



Comité International
d'Histoire de l'Art
CIHA Italia

MOTION: TRANSFORMATION

35th Congress of the International Committee
of the History of Arts
Florence, 1-6 September 2019

Congress Proceedings

- Part 2 -

Bononia
University Press

MOTION: TRANSFORMATION

35th Congress of the International Committee
of the History of Arts
Florence, 1-6 September 2019

Congress Proceedings
edited by Marzia Faietti and Gerhard Wolf

- Part 2 -



Bononia University Press
Via Saragozza 10, 40123 Bologna
tel. (+39) 051 232 882
fax (+39) 051 221 019

© 2021 Bononia University Press

ISBN 978-88-6923-650-1
ISBN online 978-88-6923-792-8

www.buonline.com
info@buonline.com

It is the responsibility of the Authors of the individual contributions to secure any permissions necessary to reproduce and publish any included images. Should any complaint or legal dispute arise in relation to a paper, the author shall take responsibility for it.

Graphic design: RovaiWeber design
Layout design: Gianluca Bollina-DoppioClickArt

First edition: September 2021

Contents

CONGRESS PROCEEDINGS - PART 1 -

Index of Authors 9

Preface

Florence 2019 and Beyond

Marzia Faietti, Gerhard Wolf 11

Session 1

The Mystical Mind as a Divine Artist: Visions, Artistic Production, Creation of Images through Empathy

Akira Akiyama, Giuseppe Capriotti, Valentina Živković

Introduction 17

Alessandra Bartolomei Romagnoli

The Painted Word: Forms of Mystical
Language in the 13th Century 23

Claudia Cieri Via

Beyond the Visible: Aby Warburg and His
Final Reflections on Images 31

Michele Bacci

Holy Sites, Ecstatic Experience, and Icon-
Generating Visions 39

Sergi Sancho Fibla

Picturing the Trinity: Vision, Iconography, and
Theology in Béatrice of Ornacieux (d. 1303) 43

Teruaki Matsuzaki

Kakezukuri: A Japanese Architectural Style
for the Mystical Experience of the
Mountain Religion 49

Philippe Morel

An Introduction to Spiritual Contemplation:
The *Vision of Saint Bernard* from Filippo Lippi
to Fra Bartolomeo 53

Raffaele Argenziano

The “Represented” World of Colomba da Rieti
and Domenica da Paradiso 59

Session 2

Artist, Power, Public

Giovanna Capitelli, Christina Strunck

Introduction. Artist, Power, Public 67

Gaetano Curzi

The Power of Images and Images of Power:
The Replicas of the Lateran Saviour in Central
Italy 71

Hannah Baader

The King’s Finger, the Mermaid’s Body and the
Power of the Sea 77

Carlotta Paltrinieri

Social and Spatial Dimensions of the Florentine
Accademia delle Arti del Disegno: The Spaces
of the Florentine Art Academy 83

Priyani Roy Choudhury

The Mughal Simulacra: Architecture as Visual
Language of Imperial Identity in Fatehpur
Sikri 87

Friederike Weis

Confident Women in Indo-Persianate Albums:
Visual Metaphors or Ethnography? 93

Marco Folin / Monica Preti

The Wonders of the Ancient World: Western
Imagery in Translation 99

Stefano Cracolici

“Para hacer honor a su patria y al gobierno”:
Mexican Artists in Rome (1825-1835) 107

Leonardo Santamaría-Montero

From Colony to Republic: Political Images and
Ceremonies in Costa Rica (1809-1858) 113

G. A. Bremner

Propagating Power: Gender, Language, and
Empire in the Edwardian Baroque Revival
(1885-1920) 117

<i>Giulia Murace</i> “Engaged in an Undertaking of the Highest Artistic Culture”: Two Projects for a South American Academy in Rome (1897-1911)	123	<i>Carlo Severi</i> <i>Parer vivo</i> and Perspective: The Case of Mantegna	189
<i>Yi Zhuge</i> An Overview of Contemporary New Media Art in China	127	<i>Ewa Rybalt</i> There Where the Light Retreats: More About Titian’s <i>Annunciations</i>	195
<i>Katarzyna Jagodzińska</i> Between Museum as a Symbol and Museum as a Forum: Power Relations in Building a Museum of Modern Art in Warsaw	133	<i>Zuzanna Sarnecka</i> Divine Sculptural Encounters in the Italian Renaissance Household	201
Session 3 Art and Nature. Cultures of Collecting		<i>Caroline van Eck</i> Sacrifices Material and Immaterial: The Survival of Graeco-Roman Candelabra	207
<i>Marco Collareta</i> Introduction	141	<i>Pamela D. Winfield</i> Visual Mimesis, Textual Nemesis: Animation and Alienation in Zen Portrait Inscriptions	215
<i>Avinoam Shalem</i> Introduction	142	Session 5 De/Sign and Writing	
<i>Dimitrios Latsis</i> Aby Warburg in Arizona: The <i>Denkraum</i> of Nature and Art	145	<i>Lihong Liu</i> Introduction. De/Sign and Writing: Toward an Aesthetic of the Asemic	221
<i>Anja Grebe</i> Art, Nature, Metamorphosis: Maria Sibylla Merian as Artist and Collector	153	<i>Marco Musillo</i> Introduction. Lines, Blots and Graphemes: From Drawing to Invisible Forms	231
<i>João Oliveira Duarte</i> Archiving Nature. From Vandelli’s Curiosity Cabinet to the Natural History Cabinet	159	<i>Sanja Savkic Sebek / Erik Velásquez García</i> Writing as a Visual Art: The Maya Script	235
<i>Elizabeth J. Petcu</i> Palissy and the Clash of Natural and Artistic Processes	165	<i>Liang Chen</i> The Seven Sages of the Bamboo Grove: The Canonization of a Pictorial Theme in Brick Reliefs During the Southern Dynasties	243
<i>Matthew Martin</i> The Philosopher’s Stone: Art and Nature in Eighteenth-Century European Porcelain Production	171	<i>Béla Zsolt Szakács</i> Written on the Wall: Script and Decoration in Medieval Central Europe	251
<i>Stefan Laube</i> Collecting the Other Way Round: Collecting and Being Collected	177	<i>Tutta Palin</i> Modern <i>Disegno</i> : The Embodied Splendour of Lines	257
Session 4 Art and Religions		<i>Arthur Valle</i> Brazilian <i>Pontos Riscados</i> : Spiritual Invocation, Nomination, Geometric Thought	263
<i>Andrea Pinotti</i> Introduction. Animation Reloaded: The Image as ‘Cult Value’	185		

CONGRESS PROCEEDINGS - PART 2 -

Index of Authors	281	<i>Jing Yang</i> The Human and Non-human Interconnectedness in Three Chinese Contemporary Artists	365
Session 6 Building an Icon: Architecture from Project to Product			
<i>Filiz Çakır Phillip, Dario Donetti</i> Introduction	285		
<i>Sharon C. Smith</i> Of Architecture, Icons, and Meaning: Encountering the Pre-Modern City	291		
<i>Yu Yang</i> Shadows of Urban Utopia: Japanese Housing in Colonial Manchuria	301		
<i>Elena O'Neill</i> The Architecture of Eladio Dieste: Challenging Technology, Structure, and Beauty	307		
<i>Alina Payne</i> The Architect's Hand: Making Tropes and Their Afterlife	313		
Session 7 Matter and Materiality in Art and Aesthetics: From Time to Deep-Time			
<i>Francesca Borgo, Riccardo Venturi</i> Introduction	325		
<i>Fabian Jonietz</i> Small Matter and Eternity: Michelangelo's <i>Last Judgment</i>	329		
<i>Nicolas Cordon</i> The Liveliness of Stucco: Vanishing Statues and Creamy Clouds in Baroque Palermo	335		
<i>Bronwen Wilson</i> Lithic Images, Jacopo Ligozzi, and the <i>Descrizione del Sacro Monte della Vernia</i> (1612)	341		
<i>Amy F. Ogata</i> Making Iron Matter in Second Empire France	349		
<i>Stefania Portinari</i> The Venice Biennale as a World Map: Cartographies, Geological Interventions, Landmark Layers	353		
<i>Liliane Ehrhart</i> Towards the Creation of Original Material Depictions of the Human: Marc Quinn's Sculptures	359		
		Session 8 The Ghost in the Machine: The Disappearance of Artists, Critics, Viewers?	
		<i>Rakhee Balaram</i> Introduction	373
		<i>Kwan Kiu Leung</i> Visibility and Criticism in the Public Sphere: Marcel Duchamp & He Chengyao	377
		<i>Nadia Radwan</i> Invisible Stories: The Other Criteria of Art Criticism in the Middle East	381
		<i>Ling Min</i> What is Lost in the Transformation of Art Criticism in China?	387
		<i>José Antonio González Zarandona</i> Destruction of Images; Images on Destruction: Critical Stances on Contemporary Heritage	391
		<i>Francesco Guzzetti</i> Standardizing the Author: Emilio Prini and Conceptual Art	397
		<i>Lola Lorant</i> From Art Criticism to Art History: Challenging the Environmental Exclusion in the Writings of Nouveau Réalisme in the Transatlantic World	403
		<i>Maria de Fátima Morethy Couto</i> Bringing the Spectator to the Foreground: Julio Le Parc and Lygia Clark at the Venice Biennales (1966 and 1968)	409
		<i>Leonardo Impett / Peter Bell</i> Reverse Engineering Michael Baxandall's Pictorial Plot	415
		<i>Pamela Bianchi</i> Digital Curating and Ephemeral Artworks: Three Case Studies	423
		<i>Sara De Chiara</i> <i>Edmond de Belamy</i> or <i>Bel Ami</i> : The Rise of the 'Non-Artist' vs. the Artist's Retreat	429

Session 9**Voyage***Marzia Faietti*

Introduction. From Florence to São Paulo via Marozia 437

Ana Gonçalves Magalhães

Introduction. Voyage: Misplacement and Foreignness 443

Miyuki Aoki Girardelli

The "Orient" in the West: The Japanese Architect Itō Chūta's Travels in the Ottoman Empire and Its Challenge to the Oriental Narrative 445

David Young Kim

Notes on the Underground: The Subterranean Voyages of Giorgio Vasari and António Vieira 451

Maria Berbara

Representations of Brazil in Italy in the 16th and Early 17th Centuries: Between Domestication and Ferocity 459

*Alexander Gaiotto Miyoshi**The Emigrants* (1910) by Antonio Rocco: A Voyage of a Painting and Its Painter 465*Paolo Rusconi*

Attraction and Artistic Mobility Patterns in P.M. Bardi's Brazilian Way 471

Gerhard Wolf

Beyond the Voyage 477

Poster Session*Jefferson de Albuquerque Mendes**Imago Signorum*: The Doctrine of the Microcosmic Man in Illustrations Between the 14th and 15th Centuries 483*Tatiane De Oliveira Elias*

Symbolism of Afro-Latin American Religions in Visual Arts 486

Pedro Luengo

18th-Century Foreign Artists in Courts 489

Renato Menezes

Ambiguous Gestures: Iconography of the Archers Between Europe and the New World 490

Hiroko Nagai

Giovio's and Vasari's Who's Who: Pinturicchio's Mural Paintings as Models for Paolo Giovio's Portraits 493

Haoxue Nie

The Anti-Urbanism Discourse in the Paintings of George Ault and Other Precisionists 496

*Izumi Florence Ota*A French Royal Reliquary With the Image of the *Arma Christi*, the so-called *Libretto* 499*Larissa Carvalho*

Between Art and Fashion: 16th-Century Costume Books Today 502

Jaqueline Souza Veloso

Projection of Maturity, Inventiveness, and Imagination in Roman Funerary Art: Analysis of the Altar of Iulia Victorina 506

Yuning Teng

The Re-fabrication of Napoleon in China (1900-1930) 508

*Yoko Tsuchiyama*Between Object and Text: A Study on Local Reactions to *The Family of Man* in the 1950s and '60s 511**Keynote Speech***Kavita Singh*

Uncollecting India at the V&A: Colonial Artefacts and Their Afterlives 517

Round Table*Vera Agosti*

Motion/Transformation in Valerio Adami 533

Thierry Dufrêne / Peter J. Schneemann

Contemporary Art and CIHA. The Challenge of Transformation. An Informal Conversation 537

**CIHA, Florence 2019
Congress Program**

545

SESSION 7

Matter and Materiality in Art and Aesthetics: From Time to Deep-Time

CHAIRS

Francesca Borgo

University of St Andrews

Riccardo Venturi

Villa Medici - Accademia di Francia a Roma

CONTRIBUTORS

Fabian Jonietz

Small Matter and Eternity: Michelangelo's Last Judgment

Nicolas Cordon

The Liveliness of Stucco: Vanishing Statues and Creamy Clouds in Baroque Palermo

Bronwen Wilson

Lithic Images, Jacopo Ligozzi, and the Descrizione del Sacro Monte della Vernia (1612)

Amy F. Ogata

Making Iron Matter in Second Empire France

Stefania Portinari

The Venice Biennale as a World Map: Cartographies, Geological Interventions, Landmark Layers

Liliane Ehrhart

Towards the Creation of Original Material Depictions of the Human: Marc Quinn's Sculptures

Jing Yang

The Human and Non-human Interconnectedness in Three Chinese Contemporary Artists



Introduction to Session 7

Matter, material and materiality: over the course of the past two decades these three words have become ubiquitous in the humanities and social sciences. Driven by a rising ecocritical awareness and backed by a focus on mobility and trade, the discourse on materiality has profoundly shaped both the theory and practice of our discipline. A response to the 'linguistic turn' of the 1970s and 1980s, this 'material turn' now compellingly counterbalances the dematerialization of today's digital reality, the loss of a culture of tactility and manual crafts.¹ But why does materiality appeal so much to art historians? Perhaps it is because it extols the idea that images are not signs but embodied objects that call for our own, discipline-specific expertise; perhaps because it claims a much larger field of intervention for art history, well beyond the realm of art, into that of material culture and even beyond, past the fabricated object and towards unbounded matter of all kinds.² On the one hand, materiality has reinforced the disciplinary boundaries of our academic field; on the other, it has broadened them.

This focus on the matter of art has often translated into an emphasis on the moment of the object's creation: its making, production, and the artist's choice of medium. This session looks instead at what happens *over time*.

In attending to time, the following contributions address an often-overlooked dimension in the biography of the 'animated' artwork: not its coming into life, but rather its slow aging and eventual release into a novel configuration of matter – be it a fragment, ruin, or waste. By following matter before and after the finished, localized object, the session encourages to think about materials subject to time scales at odds with those of human experience, moving – as the title suggests – from the time of human history to the deep time of geological history.³

The effect of time on artworks is a matter of great concern for conservators, curators, and

policymakers, but it has rarely been the focus of art historical inquiry and interpretation. Art historians might even harbor hostility toward time because it obliterates the objects we study. Issues of conservation remain relegated to restoration reports and are often seen as peripheral to the field. Art history established itself as a humanistic discipline by insisting on this distinction: in a now canonical contribution, Erwin Panofsky advocated for the separation between the scientific work of technical art history and humanist inquiry, arguing that "from the humanistic point of view, human records do not age".⁴

When, as art historians, we consider the temporal instability of artworks, we tend to interpret it as the visual manifestation of the distance that separates us from the original condition of the object, a condition we assume to be the relevant one. This session proposes instead to read time more productively and sympathetically: not just in terms of its 'subtractive agency', but as an active, shaping force that compels artists and audiences to confront the object's processes of making and unmaking.

Our session interprets the theme of the 2019 CIHA Congress, *Motion: Transformation* in temporal terms. By focusing on movements that are not just across space but also across time, we hope to complement the current emphasis on the circulation and mobility of objects: the pathways, trajectories, and exchange practices that have helped us productively rethink so much of our globalized discipline.

The themes that the contributions of this session address are rather episodes of stillness and stasis (the dusting of fresco surfaces; the progressive hardening of wet stucco; the freezing of blood; the slow growth of silkworms and plants). They are episodes where movement is vertical rather than horizontal, a deep dive into the earth's stratigraphy and the abyss of geological time

(the rocky escarpments of a sacred mountain; the extraction of iron; the excavations through the geological strata of the Venice Biennale). Taken collectively, they help revise the assumption that matter and objects that are 'on the move' are more significant or have more to offer to art history than those that remain halted, stuck, or marooned.⁵

Matter, material, materiality: so far, we have used these words as synonyms. But do these notions share the same semiotic content? Today, we are still missing an accurate analysis of their distinct applications in different historical and geographical contexts. A survey of the usage and dissemination of these terms would undoubtedly surprise us with respect to our understanding of art history. With its attention to the material *facies* of works of art, our discipline is, within visual humanities, exceptionally well equipped to deal with these issues.

And yet, over the course of the last century, materiality has been neglected, partially as a result of the pull of two important artistic shifts. First, during the avant-garde, when artistic attention was increasingly focusing on ether vibrations, electromagnetic waves, radioactivity, and other invisible phenomena that could be reinvested in the aesthetic field and beyond the material world – a trend Lynda Henderson has designated as *vibratory modernism*.⁶ Later on, in the 1960s, conceptual art challenged materiality in an even more radical fashion. After centuries during which artmaking was fully ruled by the paradigm of visibility, it seemed that, oddly enough, artists were interested in making their works invisible, investigating the threshold of the visible and dismissing its subject matter.

Invisibility, absence, emptiness: the new agenda promoted by conceptual practices involved long-term consequences regarding the role of museums and art institutions, as well as the function of art exhibitions in legitimizing artworks. The material that mattered was now the exhibition itself. This historical move was aptly and timely grasped in 1968 by Lucy Lippard in *The Dematerialization of Art*, a volume that offers a valuable overview of that period.⁷

Within this framework – one that challenges materiality while moving towards invisibility – one

should also mention nuclear energy and radioactivity, as it is in these fields that invisibility first revealed its potentially destructive force. This *avisuality*, to use the expression coined by Akira Mizuta Lippit, threatened to engender a catastrophe that would instantly annihilate human presence on earth.⁸ Nuclear energy, however, does not endorse the negation of matter but rather its transformation: a conversion of matter into the infinitesimal, into a microscopic scale that is simultaneously invisible to the naked eye and colossal in its effects. It is no accident that contemporary artistic practices have so often turned to nuclear energy as the subject matter or 'material' of art.⁹

What these practices and experiences have in common is a compelling invitation not to oppose materiality and de-materialization in a simplistic manner. As a form of de-substantialization, the dematerialization of objects and media does not necessarily lead to the immaterial. Materials – even when they are invisible to the eye – might still possess a matter of some sort, leading to an *impasse* of the modernist aesthetics grounded on the scopic regime or the oculo-centric model.

More recently, according to Jane Bennett, matter has been reconceived not as a passive and inert substance but rather as an activated and energetic element, subject to timescales that are much grander than those of human history.¹⁰ This 'deep-time' of geological history and its unyielding remoteness force the limits of the anthropocentric humanities, eluding our comprehension. Exercising our ecological and geological imagination draws attention to the visual aspect of materiality while challenging common assumptions about the paradigmatic intertwining of time and matter in visual and cultural practices. It leads us to explore the power of images to visualize the materialities that make up our present in an historical framework.

Deep time also resists being reduced to the present moment, to a form of 'presentism' that contemporary art appears to cultivate; it exceeds the human scale and perhaps even our imagination.¹¹ How do artists respond to the materiality that is specific to what has been now called the Anthropocene? How do they visualize an increasingly controversial and threatening geological era that eschews clear-cut and reliable representations? How do they face the catastrophic events that this might engender? How do they respond to a future that is not only unfathomable, unpredictable, or inscrutable, but also unimaginable?

These questions might offer new methodological insights into the exploration of matter and materiality: both in the historiographical weight these terms carry and in their resonance in contemporary artistic practices. With regard to this session, they provide a useful background to shift the focus away from human orchestration towards human and non-human collaborations; to consider material flows and productively rethink the relationship between matter and form beyond the hylomorphic model, the formalism of art history, and the visibility of the Western scopical regime; and to broaden the *longue durée* – encompassing, according to Fernand Braudel, the history of the Mediterranean sea in the XVI century – into an ecology of deep time towards which the current era of the Anthropocene has stretched.

As a testament to the liveliness of the material turn, this session offers only a small selection of the many proposals we received. This final lineup follows a rough chronological order but also groups papers by the nature of the material they

primarily address. With Fabian Jonietz, we start our journey into matter high above ground: from the subtle, fine particles of dust floating in the air and quietly settling on the surface of Renaissance frescoes. We then move on to the glittering marble dust that is stucco, the stuff of otherworldly, celestial softness: of clouds, wings, fleshy dimples, and garlands spreading onto the baroque ceilings of early 18th-century Palermo in Nicolas Cordon's contribution. From there, we descend to the metallic, the mineral, and the lithic. First, with Bronwen Wilson, exploring the rocky landscape of La Verna, among mountains, boulders, and cliffs and then the underground, as Amy Ogata follows iron from Algerian mines to French furnaces and forges, all the way up to the railroads and lamp posts of the Second Empire. We continue with the complex curatorial stratigraphy of the garden of the Venice Biennale in Stefania Portinari's essay, before resurfacing to organic life: to Marc Quinn's manipulation of biological matter in Liliane Ehrhart's essay and finally, with Jing Yang, to the ecological entanglements of human, animal, and vegetal life of contemporary art in China.

Francesca Borgo, Riccardo Venturi

Notes

The session is the result of the authors' cooperation and collective decisions. Borgo authored paragraphs 1-7, 16 and Venturi 8-15 of the introduction. Both authors would like to thank the contributors for their collegiality and lively exchange.

¹ N. Athanassoglou-Kallmyer, "Materiality, Sign of the Times", *The Art Bulletin* 101, no. 4 (2019): pp. 6-7, as well as the issue "Notes from the Field: Materiality", *The Art Bulletin* 95, no. 1 (2013): pp. 10-37.

² For both claims see, respectively, M. Cole, "The Cult of Materials", in S. Clerbois, M. Droth, eds., *Revival and Invention. Sculpture through its Material Histories* (Oxford, Bern, Berlin, Brussels, Frankfurt am Main, New York, Wien: Peter Lang, 2011), pp. 1-15; J. Roberts, "Things: Material Turn, Transnational Turn", *American Art* 31, no. 2 (2017): pp. 64-69.

³ N. Heringman, "Deep Time at the Dawn of the Anthropocene", *Representations* 129, no. 1 (2015): pp. 56-85.

⁴ E. Panofsky, "The History of Art as Humanistic Discipline", originally published in *The Meaning of the Humanities*, ed. T.M. Greene (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1940), pp. 98-118. See C. Fowler, "Technical Art History as Method", *The Art Bulletin* 101, no. 4 (2019): pp. 9-17.

⁵ For a similar conclusion, see also C. Heuer, *Into the White: The Renaissance Arctic and the End of the Image* (Brooklyn: Zone Books, 2019), pp. 174-195. On the impact of the discovery of geological time on 19th-century art, see S. O'Rourke, "Staring into the Abyss of Time", *Representations* 148 (2019): pp. 30-56.

⁶ L.D. Henderson, "Vibratory Modernism: Boccioni, Kupka, and the Ether of Space", in B. Clarke, L.D. Henderson, eds., *From Energy to Information: Representation in Technology, Art, and Literature* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2002), pp. 126-149.

⁷ L. Lippard, *Six Years: The dematerialization of the art object from 1966 to 1972* (Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press, 1973, 2001).

⁸ A. Mizuta Lippit, *Atomic Light (Shadow Optics)* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005).

⁹ Cf. E. Carpenter, ed., *The Nuclear Culture Source Book* (London: Black Dog Publishing, 2016).

¹⁰ J. Bennett, *Vibrant Matter. A Political Ecology of Things* (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2010).

¹¹ F. Hartog, *Régimes d'historicité. Présentisme et expériences du temps* (Paris: Seuil, 2003).

