis that if there is more understanding between people there will be less conflict. And you know, so we can sort of live together in a more ideal world, of mutual respect. And we use volunteer projects as a forum for bringing people together to get to know each other'.*[147]

> *Joyce Kamboni, Fountain of Hope Zambia, 'we are a group of people who recognise that children in Lusaka need somewhere they can call home. We work to provide a voice and place in Zambia for young children who are orphans to grow into strong and happy adults. As an NGO we are independent of government ruling but have to account for our action to donor communities, I think this is what all NGOs in Zambia should be doing…'* [148]

This section has shown that NGOs identify themselves as independent from government

and as representative of their constitutive communities. They are sensitive to diversity and

show a narrative appreciation of their community in their approach to working and

---

[145] Micheal Marra, Oxfam Scotland http://www.oxfam.org.uk/scotland/, Interview [9th May 2010]
[146] Gillian Morgan, NIDOS http://www.nidos.org.uk/, Interview [March, 2010]
[147] Jackie Purves, IVS Scotland , http://ivsgb.org/info/, Interview [May ,2010]
[148] Joyce Kamboni, Fountain of Hope Zambia, http://www.fountainofhope.org.uk/index, Interview [July 2010]

promoting their community cause. Furthermore these self-defining statements also highlight the diversity in scope, cause and context in which NGO communities are found. Thus, arriving at one definition of the NGO community serves to undermine their plurality and richness as a result. Just as it is difficult to arrive at one universal definition of civil society so too is it difficult to statically define the NGO community, it too is a project of projects.

Where and what is the state?

The definition of the state provided here is in the context of the case studies which are both situated in democratic states. Thus, while there are competing articulations of the democratic state, it is important to remain consistent for conceptual clarity.

The conceptualisation of the state began in the section dealing with the conceptualisation of civil societies. While civil society and subsequently the NGO communities have been characterised as non-governmental, in that they are not constructs of the state but rather constructs of constitutive communities, they are still exercising and are under the legal jurisdiction of the state in which they are in. Witness Weber's definition of the state as 'a human community that claims the monopoly of the legitimate use of physical force within a given territory'.[149] Violence, as articulated here is not through the means of physical violence but rather institutionalised violence through imprisonment of citizens for criminal activity. Thus in retaining the power of violence the state is central to the location of civil society groups.

---

[149] M. Weber (1958), p.78. As citied in D. Beetham, *Max Weber and the Theory of Modern Politics*, (Polity Press).

The concept of the state for the purpose of this thesis is the democratic state, as found in Scotland and Zambia, one that is elected democratically by enfranchised citizens through a process of free and fair elections. The significance of this is that it facilities the conditions necessary for the establishment of a vibrant and plural civil society. Civil society is established due to the fact that the state protects and enables societal relations to develop autonomously from the state,[150] thus allowing the creation of a public and private sphere of activity, commerce and community.

Brinkerhoff argues that democratic governance combines features of a political regime in which citizens hold the right to govern themselves, democratically, with structures and mechanisms that are used to manage public affairs according to accepted rules, procedures and governance.[151] In defining democratic governance Brinkerhoff defines the state as a set of institutions which assure meaningful competition among broad participation in the choice of leaders and policies, and in the allocation of societal resources; and a high degree of civil, political, and economic liberties.[152]

Democratic states as described here through their duty both to protect and also to punish citizens, have a role in the managing, limiting and changing of powers enjoyed by civil society. The state achieves this through setting boundaries and also through recognising different statuses of citizens. Under democratic circumstances, however, states protect civil society groups including those who are established to challenge state policy. As discussed by Habermas, a 'democratic state is protective of normative discourse within society, because

---

[150] J. Cohen and A. Arato, *Civil Society and Political Theory* (MIT Press: 1992), p. 342.
[151] D. W, Brinkerhoff, 'Assessing political will for anti-corruption efforts: an analytic framework', *Journal of Public Administration and Development*, Public Admin. Dev. Vol 20, Issue 3, p. 602.
[152] Brinkerhoof, p. 600.

this is the source of the people's voice, will, and preferences which, ideally, are transmitted through democratic institutions and transformed into legitimate state power'.[153]

Mackinnon presents a critical assessment and rejection of the state asserting that '[f]eminism has no theory of the state'.[154] She argues that feminism will not conform to the traditional notion of the state as, in its current form, it is 'a theory of social determination specific to sex. As a result, it lacks a jurisprudence, that is, a theory of the substance of law, its relation to society, and the relationship between the two'.[155] Mackinnon's critique of the state from a feminist perspective could also be used to describe an experience where '[w]omen [NGOs] implicitly become an interest group within pluralism, with specific problems of mobilisation and representation, exit and voice, sustaining incremental gains and losses'.[156] However in the context of the case studies, the understanding of the state and its position of power must be recognised in order to fully appreciate the reality of the state in Scotland and Zambia.

The dialogical space

'When the ethics of care is located within such a notion of citizenship , discursive space is created for carers to bring their expertise and moral considerations into public debates without being associated with a fixed caring identity or with associated claims to moral truth or moral goodness'.[157]

---

[153]J. Habermas, *Between Facts and Norms: Contributions to a Discourse Theory of Law and Democracy* (MIT Press: 1996).
[154] MacKinnon, p. 157.
[155] MacKinnon, p, 159.
[156] MacKinnon, p. 160.
[157]Sevenhuijsen, p. 15.

The dialogical space is pivotal not only in what it facilitates in terms of dialogue but also in its provision of a space where the ethic of care can be nurtured, as will be explored in the following chapter on the Ethic of Care, on the understanding that 'the task of offering dialogic civility as a public narrative or common ground for interpersonal communication is not an effort without risk'.[158] The use of 'narrative' as described by Fraser is similar to the use of the dialogical space and is tied to, as Fraser observes, Arnett's 'humble narrative'. While a humble narrative does not dictate the way to approach a situation, it at least offers a background set of assumptions agreed upon by enough people to permit it to influence everyday perception and actions.[159] Thus the ethic of care is nurtured in dialogical spaces as they create an environment conducive to learning and, as Fraser highlights, '[c]ommon sense is founded within a human community – we learn what we practice'.[160]

The dialogical space emerged through the interview process as the key area where NGOs and the state, particularly in the Scottish case study, had the opportunity to meet and learn from each other's expertise. Defined here as the 'dialogical space' because it was consistently referred to as a situation that provided more than just a meeting place and a common theme on the invitation that brought the participants together, the dialogical space is recognised as such because of the following attributes it was described as having by the interviewees. Participation was voluntary and this voluntary involvement was applicable to both NGO and state representatives. As a result there are no fixed or specifically designated meeting places, meetings could therefore take place in a multitude of different areas, arenas and locations. Each party, NGO, individual or elected representative from government, was welcome to arrive with or without an agenda and mandate. Equally, all

---

[158] Fraser, p.52.
[159] Fraser, p.52.
[160] Fraser, p.54.

those involved have a stake in the proceedings and contribute to the agenda as they see applicable and necessary. In these dialogical spaces, there is an understanding that all those involved in the exchange are doing so with their own biases and particular group in mind. Ultimately, the shared aim is to open up and make readily available the knowledge each party has, and to further contribute to the issue and its understanding or resolution.

As will be shown and unpacked in the following chapter, the dialogical space can be analysed through the lens of an ethic of care as it is characterised by the same principles; it is built upon an understanding of attentiveness, narrative, communication, open biases towards representative groups and policy direction. Thus, defining the conditions of the dialogical space is key to understanding the ethic of care as this is where the ethic is posited.

The positive contribution that the dialogical space makes to the outcome of policy, and the perception which states have of the NGO community, is based upon an idea of common ground and mutual understanding; the dialogical space further emphasises the richness of autonomous narrative in constitutive communities. 'This is not to say that successful impact necessarily means that the desired policy of the NGOs will be fully adopted, but it does mean one can perhaps be influential in the process without totally determining the final outcome.'[161] While it may be challenged that the dialogical space and constitutive communities are one and the same, the difference is outlined here. As defined in the chapter addressing the conceptualisation of civil society, civil society is made up of many constitutive communities who have varying forms and degrees of shared identities that bring these communities together; through the establishment of constitutive communities civil society is formed. Only after civil society is formed can a dialogical space

---

[161] Fitzduff and Church, p.6.

then be established. The dialogical space is where organisations made up of civil society, such as NGOs, or those representing civil society, such as the state, meet to discuss and share ideas. The dialogical space is located in the public sphere and is part of civil society, although it must be recognised by all parties involved, which includes the state. Individuals also participate in the dialogical space. However, this is due to their concern regarding a matter of civil society interest, which of course will also be personal, but nonetheless is in the public domain. Such individuals are also seeking to further publicise their concern and to gain more public support. As such civil society must be established before a dialogical space can explored. The dialogical space was identified by the NGO workers interviewed as follows.

'A space for open dialogue.'[162]

'Room to talk, share, explore and of course disagree.'[163]

'Understanding that this room was where we could be as we are and learn from   each other.' [164]

'Great places to learn and share ideas, Ministers and NGO types, community representative, you know, all the people involved, it get much more done than a string of emails here and there could ever be imagined as achieving.'[165]

Within the dialogical space it is recognised that there is a common ground shared by both the state and the NGO. This common ground, their interest in civil society, is pivotal in the formulation of policy which is accurately representative of the community.[166] It acts as a place of convergence, discussion, exchange of ideas and the utilisation of specific expertise – this is where policy is nurtured to be representative of the needs of the constituents who

---

[162] Kevin Dunion Freedom of Information Commissioner, Scotland, interview, January 2010.
[163] Shelley Gray, Long term Conditions Alliance, interview, March 2010.
[164] Gray interview.
[165] Agnes, Coalition for Stop Climate Chaos, interview May 2010.
[166] See Williams.

are simultaneously represented by both the state and the NGO. Where the dialogical space is not utilised a number of problems arise and indeed, absence of the dialogical space results in the misrepresentation of need and, most importantly, the formulation of a policy that does not benefit, but serves to undermine, the population. When the NGO and the state fail in their duty to communicate with one another, assumptions are made about responsibility, action and the execution of tasks and policy.

Fraser, as part of his work on the public sphere alludes to the absence of dialogical space in his critique of the modern liberal conception of the public sphere: 'the idea of the public sphere is a valuable conceptual resource for contemporary critical theory. It designates a theatre in modern societies in which the political participation is enacted through the medium of talk'.[167] Fraser addressed the absence of 'talk' in his critique of the modern liberal public sphere and then identifies three areas that are problematic in the current institutionalised arena where discursive action is missing. The three problematic areas identified by Fraser are outlined here and in the context of this thesis are used to further support the need for the utilisation of the dialogical space. Fraser identifies that, in the absence of dialogue or 'talk', there is an assumption made 'that it is possible for interlocutors in the public sphere to bracket status differentials "as if" they were social equals'.[168] This leads to the assumptions, therefore, 'that social equality is not a necessary condition for political democracy'[169] and subsequently 'that the proliferation of a multiplicity of competing publics   is necessarily a step away from, rather than toward, greater democracy, and that a single, comprehensive public sphere is always preferable to a

---

[167] N. Fraser, 'Politics, culture, and the public sphere : toward a post-modern conception' in L. Nicholson and S. Seidman, eds., *Social Postmodernism: Beyond Identity Politics* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press: 1995), p.287.
[168] Fraser, p.288.
[169] Fraser, p.288.

nexus of multiple publics'.[170] The assumption is that discourse in public spheres should be restricted to deliberation about the common good, and that the appearance of 'private interests' and 'private issues' is always undesirable.[171] What Fraser offers is a defence of the civil society and the dialogical space as he highlights that it not enough just to acknowledge that civil society exists but it is equally as, if not more, important that it be engaged and conversed with. It is dangerous to simply acknowledge rather than incorporate it as, it is only through their 'participatory parity'[172] that social inequalities can be worked on.

Fraser's critique can be regarded as a cautionary note for those addressing the importance of civil society, and subsequently the dialogical space. It is not enough, he asserts, to legally acknowledge these groups as 'the transformation of "I" into "we" brought about through political deliberation can easily mask subtle forms of control'.[173] This is true of the political situation witnessed in Zambia in the early 1990s, which continued and intensified into the contemporary political scene, when a two-party system was constitutionally acknowledged and 'introduced' as part of a democratisation of the formerly one-party state. However, steps towards plurality in terms of the official recognition of a multiplicity of political parties, and by default of such a multiplicity of political communities, was, as Fraser would describe it, an example of when 'deliberation can mask domination', the result being the marginalisation of the contributions of subordinated groups as they were then masked under one label, public and civil society. This is as a result of there being only one recognised public sphere, a homogenous group named 'public' or 'civil society' or 'NGOs' and by recognising these groups as homogenous 'the social inequalities among the

---

170 Fraser, p.288.
171 Fraser, p.288.
172 Fraser, p.289.
173 Fraser, p.289.

interlocutors are not in fact eliminated, but only bracketed, held in suspense and supposedly rendered inoperative'.[174]

Fraser reinforces the requirement that the plurality of the public must not only be acknowledged but embraced in a practical manner through participatory parity and 'that participatory parity requires not merely the bracketing but, rather the elimination, of systematic inequalities'.[175] Furthermore, in acknowledging that bracketing, namely labelling, civil society serves merely as an aesthetic acknowledgment, Fraser shows that a 'multiplicity of mutually contestatory publics'[176] is preferable to a single modern public sphere. While recognised as a postmodern account and solution, it is shown here that Fraser's work on the public sphere has significant contemporary practical relevance and that it allows the countenance not of the exclusion, but of the inclusion, of interests and issues that are traditionally labelled 'private' and treated as inadmissible.[177]

Summary of the dialogical space

This section has addressed and defined the dialogical space, which is the main contribution of this thesis to the literature on civil society. This chapter began with a review of definitions of civil society as multidimensional as well as diverse in its make up, as a plural entity consisting of constitutive communities. The dialogical space is but one of the many dimensions of civil society and it plays a role in the shaping of the experience, representation and identity of the citizen and the constitutive communities which they form and choose to become involved in. The creation and utilisation of dialogical spaces is key for

---

[174] Fraser, p.289.
[175] Fraser, p.294.
[176] Fraser, p.295.
[177] Fraser, p.295.

civil society to engage and hold a dialogue with the state as it is a space which is defined by attentiveness, narrative, communication, and open biases, as described by the interviewees. It is this description which encapsulates the ethic of care, explored in the next chapter in the context of the dialogical space. The dialogical space is characterised by an ethic of care and thus facilities its nurturing in the space, a space where lessons are learned by the participating parties, as will be shown in the case studies exploring the NGO communities in Scotland and in Zambia.

Chapter 3
An Ethic of Care

'…because it rejects indifference to social consequences of actions and decisions, an ethic of care can provide valuable guidance for governments and social institutions to create more humane, effective, and robust social policies.'[178]

An Ethic of Care

This chapter provides a review of the literature on the 'ethic of care' in order to contextualise its use as a lens to analyse the relationship between the NGO and the state in the dialogical space. As will be shown, the NGO in its relationship with its care recipients, espouses an ethic of care which describes the nature of their relationship. Present in the dialogical space, the ethic of care guides the dialogical exchange of ideas and expertise between the NGO and the state. Locating the ethic of care in the dialogical space, a space created in and by civil society and thus located in the public sphere, highlights the applicability of the ethic of care in the discourse of politics and international relations. The following literature review considers two generations of feminist care ethics, thereby tracing the evolution of a maternal ethic to something which is much more applicable to public, civic relations. This chapter is thus suggestive of the ethic of care as a pragmatic and practical ethic, rather than a static abstract theory. First, an overview of the literature is provided: the generations are identified and their work analysed. The second part of the chapter places the ethic of care in the context of practice.

---

[178] O. Hankivsky, *Social Policy and the Ethic of Care*, p. 2.

The literature concerning the ethic of care, addressed here, remains something of an abstract category. Such abstraction often obscures the ethic of care in a way that leaves its direct and rich correlation with citizenship misunderstood or underestimated. The literature on the ethic of care as presented here is one of this thesis' conceptual foundations. Furthermore, specific consideration is given to the traditional ethics of care literature, in order to unpack, and also to challenge, the literature by showing its limitations. Such limitations are also considered by exploring how the literature inadvertently contributes to its own oversimplification. Thus this chapter contends that some dismissals and misrepresentations of the ethics of care can be attributed in part to the mislabelling of the ethics of care as a purely feminist ethics.

While the literature addressed comes from a variety of disciplinary traditions such as Gilligan's psychosocial challenge to the understanding of moral voice[179], a moral categorisation that was originally preoccupied with the male moral voice as definitive, the key and underlying link with Gilligan's work has not been a disciplinary link. Rather, it has been the consideration of care and how it is socially and politically addressed in academia. Held's addressing of the ethic of care is also considered important as it seeks to emulate the practice of an ethic of care as something particularly noble and at times even exceptional.[180] While this too is an important analysis of the ethic of care, it is at odds with one of the key practical aims of this thesis, namely to remove the ethic of care from a purely feminist or mothering metaphorical bracket, and to show that in practice it is in fact a human, relational and socio-political ethic that transcends fixed gendered stereotypes. This is specifically shown in regard to the dialogical space, where the ethic of care is a practical ethic. Thus

---

[179] C. Gilligan, *In a Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development* (Harvard University Press, 2003).
[180] V. Held, *An Ethic of Care: Personal, Political and Global* (Oxford University Press, 2006).

Gilligan and Held's work facilitates a bias towards mothering as an abstraction of a higher moral standard[181], making the ethic of care difficult to locate in contemporary discourse. Furthermore, as will be discussed, Gilligan and Held's analysis is located within a private or depoliticised understanding of relationships, rather than in the public sphere between members of constitutive communities, civil society. To deal exclusively with personal voices and expressions of mothering, directly assimilates an ethic of care with the silenced private sphere.

Ruddick's work on an ethic of care, as shown, acknowledges the political significance of this first relational, as opposed to gendered, lens and practice.[182] While Ruddick is specifically concerned with care as a provision in a palliative context, she seeks to give it a political voice. However, her work, like that of Gilligan and Held, also continues with the mothering metaphor to give the ethic strength, and in doing so perpetuates the idea of the higher moral standard attached to the ideal of mothering, especially when the political sphere is identified as austere, objective and masculinised.[183] Such metaphorical construction is limits those who would seek to show that the ethic of care is a normative ethic[184], present in the public sphere, rather than an exceptional ethic. Ultimately, if an ethic of care is deemed the exception it can never be understood as one of the many and diverse rules of societal communication, action and practice.[185] As Tronto challenges, 'let's take seriously that democratic citizens care.'[186]

---

[181] Gilligan.

[182] S. Ruddick, *Maternal Thinking: Towards a Politics of Peace* (Beacon Press: 1989).

[183] J. Evans, 'Feminist Theory: An Introduction to second wave feminism', (SAGE Publications: 1995), p.58.

[184] See J. C. Tronto, *Caring democracy: Markets, Equality, and Justice* (New York University Press, New York; 2013).

[185] Tronto, (2013).

[186] Tronto, (2013), p.179.

Tronto and Sevenhuijsen discuss the ethic of care in the context of citizenship, political engagement and agency[187] and their work is of great significance of to this thesis, as it verifies the need for a reconceptualization of the consideration of an ethics of care, especially in terms of relevance and resonance in International Relations.[188] Like the arguments provided here and supported by extensive fieldwork, and analysis of the interviews conducted, the ethic of care is understood not as a solely feminist or post-modern postulation but as a practical ethic. In showing that identity and citizenships are not fixed entities[189] the ethic of care as considered by Sevenhuijsen, is shown to be part of our thinking and consideration about the relationship between citizen and the state.[190]

This review of the literature on an ethic of care suggests, then, an evolution of the ethic from Gilligan's psychosocial to Sevenhuijsen's socio-political consideration of the ethic of care in discourse and in the practical consideration of citizenship, agency, voice and the relational characteristic of the political.[191] As shown by this thesis, through the consideration of the literature on care and the empirical research conducted, an ethic of care is expressed by the NGO community and utilised in the dialogical space which facilitates a sharing of knowledge and expertise. Thus lessons are learned from the constructive conversations between the NGO and the state.

The ethic of care should be considered a pragmatic ethic, rather than a feminine, mothering or maternal ethic with claims to be of a higher moral standard than most would allow it attains even in its idealised state.[192] Rather, we should take the opportunity to

---

[187] J.C Tronto, *Moral Boundaries: a political argument for an ethic of care* (Routledge: 1993).
[188] S. Sevenhuijsen, *Citizenship and the ethics of care* (Routledge: 1998).
[189] Sevenhuijsen p.7.
[190] Sevenhuijsen, p.11.
[191] Sevenhuijsen.
[192] Hankivsky, p.9.

translate the ethic of care from identity politics, in order to consider it as a facilitative ethic, one which facilitates inclusion, agency and knowledge sharing in dialogue. As Tronto asserts, '[w]hat we see if we peek over the wall is the possibility of a world in which our capacities to care for ourselves and others will increase only if we have the courage to admit that we need, and will benefit from, recognizing the large web of caring relationships within which our lives gain meaning'.[193]

Two Generations of Care Theorists: Gendered and Relational Ethics of Care

There are two generations of care ethicists, as identified by Hankivsky,[194] characterised by their handling of the care ethic. The first generation are those who explicitly place an ethic of care in the context of gender, and then there are those who widen the scope of care and claim that care is actually central to human relations, the second generation.[195]

As will become apparent in the second section of this chapter, the work of the second generation of care ethicists is of most interest for this thesis. However, this does not mean that the first generation, Gilligan, Held and Ruddick are insignificant considerations in analysing the ethic of care. As shown by this thesis, the limitations of the first generation care theorists have been attributed to the underutilisation of the ethic of care as a lens and as a way of articulating the relationship between the NGO community and the state, while the second generation of care theorists, Tronto and Sevenhuijsen, have facilitated the introduction of an ethic care in political discourse and, as this thesis advocates the discourse of international relations.

---

[193] Tronto, (2013), p.182.
[194] Hankivsky, pp.10-13.
[195] Hankivsky, p.11.

The First Generation

Initially, care was seen as a form of moral reasoning that emerged from the experiences of mothering, caring and nurturing. Ruddick called for a refocusing of ethical priorities in the public sphere, arguing that an ethic of care develops from maternal work and 'offers a critical perspective that illuminates both the destructiveness of war and the requirement of peace'.[196] Ruddick linked the ethic of care directly to materialism, embodied in the relationship fostered between mother and child, describing it as a natural pacifism that should be mimicked in the political sphere as it is a 'commitment to avoid battle whenever possible, to fight battles non-violently, and to take, as the aim of the battle, reconciliation between opponents and the restoration of connection and community'.[197]

Held also was an advocate, as one of those identified as a first generation care theorist, of the possibility of 'replacing traditional contractual values of human relations with moral characteristics derived from mother-child relationships'.[198] This discourse concerning the ethic of care resulted in it becoming recognised as a maternal or mothering ethic. This placed limitations on the ethic as it suggested, implicitly and explicitly, that care was the traditional domain of women and, further, that care was reserved for mothering. As is supported in this critique of the marginalisation of the ethic of care as a gendered ethic, '[m]aternal, nurturing-based defences of the ethic of care have been charged with

---

[196] S. Ruddick, 'Preservation, Love and Military Destruction,' *in Mothering: Essays in Feminist Theory,* ed. J. Trebilcot (Rowman and Allanheld: 1983), p.239.
[197] Ruddick, p.239.
[198] V. Held*, Feminist Morality: Transforming culture, society and politics* (University of Chicago Press: 1993).

contributing to women's oppression by reinforcing dangerous stereotypes about women in society'.[199]

The significance of nascent articulations of care is that they made visible an alternative form of moral reasoning and its potential to affect the public realm. At the same time, articulations of care put forward by the first generation of care theorists essentialised women and, as a consequence essentialised care. Without doubt, a gendered ethic based largely on the dynamics of mother-child relations it is difficult to import into the mediation of public life'.[200] Here, the articulation of the ethic of care from the perspective of the first generation is presented from Gilligan, Ruddick and Held. While, 'first generation care ethics theorists were not able to demonstrate persuasively how a care ethic can be relevant and applicable to the public sphere and its institutions,[201] the significance of their work should be appreciated as a stimuli for responses and revision of the ethic of care by the second generation of care ethicists.

Gilligan: 'In a Different Voice'

'In the different voice of women lies the truth of an ethic of care, the tie between relationship and responsibility, and the origins of aggression in the failure of connection'.[202]

Gilligan's work provided a foundation for considering the moral orientation and moral development of women. As a psychologist, Gilligan considered gender difference in the mental processes and moral orientations of male and female children in an attempt to trace

---

[199] Hankivsky, p.13.
[200] Hankivsky, p.13.
[201] Hankivsky, p. 15.
[202] Gilligan, p.12.

and define stages in their moral development. Gilligan discusses how women define

'themselves in a context of human relationship but also judge themselves in terms of their

ability to care'.[203] By discussing the 'split value of autonomy versus connection',[204] with boys

being described as autonomous and the girls' orientation as being based on connection,

Gilligan makes a gendered distinction between the moral and logical approaches to

relationships. During her studies Gilligan noted the difference between girls and boys with

regards to their feelings and responses towards caring, relationships, and connections with

others. In her findings Gilligan concluded that girls appear to be more concerned and

involved in relationships, forming closer connections with other people and displaying more

compassion and interest than boys of the same age. From this observation Gilligan

concluded that girls are more inclined to caring, while boys on the other hand, are more

inclined to choose a justice-orientated relationship. Gilligan suggests that the reason for this

is a direct consequence of the difference in the relationship which girls have with their

mothers in comparison with how boys relate to their mothers. Gilligan's work concludes

through her study that women are naturally nurturing whereas men are logical.

In defence of her gendered moral distinction, Gilligan argues that her work with

women will inform a different schema, one where a 'moral problem arises from conflicting

responsibilities rather than from competing rights and requires for its resolution a mode of

thinking that is contextual and narrative rather than formal and abstract'.[205] Using the

Persephone myth to elucidate the different views of men and women, Gilligan concludes

that 'when life-cycle theorists divide their attention and begin to live with women as they

---

[203] Gilligan, p.17.
[204] Gilligan, p.17.
[205] Gilligan, p.19.

have lived with men their vision will encompass the experience of both sexes and their theories become correspondingly more fertile'.[206]

Gilligan assumed the interpretative challenge of introducing and necessitating the inclusion of women's voices in her seminal work *In A Different Voice*, published in 1982, as a critique of Kolberg's psychological study of moral dilemma.[207] Gilligan defends her work by outlining her frustration towards her contemporaries in the field of psychology, while also acknowledging a wider academic scope, as they focussed exclusively on the experience of men and thus produced what can be described as an abstract generalisation of human experience and thus a distortion of reality. Gilligan explains this as 'seeing a picture without seeing the frame, and the picture of the human world had become so large and all-encompassing that it looked like reality or a mirror of reality, rather than a representation.[208]

Gilligan's issue with such a distortion of the reality of relational *selves* - the frame - is integral to the critical argument of this thesis. Gilligan shows that conceptions of an autonomous self as 'the height of and most desirable assertion and expression of maturity' can unhelpfully tend to position actual human experience as immature, irrational, and to some degree irrelevant.

The particular importance of Gilligan's work for this thesis is twofold. First, the need to include a multitude of voices in order to validate experience and moral reasoning, and, second, the understanding of the ethic of care, which Gilligan concludes is part of the female moral voice. As such, while the limitations of Gilligan's theory, in particular the

---

[206] Gilligan, p.28.
207 See Kolberg.
208 C. Gilligan, 'Hearing the difference : theorizing connection', *Hypatia*, (March 1995).

eschewing of the ethic of care as purely feminine, are contested here, it is important to acknowledge the emergence of the discussion of care, even if it has since been revised.

Gilligan points to the existence of more than two moral voices rooted in different subjectivities.[209] This thesis supports and appreciates the absolute importance of understanding the plurality of moral voices, the carer, the recipient, the mutually supportive voices, and the voices of subjectivity and objectivity in concert with one another, at all of the different stages of the policy-focus, -making and -application stages. The dialogue between the NGO and the state demand that this concerted effort, dialogue and listening process be understood, in order for policy to be tangible, reflective of practice and void of abstraction. In essence the 'relational-self that Gilligan espouses cannot, as she sometimes seems to argue, coexist with the autonomous subject of traditional moral theory'.[210] Moreover, as is expanded on here, the autonomous subject, whether the state or the NGO, cannot function autonomously and without the acknowledgement of a dialogical relationship with the other. Crucially, it should not be expected to function automatically. There is of course a wider application to that in international relations, as will be shown. The NGO and the state, are relative selves rather than the abstract selves that enlightenment theory posited, the definition of which has until recently gone relatively unchallenged. This further highlights the validity of Gilligan's observation that, in spite of the marginalization of female subjects and their exclusion from studies, the conclusions of those studies were nevertheless regularly deemed applicable to women and the female voice, reinforcing the idea of a 'picture without seeing the frame'. [211]

---

209 Hekman, p.33.
210 Hekman, p.32.
211 Gilligan (1995).

In order to appreciate the picture of the NGO and the state and their dialogue, the art of it, the limitations and maturity of it, it is essential to frame it in such a way that draws the viewer to a focal point. This is where Gilligan's work is of particular importance, as it encourages the viewer to make sure that they are viewing the whole and not just one section. Gilligan's alarm and reaction to the all-male sampling in Kolberg's work shows the importance of capturing as much information as possible in order to make an informed, accurate and real observation rather than an abstraction.

Gilligan's objective begins and ends with the idea of a metaphysical shift from the abstract to the relational, based on the inclusion and acknowledged importance of the multiplicity of experiences, in particular those of historically 'silenced' female voices in psychological study. 'Focusing on women in relationship, Gilligan's work provides important insight about exclusion, which opens the door to routine cynicism in contemporary society'.[212] Gilligan's objective, 'to open up' and to provide not only an insight into this exclusion, but also to initiate a move towards inclusion, is reflective of the dialogical space which is created in the theoretical framing of this thesis. As a result of her rejection of any one single moral voice that could be said to be aspired to in order to validate the moral self, Gilligan is rightly hailed as one of the pioneers of a new type of moral theory, a moral theory that highlights the redundancy of the 'exhausted masculine tradition of moral philosophy'.[213]

The use of Musical Metaphor

---

212 R. C. Arnett and P. Arneson, *'Dialogical Civility in a Cynical Age: Community, Hope and Interpersonal Relationships',* (USA: State University of New York, 1999), p. 150.
213 Hekman, p.1.

Gilligan's work, as shown here, has created a snowball effect with her rejection not only of

Kolberg's psychological studies, but also in the initiation of the debate surrounding

experience and an appreciation of a multiplicity of experiences and 'voices' as being the

most valuable and realistic way to understand human connectedness, care and moral

maturity. Gilligan seeks to go beyond 'representation' and to capture reality – which she

asserts as the key in framing 'the whole picture' of human relationships. What can be

utilised from Gilligan's work for the discipline of International Relations and for this thesis as

a whole, is this understanding of interconnectivity and, in particular, the musical metaphor

which is used in response to the critiques of Gilligan's seminal work *In A Different Voice.* It

makes a valid and valuable contribution to the understanding of, and corresponding

rejection of the static, linear and staged nature of moral theory as a singular and static view

of the rich tapestry of human relations.

Gilligan explains her use of the musical metaphor through Noel's analysis of the

silencing power of one homogenous voice. Noel highlights that as a tuning fork, tuned to a

particular pitch, will stop the vibrations in eight or nine others that are tuned to a different

frequency,[214] so a single voice 'can stop the emotional vibrations in a group of people so

that the environment in the room becomes deadened or flat….when this happens….it looks

like silence but in fact – the psychological energy – often move[s] into the only place they

can still live, and vibrate in silence, in the inner sense, until it becomes possible to bring

them back into the world'. [215] Indeed the inclusion of such a metaphor is profound and

effective as it shows the inadequacies and insensitivity of a tendency to generalise and thus

homogenise the human voice. Gilligan discusses this in relation to the reception of her work

---

[214] Noel in Gilligan (1995).
[215] Noel in Gilligan (1995).

in *In A Different Voice* and, for the purpose of this thesis, that which is more akin to the ideas and findings conducted in the case study field work, especially when relating to NGOs. NGOs are defined as a group outside that of the state, acting to promote the issues of particular groups. It is of paramount importance to acknowledge, however, that while significant in terms of their legal status as 'non-governmental', these defining criteria of NGOs cannot fully account for each group that might be categorised as such. In this sense, NGOs cannot be said to comprise a single entity.

Gilligan's discussion of an ethic of care is based upon her observations and understanding of female moral maturity, that which she contrasts and shows to be incompatible with description of male progression and articulation of what it is to reach and attain moral maturity. The criteria being independence and a contractual relationship between the individual and the state. Gilligan asserts her ideas of a 'different voice' or different kind of moral maturity that conflicts with this idea of independence through the assertion that women have an 'alternative ideal concept of maturity'.[216]

Ruddick on 'Maternal Thinking'

Ruddick's work on maternal thinking sought to define the practice of mothering as a practice governed by maternal thinking. Maternal thinking forges strong associations between first generation care ethics and motherhood, through its privileging of maternal care as a gendered role, interest and act. Ruddick manages to gender motherhood by describing maternal work not as something biological but something metaphysical and conscious. In an interview with Andrea O'Reilly, twenty years after the publication of

---

[216] Gilligan, p.22.

Maternal Thinking, Ruddick maintained the belief that mothering and maternal thinking was

something more than an association with female 'bodies', rather maternal thinking was 'one

way women were thinking differently and also the name I gave to an explanation of this

different thinking that accorded limited importance to "the body"—Maternal thinking was

an expression of a whole made up of body, brain, and spirit influenced by memory and

tradition'.[217]

The context in which Ruddick's maternal thinking was framed was, like Gilligan's, in

concert with the politics of gendered difference. As Ruddick recalls, '[i]n the late 1970s there

was a vibrant feminist movement in the U.S. Within that movement some of us allied

ourselves with what we called "difference feminism." To clarify the meaning of "difference"

I quoted Virginia Woolf 's 'Three Guineas' many times, including in the first chapter of

Maternal Thinking:

> "We"—meaning by "we" a whole made up of body, brain and spirit,
> influenced by memory and tradition—must … differ in some essential
> respects from "you," whose body, brain and spirit have been so differently
> trained and are so differently influenced by memory and tradition. Though
> we see the same world, we see it through different eyes."[218]

Ruddick's work on maternal thinking sought to award agency to mothering and also

sought to further emphasise differences in gendered approaches to caring for children.

Ruddick associated maternal thinking with relational experience, that is to say, it is only

those who mother that understand the nuances of maternal thinking, or can think in a

maternal way. As highlighted by Ruddick, 'I have come to believe that we should see certain

---

[217] Ruddick interviewed by Andrea O'Reilly, pp.16-17.
[218] Ruddick interviewed by A. O'Reilly, *'A Conversation About Maternal Thinking',* in *Maternal Thinking: Philosophy, Politics and* Practice, ed. A*. O'Reiily,* (2011), p.16.

institutions as inseparable from the experiences—or more precisely the practices—of mothering. Schools, clinics, welfare offices, dentists, public libraries—these are some of the institutions of motherhood on which mothers depend. The ability to survive in institutions, to negotiate a place within them, is an aspect of maternal practice'.[219]

While Ruddick replies to this critique regarding the exclusivity of mothering by announcing that '[m]en could be mothers',[220] she continues to privilege mothering over parenting by insisting that fathers cannot answer the same questions as mothers regarding their children because 'fathers cannot answer these questions, and most can't, they are not truly engaged as equal partners in shared parenting'.[221] Thus if father wanted to be recognised for their parenting, they must assume the label 'Mother'. 'A mother was someone who made the work of mothering an important aspect of her or his life. Then I underlined her or his'.[222]

Ruddick's notion of care and maternal thinking, although she presents it as universally valid, is in fact a notion of *good care,* or, as she sees it, care which responds adequately to dependency and vulnerability, and which aims at protecting vulnerable subjects.[223] While care, for Ruddick, begins with the recognition that others need our attention, energy and commitment, it is framed exclusively as the pursuit of maternal thinkers, as mothers, which further engenders care as a maternal ethic.

Held and 'The Ethics of Care: Personal, Political and Global'

---

[219] Ruddick interview, p.21.
[220] Ruddick interview, p.27.
[221] Ruddick interview, p.28.
[222] Rudidck interview, p.27.
223 Sevenhuijsen, p.22.

Held construes care as the most basic moral value and posits it as a moral theory from which we can establish an alternative form of virtue ethics.[224] In defining care, Held asserts that '[c]are is both value and practice'.[225] In *Feminist Morality*, Held explores the transformative power of creating new kinds of social persons, and the potentially distinct culture and politics of a society that sees as 'its most important task the flourishing of children and the creation of human relationships'.[226] She describes feminist ethics as committed to actual experience, with an emphasis on reason and emotion, literal rather than hypothetical persons, embodiment, actual dialogue, and contextual, lived methodologies. 'The small societies of family and friendship embedded in larger societies are formed by caring relations...A globalization of caring relations would help enable people of different states and cultures to live in peace, to respect each other's rights, to care together for their environments, and to improve the lives of their children'.[227] Ultimately, she argues that rights based moral theories presume a background of social connection, and that when foregrounded, care ethics can help to create communities that promote healthy social relations, rather than the near boundless pursuit of self-interest'.[228]

According to Held, virtue ethics emphasises the character of individuals, but the ethics of care focuses more on nurturing connectedness among people.[229] The ethic of care values emotion, and is both a practice and a value. For Held, the ethic of care calls into question the abstract rules of the dominant moral theories. Held's contribution, however, further perpetuates the issue of 'over inclusion' in her work on mothering as the primary

---

[224] V.Held, *The Ethics of Care: Persona, Political and Global* (Oxford University Press, Oxford; 2006), p.9
[225] Held (2006), p.9.
[226] V. Held, *Feminist Morality , Transforming culture, society and politics*, (Chicago University Press, Chicago, 2003).
[227] Held, (2003), p. 16.
[228] Held (2006); Held (2003).
[229] Held (2003), p.58.

and foundational model for 'caring' in the political and ethical domain. The use of the

mothering figure, as the 'ideal' features as an integral part of Held's alternative model. This

is a model which subverts the idea that the political philosophical concern of the state is

primarily a 'view of moral problems solely as a conflict of rights between individuals'.[230]

Again, it is the mothering metaphor which lies at the centre of Held's work. While

metaphorical examples are beneficial and equip the discipline with cases to exemplify

theories, Held's ethical moralising leads to the production of moral motherhood by placing

particular emphasis on mother's moral experiences.

Critiques of Held's work centre on the reliance on 'parenting'. As such Held disputes

contentions with her argumentation on the grounds that these are based on a

misunderstanding of her argument as *simply mothering*. She argues that the 'mothering-

person' can be either sex and therefore that to criticise the semantics is an analytic

misunderstanding.[231] However, the assertion that this is a misunderstanding on the reader's

part, rather than either a genuine conceptual limitation of Held's argument, in addition to

the assertion that the mothering metaphor might be retracted that Held verges on when

responding to criticism, serve to further alienate feminism[s] from IR discourse.

In addressing the idea of what can be perceived of as 'good' ethical practice, Held

addresses care as a practicality as well as an ethic.[232] This is a valuable contribution to the

discipline as it undermines the oft cited abstract nature of theory. As highlighted throughout

this thesis, there seems to be a large juncture between theory and practice, contrary to

designations of theory as abstract and practice as exceptional. In fact, neither of these two

---

[230] Sevenhuijsen, p.11.
[231] Held, (2006).
[232] Held, (2006), p.29.

characterisations are, in reality, entirely correct. Nevertheless, the alternative morality

which Held aims at, is limited, as again it focuses on parenting and mothering as its sole

practical examples.

Second Generation Care Ethicists: the Centrality of Care

'…second-generation care theorists have established the centrality of care to all human life and activities.'[233]

Tronto and Sevenhuijsen lead the way for the second generation of care ethics through their

identification of care as a central component of relationships in the public sphere. In doing

so they have '[e]stablished a firm basis from which to argue that a care ethic should

legitimately lead us to contemplate what we value in our public lives, including social policy

actions and decisions'.[234] Care is now generally accepted as 'a species activity that includes

everything that we do to maintain, continue and repair 'our' world so that we can live in it

as well as possible. That world includes our bodies, our environments, all of which we seek

to interweave in a complex, life-sustaining web'.[235]

Tronto on 'Moral Boundaries'

Tronto's *Moral Boundaries: A political Argument for an Ethic Care* made a great impact on

the categorisation the ethic of care, and the significance of her work, like Sevenhuijsen's, is

particularly acute here as it moves the discussion of an ethic of care into the political realm.

---

[233] Hankivsky, p.27.
[234] Hankivsky, p.27.
[235] J. Tronto, *Moral Boundaries: A political argument for an Ethic of Care* (Routledge: 1993), p.103.

This facilitates the ethic's move away from identity politics and the assimilation of the ethic of care exclusively with mothering, as discussed in Ruddick's *Maternal Thinking*. It is also a step towards the understanding of the ethic of care as a practical, as well as an informative, ethic.

Caring is by its very nature a challenge to the notion that individuals are entirely autonomous and self-supporting. Tronto's main concern it to highlight the interdependent nature of the socio-political citizen in a way that does not isolate those who are interdependent or characterise them as 'needy' or incapable. Warning against the possibility of 'missing a great deal of human experience'[236] Tronto challenges the notion of autonomy and independence, and highlights that in favouring such attributes we merely hide a need which is fundamental to all citizens at some point in their live. Instead, we should acknowledge the reality of human interaction and interdependence. Highlighting that 'such an order must rigidly separate public and private life',[237] Tronto shows, as does this thesis in the conceptual outline and interview analysis, how we might remove care from the traditional mothering metaphorical categorisation, highlighting that care is in fact a reality of political and social experience. Furthermore, she emphasises that in responding to and understanding the needs of citizens and civil society the state embraces the lived reality and experience of its surrounding, as well as that of those who constitute, in a democratic setting, its recipients of policy, representation and identity. Tronto's work is particularly important as it highlights that to care is to engage with those in need of care in the context that it is shown to be required, thus awarding autonomy to those in the recipient's position. This is recognised as civil society in this thesis. Of significance is that this is also along similar

---

[236] Tronto, p.135.
[237] Tronto, p.135.

lines to the argument presented in this thesis that, in entering the dialogical space, a

dialogue as identified in Tronto's work, the state engages in open dialogue with civil society

in organisation in order to understand, rather than assume, what is required. This is

achieved through those responsible for researching, outlining and initiating policy.

Tronto introduces these ideas through her definition of responsiveness, showing that

to respond to need is not to assume what those in need require, but rather it is to enter into

an exchange with them, in order to understand the nature of their situation. Responsiveness

suggests a different way to understand the needs of others rather than to put ourselves into

their position. Instead in suggests that we consider the other's position as that other

expresses it. Thus, one is engaged from the standpoint of the other, but not by simply

presuming the other is exactly like the self.[238]

Significantly Tronto also highlights that to be responsive to need is not to undermine

the autonomy of those in need, nor is it to assume that they, through requiring

representation and a revision of policy, are subservient and completely dependent. Only in a

democratic process where recipients are taken seriously, rather than being automatically

delegitimised because they are needy, can needs be evaluated consistent with an ethic of

care.[239]

Tronto highlights in her study of an ethic of care that need and the requirement of

representation should not necessarily be assimilated with negative connotations and

dependence, which undermine the position of those being represented by the NGO

community. Rather she categorises an ethic of care as being part of the democratic process.

Her work highlights the importance of an understanding of need that moves away from the

---

238 Tronto p.136.
239 Tronto p.139.

idea of identity politics which posits care in the context of a mothering metaphor. Critical of the work of traditional care ethicists, Tronto's work is symbolic of the need to diversify international relations discourse and to escape the gendered terminology of care and the subordinate position of the care recipient, which naturally arises if the discipline assigns the mothering metaphor not only to the recognition of need, but also an understanding of the position of the caregiver and care receiver.

Sevenhuijsen on 'Citizenship and the Ethics of Care'

Sevenhuijsen's contribution to the ethic of care as a theory reflecting practice begins, like this thesis, by addressing the issues she feels that continue to dominate the discussion of the ethic of care but that simultaneously serve to undermine its actual and potential value to citizenship, and to the polices affecting the citizens of the state. Sevenhuijsen's critique of Held's 'moral mothering figure' facilitates her argument that an ethic of care is something all citizens can work towards and assume without having to use a mothering metaphor or indeed any other metaphor. Such reliance on metaphor, she contends, keeps the ethic of care to the philosophical musings of intellectual debate rather than showing that is it applicable to our ethical and moral norms as citizens and, as applied here, to the ethical and moral norms of non-governmental and governmental organisations.

As discussed in this chapter, Gilligan and Held rely on the use of metaphors, and music and mothering respectively, in order to facilitate the comprehension of an ethic of care. The 'motherly metaphor', asserts Sevenhuijsen, relies too heavily on the mythical image of 'woman', which has persisted for too long in various moral texts and which fails to do justice to the diversity of moral experiences of actual women, and to the moral

experience of civil society as a whole.[240] Throwing caution to the use of the mothering

metaphor as a fixed criteria for 'the judging of the quality of morality'[241] makes it very

difficult to move away from the idea that mothering is of a higher and therefore most moral

reference point for the self-reflective citizen who would contemplate their own moral and

ethical stance. Sevenhuijsen tries to 'overcome these problems by placing the discussion

about the ethics of care, where possible, within the conceptual framework of politics and

citizenship, thus striving for a combination of an empirical and political-philosophical

approach to the feminist ethics of care'.[242]

Sevenhuijsen's assessment of Held's work on the mothering metaphor, as

highlighted, contributes to the observations, and what may be termed 'frustrations',

expressed in this thesis when addressing the literature based on the ethic of care when,

invariably, it is hijacked and caught up in the often subversive and revivalist claims made by

those feminist works that seem more preoccupied with voice than with cause, in their

assessment of situations where the plurality encompassed by feminist methodology should

be seen as being of primary importance, as opposed to the question what is 'feminine'. As

highlighted by Sevenhuijsen and reiterated here, 'there is not fixed reference-point marked

'woman' [nor marked 'man'] which can serve as a criteria for the judging of the quality of

morality'.[243]

Sevenhuijsen encourages an assessment of moral and ethical conduct based 'more

on what you do than what you are' [244] as part of her overall critique of the use of the

---

240 Sevenhuijsen, (1993), p.16.
241 Sevenhuijsen (1993), p. 16.
242Sevenhuijsen (1993), p.13.
243 Sevenhuijsen, (1993), p.16.
244 Sevenhuijsen (1993), p.14.

motherhood as a 'privileged identity'.[245] By bringing to our attention the need to focus on action rather than metaphorical ideas of identity, Sevenhuijsen brings the ethic of care in line with a renewed form of political agency, 'a renewed hope of reclaiming truly human forms of moral agency, based on a recognition of responsibility'.[246] Sevenhuijsen rejects the use of metaphor and identity as a way of locating the ethics of care and encourages the view that citizenship be its own vehicle of integration into moral and ethical norms. This is in order to give the ethic of care a political dimension and meaning away from identity politics or a 'one-dimensional idea of interest promotion, or indeed a nostalgic return to harmony and consensus'.[247]

Sevenhuijsen's work has been addressed in the conceptual outline of this thesis as it shows the applicability of the ethic of care in the public domain, and thus facilitates its use in policy-making as highlighted in the dialogical space. What Sevenhuijsen facilitates is an important understanding of how the ethics of care can be integrated, as well as the value it serves to our understanding of the concept of citizenship. If we integrate the values derived from the ethics of care , such as attentiveness , responsiveness and responsibility , into concepts of citizenship this will produce a dual transformational effect :the concept of citizenship will be enriched and thus better able to cope with diversity and plurality, and care will be 'de-romanticized' , enabling us to consider its values as political virtues.[248]

Sevenhuijsen's contribution to this thesis, as already highlighted through the discussion and use of her work to further strengthen our understanding of the ethic of care, and the dialogical space, is that it challenges the normative location of an ethic of care as a

---

[245] Sevenhuijsen (1993), p.14.
[246] Sevenhuijsen (1993), p.14.
[247] Sevenhuijsen, (1993), p.15.
248 Sevenhuijsen , p.15.

purely feminist metaphorical discourse and, like this thesis, locates it as a discourse more

accessible and amenable to the consideration of political experience. Furthermore,

Sevenhuijsen introduced the ethic of care into a discussion of the political in an instrumental

sense, thus showing its transformational value.

> [I]t is political in the narrow sense, since it wants to transform systems of
> instrumental and bureaucratic rationality, which aim at banishing the
> unexpected and the uncontrollable- the symbolically feminine- and argue
> instead for new forms of creative power – a power to act together in concert,
> to borrow Arendt's terminology- and thus form renewed forms of political
> agency, political judgement and social justice.[249]

Whereas Gilligan highlights the need to include a multitude of moral voices and an

understanding that there is no one homogeneous moral stand or 'highest moral standard'[250]

that humans aspire to, she alienates women through her assertion that women speak 'in a

different voice'.[251] Held's contribution also provides some key ethical considerations, but

relies too heavily on the use of the 'mothering metaphor'[252] which again, as in Gilligan's

work, alienates women, including by suggesting they emulate a more moral being.

Sevenhuijsen charges the feminist ethicists with the challenge of going beyond a purely

philosophical approach to care and, like this thesis, attempts to place a discussion of the

ethics of care into a conceptual framework, through her analysis of the implications of the

notions of care on the idea of the citizen.

Sevenhuijsen's contribution is methodologically valuable in its consideration of the

practical implications of care. However, she dwells on the private function of care as action,

---

249 Sevenhuijsen, p.19.

250 See L. Kolberg , *Stages of Moral Development* , (1971)
<http://moodle.unitec.ac.nz/file.php/950/Day_9_childhood/Stages_of_Moral_Development_According_to_Kohlberg.pdf> [Accessed 10th April 2009]

251 C. Gilligan, *In a Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development* (Harvard University Press: 2003).

252 V. Held*, An Ethic of Care: Personal, Political and Global'* , (New York; Oxford University Press, 2006).

rather than an understanding of care as a relational ethic as it is shown to be here. Tronto extends the political argument for an ethic of care in the public sector explicitly asserting that there is a capacity, within the state, to care. Tronto, like Sevenhuijsen draws upon the actual application and experience of care and the type of care received in her assessment of the ethic as a moral concept. Care, Tronto asserts, 'rests upon judgements that extend far beyond personal awareness', which is in line with the requirements of the dialogical space addressed here.[253] This is a space which requires both the NGO and the state to relate to each other's personal awareness and biased judgements. Tronto's *Moral Boundaries* facilitates the exploration of a political order that presumes only independence and autonomy as the nature of human life, specifically the rigid and inaccurate separation of public and private life.[254]

A key feminist ethicist to consider in this context is Ruddick, who brings to our attention the need to understand the place of care specifically in our social space. Ruddick's contribution to the literature on care is based upon the *cared for*, be that institutionally or within the confines of the family unit, taking such individuals and groups as those who are particularly vulnerable and disenfranchised as a result. Ruddick's examples are drawn from children, the elderly and the disabled. Because of the maternal metaphor Ruddick utilises, her work, while important in that it raises awareness of the ethic of care, is also to be disputed. It perpetuates the myth of mothering as something of a higher status, much like the idea of the enlightened moral man championed in liberal thinking. While Ruddick's work is valued and, as stated, will be analysed here for its merit, it is important to bear in mind that it is self-limiting because it is in keeping with abstract notions of feminism as a purely

---

[253] Tronto, pp.136-137.
[254] Tronto, p.135.

feminine construct. This means that feminism, therefore, is treated as an alternative to the status quo rather than as reflective of, and informing observations about, human relations that can further add to the tapestry of our current understanding.

An Ethic of Care in Practice

> *'Care as a practice involves more than simply good intentions. It requires a deep and thoughtful knowledge of the situation, and of all the actors' situations, needs and competencies...care rest upon judgements that extend far beyond personal awareness'.*[255]

This section outlines and describes the ethic of care as understood and applied by this thesis. Here a definition of the ethic of care is outlined, a definition which is specific to the fieldwork experience and interviews conducted. The definition of care presented is an inductive concept as it was arrived at through the analysis of its indicators. These indicators were present and observed, discussed and defined by the NGO interviewees in both Scotland and Zambia. The definition presented here has theoretical links to the existing literature, especially through consideration of Selma Sevenhuijsen's *Citizenship and the Ethics of Care.* Sevenhuijsen's analysis contributes to the understanding of an ethic of care in a political context in addressing the interaction between citizenship and care. Her work highlights the contribution that an ethic of care, in its sensitivity, responsiveness and communicative approach, facilitates the utilisation of the dialogical space for both NGOs, civil society in organisation, and the state.[256]

---

[255] Tronto, pp.136-137.

[256] Hankivsky, pp.27-42.

The depth which the care ethic adds, the responsibility it incorporates, and the understanding of recipient needs is outlined here, showing how it can be utilised in the dialogical space by the state and the NGO, in a contextually specific manner, in the policies and approaches to policy-making by the state. This section argues, as the rest of the thesis supports, that an ethic of care is embodied by the NGO community due to the nature of their work and close engagement with the specific communities of citizens they seek to represent.

The conceptualisation of an ethic of care is recognised through the following indicators, all of which were present in the work, outlook, discussions and reflections presented by the interviewees during the field work process. In practice, that is the way in which the NGO interacted with their care recipients and also how they transported their knowledge, ideas and understanding of their community to the government. The ethic of care was indicated in the following ways.[257]

- Sensitivity
- Attentiveness
- Relational interaction
- Narrative appreciation
- Communication
- An emphasis on the generation of knowledge through tangible experience
- Bias

---

[257] See Hankivsky; Evans; Arnett and Arneson.

NGOs assume the role of carer as defined by the ethic of care.[258] In doing so they form an intimate and interested relationship with the care receiver, the care receivers being members of society at different times, and in different contexts, depending on necessity and requirement. One will show that the innate behaviour of NGOs, as attentive, knowledgeable carers and nurtures is suggestive of an ethic of care in statesmanship. The knowledge accumulated through the experience of a very specific and intimate relationship between carer and care receiver can be communicated to the state which does not have the resources, time, nor the capacity to build such tight bonds with these small specialised groups that the NGO builds relationships with. Thus, the NGO nurtures the ethic of care in states by providing the necessary details to the state which enables an informed, experience-based guide for practical judgement in policy-making.

An ethic of care upholds the importance of the relational, and encourages a move away from the traditions of the abstract and the ideal, often assimilated with liberal individualism.[259] Through the definition of an ethic of care, the value of its attentiveness and narrative appreciation will be shown. As such the ethic facilitates the communication of knowledge for practical judgement and decision-making, specifically the decision-making process of traditionally capitalist, liberal states.[260] The ethic of care demands that it be understood through practice, and thus be considered in context rather than abstraction.[261] Thus it is the rejection of abstraction, and the importance placed on contextual practice, that directs focus towards the consideration of *where* an ethic of care should be placed in

---

[258] Held, (2006), p.11.
[259] Tronto, p.54.
[260] Held (2006), p.15.
[261] Held (2006), p.9.

time and space in accordance with current social science discourse, which also incorporates

debates regarding philosophical theory.[262]

The importance of 'placing' an ethic of care into context facilitates its understanding

and reception as an actuality, rather than relegating it to the periphery as something 'some

people do' and some 'others' receive, the 'other' being recognized as the care receiver,

removed from societal narrative by virtue of their requiring care.[263] Thus, care as a

normative concept can be fully accessible, involved, and at the core of a post-modern era,

to the extent that it contributes to what it means to be post-modern. Currently in practice

the ethic of care finds itself, like society, straddling modernity and post-modernity, both in

the modern private sphere and as it is ingrained in post-modern political discourse.[264]

Ethic of Care: a definition in its 'optimum state'

*'[I]t wants to transform systems of instrumental and bureaucratic rationality, which aim at
banishing the unexpected and the uncontrollable- the symbolically feminine- and argue
instead for new forms of creative power – a power to act together in concert, to borrow
Arendt's terminology- and thus form renewed forms of political agency , political judgement
and social justice'.[265]*

The first definitive quality is that of choice. While many feminist theorists who explore the

ethic of care contend this, placing attentiveness as the first marker used to define the ethic

of care, it is argued here that in order to care one has to choose to care and to support the

care receiver. This is due to the fact that the ethic of care, for its effective and genuine

---

[262] See Held (2006).
[263] Sevenhuijsen, p.45.
[264] Held, (2003); Held (2006).
[265] S. Sevenhuijsen, 'Too Good to be True?', *IWM Working Paper*, No. 3/1998, Vienna, IWM Publications (1993), p.19.

practice, is displayed within the context of an interested and informed relationship. In the case of an NGO, for example Save the Children, the NGO has made a conscious, direct and informed choice to 'care' and to support children, especially those effected by poverty, illness and violence. The choice to focus on a particular group, in this case children, facilitates the understanding of roles in the relationship. The NGO, although recognised as carer from the outset, has taken the time to thoroughly research the needs, nature and possibly the goals of the particular group it wishes to care for. This acts as a prelude to the second defining factor of the ethic of care in practice, attentiveness.

To be attentive is to be well informed, close and mindful of the character, context and needs of those who the care is directed towards. Furthermore, attentiveness creates a sensitivity in the relationship as it calls for thorough and adequate reflection of both the caregiver and care recipient in order to assess what action is necessary to achieve the desired goals which are outlined in the choice process. Attentiveness also acts as a point of accountability as it gives an opportunity for the reflective mechanism described above. NGOs display an attentiveness to the actual needs and direction of resources, the closest state-centric example being the way a welfare system provides for citizens. However, due the close and communicative relationship between carer and care recipient, the needs, which change incrementally, are responded to pragmatically and are specifically tailored rather than capturing of the majority of needs or commonality of needs as is necessary in the welfare state system. It is this attentiveness which NGOs use to build a structural approach to care, and it is also one of the attributes which enables the NGO to nurture the state's approach to care. Attentiveness at the NGO level is more specialised, direct and sensitive than at the state level and it is this attention to detail which enables an enriched,

detailed provision from the NGO to the state of information which can be used for an informed practical judgement in policy direction. Attentiveness also furthers the possibility of pragmatism, which will be further considered when addressing an ethic of care in its nature post-modern context.

Relational conceptualisation of care is subject to the choice of the direction of care and also to the level of attentiveness which the caring relationship is exposed to. In the state system, relational conceptuality is often misguided as it is drawn upon abstraction and idealisation, aspects of liberalism which an ethic of care rejects. As highlighted by Held, 'moral inquiries that rely entirely on reason and rationalistic deductions or calculations are seen as deficient'.[266] Therefore, the importance of relational conceptuality is increasingly important for states, as shown by NGOs, as it provides crucial information based on fact, rather than exclusive reliance on theoretical presumption based on rationalistic deduction alone. The experience of direct relations 'on the ground' instead of abstraction manufactured bureaucratically informs policy-makers of what to expect, how to handle expectation, and also provides the opportunity for the state policy-makers to ask targeted questions of those with expertise pertaining to the particular group in question. One example of the use of relational conceptuality is the assessment carried out by NGOs on the ground concerning actual quantities, types of and specialisation of aid. Often NGOs, as they have no political agenda, are the first 'on site', and are accommodated more freely due to their neutrality. Therefore, NGOs build an attentive relationship which facilitates assessment of need far more quickly and in greater detail than states who choose to intervene after what may have been lengthy deliberation and arduous negotiation with

---

[266] V. Held, *An Ethic Of Care : Personal Political and Global* (Oxford University Press: 2006), p.10.

governments, and aggressive actors. It is the ethic of care which enables NGOs to communicate invaluable details, information and specifics to the governments beyond what military intelligence can, and is expected, to provide given that engagement is with the civilian population.

A consequence of the exhibition of modern conflict, through media reports and a greater public awareness and exposure to foreign policy, demands the specific consideration of the civilian population experience, which is a consequence of occupational, territorial and political disputes. The open communication and immediacy of media representation relays and communicates a real time narrative to the observant civilian population of the global community. This communication, however, speaks volumes but stands still and it is the narrative which NGOs can relay to states from the perspective of the nurturing of an ethic of care that is the most significant and effective. The ethic of care, as mentioned, is based on experience and in situations of conflict and crisis it is the specialisation of communication which the NGOs can provide to states which has a profound effect on guiding policy and action. The ethic of care as a knowledge based moral theory utilises the invaluable tool of narrative appreciation. This is in the case of NGOs through the communication with local government, tribes, educational establishments and communities at face value, and so on. This is achieved, again, as a result of choice, attentiveness and relational conceptuality. The choice to target a specific group also incorporates an attentiveness to their specific linguistic, cultural and institutional interactions and practices, each of these are understood in practice as the NGO has relational experience and thus the ability to conceptualise and therefore prioritise the specific requirements of the group both in times of peace and especially in times of crisis.

Narrative appreciation and communication are especially important in the ethic of care as they enable the delineation from the abstract and the ideal, and show the real reaction, providing a true insight into the lived experience and the dynamic of the care relationship, and also what the goal for the care relationship being established is. The appreciation of a narrative instead of the reliance on purely statistical data and general trends protracted over X-time in relation to Y-variables provides a humanistic, reflective mapping if you will, outlining those sociocultural issues which can only be appreciated through a closely monitored and specialised relationship which is the care relationship underlying the ethic of care practised by NGOs. This is due to the narration between the carer and those who are being cared for which is another key component of the ethic of care, important in its establishment and continual development.

An ethic of care is based upon an open dialogue and an interaction between two parties. Although one is the primary caregiver and the other receiver, the agency, dynamic and responsibility lies with both parties to openly assess and discuss the experience as this acts as a self-reflection and assessment of the relationship at hand, its limitations and where it has excelled. Those who care and those who are being cared for also have different kinds of power which are executed within the relationship and it is this as with the component of choice which set this contemporary, state centric definition of an ethic of care apart from the traditional linear, basic, and private sphere based definitions offered by feminist thinkers.

The care requirement of any group may change, increase or decrease over time and thus the ethic of care model as asserted by Nel Noddings has is shown to be limited in scope and inapplicable to modern day care scenarios. Nodding's exploration of the moral

approach to the concept of care was a pioneering and comprehensive step towards the understanding of care as 'knowledge'. Noddings situates care ethics and relations as basic both in terms of ontology and in terms of their role. By 'basic' Noddings means that care is a rudimentary component of moral being and in order to attain the 'ideal self', described by Noddings as the 'ethical ideal'[267], one must make sure to care and to be caring. One's *ethical ideal* is basic in its moral code as it is non-negotiable and thus calls for one to maintain the *ethical ideal* even in the most testing of situations, as Noddings insists, 'I am under an obligation to do so if I want to be moral, that is, to maintain myself as one-caring.[268] What Noddings fails to address is that as a carer one has the agency to assess and choose whether to care how far one should actually take the position as carer. By describing the role as basic and obligatory Noddings pulls the ethic of care into an area of expectation and obligation, and posits the carer as inanimate in their exercising of choice.

Noddings' version of the ethic of care is based around a familiar feminist construction of care, synonymous with maternal underpinnings and identity. Furthermore, it posits the consideration of an ethic of care, not as something with the potential to be nurtured but as something from the periphery which if given the 'power' would eventually be a 'revolutionary' alternative for contemporary politics through breaking down the public sphere, the apparent bastion of masculinity. Essentially this posits the ethic of care as a private sphere component which seeks to emerge onto the public sphere which also asserts that it is a concern for the marginalised rather than something which can be nurtured under the status quo. An ethic of care through the above definition can exist in tandem with the

---

[267] N. Noddings, *Caring, a feminine approach to ethics and moral education* (University of California Press: 1984) p. 10.

[268] Noddings, p. 82.

status quo and, as this thesis will argue, needs to be nurtured together with a clearly defined justice structure which traditional states promote.

What is important here is the consideration of the ethic of care in the context of the public and private spheres. This definition of an ethic of care goes toward removing this stark distinction between two spheres which in contemporary societal relations is hard to distinguish. Whether perceived in a 'public man, private woman' perspective, where women care in private and men interact as individuals in public, or through a traditionally feminist framework of care being an exclusively maternal, this thesis seeks to remove the ethic of care from these constraints. This can be done in two different ways which in tandem strengthen one another and move towards defending the proposition that care can be nurtured universally, while nevertheless still maintaining the exclusivity of an informed, attentive, conceptual real engagement. Such engagement may be observed in situations where a guide for practical judgement which is based on partiality, informs states of the incremental details which influence policy decision-making.

While we are not obliged to care we have a choice and invariably choose to engage in a caring relationship both as carer and as care receiver, dependant of course on the timing, context and goal. Socialisation begins at birth and as children we enter into caring relationships as dependants, friends, siblings and acquaintances. Each relationship has a different power dynamic and we learn to define ourselves with respect to where we fit in this dynamic. Although care can be and is also a private experience it does not mean that it is exclusive to the individual's private life or indeed that is it absent from societal relations especially between the state and its citizens, and moreover between the state and specific communities requiring 'care' in the form of specific policy packages and provisions. Care is

not exclusive to the private sphere and the ethic of care should not be considered as the exclusive concern of those who do not engage in, or who do not have involvement or full representation with, the political.

The components of an ethic of care are attentiveness partnered with relational conceptuality, an appreciation of the importance of narrative and thus clear, informative communication which is based on actual lived experience of both the carer and the care receiver. Despite the claims of traditional advocates of the obligatory model of the ethic of care which finds its home in the private sphere, an ethic of care is very much part of and will continue to be nurtured by NGOs and states alike, given that it can be very firmly established in the public and political spheres. An ethic of care informs and also challenges the limitation of the abstract and the idealisation of theoretical models and approaches to policy.

What does an understanding of an ethic of care achieve?

Despite the reservations of some philosophical and feminist theorists, an ethic of care can be applied on a larger scale and is not reliant on a one-on-one relationship in order to be first, successful and secondly, genuine in practice. The aim here is to highlight how it can be applied to the relationship between the local NGOs, their care recipients and the state in the case studies in Zambia and Scotland. Focusing on lived experience, the communication, action and understanding between the NGO and the state, it can be shown that it is this lived experience which informs judgement that is most important, not the actual proximity of the relationship in terms of the space occupied vis-à-vis civil society. The NGO and the state have differing responsibilities albeit with the same aim, to represent civil society.

However, these responsibilities do not have to be in isolation, the information and expertise honed and retrieved from these interactions and responsibilities can and do, where given the chance, reliably inform one another to achieve the best representative outcome of policy. As will be shown in the analysis of the field work interviews, the notion of practice and representation, defined as the ethic of care, as highlighted here, is grounded upon the self-reflective observations and explanations made by the interviewees themselves. This section details how Sevenhuijsen posits in the literature that the ethic of care has a promising practical dimension. It is due to this observation and analysis that Sevenhuijsen's work is a key consideration in this thesis, especially as it addresses the aims of an ethic of care in practice.

Sevenhuijsen's work highlights why it is key to understand the ethic of care in terms of practice, rather than considering it solely as part of an intellectual discussion. As this thesis shows, the ethic of care presented here arrives at its conceptual definition through fieldwork interviews where the interviewees themselves had facilitated an understanding of, and thus defined, the ethic of care themselves. This approach to grounding the theory rather than imposing it upon the case studies is also asserted by Sevenhuijsen. Sevenhuijsen highlights the importance of allowing interviewees to interpret practice in order to understand the aims of the organisations, actions and agency that prevails. In doing so the aims of those interviewed are understood not just as the aims of the organisation but as something more engaging. Sevenhuijsen asserts that 'it is not the practice itself which sets aims, but these aims are embodied in the way human agents who are engaged in these practices perceive and interpret them'.[269]

---

[269] Sevenhuijsen, p.21.

The aim here for Sevenhuijsen, as also proposed in this thesis, is to remove care from an exclusively feminist bracket and to place it in a more suitable area of international relations discourse which allows it to become part of a normative rather than exemplary discourse concerning the provision, receipt, and also the nurturing of care. This was achieved by allowing the interviewees to guide the insight and furthermore by contesting the genderisation   of care. This discourse shows the ethic of care in practice rather than in abstract discourse and also facilitates a step away from it being a purely gendered lens of analysis, allowing it instead to be accessed as an interpretive lens in international relations. 'By acknowledging the flexible and contested nature of gender and care, care can be "saved" from associations with traditional and fixed gendered identities, an association which continues to lurk within most versions of communitarian thought'.[270]

The importance of such flexibility in the framing and use of care provides the basis for the goals of publicly deliberating on what are significant similarities and difference between people and deciding which values should be given the status of common values. Differentiating between common and particular values also allows the NGO community, as well as the state, to emphasise what is needed for a particular group to enjoy its role as a civil society group. Understanding the ethic of care in this sense facilitates the nurturing of care in policy. Sevenhuijsen's removal of maternal metaphor as a fundamental framing and understanding of the ethic of care challenges Held's attempt to link the ethics of care to an unequivocal image of '"women" [which] still displays too many traces of foundationalism'.[271] The 'motherly metaphor' relies too heavily on the mythical image of

---

[270] Sevenhuijsen, p.22.

[271] Sevenhuijsen, p.16.

'woman', which has persisted for too long in various moral texts and which fails to do justice to the diversity of moral experiences of actual [men and] women.[272]

As shown by this thesis there is an attempt, through the use of traditional enlightened articulations of the state and its responsibility, to advocate that the NGO community are, due to the nature of their relationship with their community and civil society at large, the softer and thus more 'feminine' actor when compared with the state. This was also highlighted by those who were interviewed when they cited that often they are seen as less robust, more fragile and too emotive – all of which were attributed to being the more feminine actor when compared to the 'rational and objective' state actor. However such an arbitrary label led to gross generalisation and an inappropriate labelling of the NGO community. Furthermore, to further add to the mislabelling of the NGO, so too is care mislabelled and directly assimilated with a mothering metaphor another point directly challenged by Sevenhuijsen , who, as with the interviewees and fieldwork observations from this thesis, reminds us that '[t]here is no fixed reference-point marked 'woman', which can serve as a criteria for the judging of the quality of morality'.[273]

In arguing this Sevenhuijsen shifts the way in which care should be and is recognised, and strengthens the idea of plurality, diversity and difference within society, which in turn strengthens the need for a communicative relationship between the various groups and the state. Here, this thesis takes it a step further by highlighting that the ethic of care can be utilised in the dialogical space to inform the state as it enriches the policy process and strengthens the understanding, and indeed the encouragement, of plurality, a concept

---

[272] Sevenhuijsen, p.16.

[273] Sevenhuijsen, p.16.

which civil society as a construct and in its practice is based on. If we integrate the values derived from the ethic of care, such as attentiveness, responsiveness and responsibility, into concepts of citizenship, this will produce a dual transformative effect. The concept of citizenship will be enriched and thus it will be better able to cope with diversity and plurality, and care will be 'de-romanticized', enabling us to consider its values as political virtues.[274] Sevenhuijsen would 'rather stress the need for a social-constructivist and hermeneutical way of interpreting care, to counter the functionalism and the tendencies towards homogeneity inherent in communitarian thought'. [275]

The ethic of care has become part of political discourse in the past two decades and has, from the outset, been defined in many different ways due to the various ways in which it has been used to describe particular phenomena. Some theorists have chosen to narrow the relationship between carer and care receiver to that of parent and child, friends, partners and immediate family in order to emphasise the very intimate and close relationship which this fundamental ethic of human socialisation requires. However, as highlighted by Sevenhuijsen there is little reason to give motherhood a privileged status in arguments about women's moral or political identity.[276] The issue raised here is that care is applicable to both genders and through the constant use of maternal metaphor, it may seem to be now reserved for the 'exclusively' or 'morally' feminine. Held can be accused of championing what may be perceived as a moral high ground of motherhood or rather a concept of 'moral motherhood' as she advocates and describes a tightly conceptualised expression of the moral experience of mothers using the mother and child metaphor in

---

[274]Sevenhuijsen, p.15.

[275]Sevenhuijsen, p.22.

[276]Sevenhuijsen, p.13.

much of her text. As highlighted by Sevenhuijsen and other advocates of the post-modern conceptualisation of an ethic of care, it is not the use of the mother-child metaphor which is the problem, but rather the pairing of it with a notion of 'good ethics', therefore introducing the concept of 'bad ethics' as a natural contrast, which genders and removes an ethic of care from political discourse as Held attempts to ground 'good' ethics in a subjective ideal, which is then regarded as a normative image for moral reasoning and political action in general. According to post-modernist philosophers, we should bid farewell to foundationalism and the grand narrative of human progress. In their place we should accept the fragmented, ambiguous nature of the human condition.[277]

Where should it be placed?

Care must always be understood in a condition of interdependence and should also be recognised, as highlighted by Sevenhuijsen as 'political in the broad sense because it wants to break with the patterns of domination that have surrounded caring activities'.[278] Understanding care away from the context of domination awards due recognition of agency of the care recipients which is key for civil society, especially in a democratic context. This posits care in a more relational, as opposed to exclusively dependant driven, context than some of the literature is prepared to allow, as highlighted in the literature review above. The significance of this contextualisation of care as political for this thesis highlights that NGOs have a role both in the provision of representation for the care recipients as more than just service providers, but also as experts in the political context which is further

---

[277]Sevenhuijsen, p.16.

[278] Sevenhuijsen, p.16.

confirmed in the next section outlining the dialogical space where the NGO and the state communicate, collaborate and share expertise in order to render policy more amenable to civil society, especially to groups that find themselves at the periphery. While it does not prioritise one group over other groups, the inclusion of those at the periphery following the involvement of NGOs, especially as shown in Scotland in coalitions of NGOs with similar approaches and issue concerns, supports the inclusion and understanding of plurality and diversity in the policy-making process. Thus the ethic of care as a political concept relocates it and utilities it in a much more democratically sound location where democracy is embraced in its civil diversity and plurality. As highlighted by Tronto, this relocation of the ethic of care is required in order for it to be much more than a synonym for dependence. Thus it is a possible hindrance on the resources of the state. Given that 'dependence does not truly describe the condition of care we can probably assert that one of the goals of care is to end dependence, not to make it a permanent state'.[279] Thus, as shown by the conceptualisation of the ethic of care, and the consideration of its politicisation, rather than its use as a synonym for permanent dependence, the ethic of care can be understood as a component of the democratic process. The ethic of care as demonstrated by the NGOs who represent civil society in organisation helps to facilitate a closer understanding of the needs of those they represent. However in order for the ethic of care to be positively utilised and exploited in the most beneficial and dynamic manner, a care perspective must be assumed and a space must be created for constructive, critical and pragmatic conversations about need, appropriateness and delivery of policy.

---

[279] Tronto, p.163.

Assuming a Care Perspective

For an ethic of care to be effective, a care perspective must also be assumed. This care perspective, as will be shown, resonates in the Scottish case study through an understanding of its value by both the NGOs and also the state. Therefore, through assuming a care perspective, a dialogical space is provided for the ethic of care to be realised. As highlighted by Tronto, '[a] care perspective would have us recognize the achievement of equality as a political goal. If we attempted to achieve some type of equality as a political goal, it would make facts about inequality more difficult to dismiss'.[280]

Thus the political ideal of care would force us to reconsider the delineation of life into public and private spheres, showing a fundamental understanding that social relations are political relations and must be understood and represented as such. This idea has been much debated and also rejected somewhat by what the literature refers to as 'modernity' and therefore posits care in post-modern, abstract discourse rather than acknowledging its tangible resonance with contemporary societal interaction, as shown in the fieldwork conducted in both Zambia and Scotland. Therefore as highlighted by the literature on the ethic of care, while modernity strives and pursues individualism at its core, defining the pursuit of individualism as the pursuit of an ethics of rights, Held's criticism of an ethics of rights is that it presumes an atomistic view of human nature: 'detached, self-sufficient,

---

[280] Tronto, pp.164-165.

fundamentally egocentric...directed against the assumption that possession of rights is the primary factor in transforming individuals into human "persons"'.[281]

One of the main charges against feminist and recognisably post-modern theorists, is their identification of the limits of modernity in political discourse as it favours the pursuit of the individual and curtails the need to understand the social foundations of the political. Thus the conceptualisation of modernity is at odds with the positioning of the ethic of care as something which should be incorporated into international relations discourse, and also recognised as part of the political experience of civil society. As highlighted by Tronto, '[m]odernity is thus built on a mistrust of human spontaneity, drives, impulses and inclinations; it tries to replace these with the universalizing gaze of unemotional calculating reason'.[282] This debate is further explored in the literature review but it is important to acknowledge here when considering how care should be positioned. While, academically it is positioned in post-modern discourse, practically this positioning is too abstract to be part of a grounded theory and actually serves to make it part of a grand theory that has little direct identification with the everyday experience of the political for civil society.

However, while the idea of the post-modern can be difficult to conceptualise in practical terms for the positioning of an ethic of care in practice, the ideas therein are valuable. Under post-modern conditions we may, in Bauman's view, have a renewed hope of reclaiming truly human forms of moral agency, based on a recognition of ambiguity and responsibility.[283] It is here that the idea of the heterogeneity of public spheres can be embraced and validated through an understanding that one single public space does not

---

[281] Sevenhuijsen, pp. 11-12.

[282] Tronto, p.165.
[283] Sevenhuijsen, p.17.

suffice in terms of representation and understanding of value, needs, and therefore the ethic of care. Such acknowledgment of the heterogeneous character of the public and civil make-up of society provides a more satisfactory starting point for characterising the post-modern condition in general, and indeed the social organization of care.[284] In doing so this facilitates a more practical application of the ideas discussed in the context of the post-modern. It allows the discourse of the ethic of care to be defined in a practical sense, and thus also highlights its value and dynamic.

This section has shown that the ethic of care can be understood and placed within the current socio-political understanding of civil engagement and representation. Unlike most scholarly discussions of the ethic, by placing the ethic of care in the discussion of the public domain it can be seen that the ethic resonates in contemporary political experience which calls into question the reliance upon 'modernity' as a lens used to view and shape political understanding and engagement. As highlighted by Sevenhuijsen and extended here, the ethics of care can offer new points of departure, through its plea for intimacy and close relationships to be counted as important humanitarian values.[285]

Conceptual Summary

The ethic of care as shown here is used as a lens to understand and further expand the discipline of international relations in its pursuit to explain and illustrate how political actors and institutions engage with one another, specifically local NGOs and the state in Scotland and Zambia. For the purpose of this thesis the ethic of care has been located in the fabric of

---

[284] Young (1990) in Sevenhuijsen, p.27.

[285] Blustein (1991) and Nussbaum (1990,1992,1995) in Sevenhuijsen, p.27.

NGO activity and engagement with the communities that they represent, as defined by the interviewees themselves across the two case studies. As understood and explained here, NGOs are civil society in organisation. These sections highlight that, fundamentally, the political experience of civil society encapsulates a complex and integrated network of interactions.

The ethic of care and its core principles of sensitivity, attentiveness, relational interaction, narrative appreciation and communication have been theoretically identified and located within the central framework of local NGO activity. However the identification of the ethic of care is not enough as it only highlights that it exists, rather than what it facilitates. While the ethic of care helps describe how the local NGO community engage, learn with, from and about their respective community or 'care recipients', it is only through analysing how the NGO community and the state engage with one another that the value of the ethic of care can be understood and addressed. Furthermore, through the acknowledgement and evidence that an ethic of care is present in the dialogical space, the ethic can be appreciated in wider International Relations discourse, challenging its current and vastly overlooked location in post-modern feminist discourse, which lies at the periphery of the discipline.

Chapter 4
Case Study One:
One Nation, One Zambia[286]?

'When you run alone, you run fast. When you run together, you run far.'[287]

The research process in Zambia captured an insight into the local NGO community ethic which is relatively undocumented and absent from the literature regarding sub-Saharan Africa. The ethic of care was found to be persistent, present and practised by the NGO community, but largely under-utilised as a knowledge tool by the state. While most of the literature available regards aid and development, little is asked of the NGOs in terms of how they function on a day-to-day basis. Rather, the literature presents an overarching and generic view of who the NGOs work with and for, targeting their developmental aims and aid-giving vis-à-vis their target groups, as opposed to giving due consideration to the organisations themselves. The ethic of care, as detailed, is difficult to gauge from the vagueness of the literature. However, the ethic emerged through the case study experience, in-depth interviews, and a grounded approach to data collection with me as the researcher shadowing and working alongside the NGO Sport in Action (SIA). Furthermore, while the ethic of care could be observed and discussed, the difficulty of how it might in reality be nurtured in statesmanship was all too apparent, especially given how difficult it was to access policymakers who are needed by NGOs to facilitate their goals, or at least to acknowledge their expertise and knowledge of the communities they represent. Thus this case study highlights the merits and the rich potential of the ethic of care as displayed by

---

[286] Zambian government slogan adopted by President Kenneth Kaunda [date]
[287] Zambian Proverb , http://www.historyofpainters.com/zambia_proverbs.htm [last accessed,etc.]

Zambian NGOs, but also the challenges faced by the NGO community in sharing their knowledge.

One of the main issues that emerged as a limiting factor was the distorted domestic political environment, a political environment described by one of the interviewees as 'a tri-political system where citizens have different perceptions of who rules' and where 'these three strands do not converge'.[288] Citizens might identify themselves as being governed by their local township, local government, and/or tribal leaders. While the existence of a parallel tri-political system is widely acknowledged, its impact on the systematic structure of the relationship between civil society and the state has not been fully realised. It is, however, of central importance that there is political disjuncture in the ways in which municipal and governmental structures work in parallel, rather than with some centralised coordination. Specifically this helps in understanding the disjuncture between the reality of the diversity in the Zambian state and how, conversely, policy is implemented to honour the 'one nation, one Zambia' mandate. As proclaimed by the many publications sponsored by and thus in support of the government's slogan,

> Civil society should equally promote dialogue that encourages a shift from tribalism and its offshoots, regardless of their benefactors. At the end of the day, no cause, campaign or reasoning, is greater that the unity of Zambia for purposes economic development. It is now that Zambians everywhere, young and old, rich or poor, learned or not, begin to live by the 'One Zambia-One Nation' stand.[289]

The persistence of the government's aim to create a homogeneous state means that the rich diversity of the Zambian state of communities - comprising many ethnic groups identifying with Zambia's 72 recognised but 'unofficial' languages - is largely undermined by

---

[288] Counsellor Interview.
[289] Hildah Lumba, 'Zambia: Let's Live By One Zambia, One Nation slogan' Times of Zambia, 23 Feb 2015, http://allafrica.com/stories/201502240301.html

political elites. Civil society's vibrancy is thus denied an official platform, and the NGO community - civil society in organisation - is too denied its place at the table. This is because divergence from the idea of 'One nation, one Zambia' is regarded as a threat to state cohesion rather than a step towards inclusion and the utilisation of the diversity of the community at large. While many studies of the Zambian state highlight that 'to a large extent, the effort to forge "One Zambia, One Nation" has succeeded', nevertheless, 'Zambians identify with the nation as well as with individual ethnic groups. Many trace their own family heritage to more than one Zambian group. Most Zambians live within but also beyond their ethnic boundaries. Identities at different levels coexist and change'.[290]

There is a difference between local level understanding of diversity, and an ability to overcome differences in order to work with, and also to transcend, difference. The government's contact with society remains, as will be shown, dislocated, largely because of the political push to maintain the rhetoric of 'One nation, One Zambia' amidst the many cultural and linguistic identities. This rhetoric is from the unification policy introduced by President Kenneth Kuanda and was originally aimed at discouraging strong tribal identity as it was believed that such claims would impinge on cohesion. The principle of creating a homogenous society has also therefore led to an attitude of suspicion regarding local NGOs who seek to represent the rich divergence in ideas, beliefs and attitudes of particular groups, one of the most difficult representative hurdles being their identification of the needs of particular groups as such identification also undermines homogeneity, a concept strongly challenged in the theoretical section of this thesis. While the NGOs interviewed during the fieldwork study were not focussing specifically on ethnicity, they were focussing

---

[290] *Adapted with permission from "Talking About 'Tribe,'" Africa Policy Information Center.* <http://www.tolerance.org/supplement/one-zambia-one-nation> [Accessed 5 March 2012; 11.43 GMT]

on particular sections of society that were not incorporated into the 'One nation, One Zambia' blueprint and as a result did not have a 'place at the table' during policy-making.

NGOs are, as will be shown, often perceived primarily as caregivers. The care or aid they provide to communities is perceived to be, 'one other thing that the government doesn't have to worry about, or rather let's say, concern themselves with in terms of actual delivery, they can put it in their reports, they can show it's happening but what they don't really show is how this arrangement came to be'.[291]

In what follows the ethic of care will be highlighted as it was identified by NGO workers and policymakers who were available and prepared to discuss what they diagnosed as the lack of dynamism in the relationship between NGOs and the state. While partial, the knowledge and insight gained and presented here was gathered during an intensive research period, facilitated by the public and civil society and the local NGO community. Further to this a number of other important insights were provided by Zambian civil society: students at local state and private universities and higher education colleges; teaching staff at many of the local Lusakan state schools; township Chiefs; local Counsellors; and local Members of Parliament. These latter groups are all expressive civil society groups in *parallel* public spheres, silenced by labels, relegation or changes in how the law recognises their gathering, opinions and legitimacy as consultative bodies. The methodology as discussed in the previous chapter was based upon principles of trust, integrity, and a willingness to understand and respect those who were willing to give up their time to engage with me, the researcher, but also to reflect on and give insight into issues concerning their job, beliefs, approaches and experiences. This is a key point to highlight particularly in light of the nature

---

[291] Voter Registration Activist, Independence Avenue [Lusaka, June 2010]

of the marginalised and silenced groups that these NGOs represent. Discussions were highly emotionally charged for both personal and psychological reasons. While this was also the case to some extent in the Scottish case study, the Scottish NGO community acted more as a community of organisations which operated with some distance between the NGO worker and the community, even if this was just in terms of day-to-day interaction. The Zambian NGOs, however, are situated in localities and their head offices are found 'on the very pulsing heart of the matter', which also enabled me to get an insight regarding who came in through the door, and to make a comparison with the situation of those who cannot even access the door of government offices, Counsellors, and Members of Parliament.[1] The contrast, while anticipated, was exceptional as even the Directors of the NGOs had very little access to these doors, both in metaphorical and literal senses.

This case study highlights the wealth of information that is readily made available to local NGOs due to their proximity to those they represent. While arguably biased, their relationship with the communities in question acute and Zambian NGOs often fill the void left by government, especially on a local scale. The findings presented thus highlight a thriving, self-conscious, sensitive, intuitive, biased, and persuasive public and civil society that presents an ethic of care as one of their fundamental premises, faced as it is with the challenge of being labelled as anti-governmental. The dialogical space, where NGOs make up and reflect public and civil society, had very little opportunity to nurture governmental policy to truly provide for their constituent communities' needs.

Significance of the Zambian case study

The Zambian case study for this thesis is key as it represents what can happen when the state does not engage in a dialogue with public and civil society through local NGOs and civil society groups. It shows that when there is no conversation with the NGO, the potential lessons learned - the information and detail that has great potential to render policy more suitable to the population's needs - is not fully realised, let alone utilised. Furthermore, this chapter highlights how, in practice, the homogeneous labelling of one single public group, 'One Nation, One Zambia', facilitates the silencing outlined and discussed in the conceptual chapter, and in particular Fraser's analysis of the public sphere. As outlined in the conceptual chapter, public and civil society often come together and identify their need in very specific communities identified here as NGOs. These NGOs, as civil society in action, represent marginalised communities in a diverse and pragmatic way, through specifically channelling critique of the limitations of the status quo if, and when it fails to adequately represent groups and communities with public and civil society. In the Zambian case study, each of the groups interviewed discussed their operative mandate, their focus and specific challenges to the 'incumbent'[292] government and constitutional practice. While the interviews and findings discussed here are directly related to the overarching thesis question, it is important to appreciate that the voices heard and the experiences shared all paint a much larger and more detailed picture of the socio-political situation in Zambia. These are neither governmental statistics nor official party slogans; they are lived, diverse experiences in Zambia – not one, but many.

The interviews conducted for the purpose of this research project opened up many different avenues for further research and projects based on the representation of civil society, which therefore highlights that this particular insight is only one element of many

---

[292] Counsellor Interview

layers of a much larger study regarding the Zambian local NGO community. This is important to note as it shows the further potential of the ideas and discussion elicited by this thesis and lays the foundation for a wider research agenda beyond what is presented here. While this may prove to be one of the difficulties of this research approach, that only a partial insight can be ascertained from qualitative research, the lack of, and therefore need for, rigorous research in Zambia is shown. The issues analysed here as a result of the discussions had in numerous offices and institutions, streets and clinics, buses and village meeting areas, are often silenced and rarely explored.

The interviews specifically addressed are those that highlight the main thematic lessons and discuss the opportunities, or lack thereof, for the NGO community to enter into dialogue with the state. This involved an appreciation of the sensitivity of the NGO community to their position at the grassroots of Zambian society. In particular, there was difficulty around openly criticising the state without fear of being further undermined or challenged for doing so. What will be shown, first, is that there was an understanding that biases can be utilised in order to come to a compromise, and that there was a practiced, present and tangible ethic of care present. Second, the ethic of care was specific to the NGO community and directly correlated with their heighted awareness, sensitivity and proximity to their constituents. Thus accessibility, and equally an inaccessibility, to the government and policy-makers was a shared experience of the community as a whole. This experience was not just specific to particular NGOs. Had that been the case, this would have undermined the previous two points of importance. Third, when given the time to work and consult with government and policy-makers, the NGOs who described their experience believed that they were able to bring a new perspective to the table due to their close

proximity to those they were representing. Fourth, and finally, the NGOs and policy-makers alike believed that a multitude of perspectives, capturing many different interactive approaches, distances, and understanding regarding civil society, made for a significantly more robust, tangibility beneficial, and precise policy. Thus the NGOs' perspectives were advantageous to the government.

Zambian political context

Zambia was one of the first sub-Saharan nations to experience a peaceful transition to multi-party rule in 1991. The Movement for Multiparty Democracy (MMD) won an overwhelming electoral victory over the United National Independence Party (UNIP) who had presided under single party rule for 17 years, since Zambia gained independence in 1964, replacing an authoritarian regime with an elected government. The MMD's electoral manifesto promised a liberal economic reform plan, another relatively new step in sub-Saharan governance. Such political and economic diversification introduced a potential for change in the relationship between state and civil society as the newly elected government sought to capture and uphold the confidence of the electorate. While the manifesto and the new idea of a multi-party democracy promised innovative interaction between the state and civil society, its realisation, as witnessed and explored in the interviews during fieldwork, has been far less tangible.

The peaceful transition to multi-party democracy in 1991, as well as the economic policies promoted by the new government, made Zambia a '"model for Africa"'[293] both in

---

293 A.Rakner, *'Political and Economic Liberalisation in Zambia 1991-2001',* The Nordic Africa Institute, (Stockholm: Elanders Gotab, 2003)p.12

the eyes of the international donor community and much of the academic community. As Rakner highlights, with donors eager to promote an African 'success story' of dual reforms, as one of the few countries in sub-Saharan Africa to do so, Zambia experienced substantial growth in Official Development Assistance (ODA) in the immediate period after 1991.[294] However, such growth was not reflected in party and governmental practice, a hangover from the unitary state system, which in 2010 was still cited as a dividing issue between civil society groups and the government. This was a particularly key point of discussion in the interviews conducted at the office of the National Youth Development Council of Zambia (NYDC), where advocacy and consultancy work was underway with governmental ministers to adapt outdated constitutional policy concerning youth representation and political education. Rakner highlights the theoretical details that the multiparty democratic system potentiality entailed for Zambia after 1991. However, the fieldwork shows that in practice such promise and the potential for Zambia to establish itself as a 'model for Africa' was undermined by what one interviewee describes as 'applying a fresh coat of paint over a crumbing wall'.[295]

The process of the political liberalisation of Zambia began in earnest in 1991 and is traced until 2001 by Rakner. Concerned primarily with the analysis of three main actors - the MMD government, the main domestic interest groups and the international donor community - and their negotiations concerning the implementation of structural adjustment reforms through two election periods, 1991-1996, and 1996-2001 - Rakner provides a detailed analysis of the contemporary Zambian political and economic scene. This account is particularly noteworthy as it is one of a few publications which addresses Zambia as the

---

294 Rakner, p.12
295 Counsellor Interview

main case study despite, as highlighted, the initial excitement of Zambia being a 'model for Africa'. However, as Baylies and Szeftel highlight, '[a]fter a few months in office, accusations based upon a lack promised political reform begged the question of whether the MMD replaced the UNIP's system of presidential authoritarianism or simply reproduced it'.[296]

The non-violent, swift transition from single to multi-party representation in Zambia, as stated by Baylies and Szeftel writing in 1992, had revitalized political participation, 'unknown since the struggle for independence'.[297]This sentiment ripened, and continued to be visible in 2010 during the fieldwork interviews and the witnessing of protest at national and local levels. As highlighted by the British High Commissioner, Mr Tom Carter, there was an internationally funded and 'mentored'[298] push for voter registration, as well as campaigns to bring greater transparency to the electorate. However, the political situation in Zambia became stagnant after the elections in 1991. This election is remembered for both its promise of and failure to deliver the anticipated freedom of the multiparty state. In 2010 such a cleavage between the promise and the delivery of the 1991 manifesto was apparent in the interviews conducted.

A multi-party state system should encourage a multiplicity of representative bodies, community groups, differences and challenges from civil society. However, as state confidence in its ability to achieve the archetype that is 'One nation, One Zambia' declined, the power invested in the multi-party system was soon to be undermined as those in power reverted to politics reminiscent of the 1980s. As reiterated in many of the interviews,

---

[296] C.Baylies and M.Szeftel, 'The Fall and Rise of Multi-Party Politics in Zambia', *Review of African Political Economy,* No.54:74-91, (ROAPE Publications Ltd, 1992),
[297] Baylies and Szeftel, p.75
[298] Tom Carter Interview

political elites from the 1980s 'simply changed their coats'[299] and, to continue the

metaphor, dressed in order to secure their position within the ruling parliament. For the

Zambian electorate and those working for civil society groups and NGOs this was, and

continues to be, a staged costume change, rather than a thorough recasting of the political

actors and characters. Due to the frustration elicited by this dressing up of issues, the

interviewees were keen to express their disappointment with the lack of reforms. This lack,

widely cited by the interviewees, was prevalent in community discussions, and was also

apparent in the change in policies regarding the legal status of NGOs. The relegation from

NGO to civil society group was one of the first issues raised in each interview, especially by

those coming from policy-making backgrounds, but also by the NGOs whose status and

potential contribution to policy was being undermined.

In the first interview outlined here, with the British High Commissioner to Zambia, he

was able to give a frank and relatively objective view of the political climate. He was

interviewed at the British Embassy and described the significant backwards step in the

democratic process regarding NGOs' legal status and their stake in the political process. He

also highlighted the significance of this for the media as civil society's other means of having

a voice in the political realm. The interview here is described in order to further highlight the

political context. This is followed by the analysis of the interviews conducted with youth

empowerment officers. Finally, I describe an interview with a local Lusakan elected

Counsellor, who in order to be able to speak freely and critically explicitly asked that his

identity be kept anonymous.

---

[299] Counsellor interview

'Political climate' interview analysis

The rich and critical accounts of the Zambian political experience facilitated a greater understanding of why and how some circumstances within the NGO community experience had come into being, and further explained the disparity between what was 'promised' and the difference between 'what is received' in the seemingly 'multiparty' state.[300] These interviews highlight the change in the status of the NGO community and also the lack of political status awarded to Zambian youth groups who have been fighting a tense and historic battle to be 'written into the constitution and recognised as Zambian citizens of worth, merit, work and intellect'.[301] The information detailed here explicitly highlights the lack of a dialogical space whereby the NGO, civil society, and even Municipal Counsellors are excluded from discussions related to policy formulation, implementation, delivery and reception. As described here, groups critical of the government, as defined by the interviewees, are treated with hostility and scepticism, and are perceived to challenge the government. As such a distance, silence and stigma, has emerged as a 'stagnant norm'.[302]

As highlighted by the UNHCR, the political context in which civil society has had to fight against, rather than work alongside government, undermines the potential for dialogical spaces where NGOs can share ideas, represent their community, challenge and critique. As a result, despite the 1991 step towards democratisation, changes in 2009 before the fieldwork process began, had already served to directly undermine and to further remove civil society, in organisation or otherwise, from the policy process. As highlighted by the UNHCR, freedom of association was being contravened on an 'apparently political

---

[300] Counsellor
[301] Youth empowerment officer
[302] Youth empowerment officer

basis'.[303] The difficulties explained in the interviews were threefold – access, recognition

and influence. These three issues will also be addressed in the Scottish case study analysis,

although with a wide degree of difference in both how they are discussed and what

implications this has for the nurturing of an ethic of care in statesmanship. As shown in the

following analysis, access, recognition and influence are important as the Zambian

government seeks to further restrict freedom of expression and the potential autonomous

impact of these organisations.

The British High Commissioner addressed questions literally and precisely. Given the

conditions of an official, recorded meeting, there was little figurative language. Presumably,

this was deliberate so as to avoid misinterpretation. The High Commissioner described the

proposed 2009 NGO Act as seeking to significantly reduce the power and influence of NGO

and civil society groups, and thus to legally change their status. This precarious legal

situation was highlighted by the National Youth Development Council (NYDC). In three

interviews over the course of a three week period Ms Malako, the NYDC Project Manager,

and Mr Innocent, the NYDC Press and General Secretary, provided a real-time insight into

the difficulties faced by organisations who are actually recognised and 'supported by the

state',[304] who nevertheless seek to retain autonomy, albeit under the continual threat of

withdrawal of support by the powers that be. The NYDC, at the time of the interviews, was

at the height of its recommendatory pitch, lobbying for a long overdue change in the

Constitution to recognise youth as a key resource, influence and developmental concern for

the Zambian state. The tension between the representation of young people as a specific

---

[303] Freedom House, *Countries at the Crossroads 2011 - Zambia*, 10 November 2011, available at: <http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4ecba6401a.html> [Accessed 8 March 2013]
[304] Ms Malako, Project Manager of the   National Youth Development Council of Zambia [Interview 1 June 2010]

societal group, and the rhetoric of 'One Nation, One Zambia', were at odds with each other

and since 1991 the latter had prevailed. In the interviews with Ms Malako and Mr Innocent -

and through witnessing the hype, activity and preparations underway in the NYDC office - it

was obvious that the process to change the outdated constitution from 1991 was an

arduous and highly politicised process 'to achieve a simple aim'.[305] The aim was to

constitutionally allow for youth delegates to be involved in the policy meetings and

processes concerning them. The disconnect between the government and youth was of

great concern especially with the growing tensions regarding the inapplicability of the 1991

constitution, after some twenty-eight years of a multiparty system (see above). The

interviews at the NYDC facilitated an interview with Mr Evans Misonda, President of the

Youth Association of Zambia, who was also directly involved in the lobbying for the change

in the constitution to make it more amenable to and representative of requirements of the

Zambian youth, as well as more reflective of what they could bring to society with the

support of a constitution that recognised their importance and significance.

Each of these interviews highlights that there is a distinct lack of a dialogical space.

As discussed in the conceptual discussion of the dialogical space, there can be tension and

there is a distinct risk of breakdown in communication as a result of bias, which can turn

into stalemate. However, at the very least an open dialogue takes place and there is

potential for a shared learning process. An ethic of care is therefore potentially encouraged

in government policy, whereas in Zambia the lack of the dialogical space directly influenced

a lack of an ethic of care being nurtured in statesmanship. Furthermore, while a lack of a

dialogical space is counterproductive in most policy settings, the Zambian case study shows

---

[305] Mr Innocent, Press and General Secretary of the National Youth Development Council of Zambia [Interview 2 June 2010]

a further imbedded flaw in its managing of what should be autonomous organisations, NGOs and civil society groups, like that of the Youth Association of Zambia. Lack of autonomy was explicit in the 2009 NGO Bill as it explicitly undermined the availability of voice and recognition, power and understanding of the value of the NGO community. The Bill relegated NGOs from 'civil society in organisation' to activists treated in the same legal sense as impromptu civil activist groups - those considered most divisive and problematic, and at odds with the state prioritisation of 'One Nation, One Zambia'. The dated constitution failed, and continues to fail, to acknowledge and thus tolerate the diversity of a nation in its ethnicities, needs, perspectives and practices. Furthermore, as discussed by those at the forefront of the campaign to change it, it fails to represent the future of the Zambian nation, its youth. By having Ministerial figures rather than youth leaders explicitly dealing with youth policy, the resultant decisions are made in an insensitive, objective and obtuse manner, which continues to undermine the importance of youth development through polices based on assumptions rather than sensitivity.

Political context from the High Commissioner's office

The interview with the British High Commissioner details a frank and critical account of the Zambian state in terms of is move to further regulate, and in turn restrict, civil society. The High Commissioner provided a candid, albeit self-aware and diplomatic, account of how the Zambian state *interacts* with civil society, NGOs and the media, explicitly highlighting the concerns regarding the NGO Regulation Bill outlined in 2009 and further amended in 2011 after the fieldwork process.

While the focus of this thesis does not extend to the analysis of diplomacy and to the influence of foreign diplomatic discourse in terms of its impact on policy, the interview raised some interesting issues regarding the international interpretation of the Zambian government's conduct in terms of representation of civil society and NGOs, which further emphasises the importance of the Zambian political situation as an interesting case study for IR.

The interview with the High Commissioner began with a discussion concerning the role and reception of NGOs in Zambia. The Commissioner was quick to highlight that there was a tension between the state and the local and national NGO community, and that such tension had also increased in its politicisation since 2009.

> [Y]ou're probably discovering in your research is very political at the moment… There was a government bill that was turned into law last year speaking to regulate NGOs, civil society organizations are they are quite often called here. And although the implementing legislation policy hasn't yet been passed, a lot of NGOs are very worried about what that means for the freedom of their actions.[306]

The High Commissioner highlighted and verified what had been published by leading civil society watchdog agencies in the previous year regarding the regulation of the NGO sector, as highlighted by CIVICUS: '[a]ny regulatory framework for NGOs must actively preserve the independence of the sector. The Bill in contrast seeks to emasculate the autonomy of NGOs and co-opt them into becoming extensions of the government'.[307] The 2009 Bill was discussed at length by the High Commissioner, as will be shown. However, it is important to first contextualise the NGO Bill in order to fully appreciate the critique voiced by Mr Carter.

---

[306] Tom Carter
[307] I. Srinath Secretary General of CIVICUS <http://reliefweb.int/report/zambia/zambia-ngo-bill-could-severely-restrict-civil-society-freedoms also see www.civicus.org> [Accessed 3rd April 2010 12.42 GMT]

The 2009 NGO Bill

The NGO Bill reinforced the authority of the government and its dominance over the NGO Registration Board. The NGO Registration Board vets, approves and 'regulates' the work of NGOs. The Bill explicitly stipulates the Registration Board's responsibility in 'approving', 'harmonising' and 'advising' NGOs, in order to bring them in line with the national developmental plan and policies. The ostensible aim was to make the process of development more efficient. However, the existence of such a registration board means that an NGO can only be recognised as such if its work is 'approved' by the state, leaving little opportunity for unapproved organisations.

To determine NGO status, the government reserves the absolute right to request important administrative and financial documentation within an 'unspecified time'.[308] Failure to provide such records results in the temporary suspension or cancellation of registration, meaning that the NGO is no longer recognised as such. The suspension of registration has a direct impact on the ability of the NGO to perform its primary task which is to represent vulnerable and disenfranchised communities. NGOs must register on a three-yearly basis and registration can be denied in the 'public interest', which is not defined in the Bill.[309] It is controversial that while the Bill demands transparency and full access to records, accounts and project planning from the NGOs 'in the public interest', it does not demand that the government honour this in the same vein. Arguably, NGOs cede some autonomy even before the application procedure, as they must revise their principles,

---

[308] CIVICUS
[309] CIVICUS

procedures and, in some cases, their identity in order to satisfy the criteria that the registration procedure demands.

The restrictive nature of the NGO Bill undermines the independence of Zambian NGOs and reserves the right of the state to choose what is recognised as an NGO. This excessive control can 'serve to impede rather than enable the freedom of association guaranteed by the Constitution of Zambia and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and the African Charter on Human and People's Rights to which Zambia is a party',[310] as highlighted by CIVICUS.

The government-controlled NGO Registration Board has three main functions, all of which are problematic both in principle and implementation. As identified and critiqued by CIVIUS the three powers are approval of NGOs' areas of work, provision of policy guidelines to harmonise NGOs' activities with the national development plan, and strategy advice for coordinating NGOs as government subsidiaries.[311] With such challenges in mind the tension in the NGO sector was discussed at length by the High Commissioner. First, he gave a general account of how he believed the British High Commission in Zambia could facilitate the representation of the NGO community through its diplomatic relationship with the Zambian government.

While the High Commissioner stated explicitly that they were impartial, his acknowledgement of the need for an impartial actor was an important insight regarding the NGO community, as it further highlighted what the many reports and analyses of the NGO Bill had sought to publicise, that the introduction of the Bill provided little impartial, unbiased support and recognition of the sector. That said, the Commissioner was conscious

---

[310] CIVIUS
[311] CIVIUS

of the limits of the British government's influence and also that it must be mindful of

Zambian state sovereignty.

> I think many NGOs see us as useful allies and they'd probably like us to do
> more, but we have to balance what we do against our relationship with the
> government.[312]

It was important to establish what the critical issues of discussion were between the British

High Commission and the Zambian government as this would also give an insight what could

also be interpreted as 'areas of concern'. Again the High Commissioner was very direct in his

answer.

> We have various levels of interaction with government…we talk at different
> levels through the government infrastructure as well. And you know a lot of
> those discussions are confidential as we talk pretty frankly…the areas we are
> currently focusing on primarily with the government here: NGO freedom,
> press freedom, and fight against corruption. And those are very much three
> things which are actually interrelated.[313]

The identification these three issues was of great significance to this thesis as it highlighted

that the inability of the NGO community to interact with the government critically and

autonomously, was not a biased account but rather one verified by those who can

convincingly claim to have a significant degree of objectivity.

Verifying the reluctance to welcome the diversity of views highlighted the acute and

internationally understood reluctance of the Zambian government to open a space for

dialogue with their citizens and the groups representing them. Furthermore, it highlighted

the democratic deficit and the inefficiency of the multi-party mandate that ostensibly

prevailed in the country. Highlighting such inefficiency, the High Commissioner drew upon

---

[312] Tom Carter
[313] Tom Carter

examples to further highlight that 'the state [was] effectively all-powerful'.[314] In doing so he

further concluded that due to this democratic anomaly, some NGOs effectively found

themselves to be an arm of, rather than independent of, the government. This insight led

the interview onto a discussion regarding Youth Empowerment and abuses in electoral

registration that was a current, local, national and international concern. Since the 2005

election, many young men and women had witnessed and become very much aware of the

injustices within the prevailing system, and it was that particular demographic who were, as

highlighted by one of the campaigners for the Anti-Voter Apathy Project,

> not necessarily *missing* votes form the government's perspective, it [was]
> more like conveniently silenced voters and also many, many votes in the
> favour of the people who are ruling us.[315]

The Anti-Voter Apathy Project was a vibrant and vocal group present on

Independence Avenue, the main diplomatic and governmental hub in Lusaka. They also had

a strong presence in the bus stations around the city centre, and one in particular in Kulima

Tower, the most populated bus station, located close to the parliament, business and

financial districts of Lusaka where many of the young men and women from the

'disenfranchised generation of workers, sons, daughters, future father and mothers of

Zambia'[316] would get to and from work, university and the large fruit, clothing and meat

markets in the surrounding area. The AVAP mounted civic and voter education campaigns,

targeting the disenfranchised demographic and also encouraging men and women to

register and even to go as far to re-registering to ensure that their vote counted for the

province that they were currently associated with, rather than being tied to a province they

---

[314] Tom Carter
[315] Anti-Voter Apathy Project
[316] Anti-Voter Apathy Project

no longer lived in, lost or hijacked of reviving voter participation in what might be a hotly

disputed election. The Electoral Commission of Zambia was convened in order to reconcile

the anomalies and gaps in the registration of the Zambian population. However, because of

the inefficiency of the national births, marriages, and deaths registration system, serious

flaws with the roll remain, and the names of hundreds of thousands of dead or migrated

people still appear on it.[317] An ECZ-led multi-stakeholder review of the Electoral Code of

Conduct in October 2010 urged that all election results be released within 48 hours, and

suggested that the police and other law enforcement agencies help assure compliance with

its provisions. However, the ECZ's investigative and enforcement capacities are very

limited.[318] This provided the context of the High Commissioners critique of the voter

registration problems experienced by the Zambian population.

The interview with the High Commissioner further emphasised the nuances of the

Zambian political experience, which is not best captured in Lusaka as it is the capital city of

Zambia. Due to it being the capital city the Lusakan population are more readily exposed to,

and therefore aware of, the various political problems and issues facing the general

Zambian citizen. There is an almost constant flow of media, both critical of and in

acclamation of the government. Furthermore, there is less division in terms of ethnicity.

Rather, the differentiation is more sensitive to the socioeconomic experience of the

individual and their family, ethnicity coming afterwards in terms of social identity and

linguistics in the Lusakan locality and townships. Therefore, when asked about the larger

national experience the High Commissioner, like the Counsellor, mentioned the

regionalisation of the political experience for the majority of Zambians who do not live,

---

[317] Freedom House
[318] Freedom House

work and therefore also do not vote in Lusaka. Such regionalization also highlights the

difficulty in establishing and implementing the policy of 'One Nation, One Zambia' so

ardently sought by the post-1991 governments.

> [T]here is this sort of regionalization if you like and people identify with
> parties from a regional perspective…So that is a big impediment in voter
> education because what do you educate them in? So I mean when we do
> talk to the political parties, which we do very often, one message I firmly
> stress is could parties actually switch a bit more to policies.[319]

The significance of the High Commissioner's focus on the NGO Bill and issues of voter

registration was that they helped establish an understanding of the contemporary political

climate that was not necessarily accessible through restricted media outlets or bias-free

from the NGOs struggling with the Bill in their own way. The interview, albeit relatively short

in comparison to the other interviews (where the interviewees were less conscious of time

and much more conscious of giving a detailed, rich and embellished account of their

experience with the state and its restrictive, selective policy towards the NGO sector), was

rich and insightful.

Using his own method of situated knowledge to highlight why he believed that the

Zambian electorate had not yet come to be an educated electorate, the High Commissioner

made a point of highlighting that the immaturity of both the multi-party system and the

electorate in Zambia, which had a direct impact on their collaboration, dialogue and ability

to trust one another: an insight into one of the many explanations as to why the

establishment of a dialogical space had not yet become available as a space where civil

society in organisation, the NGO community, and the state could come together in a manner

whereby a dialogue could be established and an ethic of care could be nurtured in state

---

[319] Tom Carter

policy. The Commissioner outlined that the statesmen in Zambia appeared much more comfortable 'in a dialogue with their own kind',[320] which was further reiterated throughout the interview process in Zambia and to a much lesser but still noticeable extent in the interviews conducted in Scotland. Kevin Dunion made the point that he made sure that meetings were held both in and out of Parliament, to take policy-makers out of their comfort zone and also to expose them to exactly who they were discussing. Thus, while an openness to civil society and the NGO community was and continues to be at odds with the policies of the Zambian administration, dialogue to some degree was indicated. However, as highlighted by the Commissioner, it had to be 'with their own kind' making accessible a dialogue between the High Commissioner and the party elites. While a direct correlation between this accessibility and the changing of policy is not addressed here, it does highlight that dialogue can be established. Furthermore, it also echoes the points raised by the Scottish NGO community about feeling pressure to make sure that they look, speak and act the part in order, in some instances, to be taken seriously.

Highlighting the Zambian government's perception of the electorate – that they were not educated in a manner that would enable the government to have a constructive dialogue -further emphasised the disconnect between civil society and the state. This is a structural disconnect. The implementation of policies to further isolate the NGO community from discourse with the state by relegating them to the legal status of activist groups and curbing their freedoms, was an insightful message and a view onto the perception of the relatively objective diplomatic community's understanding regarding why a democratic deficit prevailed.

---

[320] Tom Carter

The NGO Bill was one of the strongest examples provided by the High Commissioner as confirmation of a closed, reluctant and judgemental administration, one that proceeded with great caution and in doing so sought to silence rather than to converse with NGO groups, key stakeholders in civil society and key advocates for the needs of the diverse and disenfranchised Zambian population.

National Youth Development Council of Zambia (NYDC)

The analysis provided here of the interviews with the NYDC and with Mr Evans Misonda, Director of the Youth Association of Zambia, provide the contextual introduction to the interview with Mr Misonda. The interview was significant in that it confirmed the findings in the Scottish fieldwork, that the ethic of care was recognised by NGO workers. Furthermore, the interview process began to reveal that there was a possibility of a dialogue with the government, but that also a need for revision of how the state and the NGO sector interact. This was also highlighted in interviews with 'Sport In Action' and 'The Corridors of Hope'. For lessons to be learned the state had to be prepared to hear critique rather than silence it.

NYDC in context

The NYDC was created by a 1986 Act when Zambia was presided over by a one-party-state, a 'commandist governmental'[321] system. The aim was to establish a link between government and civil society in the late 1980s. The 1986 *Council Act Number 7* acknowledged the existence of 20 relatively small and loosely organised youth groups, most

---

[321] Ms Maloko

of which were limited in their scope. On the whole they focussed on the economic

circumstances of the 18-32 year old demographic in terms of labour and trade unions.

Furthermore, the youth groups in these early years had limited means of disseminating

information, publicising their cause and increasing membership beyond their geographical

locality, which invariably was in Lusaka, although with some groups established in the

Copper Belt, the northern region of Zambia.[322] Since 1986 there has been a 'mushrooming

of youth NGOs from 20 in 1986 to over 200',[323] thus there were a number of gaps in the 24

year old *Council Act Number 7,* which the NYDC was working to address. The NYDC provided

an insight into the difficultly of instigating change in policy.

During June 2010 the NYDC were attending a series of meetings focussing upon the

'Review of National Youth Development'[324] in Zambia. The interviews were conducted in the

midst of preparations, phone calls, and different people, representatives and youth groups

coming and going from the small office situated in Chainama, Lusaka. The opportunity to

observe the activity in the NYDC office during this time further enriched the context of the

situation being studied in Zambia for this thesis.

Since 1986 the NYDC has experienced little active support from the government.

Instead, youth groups approach them in order for their message to be filtered to

parliamentary committees. This system has both positive and negative consequences. The

positive consequence are that organisations with similar mandates come together and

establish a larger and therefore stronger network in pursuit of their collectively desired

policy change. This was also highlighted by those involved in small NGOs in Scotland when

---

[322] Ms Maloko
[323] Ms Maloka
[324] Meeting held on Thursday the 3rd of June 2010 , Hilton Hotel, Lusaka.

discussing the use of coalitions, or 'umbrellas',[325] as one interviewee described it when

discussing the Stop Climate Chaos Coalition. The coalition harnesses expertise and facilitates

a sharing of ideas. Moreover, it emphasises the need for change as identified by many

groups, amplifying the need for change. That said, there are also drawbacks associated with

even the most democratic and inclusive coalitions, especially when the central unit has been

established by the state, as in the Zambian case with the NYDC. Unlike the Stop Climate

Chaos Coalition in Scotland, the NYDC was only allowed to represent those youth groups

that had qualified for registration and were therefore recognised by the Zambian state. Thus

this was more a case of managing the youth groups and bringing them in-line with the NYDC

as their official representative: more state management than self-management.

The content of the interviews is described below but it is important to describe what

was witnessed in the office in preparation for the meetings. There was a concerted effort to

harness the expertise of the NYDC's members, NGOs and civil society groups to elicit change

that not only represented the demographic but underlined the diversity, plurality and

richness of Zambian youth.

While the NYDC were established and are supervised by the government they were,

as highlighted by the Project Manger Ms Maloko,

> [we are] always the last to know and always feel the least prepared for these
> meetings as agendas, location, time and other pretty crucial details always
> *seem* to take a long time to reach us here.[326]

Ms Maloko also expressed her frustration by showing the documentation from the

government ministers 'summoning' the NYDC to the 'Review of National Youth

Development' on the 3rd June 2010. Ms Maloko emphasised the following. The letter from

---

[325] Stop Climate Chaos interview
[326] Ms Maloko

the ministry said a two hour window had been allocated for the meeting with no further information about whether this would be a preliminary or one-off meeting. The government usually does not want to be tied to a timeline of meetings and wants to retain the power to determine the consultation process.

Ms Maloko spoke extensively of the requirement for a roadmap to ensure that a structural approach to change takes place. Ms Maloko highlighted the position of the NYDC in terms of how it can facilitate and enrich this structural change, and it is here that the potential opportunity to nurture an ethic of care in state policy can be seen. While the government seemed to want to 'get the policy right',[327] Ms Maloko explicitly stated that a 'roadmap' was required in order for this to happen. Ms Maloko's use of the term roadmap was more in terms of a mapping of the youth groups and practices in Zambia, rather than just a linear map from point to point. The roadmap, one of the key items on the NYDC's agenda for the meeting was to ensure change that was fully representative of youth civil society.

> [A]nd this means extensive and detailed research, surveying and monitoring og the current youth climate through the analysis of data and surveys produced by the register of organisations, NGOs and stakeholders.[328]

To achieve meaningful change, close consultation with the Zambian youth regarding their needs, and sensitivity to detail, was required from the outset. This shows the significance of a communicative relationship with the subjects of policy, thus reinforcing the requirement for an ethic of care and its nurturing in the meetings that the NYDC had been summoned too. A further reiteration of the ethic of care, as outlined in this thesis and defined by the interviewees, was highlighted by Ms Maloko when she described the most important issue

---

[327] Ms Maloko
[328] Ms Maloko

at hand and on the agenda for the meeting the following day. The NYDC were most concerned about the make-up of the committee charged with making decisions on behalf of Zambian youth and the issues that most concerned this particular demographic. The long standing criticism of the Board of Directors of the of parliamentary youth committee was not only how members were elected but most importantly who they were and what message such appointments projected regarding the relational ties the Board had with those they were appointed to represent. Ms Maloko and Mr Innocent's concerns were constantly reaffirmed by the many visitors to the NYDC office on the three days that the interviews took place. As highlighted by Mr Innocent, these visitors were representatives of the Zambian youth council and groups specifically working with youth education, representation, health and employment. Furthermore, they were well-informed and aware of their rights as citizens, and of the anomalies in their constitution. These 'legitimate, active representatives' when compared to the 'incumbent inactive Board of Directors' were the real stakeholders in the Zambia youth story, but unfortunately these were the very people who, while registered as legitimate groups, did not have a 'ticket to the concert'.[329] Ms Maloko outlined that one of the main changes that the NYDC advocated was to the election of Board of Directors' members. The main concern of the NYDC was the disconnect between the board and the cause, as board members were appointed directly by Ministers. In order to make the board more representative, the NYDC was building an ambitious case to advocate that the stakeholders should elect and therefore appoint the members of the board. This proposition highlighted the need for a dialogical space which could be created through the appointment of board members with an interest in and understanding of the youth demographic.

---

[329] Mr Innocent

The interviewees understanding of the possible benefits of their knowledge of and engagement with the civil society highlighted a readiness to share and nurture the changes required in the constitution and the process of the appointment of the Board of Directors.'[W]e are considered to be, have much more information working on the ground than they would have up in the government'.[330] However, while this acknowledgment is key, and the presence of a self-conscious ethic of care highlights the readiness for the NYDC and their associated NGOs, youth groups and interest groups to directly communicate with the government, the lack of time, space and any welcoming of a rich and wide diversity of youth groups to the 'Review of National Youth Development' meeting on the 3rd of June was indicative of a lack of readiness from the governmental side to enter into a dialogical space with the NYDC and associated groups. Instead, as Ms Maloko highlighted,

> as you can see we spend time, we open our doors and welcome everyone in to tell us what they want us to say, we do the research, we go prepared but we only have two hours and we will be there with the newspapers and the radio who are also summoned by the Ministers, they want photos which takes time, so what can we expect? A dialogue, there's little time for that, a monologue, maybe and monologue that will indicate what the government is planning...[331]

Youth Association of Zambia (YAZ)

The interview analysis thus far has shown disconnect between the constitution and the political terrain in Zambia, especially regarding the tentative status of NGOs as representative groups aiming to communicate with the government. During the interview process the NYDC were conscious of their own status as a bridge between youth civil society groups and the government. While their experience highlighted that an ethic of care was

---

[330] Mr Innocent
[331] Ms Maloko

prevalent in their workings and representative mandate, the organisation was also keen to show the even greater difficulty experienced by the groups that they were seeking to accommodate at the 'Review of National Youth Development'. In order to further highlight the lack of dialogical space and inclusion, the NYDC introduced Mr Evans Misonda, President of the Youth Association of Zambia, an independent Youth NGO affiliated with the NYDC, as per the *Council Act Number 7* of the Zambian Constitution. YAZ was registered as an NGO at the time of the interview, but there was real possibility that the YAZ was soon to be relegated under the new NGO Bill, and subsequently recognised merely as a civil society group, emphasising its difficultly in establishing a dialogue with the state despite its work with Zambian youth.

During the interview that took place at Freedomway in Central Lusaka on the 3rd of June 2010 - the same day that the 'Review of National Youth Development' meeting referred to earlier - Mr Misonda provided examples of the work that the NGO community in Zambia do regardless of their ability to access policymakers. In highlighting YAZ's commitment to civil society, Mr Misonda further grounded the theory that an ethic of care resonated in the philosophy and the work conducted by the local NGO community. By showing the sensitivity, bias and communicative interaction with Zambian youth, and a readiness to represent them in dialogue with the state, Mr Misonda highlighted that policies representing his civil society group, could be much more efficient through collaboration with government. Mr Misonda represented a frustrated but resilient section of Zambian civil society, which is key to the progression of the Zambian state. 'Youth, after all, are our future'.[332]

---

[332] Mr Misonda

The interview with Mr Misonda differed in terms of the general atmosphere, flow and openness of the interview context and conversation. As Director of YAZ, a completely independent NGO (but nevertheless nationally recognised as a member of the NYDC), with localised offices and representation groups in each of the provinces in Zambia, Mr Misonda was accountable only to those that he stood to represent. Therefore he took the opportunity to speak frankly about the work, challenges, interactions and concerns that YAZ faced and hoped to overcome in the restrictive political situation in Zambia.

Mr Misonda highlighted YAZ's different projects and their approach to educating and facilitating the representation of the Zambian youth through a project called 'Building Local Democracy' to involve youth in public institutions and another to give young people information about HIV/AIDS. The significance of these two particular projects was that they aimed at educating and empowering Zambian youth as responsible members of civil society, 'strengthening and building democracy in understanding and practice'.[333] Both the Building Local Democracy Project and the HIV/AIDS education programme are common projects assumed by local, national and also international NGO organisations and thus are often overlooked by the state as projects that, as Mr Misonda highlighted 'are already taken care of'.[334] The main issue here therefore was that while the state acknowledged the importance of these projects, its investment was limited. Thus it could only claim to really directly benefit from the outcome if indeed it chose to do so. In terms of the greater involvement desired by YAZ, this created a disconnect between civil society and the government. This disconnect can be interpreted as the verification of a lack of dialogue and engagement between the Zambian state and the YAZ NGO.

---

[333] Mr Misonda
[334] Mr Misonda

It was important to explore why the NGO staff worked in the sector and pursued work that was rewarding in terms of their relationship with those they represented, but on the other hand deeply frustrating and at times ambiguous in terms of their relationship with the state. Such analysis was important in both the Scottish and Zambian case studies as it facilitated a greater understanding and verification of the ethic of care, which emerged as one of the central and defining aspects of their organisational but also personal role within the organisations they worked for. Each of the interviewees when asked about their motivation, role and understanding of what they contributed to the organisation and its cause highlighted that they had a direct and involved attachment to the community that the NGO represented. As highlighted by Mr Misonda, his direct and interpersonal link to YAZ further strengthened his ability to speak for Zambian youth. Mr Misonda outlined his path from volunteering with YAZ as a student to his appointment as its Director. Thus the relational tie between him and the organisation was thus observed.

The knowledge cited as essential by Mr Misonda was a further indicator of the resonance of the ethic of care in YAZ as an organisation. Furthermore, Mr Misonda highlighted the specialist and in-depth knowledge he had which facilitated one of the initial steps in the understanding that youth policy was a necessary component for the government's agenda. Being directly involved in a diverse range of provincial and national youth community and organisational projects, Mr Misonda highlighted the value of this intimate relationship and knowledge from experience.

Mr Misonda's active participation enabled him to show the government what was missing in its policy. Through experience, evidence, knowledge and a sensitivity to the needs and requirements expected of the policy, Mr Misonda and his youth organizations were able

to verifiably challenge and highlight its shortcomings. However, while this awareness, facilitated through an inherent ethic of care, was tangible, its value could not be realised due to the lack of a dialogical space. As the most powerful actor in this exchange, the state had the power to create and explore, or silence and ignore the potential value of such relational and experiential knowledge.

Mr Misonda candidly described the anomalies in the very policy that was supposed to represent Zambian youth highlighting, 'when we checked in the policy, there were a number of issues that were missing in the policy, and it was not matching the current situation'.[335] The policy, from 1986, failed to address key issues such as HIV/AIDS and volunteer management. It was the NGO that did the research, educated young Zambians and presented the government with ways to make policy reflect of the needs of the Zambian youth so desperately under-represented by a dated policy.

Mr Misonda was asked how YAZ conducted their research and interacted with the community, as it was important to understand if he was an advocate, as the other NGO leaders and personnel interviewed had been, of the creation of a dialogical space. As shown below he described the importance of direct, intimate and educated policy-making and also the importance of directly interacting and learning from the community, and thus directly interacting and imparting knowledge to the government.

> So we went out, because for much of the young people in Zambia...they didn't know what the policy document is all about...So the young people before the government went there, the young people knew exactly what the youth policy was...So when the government went out in some places they tried to manipulate the young people but the young people said "no, we know about this thing, there is nothing that you can tell us about the policy, this is the direction we want to take as young people, this should be a youth

---

[335] Mr Misonda

driven policy, we want to be fully involved in this policy formulation." And that's how the youth policy was done, it started with the provinces, there were some provincial meetings, and then we had the big national event.[336]

Mr Misonda's insight provided further clarification of the need for a dialogical space in Zambia, a space to allow for gaps to be filled in outdated policy. Furthermore, this allowed greater understanding to be established in the policy process that research, interaction and direction is ultimately provided by those who are in close liaison with the community, to verify what is required by the community from polices enacted by the state on their behalf.

This interview ended due to time constraints rather than there being a stop in the flow of information. In ending the interview Mr Misonda provided an added insight into his understanding of the value of YAZ which was constantly reiterated by the NGO interviewees across the spectrum of NGOs interviewed. This insight reiterated both the ethic of care and the state's reluctance to engage in a dialogical engagement concerning the policy process.

Government from their perspective cannot work in isolation, they need us, we supplement government therefore…we have so much knowledge that they don't have, that they depend so much on us for, like they have been talking about… but we know how to push them a little bit hard because in Zambia, especially now, if you push government too much, then the government will make no comment… we also make sure that as working as an alternative, we do not completely leave government behind, because otherwise our relationship is very difficult.[337]

Project Zambia - Sport in Action

---

[336] Mr Misonda
[337] Mr Misonda

The Zambian case study was conducted in conjunction with the University of St Andrews 'Project Zambia 2010'.[338] Project Zambia aims to raise awareness and introduce volunteer university students with a sporting and mentoring background – following training over the course of a full academic year - to working as peer leaders for a period of 12 weeks at Sport in Action (SIA), a Zambian NGO based in the capital Lusaka. SIA aims to improve people's quality of life through sport and recreational activities. Founded in 1998, SIA was the first Zambian sports NGO. Sport for development (the use of sport as a tool for social change) is its underlying principle. SIA staff and volunteers work with more than 160,000 children from all 24 Zambian districts each week, many of whom come from challenging backgrounds. SIA transforms lives through 'knowledge enhancement in the area of health and life skills, behavioural change towards both family and peers and improvement in sporting abilities'.[339] SIA plays a key role in the Lusakan youth community and also in the facilitation of awareness and outreach projects for children, youth and adults directly affected by diagnosis, social stigma and myths of the HIV virus.

SIA was established in response to a lack of credible educational advice regarding health and wellbeing, directly experienced by its founders and their communities. SIA is therefore directly connected with the community which it seeks to represent and aid: they are established *by* and *in* the Lusakan community, led by highly respected civic community peers who have been supported in the assumption of their role as educators and leaders who activity encourage participation of the community as a whole. The key here is that the

---

338 Sport In Action Homepage <http://www.sportinaction.org.zm/> [Accessed June2009]
[339] SIA Hompage. Sport has the power to act as a mobilising tool in a way that no other activities do. A combination of the fun, enjoyment and physical challenges experienced by children the world over has led to the conclusion that it is the ideal arena through which valuable life lessons can be acquired. In light of this Sport In Action works on delivering development programs in schools and communities throughout which bring about motivation, self-reliance and self-development through social, cultural, political and economic empowerment. Each component is underpinned by education on HIV & AIDS, drug and alcohol abuse prevention, gender equality and child rights.

NGO is directly established by the community it seeks to represent, as highlighted in the sections outlining the ethic of care as a concept. This 'sensitivity' is embedded in the ethic of care which local civil NGOs display toward their recipients and communities. Such sensitivity is one of the key components in the successful communication of SIA's message to the Lusakan communities it supports.

Situated Learning and observation with SIA

The SIA element of the fieldwork differed from those interactions with the interviewees detailed above. As one of the group leaders for Project Zambia 2010, as a researcher I was given a key opportunity to follow the work of the organisation, which enriched the knowledge gained from the fieldwork experience. Deliberately, due to my role as a researcher, my task was mainly comprised of shadowing the different kinds of roles in the organisational structure to gain a greater insight into how the organisation interacted with the community it represented, and also into how it interacted and accessed state personnel, policy and implementation. As highlighted in the discussion of the methodological process and approach to this research project, knowledge gained directly from situating oneself close to the process is essential to gain specific understanding.

Frustration, disappointment and exhaustive pressure within SIA was observed, reiterating the need for a dialogical space to facilitate knowledge sharing with the state. The following examples are accounts of my observations noted during an 8 week period and provide further validation of the resonance of the ethic of care in the NGO mandate and the potential insights that could be transferred in order to improve health, sporting and

educational practice if there was a positive, consistent and two-way dialogue between

NGOs such as SIA, the local Lusakan municipality and the Zambian state as a whole.

The SIA's head office is in central Lusaka, at the epicentre of the capital's activities

around health and education. The significance of the SIA offices location was twofold. First

and foremost, also cited as the most important locational aspect, was accessibility for the

peer leaders, children and young adults who were involved and represented by SIA. In

discussing the location of the building with both Mwapi and Frank, Directors of the NGO and

also with Innocent, Staffi and Joy, part-time volunteers and peer leaders at their respective

schools, accessibility was key in the mission of the NGO. Not only was it about accessibility

to sport and education, but also accessibility to those that were at the heart of the

organisation, the Directors, as highlighted by one of the managers, George,

> [w]ant to see, feel and witness the changes that we are making. They also
> need to see when it's not going well, and why, they don't want stories, it's
> better to be abler to bear witness and make judgment.[340]

In terms of accessibility, its location meant that SIA was also able to make a very

strong show of accountability and transparency, necessary components of the ethic of care

in practice. The second aspect of the accessible and central location of the SIA office was its

proximity to parliament and governmental offices. Furthermore, it was situated directly next

door to one of the Senior Lusakan Counsellors, who requested that the staff interviewed

from his team were not directly named. The Counsellor provided significant insight into the

disjuncture between physical locality and accessibility to government, even from his own

elected representative position. Notwithstanding the proximity of the parliament and SIA,

institutional, bureaucratic and constitutional distance was maintained, as could be seen by

---

[340]Mr. George Kakomwe, Administration Manager, Sport In Action

the need to formally address and post documentation, and to wait for long periods for responses. This contrasted with the parliamentary system as described by the Scottish interviewees.

Throughout the fieldwork process, the professional operation of SIA was noted specifically because it conflicted with the NGO Bill and its justification to relegate NGO status, further undermining their perceived value and also lowering the obligation of the state to interact with them as anything other than large community groups. The ethic of care was witnessed, rather than just being described as in the interviews. It was shown to be a practical ethic of communicative interaction, sensitivity, pragmatism and understanding. All of these relational aspects were part of the day-to-day work of the organisation, shown by all staff regardless of their position in the organisation. This confirmed the resonance of the ethic of care in practice. The absence of opportunity to interact with the local and national government despite the organisational proximity and also the interrelated focus on education, health and HIV was a frustrating observation. However, it verified the particular need of the state to understand the value of creating a dialogical space for engagement and knowledge transfer.

Summary of the Zambian case study

The Zambian case study has shown that a tenuous and ambiguous political situation impeded the nurturing of an ethic of care in statesmanship, and curtailed the rich lessons that can be potentially learned from the sharing of experiential knowledge and understanding between the NGO and the state. While the overall conclusions drawn from both the Zambian and Scottish case studies as a whole are outlined in the concluding

chapter, the lessons learned here by the state are limited and remain hypothetical due to

the undermining of the position of the NGO community, the perception of youth

organisations as activist organisations, and the democratic deficit created by policy and

outlook that fails to incorporate the rich, valuable and facilitative ethic of care as shown by

the local NGO groups.

Chapter 5
Case Study Two:
Scotland

The Scottish case study makes the most persuasive case for the establishment of a productive, proactive and valuable dialogical space occupied by both the NGO and the state. As highlighted in the conceptual chapter, the understanding of the key importance and value of the local NGO community is an important step towards the appreciation of the dialogical space and the lessons learned therein. This case study highlights the importance of the dialogical space in practice, based on what the ethic of care can facilitate as a tool for understanding, communicating and articulating the needs of those who are represented by the local NGO community. What is shown here - through analysis of the fieldwork interviews and political climate in Scotland - is that an ethic of care is nurtured in statesmanship through conversations with the local NGO community. These lessons further strengthen civil society and government as they show an understanding of their respective expertise and value. Furthermore, it highlights that the ethic of care is in fact a pragmatic and normative ethic, as opposed to an abstract notion or exclusively feminist postulation.

As will be shown in the analysis of the Scottish case study, the 'Third Sector', also referred to as the voluntary sector, has emerged as a prolific and powerful political and social area of Scottish politics. The sectors are divided in the following way and their ownership is outlined. There are three sectors identified in Scottish socio-political discourse. The business and private sector is privately owned and profit motivated. The public sector is 'owned' and controlled by the state, and includes all government institutions and parliamentary issues and affairs and policy. The voluntary sector, the social economy, or third sector, includes a wide range of community, voluntary and not-for-profit activities and

organisations. The significance of such categorisation, especially regarding the third sector, is that it recognises the influential non-state components of the social and political character of the Scottish consciousness, one which is directly conducive to the establishment of many dialogical spaces in which the policy process can be discussed and negotiated by the many diverse groups involved and affected by it. While the specific focus is on the NGO community located in the Third Sector, an understanding of the other sectors is key to placing the devolved Scottish political character in context.

The following section provides the political context for the Scottish case study and explores how the third sector is involved directly in the policy-making process intrinsic to the devolved Scottish context. Following the political contextualisation, some interviews will be specifically explored, interviews that further add to the thesis findings and conclusions that significant lessons are learned in the dialogical space when the state and local NGO come together and converse. This is made possible through the construction of a dialogical space as the lessons learned by the state are directly attributed to an ethic of care as a relational, experiential and interpersonal ethic. The Scottish case study analysis ends with a consideration of the current trend in Scottish third sector involvement in the policy-making process. Thus, the lessons learned are shown to be implemented in the nature and practice of Scottish politics.

Scottish political context

While there is an extensive catalogue of research regarding the Third Sector and how it interacts with the government, this research predominantly focuses on the sector's financing and expenditure as it is funded predominantly by public funds and enjoys tax

breaks through organisations being recognised as non-profit charitable organisations. Much

attention, therefore, is paid to its use and also the potential abuse of power it may exercise.

However, while the decisions made are scrutinised for their potential costs and long term

financial and economic gain, there is also extensive research into the values, rationale and

interactions that are involved in these processes, as well as the social mentality and societal

make-up of the civil and governmental community in Scotland. As highlighted on the

Scottish government website,

> The Third Sector makes a direct impact on the growth of Scotland's economy, the wellbeing of its citizens and the improvement of its public services.
>
> The Third Sector - comprising community groups, voluntary organisations, charities, social enterprises, co-operatives and individual volunteers - has an important role in helping the Scottish Government achieve its purpose of creating a more successful country with opportunities for all to flourish, through achieving sustainable economic growth.
>
> At a local level the relationship between local government and the third sector is extremely important given the role of the third sector in Community Planning Partnerships and developing Single Outcome Agreements
>
> The Scottish Government is committed to the development of an enterprising third sector in Scotland.[341]

As the third sector increases in scope and in its contribution to policy and the delivery of

services and education to the local community, it only seems correct that it should be

discussed as part of, rather than as an alternative to, the political process and culture in

Scotland. The third sector has now become part of policy rhetoric, recognised as a key

societal component by political parties and civil society. The introduction and use of 'Third

Sector Interfaces' also contributes greatly to the establishment and strength of a vibrant

---

[341] http://www.gov.scot/Topics/People/15300

dialogical space. 'Interfaces provide a single point of access for support and advice for the

third sector within the local area. They provide a strong coherent and cohesive

representation of the third sector with clear links to Community Planning Partnerships and

Single Outcome Agreements'.[342] Furthermore, the breadth and comprehensive make-up of

the agreements facilitate a point of contact and also a place of legitimatised discussion

between the third sector and the government. Interfaces are funded to deliver the following

four areas of activity across the whole local authority area:

- Volunteering development
- Social Enterprise development
- Supporting and developing a strong third sector
- Building the third sector relationship with community planning.[343]

As will be shown in the interview discussion there is a strong emphasis on knowledge

exchange and enhancement between the third sector and the government. This is

illustrated in publications resulting from discussions in the dialogical spaces created by close

collaboration between the actors involved. 'Stakeholder Engagement - Learning Exchanges'

are but one of the many examples available on the Scottish government's website. 'From

Local to National and Back Again' is a report on a series of Learning Exchanges and

Workshops between Scottish Government officials and third sector organisations. The

exchanges were arranged by Community Health Exchange, Voluntary Health Scotland and

Community Food and Health Scotland.[344] As shown in the opening section of the report,

there is an acknowledgement of the value of each actor's expertise: 'the Third Sector Unit

---

[342] http://www.gov.scot/Topics/People/15300/Localism
[343] http://www.gov.scot/Topics/People/15300/Localism
[344] http://www.gov.scot/Topics/People/15300/StakeholderEngagementCHEX

sought to create opportunities for structured dialogue between community-led and voluntary health organisations and Scottish Government's officials. The focus on co-producing services within preventative health care and tackling health inequalities has helped to create a positive environment for the exchange of ideas and practice – which we were keen to exploit. The Learning Exchanges were to increase the understanding of each other's role and the potential for joint working on the planning and delivery of policies on health outcomes.'[345] From the learning outcomes aspired to, three in particular emphasise an ethic of care, these are

- the opportunity to identify commonalities in approach, common challenges and mutual solutions
- the opportunity to identify skills, knowledge and resources that can be shared between the organisations and Scottish Government departments
- the opportunity to reflect, analyse and pass on any learning from the Exchanges. [346]

As will be demonstrated, the local NGO community is a key component of the third sector, which made a significant contribution to the making of the devolved Scottish Executive. For this reason, the NGO community is part of the day-to-day political process and thus an innate part of the devolved Scottish political character.

The posture and dialogical space utilised and valued by NGOs and the state in a devolved Scottish context is unique and deserves to be recognised as a project that facilitates learning, knowledge exchange and policy effectiveness. In May 1997, Labour, led by Tony Blair, won the British general elections. One of the election pledges in Labour's

---

[345] http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0040/00409050.pdf
[346] http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0040/00409050.pdf

1997 platform was devolution – self-government for Scotland if the people of Scotland so wished.[347] The greater incorporation of the third sector, UK wide, into a more collaborative framework was also part of the New Labour strategy in 1997, as highlighted by Jeremy Kendall, in his paper *'The mainstreaming of the third sector into public policy in England in the late 1990s: whys and wherefores'*.[348] 'The voluntary or third sector in England is now receiving more sustained attention from policymakers than ever before. This paper claims that this situation, particularly as given tangible expression through the development of a Compact between the Government and representatives of the third sector, amounts to the mainstreaming of the third sector onto the public policy agenda'.[349] The specific focus on the incorporation of a third sector was very much part of a model of a new Labour style of governance. The first elections to Scottish Parliament were held on 6 May 1999, and on 1 July 1999, the Parliament officially assumed legislative powers in the following fields: healthcare, education and vocational studies, local government, social work, tourism, the environment, Scottish roads, ports, police and fire departments, agriculture, forestry, fisheries, sport and culture, state registers and statistics, among others.[350] Devolution, as explored by Alcock in his report from the Third Sector research centre *'Devolution or Divergence? Third Sector Policy across the UK since 2000'*[351] highlighted that a number of key policy-making powers were devolved from Westminster to these new administrations. These include policy on and support for third sector activity in the different countries.[352]

It is interesting to note that the third sector has been recognised as very much part of governance in the UK, and subsequently in the devolved governments of the UK in the

---

[347] http://www.maailmavaade.ee/nr23-en/scotland-what-next
[348] https://core.ac.uk/download/files/67/96222.pdf
[349] https://core.ac.uk/download/files/67/96222.pdf
[350] http://www.maailmavaade.ee/nr23-en/scotland-what-next
[351] http://www.birmingham.ac.uk/generic/tsrc/documents/tsrc/working-papers/working-paper-2.pdf
[352] http://www.birmingham.ac.uk/generic/tsrc/documents/tsrc/working-papers/working-paper-2.pdf

1990s. The notion of a third sector has been incorporated into the policy discourse and practice of UK governance since the end of the last century. It is linked to the political and policy goals of the Labour Government to develop a new approach to social policy reform – a third way, between the state and the market – and the pursuit of this through a process of modernisation and marketisation that has opened up a mixed economy of welfare to a wider range of service providers, of which TSOs are increasingly key players.[353]

In Scotland, although this sentiment was not unique, there was an obvious bias in public opinion to more collective and egalitarian solutions. As the first, First Minister of Scotland Sir Donald Dewar professed while addressing critics of the Scottish Parliament, '[c]ynicism, together with unrealistic expectation, are the two great bugbears of politics'.[354] He vowed on the opening of the Scottish Parliament in Holyrood that this cynicism would not shape this new chapter in Scottish history. In his opening speech to the parliament, Dewar's rhetoric captured the values of a progressive Scotland, 'Wisdom. Justice. Compassion. Integrity. Timeless values. Honourable aspirations for this new forum of democracy, born on the cusp of a new century. We are fallible. We will make mistakes. But we will never lose sight of what brought us here: the striving to do right by the people of Scotland; to respect their priorities; to better their lot; and to contribute to the commonweal.'[355] This was an expression of support for a shared moral economy that spanned social classes, as opposed to a narrow anti-Thatcherite reaction to Conservative government and rule. Therefore, the New Scottish Executive had to try and capture this in the structure and practice of the new parliament. The third sector, through a change in

---

[353] http://www.birmingham.ac.uk/generic/tsrc/documents/tsrc/working-papers/working-paper-2.pdf
[354] Donald Dewar , addressing critics of the Scottish Parliament
[355] http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/EducationandCommunityPartnershipsresources/New_Parliament_Levels_A-F.pdf

British governance and the official recognition of a Scottish policy preference, was brought into the fold as part of the political community acting with the government, as well as lobbying them, before the new Scottish parliament. This was seen, by Dewar as an opportunity for the Scottish community to be heard locally, and subsequently nationally and internationally: 'I look forward to the days ahead when this Chamber will sound with debate, argument and passion. When men and women from all over Scotland will meet to work together for a future built from the first principles of social justice'.[356]

The committee structure of the Scottish executive complements the diverse plurality of the Scottish third sector, while an increase in the number of political parties and independent candidates also indicates a political understanding of diversity and the necessity for the political system to reflect the plurality of the civil society is purports to represent. The Scottish Parliament is a unicameral, committee-based legislature. A conscious decision was taken not to follow the Westminster practice where the committee system is criticised for being weak, encouraging executive dominance, and thwarting effective legislative scrutiny.[357] NGOs have negotiated a part in the policy-making process and have been brought into the fold of policy-making and delivery. The Scottish government understands that, although there is a shared Scottish value, there is a plurality in Scottish community needs and a divergence in community focus, all of which the government cannot span and cannot deliver on without the support of the third sector, its expertise, insight and knowledge. The committee system was designed to:

---

[356] http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/EducationandCommunityPartnershipsresources/New_Parliament_Levels_A-F.pdf

[357] http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/visitandlearn/Education/18643.aspx

- Encourage significant public involvement in the Parliament's activities. For example, individuals as well as members of organisations and groups can appear before committees or write to them to give evidence.

- Enable the Parliament to hold the Scottish Government to account effectively. Part of a committee's work is to scrutinise the work of the Scottish Government. The ministers in the Government do not sit on committees but can be asked to appear before the committee to answer questions.

- Encourage the sharing of power. Committees can investigate any item which falls within their remit, hold inquiries and make recommendations to Parliament and the Government. Committees also have the power to initiate legislation themselves.[358]

The very nature of the third sector reflects this diversity and therefore Holyrood, through its committee structure (unlike its Westminster counterpart) has built up a more professionalised and in some ways more institutionalised relationship with the third sector. Committees carry out inquiries and call on witnesses to give evidence. These witnesses can be from pressure groups, professional groups, Government ministers, or they can be any individual or organisation that can offer information or advice. There is also a special committee known as the Public Petitions Committee which gives anyone living in Scotland direct access to the Parliament. Any individual or group can make a request (petition) for the Parliament to take a view on a matter of public interest or concern; to change existing legislation, or to introduce new legislation.[359]

This was one of the main topics of discussion that consistently arose during the fieldwork interviews with the Scottish local NGOs. As will be shown the interviewees -from small community-based initiatives who described themselves more as community groups

---

[358]http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/visitandlearn/Education/18643.aspx
[359] http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/visitandlearn/Education/18643.aspx

than NGOs, to very professional organisations such as Oxfam and Save the Children - all stressed the fact that the parliamentary structure of the Scottish executive meant that there was an increased accessibility, ease of dialogue and also a better rapport with the Scottish executive than they had experienced in the years before the devolution bill. This was partly due to the democratic deficit and a genuine disparity between the needs of Scottish people and the time awarded to such needs in the Westminster parliament.

It is still debated whether Scotland was much in control of its own even before the devolution bill. However, there was no official recognition of the Scottish third sector as a specific entity of its own. The third sector was recognised as a block and, in spite of its great diversity, was allocated little time in parliamentary affairs. As highlighted by one of the interviewees who described the difference between his lobbying experience in Westminster and that in Holyrood:

> You get a chance. It's almost like pitching for a film or something, you know you get five minutes to rally up and then you're out. And you leave some documents, but you don't really know if they're actually listening because the next person that goes in will get another five minutes and they'll do another conveyor belt of lobbying.[360]

While this can be the case with the Scottish executive, it was consistently argued that it is much clearer how to target the pitch in the Scottish Executive committees, where those targeted seem to have a greater interest in what is being pitched. In fact, while there were Scottish arms of national NGO committees, when it came to lobbying the Scottish arms became part of the national, British body of the organisation, which led to a dilution of the demands, questions and pressure that they could feasibly apply down south.

---

[360] David Askill, Director International Business Development, Adam Smith College

The change that has been expressed by the NGOs is that they work on, lobby for, and continue to discuss their own polices. In contrast, in the past they would work on their own specific polices but would have to lobby for them within their national British framework, which would homogenise the voices of the national groups into one national British arm. The polices eventually lobbied for would be as a result of a comprise between the national NGO groups. By the time polices got to Westminster they had changed as a result of compromise, often at the expense of some of the specific interests of the national arms. A national climate change NGO in Scotland that would be lobbying concerning wind farms and fisheries, North Sea oil, or issues effecting island environmental sustainability, would often be disregarded at the national level.

Thus, the local identity of NGOs in the UK often lost their identity when faced with the need to compromise in wider national coalitions. While this still happens in Scotland it is to a much lesser degree due to the subsidiary power enjoyed by local councils. This has allowed for more structured dialogue between the Scottish executive committees and NGOs. This interpersonal relationship that emerged is reflected in the fieldwork interviews as NGO staff often speak on first name terms about their relationship with ministers and civil servants, with whom they interact with on specific issues that fall under both the remit of the NGO and the remit of the specific subcommittee of the Scottish executive that they target. Thus, an engaged dialogical space has emerged as part of the devolution process.

A parliament that mirrors the structure of civil society

Devolution gives Scotland one of the widest ranges of competences of any devolved or federal government in Europe, excepting fiscal powers. The Scottish executive is reliant on

its agencies and other external organisations for support and input, which incorporates the third sector and the private sector as part of its structural, procedural and developmental strategy. The Consultative Steering Group that was to make the recommendations for what became the Scottish Executive had bequeathed to the parliament four principles: power-sharing; accountability; access and participation; and equal opportunities.[361] These principles grew out of a long process beginning in the 1979 and then in the 1989 Scottish Constitutional Convention. The strong moral tone in this and other Home Rule documents was a deliberate attempt to establish principles which were not based on political whim or electoral expedient.

In all our deliberations we have been struck by the degree of consensus that exists. In particular, that the establishment of the Scottish Parliament offers the opportunity to put in place a new sort of democracy in Scotland, closer to the Scottish people and more in tune with Scottish needs. People in Scotland have high hopes for their Parliament, and in developing our proposals we have been keen to ensure that these hopes will be met. In particular our recommendations envisage an open, accessible Parliament; a Parliament where power is shared with the people; where people are encouraged to participate in the policy-making process which affects all our lives; an accountable, visible Parliament; and a Parliament which promotes equal opportunities for all.[362] In short, Scotland's parliament was to be a creation of civil society, and hence a doctrine of parliamentary sovereignty was appropriate. Power lay 'with the people' which was expressed through the emerging

---

[361] http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/PublicInformationdocuments/Report_of_the_Consultative_Steering_Group.pdf

[362] http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/PublicInformationdocuments/Report_of_the_Consultative_Steering_Group.pdf

political process, with the overarching principle being 'power sharing'. The kind of democracy envisaged was broadly participative rather than narrowly representative.

The devolved Parliament has 17 committees and their membership reflects the political composition of the parliament, with no single party having a majority in any of the committees. MSPs are members of the committee, normally there are between five and fifteen MSPs on each committee, selected with regard to the balance of political parties in the Parliament.[363] There was a clear intention in the development of this public policy: the new system required a government which had a popular mandate, as well as a deeper, and inevitably longer system of participation of the third sector. The argument was that key aspects of policy should not be left to politicians and civil servants, and that at the very least their decisions should be informed by people who know most about particular policy areas and services, including the general public and others in Scottish civil society. Civil society which had organised to help to create the Scottish Parliament articulated their 'right' to influence how the parliament should operate and make decisions about policy. In sum, this implied a shift away from a narrow conception of government to a more inclusive notion of 'governance', also based upon principles of sovereignty of the people, and on ideas of subsidiarity. There was opportunity for different alliances across parties, and further opportunities for other sources of advice and voices to be heard in the policy process. Such an approach has clear, and challenging, implications for traditional sources of advice, notably for the role of the civil service and the third sector.

---

[363] http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/visitandlearn/60248.aspx

From being lobbyists in Westminster to actors in Holyrood

There has been a tangible difference in NGO posture, exposure and dialogue due to the parliamentary shift north of the border in the Scottish case study. The implications of this will be further explored. In theory, it brings forth the opportunity for an introverted analysis and a self-reflective examination of local politics as it allows for an increase in diversity and representation at the party level.

The third sector in Scotland is now negotiating where it fits locally. The multi-party system creates a space where complacency is held to account, and this is also a role that the third sector in the Scottish case study fulfils after years of a democratic deficit. For example the umbrella organisation 'Scotland Biodiversity community', places an importance on NGOs understanding their role as part of the political, as opposed to one outside of the formal political space. This is highlighted in the literature published on their website. 'NGOs and voluntary bodies, such as The National Trust For Scotland, RSPB Scotland and the Scottish Wildlife Trust have the energy, commitment and flexibility to promote and facilitate the implementation of biodiversity strategies. NGOs have a vital role to play in biodiversity communications.[364] These organisations often have a prominent voice within local and national media. Coupled with strong membership databases and ownership of nature reserves, NGOs are in an excellent position to effectively communicate biodiversity issues to audiences through a number of existing channels. Through your environmental work you have the knowledge and the relevant media relationships to communicate biodiversity effectively.'[365] While this is all structurally very positive it has meant that many changes in the posture and conduct of the NGO, and thus the third sector, has had to occur. NGOs

---

[364] http://www.sead.org.uk/
[365] http://www.snh.org.uk/biodiversitycommstoolkit/you_biodiversity_NGOs.html

often stress that the change from 'lobbying losers' and noisy political activists has been a welcome but fast-paced transition which may have left some of the sector behind and created an underclass of what seems to be regarded as an 'unprofessional' subdivision of the community. Scottish interest groups have had to adjust from being lobbyists of UK government to more active participants in policy-making in Scotland, and frequently remain weak in a policy-making capacity. This is due to their required need to adapt and have faith in their own expertise when faced with the challenge of setting the political agenda.

While devolution has led to a strengthening of the Scottish level of British interest groups, many interest groups have found difficulty in making the transition from being lobbyists seeking to get more from London, to participants in the policy-making process. This involves greater policy-making skills and knowledge, and is more time consuming. However, policy divergences when compared to the pre-devolved era have in fact emerged. In part these are concerned with style, as Scottish policy-making is more consensual and negotiated. There is also a tendency for Scotland to cleave to liberal social values and social democratic welfare state attitudes which have been abandoned to a greater extent in England. As policy style in Scotland is more consensual and negotiated the transition has been smoother for NGOs because the parliament itself, without a single-party majority and relatively strong committees, imposes a need to negotiate. This can be perceived as a weakness in in the policy capacity of the Executive as it forces it to reach out to the networks, but it is also seen as a window of opportunity for NGOs and civil society groups to set the agenda in the dialogical space that is created for them and the government.

During the research interviews the NGOs spoke of their rapport with the Scottish executive and discussed the contrast not only between pre- and post- devolution years, but

also that of how the Scottish branch of larger organisations worked more efficiently with government, when compared to English branches and their contact with Westminster. The contrast was apparent across the board in terms of accessibility – both logistically and structurally. The Scottish focus on local council structures, the committee structure, and thus clearer focus on specific issues, was also considered to be a more inclusive mechanism for the third sector. An open door policy was citied and, as mentioned before, a first name basis and familiarity with Ministers was certainly prevalent. A further contrast was made by interviewees between previous email-only access (and that only to senior civil servants).

The problems in quantifying data to describe and analyse the third sector is actually a product of such diversity. The third sector encompasses arts to development, schools to disability groups, garden clubs to climate change initiative. Therefore, the third sector itself divides into subdivisions, and subdivisions of its subdivisions, in order to make more sense, to form targeted and like-minded coalitions. This also reflects the nature of a common valued nation with a diversity of interests, needs and policy foci.

The interviews conducted as part of the Scottish case study are a valuable and accurate depiction of the current system and dialogue between the third sector NGOs and the state. The role of NGOs in civil society is not just that they stand as an army of activists. The third sector is increasing in its professionalization, its presence, and in its importance in the eyes of the government, and has therefore been given more of a stake in the policy-making process. The committee structure allows for a more targeted lobbying practice for the NGOs who in turn continue to develop a professional posture and learn about their own engagement, power and articulation of what participatory democracy at a devolved, localised and therefore concentrated level can achieve. This can lead to a blurring of lines,

but also shows the development in Scotland of a participatory mode, rather than just a symbolic mode, of devolved governance. This participatory mode is a reality and therefore has to be understood as the new archetype of political engagement in Scotland. Fundamentally, what is shown is that there is a dialogue and exchange between the third sector, namely the local NGO community and the state, which shows that the theoretical hypothesis of a relational ethical model partnered with a dialogical space is in fact being practised.

The dialogical space allows the local NGOs to advocate their own agendas, but still to compromise with the government. Thus the policy which results is due to the engagement in the dialogical space and the lessons learned from the conversations that have taken place therein. This reflects Scottish values, the Scottish need for diversity in parliamentary structure and a recognition of its civil diversity. However, for this to continue and increase in its positive output, NGOs have to manoeuvre themselves in a professional manner, understand that they can be both activist and consultant, and get used to their ability to directly interact at the local level on the local issues they work for and represent.

Many of the Scottish case study interviews have been discussed due to their value and resonance with the conceptualisation of this thesis and the methodology. The interviews specifically analysed here show the ethic of care that resonates in the local NGO community. They also show how the dialogical space works and how subsequent lessons are learned by the state as a result of its conversations with the local NGO, or third sector, in Scotland. Following the interview analysis an example of the lessons learned will be shown as publicised by the Scottish Executive through the recommendations of the Christie Commission. This will conclude the Scottish case study.

Linda Dunion – See Me Campaign

The interview conducted with Linda Dunion was an insightful overview of the power of the local NGO community and its impact on Scottish policy as an educational resource. Linda Dunion has a long and punctuated involvement in the pre- and post-devolution political climates in Scotland spanning over 20 years working for Scottish Charities, including Age Concern Scotland, Scottish War on Want and Down's Syndrome Scotland. She was Campaign Director of 'See Me', Scotland's national campaign to combat the stigma of mental ill health. Her career in the voluntary sector, provided her with a knowledge of learning disability, mental health and issues affecting older people, particularly long-term care. In her current role as an independent consultant, Linda works with community, voluntary and public sector organisations to help them deliver social change through social marketing, effective communications and campaigns[366].

Linda was an excellent source not only for her professional insight into the relationship that can be forged between NGOs and the Scottish devolved state but also because of her network, both personal and professional, which centres around the Scottish political and third sectors. As will also be shown in the interview with Malcolm Fleming of Oxfam Scotland, and Michael Marra of Oxfam UK, a personal network based around the third sector is contingent on a network that has firm links to the political in Scotland. Linda Dunion, wife of Kevin Dunion, the Scottish Freedom of Information Commissioner, and ex-wife of Ian Gray, the Scottish Labour leader (2008-2011), has an entrenched and unique insight into the development of Scottish politics and through both her personal relations

---

[366] Linda Dunion, Biography published by NHS Tayside
<http://www.nhstayside.scot.nhs.uk/about_nhstay/members/ldunion.shtml> [Accessed 9th June 2010, 16.15 GMT]

and in her professional work has had a part in setting a precedent for the dialogue between the third sector and the state.

Linda spoke openly and specifically acknowledged the emergence of, and need for, a professionalised posture in the third sector. Linda also directly addressed an ethic of care and highlighted that the principles therein, specifically that of sensitivity and bias, and most importantly the utilisation of a dialogical space are those which have facilitated the success of the 'See Me' campaign. The NGO was regarded as the expert, but also given autonomy, respect and room to express its views in order to further enrich policy that could be beneficial to its recipients.

The 'See Me' campaign addressed the negative attitudes and behaviours which systematically disadvantage people with mental health problems and those close to them. The campaign was launched in October 2002, with the purpose of tackling the stigma and discrimination experienced by people with mental health problems. Funded as part of the Scottish Executive's National Programme for Improving Mental Health and Wellbeing (the 'National Programme'), but managed by an alliance of five mental health organisations, the campaign has encompassed: national level publicity campaigns targeted at the general population; targeted publicity campaigns aimed at specific groups or environments through its young people and workplace strands; work with the media; and support for local activity through the provision of materials, advice and guidance.[367]

The significance of the 'See Me' campaign is that it was the first fully funded campaign backed by the Scottish Executive but independently managed by a third sector, local NGO. In the interview Linda outlined what she believed the value of the NGO

---

[367] http://ec.europa.eu/health/mental_health/eu_compass/reports_studies/seeme_report.pdf

community meant for a devolved Scotland. The campaign was initially conceived by an alliance of mental health organisations: the Scottish Association for Mental Health (SAMH), the National Schizophrenia Fellowship (Scotland), the Royal College of Psychiatrists (Scottish Division), Penumbra and Highland Users Group. This group continues to provide the strategic management for the campaign. Operationally, 'See Me' is run by a small staff team, comprising, at the end of the period covered by the evaluation, eight people. The operational team work closely with a communications agency, which undertakes the creative design work and public relations activity.[368] As highlighted by Linda and the literature associated with the 'See Me' campaign, the autonomy and expertise of the campaign organisers was key to its success. 'The campaign proposal was initially developed by this alliance of organisations, who then brought the proposal to the Scottish Executive. Following discussion and negotiation over a number of months the campaign came to form one part of the newly formed National Programme. This early development gave the campaign its strong internal cohesion, as well as a sense of relative autonomy from the Scottish Executive'.[369]

The campaign management group comprised representatives from the five organisations which formed the original alliance. Strategically the value of this model was that it brought links to a range of different stakeholders. Operationally the small number of representatives on the group, and the consistency over time, enabled the group to cohere. It also encouraged greater understanding and dialogue between the organisations represented. Conversely, it has meant that only a comparatively narrow

---

[368] http://ec.europa.eu/health/mental_health/eu_compass/reports_studies/seeme_report.pdf
[369] http://ec.europa.eu/health/mental_health/eu_compass/reports_studies/seeme_report.pdf

range of organisations are represented, potentially limiting the involvement of other

equalities bodies, or agencies with a remit beyond mental health to support the process of

'transformational change'.[370] However, what can be seen is that a change in the way in

which the state manages these campaigns has been achieved. Although they are only a

small section of the breadth of which mental health spans across the medical, social and

economic spheres of life, it was the organisations and NGOs who were behind the initial

proposal who managed the campaign. Their expertise and their utilisation of the ethic of

care as practice meant that policy could be directly impacted and strategically informed.

Linda's experience with the local NGO community - 'its successes and struggles to be

understood and heard'[371] - are outlined here and show that an ethic of care resonates and

can be used to nurture statesmanship shown through the trust gained by her 'See Me'

campaign. Linda was asked about the relationship between the local NGO or third sector

community, and her points are summarised below.

When discussing the communicative relationship between the local NGO community

and the state Linda drew parallels between her past and present experience.

> In contrast to say, 20 years ago; there has been a genuine shift towards
> inclusion because of increased recognition that decision-making is improved,
> and more likely to lead to sustainable policies, if the people who actually
> 'live' the issues that are involved in shaping the decisions that will directly
> affect them. My own view is that the government is considerably more
> influenced by the experiences of NGOs and through their own efforts to seek
> information from the intended beneficiaries of their policies. The increased
> culture of evaluation and evidence-based policy-making has also contributed
> to more informed decision-making.[372]

---

[370] http://ec.europa.eu/health/mental_health/eu_compass/reports_studies/seeme_report.pdf
[371] Linda Dunion interview [St Andrews, March 2010]
[372] Linda Dunion

Linda's personal view was tangibly observed as well as anecdotally reiterated by the interviewees across the board during the Scottish case study. Furthermore, the interview with Linda reiterated the observations made in the political contextualisation of this fieldwork chapter, which highlights the experiential and grounded theory presented here. While the other interviews have been intermittently highlighted throughout the thesis, Linda's reflections resonate with the central premise of the ethic of care being nurtured in statesmanship and thus is explicitly cited here.

Malcolm Fleming: Oxfam Scotland

The interview with Malcolm Fleming was conducted in the Glasgow offices of Oxfam Scotland. At the time of the interview Malcolm was the 'Media and Public Relations Officer' for the organisation and eagerly replied to my email request to interview a member of the team at Oxfam Glasgow who would be able to speak specifically about the relationship between NGOs and the Scottish state.

The interview with Malcolm was extremely interesting as he informed me that he had given notice of his resignation to Oxfam in order to run for election in the Westminster parliamentary election in 2010 as the SNP candidate for the Glasgow South constituency. As a candidate for the SNP, Malcolm was focussing on the policies which he had specifically targeted as an NGO worker and hope to be able to 'fully utilise [his] expertise in a legislative manner in parliament'.[373] In announcing his candidacy the SNP published the following.

---

[373] Malcolm Fleming interview

Commenting Malcolm said: 'The next General Election is the SNP's best ever chance to win Glasgow South. In 2007, the SNP came only 1,833 votes behind Labour in the Glasgow South area, and its clear that many local people are impressed by the record of the SNP's Scottish Government, especially moves to reduce crime and reduce household costs for families. At the same time people are dismayed at the way the London Labour Government have allowed the economic crisis to hit local jobs and businesses. By voting SNP you are signalling your support for more action to help families, action like freezing the council tax, cutting prescription taxes, and creating apprenticeships'.[374]

During the interview Malcolm spoke candidly about the lack of Scottish representation in Westminster and why he feels that during his time at Oxfam he has had a stronger relationship with the Scottish parliament than with Westminster – even though he lobbies to both governments on behalf of the organisation. 'The problem is access and also, even though Oxfam is professionally established, we have trouble with the way in which the NGOs community is grouped into a collective, a collective that are also seen as activists'.[375] Malcolm, like many of the interviewees, described situations where the Westminster structure curtailed the influence that his organisation could have on policy, when compared to the Scottish governmental structure. This, he highlighted, is one of the reasons that Oxfam target businesses and corporations, one example being with Marks and Spenser, to facilitate their campaigns in order to raise their profile and challenge the perception that they are unprofessional.

While the original direction of the interview was to discuss the relationship between Oxfam and the Scottish parliament, the conversation evolved and actually become more

---

[374] http://www.glasgowsnp.org/Westminster_Election_2010/Glasgow_South/
[375] Malcolm Fleming interview

valuable as Malcolm described his motives for running for election. Malcolm described how he was inspired by the Scottish precedent of open access. When prompted about a dialogical space, he conceded that while it was present and utilised in the Scottish context he felt that in the Westminster context 'it still had quite a way to go, that's after all why I'm running for election…to get Scottish voices heard, the voices I hear every day in Oxfam that through reserved issues such as benefits and allowances are not always heard by Westminster'.[376]

While the interview with Malcolm did not necessarily concentrate on the relationship between his specific NGO, Oxfam, and the state it did highlight that the relationships established between NGOs and civil society and the Scottish state were influential in his running for election. Malcolm recognised the importance of the dialogical space and the influential nature of its existence when utilised to further the needs of society, especially where a democratic deficit is present which he claimed was occurring in Westminster. As with so many third sector workers in the early 1990s in Scotland, Malcolm was moving from the third sector into elected office, utilising his knowledge and experience of the dialogical space to inform his political career and ability to represent his potential future constituents.

SEAD - Scottish Education and Action for Development

'SEAD challenges the causes of poverty, social injustice and environmental degradation. We support the community-based movement for positive social change – people collectively tackling challenges with a local and global perspective.'[377]

---

[376] Maocolm Fleming interview
[377] http://www.sead.org.uk/what-we-do

The interview was conducted at the SEAD headquarters in an industrial estate in the outskirts of Edinburgh. Of all of the interviews conducted in Scotland this was one of the most challenging as the interviewee, who has chosen to remain anonymous, had some reservations about why a researcher was interested in their relationship with the government. Where the other interviewees appeared open from the outset, this particular interviewee took a while to relax and engage at a level that would really give an insight into the NGO and how it relates to the Scottish government. After around half an hour of very official 'this is what we do' taken from the organisation's website the interviewee asked if I was there to 'vet or to genuinely listen?'[378]

As the interview progressed the information shared was excellent and the interviewee, spoke distinctly and frankly about the struggle of being a 'single, small entity of a fish in a massive big ocean'.[379] This, it was explained, is why SEAD have a 'join the dots approach',[380] which aims to link the consequences of one cause to another, as illustrated by the information shared regarding community activist Cathy McCormack. 'I never thought that when I became active in the campaign for healthy housing that I would end up in the international struggle for justice, but that's what happened when the people in my community in Glasgow started to make the links between our sick houses, our sick children, and the sickness of the planet'.[381]

The interviewee highlighted that in order for their volunteers to feel that they could directly engage with the Scottish government, they had to have a larger context on which to base their cause. For example, highlighting the issue of food poverty, the Granton

---

[378] SEAD interview
[379] SEAD interview
[380] SEAD interview
[381] http://www.sead.org.uk/what-we-do

Community Garden Project, 'builds on SEAD's 'Sowing the Seeds' project that highlighted the interrelation of social deprivation and sustainability issues, ranging from diet, waste management and urban land use'.[382] This enabled the volunteers and workers from SEAD to create a platform on which they could help tackle multiple issues that arose from one thematic problem. This led to a further utilisation of the dialogical space, and shows the holistic nature of this space for actors to shape the conversations in a way that multiple issues can be addressed.

The SEAD projects range from clothing provision to climate injustice, and it is through this diversity that SEAD has managed to engage with the government. When asked about an ethic of care, and in particular about its principles, the interviewee specifically raised one of the main directives of the organisation 'People, Power and Partnership'[383] and linked it directly to the articulation of a mothering ethic and the robustness and power of a familial relationships which have been established between the communities and the organisation. 'Building communities which are resilient and are sustainable ecologically and economically requires us to work collectively. When problems have been created by top-down decision-making, then the time has come to re-learn decision-making from the bottom up. We can't wait passively for the solutions to come from government or from companies'.[384] This is where SEAD have become known for their ability to empower their communities in order to inform policy at a local and national level, by grouping communities, such that a dialogical space is created and the Scottish government has been invited to participate and to involve themselves in a shared learning practice.

---

[382] http://www.sead.org.uk/projects/north-edinburgh-food-network
[383] http://www.sead.org.uk/what-we-do/people-power-and-participation
[384] http://www.sead.org.uk/what-we-do/people-power-and-participation

The Chrisite Commission

As shown, the very make-up of the devolved Scottish parliament and the Scottish Executive has rendered it conducive to consultation, discourse and communication, and thus the utilisation of a dialogical space where specifically the third sector local NGO community can be involved in the policy-making process. This final section highlights the valuable contribution that such a dynamic has had on the posture of the Scottish executive which now, as standard, publicises and celebrates the third sector for its rich expertise, knowledge and, as highlighted here, its ability to nurture an ethic of care in policy that would otherwise be missed by those directly elected to parliament.

The Christie Commission was established by the Scottish Government in November 2010 to develop recommendations for the future delivery of public services. The Commission, chaired by Dr Campbell Christie CBE, operated independently of government. The Commission gathered evidence on relevant issues and, as part of this, issued a Call for Evidence. More than 200 responses were received. The Commission also conducted a series of Discussion Events, to hear views and experiences at first hand and to explore in more depth the issues identified. The key significance of the Christie Commission, and its report publication in June 2011, was the involvement of the NGO community and civil society in order to make recommendations to the state regarding the suitable provision of public sector services. Furthermore, the adoption of the recommendations by the Scottish Executive and the trust it placed in the recommendations as a policy guide highlights that the ethic of care - sensitivity, acute awareness, communicative discourse – can be nurtured in policy in a dialogical exchange with the state. As highlighted by the summary below of the

Christie Commission's recommendations, the ethic of care is tangible and the recommendations are practical in their scope, details and thus their availability to the state.

> The Scottish Government is committed to the development of an enterprising third sector in Scotland. We call on the Scottish Government, local government and other partners to work together as a priority to develop specific public service approaches targeted on the needs of deprived communities. These approaches should:
>
> - Be based on highly localised and disaggregated data, capturing the specific circumstances and needs of deprived areas and populations;
>
> - Be based on clear understanding of the successes and failures of previous regeneration initiatives;
>
> - Bring together and deploy as flexibly as possible all resources devoted by partners to each area;
>
> - Maximise the contribution that community engagement can make in enabling communities to identify and achieve their own ambitions;
>
> - Allow for particularly innovative approaches to service delivery, for example through specialised not-for-profit providers; and
>
> - Provide clear accountability, to each other and to the public, on the part of all partners involved.[385]

The Christie Commission is one of the key evidential examples of the thesis focus. It indicates that, not only is the devolved Scottish parliament system conducive to the creation of a pragmatic dialogical space, it also facilitates the influence of the third sector. Here, the third sector is recognised as a serious contributor to the policy-making process. In order to create an accurate and accessible body of policy, that civil society is an integral part of the process - valuable for its knowledge, expertise and understanding of societal requirements and need.

---

[385] Recommendations of the Christie Commission <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/About/Review/publicservicescommission> [accessed 9th December 2011, 12.30 GMT]

Summary of the Scottish case study

As this chapter has shown, devolution has introduced a change in the political and social climate in Scotland which acts to increase the involvement of Scottish civil society and thus render policy effective, inclusive, and as intuitive to need as possible. Through direct consultation, dialogue and knowledge exchange with the third sector, the sector which incorporates the NGO community, the Scottish political experience is based on the delivery of policy which strives through consultation and the involvement of NGOs at the committee level to meet the need of Scottish civil society. As will be shown in the proceeding conclusion, the lessons learned from the dialogical space - in which an ethic of care as a relational, experiential ethic is valued and utilised - have been facilitated through the emergence of a new structure in the Scottish devolved parliament that contrasts with the pre-devolved democratic deficit and difficulty experienced by Scottish civil society in engaging at a Westminster level.

Conclusion

The ethic of care contributes to our understanding of the relationship between the local NGO community and the state, as shown by this thesis and the fieldwork conducted. As a practical ethic, it equips government with a knowledge base that facilitates a policy process which is more amenable, resonant and successful for its citizens' use and experience of the representative quality and attributes of the democratic process. However, the presence of an ethic of care requires a pragmatic space where its attributes can be practically utilised. The identification of the dialogical space during the fieldwork process as a space of learning, knowledge transfer, inclusion and acknowledgment of diversity, and importantly an understanding of bias, is one of the key contributions of this thesis. This contribution is verified, grounded and situated in experiential knowledge. It is in the dialogical space that the nurturing of an ethic of care begins and key lessons are learned by statesmen through their conversations with local NGOs that, daily, are at the epicentre of civil society, and which are recognised here as civil society in organisations.

The thesis title as discussed in the methodology chapter was arrived at through the interview process as a result of an inquiry regarding the relationship between the local NGO communities in Zambia and Scotland and their respective national governments. Thus the title is as a result of a theoretical study and emerged from the interviews. While the ethic of care was the theoretical lens, and it was of interest to see how the NGO community identified with the ethic and where they placed it within their own framework, its key resonance was one of the most interesting in terms of locating the ethic of care in a practical context, reasserting the claim that it is overlooked and miscategorised as an abstract postmodern and exclusively feminist postulation.

The conclusions drawn from the fieldwork findings and the analysis of an ethic of care in both theory and practice present many significant implications for the existing theory contained in the literature, and also for the policy and practice of both the local NGO community and the state. Such implications are presented here, drawn from the conclusions of the Scottish and Zambian fieldwork analysis and the lessons learned when the dialogical space was utilised and also, as in the Zambian case study, the implications of a reduced and subsequently diminished dialogical space as a result of increasingly restrictive policies. It is in addressing such implications that the conclusions regarding the lessons learned by NGOs can be drawn from these conversations. Such conclusions serve to strengthen the significance of the ethic in its practical value. This verifies why it should be located in a much more prominent and accessible place in international relations discourse regarding citizenship, agency and the relationship between NGOs and the state. Furthermore, as the ethic of care is tangible in the dialogical space, this thesis has shown the democratic necessity of the availability of pragmatic, open and accessible spaces where a dialogue can be established between civil society, expressed in, but not necessarily limited to, organisation by local NGOs and the state.

The Scottish case study has shown that in a 'transformation from democratic deficit',[386] the use and understanding of the value of the NGO community has strengthened the relationship between civil society and the state. Accessibility to Holyrood, the Scottish parliament, was key in this transformation from the pre-devolved experience. Such an experience was cited by all of the interviewees when addressing their ability to 'go into the parliament, walk around',[387] and was further highlighted by David Astill, Director

---

[386] David Astill
[387] David Astill, Director International Business Development, Adam Smith College

International Business Development, Adam Smith College, with great enthusiasm, when he

described the difference between his ability to access parliamentary figures in the pre-

devolved era.

> [N]ow it's much more simple to ask questions, get answers and feel that
> Scottish civil society , a society that has always had a voice, don't get me
> wrong there, but it just needed ears, now it feels like it also has some kind of
> impact. It's because you can go in, you know the faces, you know that they
> are there to represent Scottish concerns, education, youth. We're [Scottish
> civil society] no longer those folk from up north, we're the folk they're there
> to represent and that means they listen, and seem to like doing it too.[388]

The Scottish interviewees working for local NGOs, non-profit educational establishments

and representative groups were acutely sensitive, attentive, and in direct relational contact

with their respective care recipients. This confirmed that the criteria the ethic of care was

part of their fundamental and practical relationship. The interviewees concentrated on the

change in the relationship between their NGOs and the Scottish Executive in the years since

the opening of the devolved Scottish Parliament in Holyrood. The remit to represent

Scottish domestic affairs created a parliament for Scottish civil society. As shown in the case

study analysis, the parliamentary character was representative regarding issue based

provision to the Scottish electorate, who had previously experienced an extensive

democratic deficit under the Westminster dealings with domestic affairs. The opening of the

Scottish Parliament 'brought politics home'[389] and, as shown by consultation with civil

society, was key from the very conceptualisation of the new parliament based in Holyrood.

The Scottish case study highlights the potential of the dialogical space as a space

where policy processes are informed both by the expertise of the government and civil

society organisations, specifically NGOs for the purpose of this thesis. The lessons learned

---

[388] David Astill, Director International Business Development, Adam Smith College
[389] David Torrance

are symbolically espoused by both government and the local NGO community, in part because they mark a division between a pre-devolved Scottish Executive and a post-devolved Executive, an experience which now encourages the input of civil society. In terms of an ethic of care the Scottish Executive have learned that NGOs are experts. However, expertise alone is insufficient and so there are committee structures, accessibility, ability to petition, and ability to hold to account, to question and discussion. These are all examples of dialogical spaces that are part of the political process in Scotland. As highlighted in the analysis of the Scottish political context and the interviews conducted, the post-devolution era was marked by a mandate of inclusion and representation in terms of the consultative framework introduced to increase accessibility. This stands in great contrast to the political climate that emerged in the Zambian political context with the introduction of a multi-party state. Thus it is argued that the Scottish Executive, since its devolved power was enacted, has captured this importance through inclusion of a diverse variety of voice and representation further more through the introduction of a variety of means of access the dialogical spaces populated by state and NGO presence are flexible, creative and conducive to sharing and learning about experience, need and specifics of the community in question at that time and place. Shown through Community Voice programs, giving direct responsibility to the NGO community to deliver education to the Scottish electorate on specific issues such as the 'See Me' campaign, the Scottish Executive and thus the state have a much closer, more intimate knowledge of the civil society which they are democratically elected to represent, strengthening their capabilities to deliver.

In the Zambian case study the undermining of the importance of civil society to the policy process was expressed and observed during the fieldwork study. Polices instituted to

curtail the expressive and representational power of the local NGO community undermined the representative nature of government and hindering the work of the local NGO community. While NGO work in and for they communities they represented continued, the access promised in comparison to that granted to the local NGO community - in terms of time with ministerial representatives, government representative and elected officials - was curtailed or practiced symbolically, reducing the much needed substance found in the dialogical space to conduct conversations, knowledge transferring and debates concerning policy formulation, process and delivery. Democracy in name but much less so in nature, the mandate of 'One Nation One Zambia' came across as more of a quest for manageable homogeneity within the country for the government, rather than a step towards inclusion for a rich and diverse civil society. This would be of crucial importance in a country rich in ethnic, linguistic and regional diversity, but also more generally, it is key for any democratic state. During the interview process the mandate of 'One Nation One Zambia' became increasingly difficult to comprehend and stood in great contrast to the Scottish case study in terms of an understanding of diversity. The lack of open, pragmatic space and conversations with the local NGO community, the potential of the rich experiential and informative value the ethic of care could bring to the dialogical space was a resource that was critically underutilised which continues to be the case in an even more tense Zambian state than what was observed in 2010.

Lessons Learned by NGOs from their conversations with states

The lessons learned are instrumental in assessing the value of the ethic of care and also the key role of the dialogical space. This thesis states that a nurturing of an ethic of care occurs

in statesmanship. The nurturing takes place through and during conversations with the local NGO community in the dialogical space created by both the NGO and the state. Such spaces vary in size, location, formality and agenda. This is why the learning process is continual, reflective and, like civil society in a democracy, constantly evolving. Thus it is identified here as an emerging norm, rather than an exceptional circumstance.

The lessons learned are examined extensively in the field work chapters. These are also summarised below, and thus the implications for policy and practice are addressed. Through their conversations between NGOs and states, it has been observed that an ethic of care has been nurtured in statesmanship. There are five lessons which have been and can be learned through these conversations, if a dialogical space is established and utilised productively.

First and foremost, *understanding the rich and diverse knowledge of local community NGOs is key to understanding the diversity and traits of contemporary civil society*. Such an understanding is achieved through open dialogue rather than by symbolic inclusion.

Secondly, *appreciating narrative and relational discourse*. Understanding that it may take time and many meetings and discussions to establish a narrative and to appreciate that relational discourse between the NGO and their communities is about trust, statesmen also learn that this also applies to the relationship between the NGO and the state. Thus, the relational discourse builds an appreciative narrative between the NGO and the state. In understanding the evolving nature of this relationship, statesmen learn, moreover, that not only should inclusion be more than aesthetically symbolic, but that it has to evolve in its nature - which means a series of meetings in a variety of different spaces should be arranged.

Third, *through their conversations NGOs learn to appreciate and further strengthen their value as part of the democratic process, rather than being categorised as activists working to undermine the status-quo.* As shown in the Scottish case study and also outlined in the conceptual chapter, NGOs have established themselves as professional organisations in order to be taken seriously and to undermine damaging stereotypical assertions that they are there to work against government rule. As shown in the Zambian case study, such a misunderstanding of the objective of the local NGO community – to represent those who are underrepresented, misrepresented or disenfranchised has resulted in dramatic political action and a relegating of the status of local and national NGOs. While as part of the democratic process opposition will be met, biases will be stressed and compromise must be achieved, this should not been seen as a reason to curtail the representative nature or to see the local NGO community as a direct threat.

The fourth lesson learned in the dialogical space is the understanding of compromise and continues on from how the local NGO community is perceived, especially regarding their professionalism. As shown by the NGO community both in Zambia and Scotland, while their specific agenda issues are the priority, an understanding of compromise is also key. In both case studies the ability to compromise, and a pragmatic openness to compromise, was identified especially by the smaller issue-based NGO community. The ability to compromise, like the assumptions and stereotypes cited in lesson three, is often regarded as something the NGO is unwilling to do, because of their intimate relationship with their community. However, as has been shown in both case studies local and national NGOs understand the necessity of compromise and flexibility because of their professional and organisational

structure. This can only be truly appreciated through experience, thus showing the necessity of the dialogical space to nurture this understanding.

The fifth lesson that is learned in the dialogical space, which is as a direct result of an ethic of care, as practiced by the NGO community, *is the degree of sensitivity, knowledge and understanding the local NGOs have concerning their recipients.* Furthermore, their readiness to share and discuss their knowledge in order to facilitate the policy process is a key lesson learned in the dialogical space as shown by the See Me Campaign and also the Sport in Action Peer leader's educational programme.

These five key lessons are learned as a result of the ethic of care. They are relational lessons which depend upon a close, open, attentive and communicative relationship between the NGO and the state that can only be realised within a dialogical space set aside for the formulation of policy which directly effects civil society. As civil society is diverse and is a multitude of communities bound together by a common government the NGO community plays a pivotal role in its political representation as a mediator between civil society and the state regarding issues that require an organisational location to fully explore, expand on and work on different solutions to the many issues facing underrepresented communities as shown in both Zambia and Scotland. While the ethic of care is nurtured, it is not directly imparted or transplanted into governmental practice. This explains why the dialogical space in its pragmatism is constantly required, and will continue to be the best and most amenable space to allow the NGO and the state to come together and to share their expertise, experiences and work upon tangible solutions to provide an amenable, manageable and fitting policy.

In the Scottish example the need for a dialogical space has been understood since the Scottish Executive has been located in Holyrood as a result of devolution, as identified by the interviewees who described the contrast between an inaccessible Westminster experience and a 'doors open' experience in Holyrood. The thesis, in terms of policy and practice, contributes to the emerging body of observations, knowledge and understanding of the dynamic of the devolved parliamentary structure and practice. In terms of policy and practice it highlights a break from the historic democratic deficit and also highlights the relationship between the local NGO community and the state, a dynamic relationship that while being extremely valuable and key in the conduct of policy, communication and understanding of civil society is generally overlooked in the address and auditing of the devolved institution.

In terms of the Zambian case study, this thesis further highlights a much-documented democratic deficit in the tense 'multi-party' political sphere. While the potential for the establishment of a closer and amicable relationship between local NGOs and the state has been observed and shown from the perspective of the interviewees a reluctance and rejection of NGO involvement in the policy process has been legislated in the policies of the state, relegating the position of the NGO community and thus further curtailing the potential for an open dialogue, knowledge exchange and relational dynamic enriched through experiential exchange and compromise. While the ethic of care has been located in the work and remit of the local NGO community its tangible value remains limited to the relational exchange between civil society and the NGO inaccessible to the state through the lack of dialogical space where the five key lessons explicated previously can be learned.

Limitations

With all research projects there are many limitations regarding the intrinsic and extrinsic nature of the project. However, the limitations outlined here also provide significant scope for further research into the nature of the ethic of care as a relational and experiential ethic; the relationship between the NGO and the state; and also the location of an ethic in International Relations discourse.

Due to the nature of the interview process, preparation time, initiating contact, gaining the trust and understanding of the interviewees and permission to be interviewed from their organisations, key research decisions were made in order to prioritise the quality of interviews conducted (as opposed to the quantity). While for the Scottish case study the logistical planning was easier, in part due to proximity but most significantly due to the organisational structure within the NGO community, it was more difficult to plan in detail ahead of the Zambian fieldwork trip which meant that the logistics were often ad hoc. As highlighted, the shared central location of local Scottish NGO offices in Rose Street, Edinburgh, also facilitated networking as most of the NGOs of interest were actually located in the Rose Street location often sharing floors and thus making introductions was much easier. However, in the Zambian case study a sense of real community was observed as it was not centrality of physical location but a centrality of ideas, and experience which connected the organisations, and thus the researcher, along the field work process. While this may be regarded as a limitation, and especially as it added greater pressure on time and directly affected the number of interviews that could be conducted, the process as a whole from the initial emails to the actual interview was a situated learning experience which provided a rich and detailed account of how the NGO community in both Zambian

and Scotland not only interacted with the state but, as shown in the interview analysis, but also how they interact with each other, observed during the interview set-up process in both Scotland and Zambia. Thus, while much time was required and allocated to identifying, approaching and securing an interview time with local NGO personnel, this process highlighted many other potential research avenues relating to the ethic of care and also to the normative understanding of the local NGO community and its dynamic role in the socio-political sphere.

Further research

The following potential avenues for further research were identified throughout the research process all showing the prevailing and potential contribution to knowledge as initiated by this original body of research.

- The relationship between the local NGOs and the state in other Western democratic countries and developing democratic countries, using an ethic of care as a lens to analyse the value of dialogical spaces and their impact on the policy process.

- The impact of proximity on the organisation of the NGO network and its subsequent relationship with the state. As highlighted in the Scottish case study, it was a matter of importance for the Scottish local NGOs to have a presence in Edinburgh.

- An investigation into the ethic of care in terms of its organisational impact on local NGOs and their mission statements. This investigation would further consider the ethic of care in its resonance in the mission statements analysing the discourse of the NGO community.

- An analysis of the understanding of the value of the dialogical space from the perspective of both the NGO community and the state. While the dialogical space has been highlighted in its value here, the interviews concentrated on the ethic of care and the lessons learned through conversation and engagement. The dialogical space was identified and conceptualised as a result of the fieldwork research for this thesis, thus a further exploration of how it is understood as a concept would further facilitate its conceptualisation in IR discourse.

Closing remarks

The ethic of care in its practical and relational importance has been highlighted as a key conceptual tool to facilitate an understanding of the relationship between local Zambian and Scottish NGOs and their respective states. The thesis *'Nurturing an ethic of care in statesmanship. What do NGOS learn from their conversations with States?'* highlights that the ethic of care can be nurtured, thus removing it from an exclusively feminist discourse which has served to limit is availability as a critical lens. Furthermore, in showing that the ethic is pragmatic and can be nurtured in statesmanship, the ethic of care specifically identified through mothering metaphors and moral voices, unattainable in practical and current ethical discourse, is reconceptualised and shown to be a valuable and accessible addition to international relations discourse and a tool with which to analyse the socio-political world.

As highlighted, the five key lessons learned by the state are instrumental in the policy process, a process that can overcome democratic deficit – the exclusion of civil society – by directly involving local NGOs and civil society groups to contribute to the policy-

making process, which can be achieved through the creation and utilisation of dialogical spaces. Thus, through their conversations with NGOs the ethic of care – a sensitive, relational, communicative and inclusive ethic – can be nurtured in statesmanship. Experience is shared and lessons in diversity awareness, inclusiveness, compromise and understanding of the NGO community as a positive rather than as an activist or alternative political community of civil society in organisation further renders policy amenable to civil society, their agency and representation.

Bibliography

BOOKS

Ackerly, B.A., Stern, M., and True, J. (eds.), *Feminist Methodologies for International Relations* (Cambridge University Press: 2006).

Ahmed, S. and Porter, D., *NGOs in International Politics* (Kumarian Press: 2006).

Arendt, H., *The Promise of Politics – introduction by Jerome Kohn* (Schocken Books: 2005).

Arnett R.C., and Arneson, P., *Dialogical Civility in a Cynical Age: Community, Hope and Interpersonal Relationships* (State University of New York: 1999).

Arnett, R. C., *Communication and Community: implications of Martin Buber's dialogue* (SIU Press: 1986).

Baier, A.C., *Moral Prejudices: essays on ethics* (Harvard University Press: 1995).

Beetham, D., *Max Weber and the Theory of Modern Politics* (Polity Press)

Benhabib, S., *Democracy and Difference: contesting the boundaries of the political* (Princeton University Press: 1996).

Benhabib, S., *Situating the Self: gender, community, and postmodernism in contemporary ethics* (Routledge: 1992).

Benhabib, S., and Dallmayr, F.R., *The Communicative ethics controversy* (MIT Press: 1990).

Benhabib, S., and Waldorn, J., *Another Cosmopolitanism* (Oxford University Press: 2008).

Bebbington, Hickey and Mitlin (eds.), *Can NGOs Make a Difference: The Challenge of Development Alternatives* (Zeds Books: 2008).

Blum, L., *Moral Perception and Particularly* (Cambridge University Press: 1994).

Braig, M., and Wolte, S. (eds.), *Common Ground or Mutual exclusion? Women's movements in International Relations* (Zed Books: 2002).

Boff, L., *Essential Care: An Ethics of Human Nature* (Baylor University Press: 2008).

Borgmann, A., *Crossing the Postmodern Divide* (University of Chicago Press: 1992).

Bowden, P., *Caring: Gender-Sensitive Ethics* (Routledge: 1997).

Buber, M., *Between Man and Man* (Hunt, Barnard and Co.: 1947).

Butler, J., *Giving an Account of Oneself* (Fordham University Press: 2005).

Butler, J., Laclau, E., and Zizek, S., *Contingency, Hegemony, Universality Contemporary Dialogues on the Left* (Verso: 2000).

Cassell. C., and Symon. G., *Guide to Qualitative Methods in Organizational Research* (SAGE Publications: 2004).

Cavanagh M., McGarvey N., and Shepard M., *Closing the Democratic Deficit? The First Year of the Public Petitions Committee of the Scottish Parliament Public Policy and Administration June 2000*.

Cohen, J.L, and Arato, A., *Civil Society and Political Theory* (MIT Press: 1994).

Crossley, N., and Roberts, M., *After Habermas – New Perspectives on the Public Sphere* (Blackwell Publishing: 2004).

Cox, E., *A Truly Civil Society: Transcript of the 1995 Boyer Lectures* (ABC Books: 1995).

Elshtain, J., *Power Trips and Other Journeys: Essays in Feminism as Civic Discourse* (University of Wisconsin Press: 1990).

Evans, J., *Feminist Theory: An Introduction to second wave feminism* (SAGE Publications: 1995).

Faulks, K., *Citizenship* (Routledge: 2000).

Fitzduff, M., and Church C., (eds.), *NGOs at The Table – Strategies for Influencing Policies in Areas of Conflict* (Rowan & Littlefield: 2004).

Freire, P. *, Pedagogy of the Oppressed - 30th Anniversary Edition* (Continuum: 2007).

Freire, P., *Pedagogy of Hope: Reliving Pedagogy of the Oppressed* (Continuum: 2006).

Gilligan, C., *In a Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development* (Harvard University Press: 2003).

Govier, T., *Social Trust and Human Communities* (McGill and Queens Press: 1997).

Guillaume, X., *International Relations and Identity: A dialogical approach* (Taylor and Francis: 2010).

Habermas, J., *The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: An Enquiry into a Category of Bourgeois Society,* trans. by Thomas Burger and Frederick Lawrence (MIT Press: 1991).

Habermas, J., *Between Facts and Norms: Contributions to a Discourse Theory of Law and Democracy* (MIT Press: 1996).

Hague, R., *Autonomy and Identity: The Politics of Who We Are* (Routledge: 2011).

Hankivsky, O., *Social Policy and the Ethic of Care* (UNC Press, Vancouver, Toronto: 2004).

Hayden, P., (ed.), *The Ashgate Research Companion to Ethics and International Relations* (Ashgate Publishing Company: 2009).

Held, V., *Feminist Morality: Transforming culture, society and politics* (University of Chicago Press: 1993).

Held, V., *An Ethic of Care: Personal, Political and Global* (Oxford University Press: 2006).

Henn, M. Weinstien, M. and Foard, N*., A Critical Introduction to Social Research* (SAGE Publications: 2009).

Hekman, S.J., *Moral Voices, Moral Selves: Carol Gilligan and Feminist Moral Theory* (Polity Press: 1995).

Hilhorst, H*., The Real World of NGOs: Discourse, Diversity and Development* (Zed Books: 2003).

Hodgkinson, V.A., and Foley, M.W. (eds.), *The Civil Society Reader* (University Press of New England: 2003).

Khilnani, S. and Kaviraj, S. (eds.), *Civil Society: History and Possibilities* (Cambridge University Press: 2002).

Koehn, D*., Rethinking Feminist Ethics: care, trust and empathy* (Routledge: 1998).

Law, J., *Organizing Modernity* (Blackwell Publications: 1994).

Lee-Treweek, G., *Danger in the field - risk and ethics in social research* (Routledge: 2000).

Loftland, J., and Loftland, L.H*., Anyalyzing Social Settings: A Guide to Qualitative Observation and Analysis,* Third Edition (Wadworth: 1995).

MacKinnon, C., *Toward a Feminist Theory of the State* (Harvard University Press: 1989).

Meyers, D.T*., Subjection and Subjectivity: psychoanalytic feminism and moral philosophy* (Routledge: 1994).

Nicholson, L., and Seidman, S., (eds.), *Social Postmodernism: Beyond Identity Politics* (Cambridge University Press: 1995).

Noddings, N., *Caring, a feminine approach to ethics and moral education* (University of California Press: 1984).

Nordstrom C., *Fieldwork Under Fire: Contemporary Studies of Violence and Survival* (University of California Press: 1995).

Novak, M. (ed.), *To Empower People: From State to Civil Society* (American Enterprise Institute, Washington D.C.; 1996).

Nussbaum, M. C., *Upheavals of thought: the intelligence of emotions* (Cambridge University Press: 2003).

Pateman, C. *The Disorder of Women: Democracy, Feminism and Political* Theory (Polity Press: 1989).

Peardon, T., *The Second Treatise of Government* (1690) (Liberal Arts Press: 1952).

Princen, T. and Finger, M., *Environmental NGOs in World Politics: Linking the Local and the Global* (Routledge: 1994).

Rousseau, J., *The Social contract* (1762) in *The essential Rousseau 9*, ed. Lowell Bair (1974).

Seligman, A.*, The Idea of Civil Society* (Princeton University Press: 1992).

Sevenhuijsen, S., *Citizenship and the ethics of care* (Routledge: 1998).

Slote, M., *The Ethics of Care and Empathy* (Routledge: 2007).

Slote, M., *Morals from Motives* (Oxford University Press: 2001).

Tronto. J.C., *Moral Boundaries: a political argument for an ethic of care* (Routledge: 1993).

Tronto, J.C ., *Caring democracy : Markets, Equality, and Justice* (New York University Press: 2013).

Rakner, A., *Political and Economic Liberalisation in Zambia 1991-2001* (The Nordic Africa Institute/Elanders Gotab: 2003).

Ruddick, S., *Maternal Thinking: Towards a Politics of Peace* (Beacon Press: 1989).

Wallach-Scott, J*., The Politics of the veil* (Princeton University Press: 2007).

Warkentin, C., *Reshaping World Politics: NGOs, the Internet and Global Civil Society* (Rowman & Littlefield: 2001).

Weiss, T., and Gordenker, L., *NGOs, the UN, and Global Governance* (Political Science: 1996).

Willetts, P., (ed.), *"The Conscience of the World". The Influence of Non-Governmental Organisations in the UN System* (Hurst: 1996).

Young-Bruehl, E., *Hannah Arden: For Love of the World*, Second edition (Yale University Press: 2004).

ARTICLES

Adams, K., 'At The Table with Arendt: Toward a Self-Interested Practice of Coalition Discourse', *Hypatia,* Vol 17, No.1 (Winter, 2002), pp. 1-33.

Allmark, P., 'Can there be an ethics of care?', *Journal of Medical Ethics*, Vol 21, No.1 (Feb., 1995), pp.19-24.

Baylies C., and Szeftel M., 'The Fall and Rise of Multi-Party Politics in Zambia', *Review of African Political Economy,* No. 54:74-91 (1992).

Beitz, C.R., 'Cosmopolitanism and Global Justice', *The Journal of Ethics,* Vol.9 No.1/2 , Current Debates in Global Justice (2005), pp.11-27.

Bernauer, J.W., and Mahon, M., 'Michel Foucault's Ethical Imagination', *Cambridge Collection Online, Cambridge University Press*, 2006.

Brett, R., 'The role and limits of human rights NGOs at the United Nations', *Political Studies* 43 (1995): pp. 96-110.

Brinkerhoff, D. *'Assessing political will for anti-corruption efforts: an analytic framework'*, Journal of Public Administration and Development, Public Admin. Dev. Vol 20, Issue 3.

Canovan, M., 'The Contradictions of Hannah Arendt's Political Thought', *Political Theory*, Vol.6, No.1 (Feb., 1978), pp. 5-26.

Carse, A.L., ' Impartial Principle and Moral Context: Securing a Place for the Particular in Ethical Theory'*, Journal of Medicine and Philosophy*, 1998, Vol.23, No.2, pp.153-169.

Cassell, J., 'Ethical Principles for Conducting Fieldwork', *American Anthropologist, New Series*, Vol. 82, No. 1 (Mar., 1980), pp. 28-41.

Clarke. J., 'Dissolving the Public Realm? The Logics and Limits of Neo-Liberalism', *Journal of Social Policy*, 33:1, Cambridge University Press, 2004, pp. 27-48.

Dallmayr, F., 'Cosmopolitanism: moral and political', *Political Theory*, Vol. 31, No. 3 (Jun., 2003), pp.421-442. SAGE Publications.

Darwall, S., 'Empathy, Sympathy and Care', Philosophical Studies: An international Journal for Philosophy in the Analytic Tradition, Vol. 89, No, 2/3 . *The American Philosophical Association for Pacific Division Meeting 1997* (Mar., 1998), pp.261-282.

Fraser, N., 'Rethinking the Public Sphere: A Contribution to the Critique of Actually Existing Democracy', *Social Text, Duke University Press*, No.25/26, (1990). pp. 56-80.

Frank, A.W., 'Why study people's stories? The Dialogical Ethics of Narrative Analysis' , International Journal of Qualitative Methods, *lecture delivered to the Advances in Qualitative Methods Conference. International Institute for Qualitative Methodology, Edmonton* (Feb, 2001).

Forman-Barzilai, F., ' Sympathy in Space(s): Adam Smith on Proximity'*, Political Theory*, Vol.33, No.2 (Apr., 2005), pp.189-217, SAGE Publications.

Friedman, M. *'*Feminism and Modern Friendship: Dislocating the Community', *Journal of Ethics* (1989).

Garnharm, N., 'Habermas and the Public Sphere', *Global Media and Communication 2007*; 3; 201. Sage Publications.

Gordon, R.M, ' Sympathy, Simulation, and the Impartial Spectator', *Ethics*, Vol. 105. No.4 (Jul., 1995), pp.727-742, The University of Chicago Press.

Hanisch, C. 'The Personal is Political', *Notes from the Second Year: Women's Liberation*), 1969.

Haraway D., 'Situated Knowledges: The Science Question in Feminism and the Privilege of Partial Perspective' *Feminist Studies,* Vol.14, No.3. (Autumn, 1988), pp. 575-599.

Hawkesworth. M.E., 'Feminist Rhetoric: Discourses on the Male Monopoly of Thought' , *Political Theory*, Vol 16. No.3 (Aug., 1988), pp.44-467. SAGE Publications.

Held, V., 'Non-contractual Society: A feminist view' in Weiss and Friedman (eds.), *Feminism and Community 209, Vol. 222* (1995).

Honig. B., 'Arendt, Identity and Difference'*, Political Theory*, Vol 16. No. 1 (Feb, 1988) pp. 77-98. SAGE Publications.

Isaac, J.C., 'Situating Hannah Arendt On Action and Politics', *Political Theory*, Vol.21, No.3 (August, 1993), pp. 534-540.

Knauer. J, T., 'Motive and Goal in Hannah Arendt's Concepts of Political Action', *The American Political Science Review*, Vol. 74, No.3 (September, 1980), pp.721-733.

Larner, W., 'Neo-Liberalism: Policy, Ideology, Governmentality'*, Studies in Political Economy* 63 (Autumn 2000).

Martens, K., 'Mission Impossible? Defining Nongovernmental Organizations', *Voluntas: International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit Organisations*, Vol.13, No.3 (September 2002), pp.271-285.

Mawlawski, F., The evolving role of non-governmental actors. *Journal of International Affairs* 46 (1993): 391-414.

Olsen, F. 'Constitutional Law: Feminist Critiques of the Public/Private Distinction', *Journal of Constitutional Commentary*, Article 10, volume 319 (1993).

Okin, S. 'Gender, Justice and Gender: An Unfinished Debate', *Fordham Law Review*, Article 9 Volume 7, Issue 5 (2004).

O'Reilly, A., Ruddick interviewed by A. O'Reilly, *'A Conversation About Maternal Thinking'* in A. O'Reilly, (ed.), *Maternal Thinking: Philosophy, Politics and Practice.*

Perlman, L., 'Buber's Anti-Kantianism', *AJS Review*, Vol 15, No.1 (Spring, 1990), pp. 95-108, Cambridge University Press on behalf of the Association for Jewish Studies.

Pogge, T.W., ' Cosmopolitanism and Sovereignty', *Ethics*, Vol. 103, No.1 (Oct. , 1992), pp.48-75, University of Chicago Press.

Nealon, J.T, ' The Ethics of Dialogue: Bakhtin and Levinas'*, College English*, Vol 59, No,2 (Feb, 1997), pp.129-148, National Council of Teachers of English.

Mitchell, J., 'Evolution and Devolution: Citizenship, Institutions, and Public Policy'*, The Journal of Federalism*, volume 36 number 1, pp.153-168 (2000) Oxford University Press.

Rautenfeld von. H., 'Thinking for Thousands: Emerson's Theory of Political Representation in the Public Sphere', *American Journal of Political Science*, Vol. 49, No.1 (Jan., 2005). pp. 184-197.

Robbins, B., 'Comparative Cosmopolitanism', *Social Text*, no. 31/32, *Third World and Post-Colonial Issues* (1992), pp.169-186, Duke University Press.

Ruddick, S., 'Preservation, Love and Military Destruction' in *Mothering: Essays in Feminist Theory*, ed. J. Trebilcot (Rowman and Allanheld: 1983).

Sales, Arnaud*.*, The Private, the Public and Civil Society: Social Realms and Power Structures*, International Political Science Review* October 1991 12: 295-312.

Schmitter, P.C., and Karl, T.L., 'What Democracy is…and Is Not', *Journal of Democracy*, Volume 2, Number 3, Summer 1991, pp.75-88, The Johns Hopkins University Press

Schoener, W., Non-governmental organizations and global activism: Legal and informal approaches*. Global Legal Studies* (1997) Journal 4: 537-569

Sevenhuijsen. S., 'Too Good to be True?', *IWM Working Paper*, No. 3/1998, Vienna, IWM Publications.

Sorensen, R.A., 'Self-Strengthening Empathy'*, Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, Vol. 58, No. 1 (Mar., 1998), pp.75-98, International Phenomenological Society.

Stone. D, 'Why we need a care movement' in *Nation* (New York), 13 March 2000, pp. 13-15.

Tronto, J. 'Moral Boundaries: A Political Argument for an Ethic of Care' (Routledge, New York: 1993), p.96.

Weiss, J.A., and Piderit, S.K, 'The Value of Mission Statements in Public Agencies', *Journal of Public Administration Research*: J-PART, Vol. 9, No.2 (April 1999).

Weyers, H., 'Co-operation between non-governmental volunteer services and the United Nations Volunteer Programme' in *The International Journal of Comparative Sociology* 21(3/4) (1980), pp. 225-242.

Widder. N., 'Time and Pluralism', *Journal of International Political Theory* 7(1) 2011, 95-101, Edinburgh University Press: 2011.

Williams, S., 'A Feminist Reassessment of Civil Society,' *Indiana Law Journal*: Vol.72, Issue. 2, Article 5. (1997).

Wodehouse, H., ' Martin Buber's 'I and Thou' ', *Philosophy*, Vol. 20., No.75 (Apr., 1975), Cambridge University Press on behalf of Royal Institute of Philosophy, pp.17-30.

Wyatt, R.O., Katz, E., and Kim, J., 'Bridging the Spheres: Political and Personal Conversation in Public and Private Spaces', *Journal of Communication*, (Winter 2000), International Communications Association.

Verlinden, A., 'Reconciling Global Duties with Special Responsibilities: Towards a dialogical Ethics', Questioning Cosmopolitanism*, Studies in Global Justice 6* (2010).

Websites

Alliance Scotland, <http://www.alliance-scotland.org.uk> , [Accessed 20/1/2011, 18.15 GMT]

Anti-Voter Apathy Project <www.antivoterapathyproject.org> [Accessed 19/5/2010 1200 GMT]

"Talking About 'Tribe,'" Africa Policy Information Center. <http://www.tolerance.org/supplement/one-zambia-one-nation> [Accessed 5 March 2012; 11.43 GMT]

Children's Rights Falkirk <www.falkirkchildrensrights.orh.uk> [Accessed March 2010]

Deaf Blind Scotland <www.deafblindscotland.org.uk> [Accessed March 2010]

See *European Convention on the Recognition of the Legal Personality of International Non-Governmental Organisations* ;

<http://conventions.coe.int/Treaty/en/Reports/html/124.htm> [Accessed 20 December 2013]

Freedom House, Countries at the Crossroads 2011 - Zambia, 10 November 2011, available at: <http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4ecba6401a.html> [accessed 8 March 2013]

Fountain of Hope Zambia, <http://www.fountainofhope.org.uk/index> Interview [July 2010]

 Hanisch, C., 'The Personal Is Political' 1969 Essay published by The Women's Liberation Movement <http://www.carolhanisch.org/CHwritings/PIP.html> [Accessed September 9th 2012 ; 18:57 GMT]

IVS Scotland <http://ivsgb.org/info/>, Interview [March, 2010]

Judge, A. *NGOs and Civil Society: Union of International Associations* (December 1994) <https://www.globalpolicy.org/component/content/article/177/31597.html> [Accessed 21st December 2013]

Kolberg , L. , Stages of Moral Development , (1971) *<http://moodle.unitec.ac.nz/file.php/950/Day_9_childhood/Stages_of_Moral_Development _According_to_Kohlberg.pdf>* [Accessed 10th April 2009]

Linda Dunion, Biography published by NHS Tayside <http://www.nhstayside.scot.nhs.uk/about_nhstay/members/ldunion.shtml> [Accessed 9th June 2010, 16.15 GMT]

Oxfam Scotland <http://www.oxfam.org.uk/scotland/>, Interview [9th May 2010]

NIDOS, <http://www.nidos.org.uk/> , Interview [March, 2010]

Sport In Action Homepage <http://www.sportinaction.org.zm/> [Accessed June2009]

Stop Climate Chaos Scotland *<http://www.stopclimatechaos.org/scotland>* [Accessed February 1st 2010] & [Accessed 10th May 2010, 12.32 GMT]

Srinath I., Secretary General of CIVICUS <http://reliefweb.int/report/zambia/zambia-ngo-bill-could-severely-restrict-civil-society-freedoms also see www.civicus.org> [access 3rd April 2010 12.42 GMT]

The See Me Campaign, Scotland <http://www.seemescotland.org/> [Accessed 24 March 2010]

What is an NGO, NGO Monitor *<http://www.ngo-monitor.org/article/what_is_an_ngo_>* [Accessed March 2 2010]

Recommendations of the Christie Commission
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/About/Review/publicservicescommission> [accessed 9th
December 2011, 12.30 GMT]

Rokotuivuna, A. 'WOMEN, DEVELOPMENT AND FEMINISM: SOME CRITERIA', Summary of
Presentation for Women, Development and Empowerment: A Pacific Feminist Perspective
<http://www.nzetc.org/tm/scholarly/tei-GriWom2-c4-3.html>, [Accessed 9th June 2011
14.43 GMT]

Appendix 1

University of St Andrews
_____

International Relations School Ethics Committee

14 February 2010

Ashley Cole

Ethics Reference No: _Please quote this ref on all correspondence_	IR6131
Project Title:	Nurturing an Ethic of Care in Statesmenship: What do NGOs Learn from Conversations with states
Researchers Name(s):	Ashley Cole
Supervisor(s):	Prof. Ali Watson

Thank you for submitting your application which was considered at the IR School Ethics Committee meeting on the 27 January 2010. The following documents were reviewed:

1. Ethical Application Form   27/01/10
2. Participant Information Sheet   27/01/10
3. Consent Form   27/01/10
4. Debriefing Form   27/01/10
5. External Permissions   n/a
6. Letters to Parents/Children/Headteacher etc…   n/a
7. Questionnaires   27/01/10
8. Enhanced Disclosure Scotland and Equivalent   n/a
   (_as necessary_)

The University Teaching and Research Ethics Committee (UTREC) approves this study from an ethical point of view. Please note that where approval is given by a School Ethics Committee that committee is part of UTREC and is delegated to act for UTREC.

Approval is given for three years. Projects, which have not commenced within two years of original approval, must be re-submitted to your School Ethics Committee.

You must inform your School Ethics Committee when the research has been completed. If you are unable to complete your research within the 3 three year validation period, you will be required to write to your School Ethics Committee and to UTREC (where approval was given by UTREC) to request an extension or you will need to re-apply.

Any serious adverse events or significant change which occurs in connection with this study and/or which may alter its ethical consideration, must be reported immediately to the School Ethics Committee, and an Ethical Amendment Form submitted where appropriate.

Approval is given on the understanding that the 'Guidelines for Ethical Research Practice' (http://www.st-andrews.ac.uk/media/UTRECguidelines%20Feb%2008.pdf) are adhered to.

Yours sincerely

Dr. J.S. Murer

Convenor of the School Ethics Committee