

MUSIC AND SPIRITUALITY

THEOLOGICAL APPROACHES, EMPIRICAL
METHODS, AND CHRISTIAN WORSHIP

EDITED BY
GEORGE CORBETT
AND SARAH MOERMAN



MUSIC AND SPIRITUALITY

Music and Spirituality

Theological Approaches, Empirical
Methods, and Christian Worship

Edited by
George Corbett and Sarah Moerman



<https://www.openbookpublishers.com>

©2024 George Corbett and Sarah Moerman (eds). Copyright of individual chapters is maintained by the chapter's authors.



This work is licensed under an Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International (CC BY-NC 4.0). This license allows you to share, copy, distribute and transmit the text; to adapt the text for non-commercial purposes of the text providing attribution is made to the author (but not in any way that suggests that they endorse you or your use of the work). Attribution should include the following information:

George Corbett and Sarah Moerman (eds), *Music and Spirituality: Theological Approaches, Empirical Methods, and Christian Worship*. Cambridge, UK: Open Book Publishers, 2024, <https://doi.org/10.11647/OBP.0403>

Copyright and permissions for the reuse of many of the images included in this publication may differ from the above. This information is provided in the captions and in the list of illustrations. Every effort has been made to identify and contact copyright holders and any omission or error will be corrected if notification is made to the publisher.

Further details about CC BY-NC licenses are available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

All external links were active at the time of publication unless otherwise stated and have been archived via the Internet Archive Wayback Machine at <https://archive.org/web>

Updated digital material and resources associated with this volume are available at <https://www.openbookpublishers.com/product/0403#resources>

ISBN Paperback: 978-1-80511-302-7

ISBN Hardback: 978-1-80511-303-4

ISBN Digital (PDF): 978-1-80511-304-1

ISBN Digital eBook (EPUB): 978-1-80511-305-8

ISBN HTML: 978-1-80511-307-2

DOI: 10.11647/OBP.0403

Cover image: Hans Memling, *Christ with Singing and Music-Making Angels* (1483–1494), Royal Museum of Fine Arts Antwerp, Wikimedia, [https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Musicerende_engelen,_Hans_Memling,__\(1483-1494\),_Koninklijk_Museum_voor_Schone_Kunsten_Antwerpen,_779.jpg](https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Musicerende_engelen,_Hans_Memling,__(1483-1494),_Koninklijk_Museum_voor_Schone_Kunsten_Antwerpen,_779.jpg)

Cover design: Jeevanjot Kaur Nagpa

Contents

Acknowledgments	ix
Notes on Contributors	xi
Introduction	1
<i>George Corbett and Sarah Moerman</i>	
Foreword: A Composer's Perspective	13
<i>James MacMillan</i>	
I. THEOLOGICAL APPROACHES	19
1. Encountering the Uncontrollable: Music's Resistance to Reductionism and Its Theological Ramifications	21
<i>Jeremy Begbie</i>	
2. Cross and Consolation: Music's Empathic Spirituality	41
<i>Peter C. Bouteneff</i>	
3. Music, Breath, and Spirit	55
<i>Michael O'Connor</i>	
4. An Adorative Posture towards Music and Spiritual Realities	73
<i>Férdia J. Stone-Davis</i>	
5. Religion, Science, and Music: An Augustinian Trinity	87
<i>Bennett Zon</i>	
6. Dissonant Spirituality: A Hermeneutical Aesthetics of Outlaw Country	109
<i>C.M. Howell</i>	

II. EMPIRICAL METHODS	137
7. From the Sacred to the Ordinary through the Lens of Psychological Science	139
<i>Yeshaya David M. Greenberg</i>	
8. An Inquiry into Musical Trance	159
<i>Dilara Turan</i>	
9. An Ethnomusicology of Spiritual Realities	193
<i>Jeffers Engelhardt</i>	
10. The Concept of ‘Atmosphere’ as a Bridge between Music and Spirituality	209
<i>Bernard Lukasz Sawicki OSB</i>	
11. Spiritual Subjects: Musicking, Biography, and the Connections We Make	233
<i>Maeve Louise Heaney VDMF</i>	
12. The Impetus to Compose: Where is Fantasy Bred?	255
<i>Richard E. McGregor</i>	
III. CHRISTIAN WORSHIP	271
13. Music in Christian Services as a Means to Induce Religious Feelings	273
<i>Melanie Wald-Fuhrmann</i>	
14. Spiritual Cultures: Innovations in Choral and Classical Music	285
<i>Jonathan Arnold</i>	
15. Listening to the Lived Experiences of Worshipers: A Study of Post-Pandemic Mixed Ecology Worship	305
<i>Elsbeth Manders</i>	
16. An Abductive Study of Digital Worship through the Lenses of Netnography and Digital Ecclesiology	327
<i>Tihomir Lazić</i>	
17. Choral Singers and Spiritual Realities: A Perspective from St Mary’s Catholic Cathedral	355
<i>Michael Ferguson</i>	

18. Music and Spirituality in Communal Song: Methodists and Welsh Sporting Crowds <i>Martin V. Clarke</i>	371
Afterword: A Psychologist's Perspective <i>John Sloboda</i>	389
List of Figures and Tables	399
Bibliography	401
Index	451

Acknowledgments

Sarah and I would like to thank the Templeton Religion Trust for a project grant contributing to its research cluster *Art Seeking Understanding*. As part of our project, we sought to develop a three-way interdisciplinary conversation between theology, musicology, and psychology and neuroscience, which led to an international workshop on Music and Spiritual Realities, as well as, in due course, to this volume. We would like to thank Christopher Brewer and all the staff of TRT and the wider ASU 'community of practice' for their help and advice on our project.

Our project team in the University of St Andrews brought together colleagues from the Institute for Theology, Imagination and the Arts (ITIA) in the School of Divinity; the Music Centre; and the School of Psychology and Neuroscience. We would like to thank especially our two senior research collaborators—Michael Ferguson (musicology) and Ines Jentzsch (cognitive neuroscience)—as well as our advisors—David Brown, James MacMillan, Andrew Torrance, and Brendan Wolfe—who contributed invaluable at different stages of the project. We are also particularly grateful for their assistance, in different ways, to Christopher Bragg, Oliver Crisp, Kate Dove, Michael Downes, Tania Holland Williams, Claire Innes-Hopkins, Susan Millar, Lyndsay Mitchell, Elizabeth O'Keeffe, and Deborah Smith.

Our workshop formed part of the annual meeting of the European Academy of Religion at the University of St Andrews in June 2023, and we are grateful to the organisers, and especially Brendan Wolfe and Sterling Yates, for their collaboration. We would like to thank all the speakers at our workshop (and contributors to this volume), as well as the many workshop attendees who contributed to the rich intellectual conversations both inside and outside the scheduled sessions. We hope you will continue to be part of the ongoing scholarly conversation which this volume seeks to foster.

We were delighted to collaborate with Open Book Publishers on this project, and we are grateful to the OBP team for their support in developing this edited volume. Thank you, in particular, to Alessandra Tosi, Adèle Kreager, Jeevanjot Nagpal, and to the two anonymous peer reviewers. Finally, I would like to thank the School of Divinity's Deas Fund for funding a research assistant, and Rosemary Williams for her meticulous work in preparing the bibliography, as well as the University of St Andrews' Institutional Open Access Fund which co-funded, with TRT, the subvention grant.

Notes on Contributors

Jonathan Arnold is Executive Director of the Social Justice Network in the Diocese of Canterbury. Prior to this, he was Dean of Divinity and Fellow of Magdalen College at the University of Oxford, and, for many years, a member of the professional choir The Sixteen. His publications include *The Great Humanists* (2011), *Sacred Music in Secular Society* (2014), and *Music and Faith: Conversations in a Post-Secular Age* (2019).

Jeremy Begbie is Thomas A. Langford Distinguished Research Professor of Theology at Duke Divinity School, and the McDonald Agape Director of Duke Initiatives in Theology and the Arts (DITA). His publications include *Theology, Music and Time* (2000), *Resounding Truth: Christian Wisdom in the World of Music* (2007), and *Abundantly More: The Theological Promise of the Arts in a Reductionist World* (2023).

Peter C. Bouteneff is Professor of Systematic Theology and Kulik Professor of Sacred Arts at St Vladimir's Orthodox Theological Seminary, where he is also founding director of the Institute of Sacred Arts. His publications include *Sweeter than Honey: Orthodox Thinking on Dogma and Truth* (2006), *Arvo Pärt: Out of Silence* (2015), and *How to Be a Sinner: Finding Yourself in the Language of Repentance* (2018).

Martin V. Clarke is Senior Lecturer in Music at the Open University. He is the author of *British Methodist Hymnody: Theology, Heritage and Experience* (2018), editor of *Music and Theology in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (2012), and he co-edited, with Trevor Herbert and Helen Barlow, *A History of Welsh Music* (2022).

George Corbett is Professor of Theology at the University of St Andrews. His publications include *Dante and Epicurus* (2013), *Dante's Christian Ethics* (2020), and, as editor, *Annunciations: Sacred Music for the Twenty-First Century* (2019).

Michael O'Connor is Associate Professor at St Michael's College in the University of Toronto, and former Director of St Michael's Schola Cantorum. He is the author of *Cajetan's Biblical Commentaries: Motive and Method* (2017) and co-edited, with Hyun-Ah Kim and Christina Labriola, *Music, Theology, and Justice* (2017).

Jeffers Engelhardt is Professor of Music at Amherst College. He is the author of *Singing the Right Way: Orthodox Christians and Secular Enchantment in Estonia* (2015), and he co-edited, with Philip V. Bohlman, *Resounding Transcendence: Transitions in Music, Religion, and Ritual* (2016) and, with Andrew Mall and Monique Ingalls, *Studying Congregational Music: Key Issues, Methods, and Theoretical Perspectives* (2021).

Michael Ferguson is Lecturer and Coordinator of Academic Music at the University of St Andrews, and Director of Music at St Mary's Catholic Cathedral in Edinburgh.

Yeshaya David M. Greenberg is a psychologist and social neuroscientist. He is the founding director of CHIME (Center for Health Innovation, Music, and Education), and an honorary research associate at the Autism Research Centre at Cambridge University. He has published the largest studies to date on autism (*Proceedings of National Academy of Sciences*, 2018), on music and culture (*Journal of Personality & Social Psychology*, 2022), and on theory of mind (*Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 2022).

Maevae Louise Heaney VDMF is Associate Professor in the Faculty of Theology and Philosophy, and the Xavier Chair for Theological Formation, at Australian Catholic University. She is the author of *Music and Theology: What Music Says about the Word* (2012) and *Suspended God: Music and a Theology of Doubt* (2022).

C.M. Howell is a doctoral researcher at the University of St Andrews, where he is working on the theological aesthetics of Eberhard Jüngel.

Tihomir Lazić is Senior Lecturer in Systematic Theology at Newbold College of Higher Education, a musician and worship leader, and the author of *Towards an Adventist Version of Communion Ecclesiology: Remnant in Koinonia* (2019).

James MacMillan is one of today's most successful composers, whose works are performed and broadcast around the world, and he is also internationally active as a conductor. He is Professor of Theology and Music at the University of St Andrews, founder of The Cumnock Tryst, and was awarded a knighthood for his services to music in 2015.

Elsbeth Manders is a doctoral student at the University of St Andrews. Prior to this she obtained an MLitt in Sacred Music from the University of St Andrews, and a BA (Honours) in Music from the University of Oxford.

Richard E. McGregor is Professor Emeritus of Music at the University of Cumbria, and he currently lectures at the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland. He edited *Perspectives on Peter Maxwell Davies* (2000), and he is the author, with Nicholas Jones, of *The Music of Peter Maxwell Davies* (2020).

Sarah Moerman is a Research Fellow in Theology and Music at the University of St Andrews. She also holds a research fellowship in social cognition from the University of Birmingham which provides psychology cross-training for theologians. Her research focuses on the various intersections between music, theology, and psychology.

Bernard Łukasz Sawicki OSB is Associate Professor in Theology at the Pontifical University of Saint Anselm in Rome. His publications include *The Concept of the Absurd and its Theological Reception in Christian Monasticism* (2005), *W chorale jest wszystko* [In Gregorian Chant Is All] (2014), and *The Music of Chopin and the Rule of Saint Benedict* (2014).

John Sloboda is Emeritus Professor at the University of Keele, where he founded and directed the Study of Musical Skill and Development, and at the Guildhall School of Music and Drama. His publications include *The Musical Mind: The Cognitive Psychology of Music* (1985), *Exploring the Musical Mind: Cognition, Emotion, Ability, Function* (2005) and, as co-editor with Patrik N. Juslin, *Handbook of Music and Emotion: Theory, Research, Applications* (2009).

Férdia J. Stone-Davis is Senior Scientist for the Austrian Science Fund (FWF) Research Project 'The Epistemic Power of Music', and Director of Research at the Margaret Beaufort Institute, Cambridge. She is the author of *Musical Beauty: Negotiating the Boundary between Subject and*

Object (2011), editor of *Music and Transcendence* (2015), and co-editor, with M. J. Grant, of *The Soundtrack of Conflict: The Role of Music in Radio Broadcasting in Wartime and in Conflict Situations* (2013).

Dilara Turan is a Research Assistant in the Department of Music, Istanbul Bilgi University, Turkey, where she also received her doctorate. Her current research focuses on the spirituality of music and the cultural study of avant-garde music practices.

Melanie Wald-Fuhrmann is Director of the Department of Music at the Max Planck Institute for Empirical Aesthetics (MPIEA) and Professor of Systematic Musicology at the Goethe University, Frankfurt/Main. Her publications include *Welterkenntnis aus Musik: Athanasius Kirchers 'Musurgia universalis' und die Universalwissenschaft im 17. Jahrhundert* [Knowledge of the World from Music. Athanasius Kircher's 'Musurgia universalis' and Universal Science in the Seventeenth Century] (2006), *'Ein Mittel wider sich selbst': Melancholie in der Instrumentalmusik um 1800* ['A Means Against Itself': Melancholy in Instrumental Music around 1800] (2010), and as co-editor, with Klaus-Peter Dannecker and Sven Boenneke, *Wirkungsästhetik der Liturgie: Transdisziplinäre Perspektiven* [Aesthetics of Liturgy: Transdisciplinary Perspectives] (2020).

Bennett Zon is Professor of Music at Durham University. He is Founding Director of the International Network for Music Theology and Inaugural President of the International Nineteenth-Century Studies Association. His publications include *Music and Metaphor in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (2000), *Representing Non-Western Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (2007), and *Evolution and Victorian Musical Culture* (2017).

Foreword: A Composer's Perspective

James MacMillan

The inspiration for my third symphony, subtitled 'Silence', comes from the novel of the same name by one of Japan's greatest twentieth century writers, Shūsaku Endō, who died in 1996.¹ His book—made into a film by Martin Scorsese²—asks profound philosophical questions and resonates with one of the most anguished questions asked some 2,000 years ago 'My God, my God, why have you abandoned me?' It is a question that has been asked continuously since, right through Auschwitz and into our own time. Endo's 'silence' is the silence of God in the face of terrible events springing from the merciless nature of man: torture, genocide, holocaust. One of Endo's characters comments, 'I cannot bear the monotonous sound of the dark sea gnawing at the shore. Behind the depressing silence of this sea, the silence of God... the feeling that while men raise their voices in anguish, God remains with folded arms, silent'. For Endo—a Christian convert—this silence is not absence, however, but presence. Rather than 'nihil', it is the silence of accompaniment, as Christ accompanies us in our *via dolorosa*, through the valley of tears, suffering with us as one of us. But the notion of silence as presence—as mystical or metaphysical substance—is one that has many musical analogies. The emptiness and solitude of a composer's silence is pregnant with the promise of possibility and potency, and music itself grows out of silence.

-
- 1 James MacMillan, *Symphony No. 3: 'Silence'* (London: Boosey & Hawkes, 2002); Shūsaku Endō, *Silence*, trans. by William Johnston (London: Peter Owen, 1976).
 - 2 *Silence*, dir. by Martin Scorsese (Paramount Pictures, 2016).

Descend into silence, indeed, and you become an extension of it. A composer should feel the silence adhering to him. And yet, we fill our worlds with everything that will challenge, contradict, and ultimately kill this precious silence. Music itself has been harnessed and co-opted as a weapon in this elemental war, transformed as it is into muzak—everywhere. Musicians should not collude with this. The war against silence is also a war against us, and against the interior life, from where spring our inspirations to create. In the early 1600s, the philosopher and boredom theorist Blaise Pascal wrote, ‘All of humanity’s problems stem from a man’s inability to sit quietly in a room alone’. Since this is what composers do a lot of the time, in following our vocations as creators, we should ask, and we should be asked, ‘why are we different? Are composers’ problems different? Why are we able to sit quietly in a room alone? Are we more fortunate than everyone else? Are we the most fortunate of the fortunate?’ On one level we are, but the descent into silence comes with a price. There is a deep fear of silence. And it is natural for composers to feel it too. This disquiet at being alone, at holding our tongues, at being starved of distraction has been with us, all of us, from the beginning—it is our natural state. More so today than ever. So we wage war on it. Silence is almost extinct.

Why do we resist going there? There is clearly a fear of nothingness—the abyss of non-being. That is completely natural. We avoid thinking about our own deaths, for example—the deep scandal of being irrelevant to this exciting, throbbing, living world. How dare they imagine going on without me? But what if there is something even more terrifying than nothing at the heart of this silence? What if Endo is right—that this silence is not absence? But presence? If it’s not ‘nihil’ that is there, but ‘accompaniment’? What are we being accompanied by? When stoics, mystics, saints, and composers dig deep into this silence searching for what is there, what if they meet that which searches in the opposite direction? Something that is searching for us? Coming back at us... I don’t know if that is what John Cage had in mind when he devised his 4’33”—that is, 4 minutes and 33 seconds of silence—a kind of provocation to our listening sensibilities, or lack of them: a kind of goad to make us hear music and other things better, a kind of challenge perhaps to our ‘Entertain me and entertain me now’ culture. It may come as a surprise

to some that his original title for this apparently jocular little slice of aesthetic naughtiness was 'Silent Prayer'.³

This silent 'place' is not necessarily a happy or contented 'place'. Sometimes the silence is dreadful and terrifying. No wonder Beethoven raged against his dying of the sound. What a frightening place to travel into, for anyone who has ever heard, never to emerge again. What an especially vile place for a musician and composer to go to and never return from. But go he did. A prison from where the condemned man will never exit. And the condemned man was Beethoven. Not just hell on earth, but hell in his own soul. And in that soundless, airless vacuum of nothing what did the composer meet? We will never know, of course, but we have messages from that deep impact, postcards from the other planet, air from this harrowed, empty place that now fills our planet with sound. His silence was pregnant. His nihil was accompanied. What became present in that ghastly absence of sound were some of the greatest masterpieces a human being has ever composed. If you want to know what is there, in that silence, what awaits, searching back at you, have a look and listen again to Beethoven's late string quartets.

I tell the young composers that I meet that this is the 'place' where we must go. Not deafness, not airlessness, not outer space. But silence. It calls us from its depth—deep calling on deep—like a monstrous ocean. It is imperative that we obey its command. It's as simple as that. Because when all the lessons are over, when you've completed your last counterpoint exercise, when you've learned all you can about how to orchestrate, when you've done modernism, postmodernism, minimalism, neo-complexity, and *musica negativa* until you can't think straight, there is only one other place to go. It is perfectly understandable if one chooses to get off the boat now. But for those who have to continue, how should we travel into this unexplored domain?

Have you ever gazed into the eyes of another person for a long time? I suppose husbands, wives, and partners do it. I suppose parents do it with their children. But otherwise it's weird, uncomfortable, unnatural. Twenty years ago, the psychologist Arthur Aron did an experiment.

3 See James Pritchett, *The Music of John Cage* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1993), p. 59: "'Silent Prayer,' as it was thus described in 1948, is clearly the first glimmer of an idea that, four years later, would become 4' 33"; while "Silent Prayer" is not 4' 33" itself, it is its ancestor'.

He was able to get complete strangers to fall in love in his laboratory. The participants sit and look into each other's eyes for four minutes (or maybe four minutes, thirty-three seconds!) without saying a word. Two of the subjects got married six months later. In this scenario, four minutes becomes a very long time—it is as though one is being pulled towards the other. Is this, perhaps, like staring into a religious icon? What actually is staring back at us? What does it see in our eyes, looking in? Gazing silently into the blind eyes on an icon is meant to let us see into the beauty of the divine presence. Icons are very important objects in the Greek and Russian Orthodox spiritual tradition. They are considered as windows into the soul of God. But God looks back. Silently. Some of the most powerful artistic representations of the nature of Heaven depict the Father staring into the eyes of the Son—for ever. Silently.

I've come to realise, then, that it is this ongoing encounter with silence that is the necessary state for a composer. Both eyes and ears turn to this empty place in an apparent and paradoxical search for sounds. Sounds which germinate in a place empty of sound. Sounds which are quickened into existence in a state of sonic vacuum—an apparent absence which brings forth presence. There is obviously a religious dimension to this but I'm keen to speak of it in ways that people and composers of very different worldviews and understandings can adapt to their own creative searches. For some, gazing at and listening for beauty is a matter of belief, but the composer's search for the numinous can take many forms—a deep, attentive looking and listening—and can be integrated into our lives as a spiritual practice, or perhaps simply as an imaginative discipline and search for the inner imagination, a search for the interior life.

My analogy with gazing at icons is intended to be helpful to my fellow composers. The composer John Tavener told me that in the Orthodox tradition icons are a form of prayer. He said to me, 'Jesus is the image (icon) of the invisible God'. When you look at an icon, it is meant to make you aware that you are in the presence of the divine. Icons, then, are not just art with a religious theme. Instead, they are sacred art because they bring the viewer into the presence of the holy. When one fixes one's undivided attention on these images over a substantial period, the images may come to life and enter into animated dialogue with the practitioner, or so the thinking goes. Painters and creators of

icons say that the image being gazed at seems to look at you, coming nearer and nearer, even into your soul. Notice how prominent the eyes are in icons. The understanding is that heaven is looking back at you.

It is said that icons are designed to be doors between this world and another world. And my suggestion is that the musical analogy of this—which does not necessarily involve or need a specific image—brings the composer to an ambiguous hybrid place where his or her world comes into contact or communion with another state, and where the mysterious silent encounter sparks sonic life and compositional possibilities. The new music that we—as composers—are always seeking thereby arises from deep within our creative imaginations and, if you like, from deep within our souls. It is music that emerges when the silent composer descends into a deeper silence, an objective other place or state to which he or she adheres and of which he or she has become an extension. Silence listening to silence.