

Stakeholder Assessment on Aviation in the UK

**Meeting with Commissioning Partners
Thursday 13 December 2007
Cabinet Office (Room 1.45, Admiralty Arch North)**

Welcome

Harriet Festing from SDC welcomed participants to the day and introduced the Core Team that were appointed by the commissioning partners (SASIG, DfT), along with IPPR and SDC and the facilitators of the process (Dialogue by Design).

Pippa Hyam, lead facilitator introduced the day and timings, including purpose, agenda and ground rules.

Purpose

- To agree stakeholder list (list of external stakeholders) and how to categorise them, identify gaps and talk about the balance of stakeholders for subsequent workshops
- To agree UK-wide methodology (take through a process, and this meeting is the building block for the next two workshops, including how devolved administrations fit in)
- To map policy issues for government (help map the policy issues for own government departments and a good guess at policy issues for other departments that may not be here today which will form a map for the next stakeholder workshops)

Agenda

- Session 1: Project Overview
- Session 2: The significance of aviation for government
- Session 3: Other stakeholders and how they approach aviation
- Session 4: Next steps

Ground rules

- No attribution (who precisely said it will not be noted but the information from today will be put into the wider stakeholder domain)
- Recording (please let us know if anything written on the flip charts needs amending)
- Telephones off

Introductions

Name and organisation stated by each of the attendees to the day.

Session 1: Project Overview

Harriet Festing (SDC)

SDC understand that there is a need to make sense of people's differing and often competing social, environmental and economic needs and how to negotiate their way through them. SDC's interest is to look for the bigger vision - not trade-offs, but double-wins. We want a set of policy recommendations to government that makes sense to government and departments across government, as well as broader society.

Martin Capstick (DfT)

Open to dialogue and constructive ways forward to find a new angle and approach for engagement with government based on needs. We want to seek to identify ways forward. Although there is currently aviation policy we are still interested in seeing how this engagement can contribute to the current policy.

Pippa Hyam (DbyD)

Understand that there are a lot of people with very strong views on aviation including the economic drivers. Look for chinks and doors and issues which people can talk about together.

Initial idea was to go into a big stakeholder workshop. However, the facilitators felt there was a need to go in not with a blank sheet of paper and therefore start with an internal government-only meeting.

Many government departments are here today that represent many parts of the community. The stakeholder map will help us to understand the policy issues across government departments from a UK perspective – may be quite similar or very different.

An output of today will be the stakeholder map.

Session 2: The significance of aviation for government

Session Task

Review the proposed matrix and complete for all your own departments and the departments as assigned below in the list of groups not attending the meeting today.

Proposed matrix

Government Departments and Devolved Administrations	Policy and operational benefits of aviation	Challenges caused by aviation

Where government departments were not represented at the meeting, attendees attempted to represent the issues on their behalf.

- Foreign Office → Table 5
- Department of Health → Table 4
- Treasury → Table 1
- OGC → Table 2
- Home Office → Table 5
- RDAs → Table 2
- DIUS → Table 3
- Regional Assemblies → Table 3
- DWP → Table 4
- Cabinet Office → Table 1
- Ministry of Defence → Table 1
- HMRC (Revenue and Customs) → Table 1

Government Departments and Devolved Administrations	Policy and (operational) benefits of aviation	Challenges caused by aviation
Department for Transport (DfT)	Promote economic wellbeing and development in UK	Climate change impacts
	Support global development	Noise effects
	Respond to public's demand for mobility and accessibility	Air quality
	Creation of liberalized, competitive market	Safety
	UK lead in service provision/manufacturing	Security
		Effect of development causing loss of communities/facilities/heritage

Government Departments and Devolved Administrations	Policy and (operational) benefits of aviation	Challenges caused by aviation
Department for Business, Enterprise and Regulatory Reform (BERR)	Wealth generation	Managing effects of growth
	Business access/opportunity	Directing technology development
	Maintain tech lead	Regulatory balance
	High employer/skills	Retention of skills
HM Treasury and HM Revenue and Customs (HMT & HMRC)	Promote economic wellbeing and development	Illegal imports, drugs etc.
	£2bn of Air Passenger Duty	Secure continued growth
	Liberalisation of markets – creates services and prices which suit the public	
	Maintain UK focus as hub of financial services and similar organisations	
Cabinet Office (C.O.)		Security
		Ensuring depts. Work on complex issues with good evidence, range of skills
Ministry of Defense (MoD)	Crossover between civil and military research/technology	Management of airspace
	Possible emergency resource	
	Income from some civil use of bases (Northolt etc.)	
Department for Children, School and Families (DCSF)	Broaden educational opportunities	Disruption of play -Wellbeing -Noise/pollution
	See 'the world'	Impact of climate change -increase of CO2
		Damage to native infrastructure by increased 'school holiday' flights
Regional Development Agencies/Greater London Authority (RDAs/GLA)	Regional Economic Strategies -aviation and industry will contribute	Environmental concerns – air quality/noise/CO2 and greenhouse gases
	Direct employment	Planning/land-take of airports and associated facilities
	Tourist and visitor economy	Transport infrastructure -Roads/rail/car parks to serve facilities

Government Departments and Devolved Administrations	Policy and (operational) benefits of aviation	Challenges caused by aviation
	Cultural exchange	
	Accessibility	
Welsh Assembly Government (WAG)	Public demand	Demands for increased capacity/new routes
	Accessibility	WAG's duty to sustainability – legal
	Social inclusion	Climate change
	Economic development	Leakage of passengers to airports outside Wales
	Lifeline service – peripheral region	Surface transport/infrastructure
	Tourism opportunities	
	Polish immigrants travel home	
Office of Government Commerce (OGC travel procurement within government)	Government travel -well networked gov't -cost saving referring to rail/accommodation	Off-setting cost
		Time
		Climate change impacts
		Costs of flying
Department of the Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (DEFRA)	International negotiations	Global greenhouse emissions – climate change impacts (e.g. flooding)
	Benefits of international trade to rural economies (?)	Local air quality
	Sustainable consumption	Noise
	[Sustainable] development internationally	Surface access issues
		Impacts on rural economies of international trade
		Sustainable consumption
		Land impacts
		Bio-fuels
Environment Agency	Overseas collaboration (EU and Africa)	Local air quality
	Aerial mapping for flood risk	GHG emissions
		Airport construction impacts

Government Departments and Devolved Administrations	Policy and (operational) benefits of aviation	Challenges caused by aviation
Energy Savings Trust	Collaboration in EU	GHG emissions – CC impacts
		Energy policy (cleaner fuels, energy efficiency of planes/engines)
SASIG Strategic Aviation Special Interest Group	Economic benefits	Land take – airport development; surface access; associated uses (housing, community facilities, employment, etc.)
	Leisure & business travel	Noise – disproportionate impact on those around airports
		Surface access provision
		Local air quality
		GHG emissions
Regional Assemblies	Local economic benefits	GHG emissions
	Tourism/leisure	Noise
		Land-take – employment use, housing etc. – local community needs
		Housing market
Department of Innovation, Universities and Skills (DIUS)	Access to international markets	Competition for university places (?)
	Foreign student intake	Brain drain
	International research and innovation	Innovation in alternatives e.g. video conferencing
	Immigration of skilled workers	
Department of Communities and Local Government (DCLG) (NB opportunities and challenges in all of them)	Regeneration	Liveability (noise, congestion, Env. Justice)
	Economic inclusion	Land for housing
	City-regions	Planning – National Planning Statement for aviation and Major Infrastructure Projects
	Cohesion (?)	Extremism (?)
	Demographics/where people live	Carbon budgets for other sectors

Government Departments and Devolved Administrations	Policy and (operational) benefits of aviation	Challenges caused by aviation
Ministry of Justice (MoJ)	Engaging people in dialogue about issues	Challenge of engaging about aviation in a constructive way
	Rights/responsibility and respect of individual	Rights/responsibility and respect of individual
		Potential role in enforcement of policies/targets arising from Climate Change Bill
		Protecting data and privacy of people who fly (Info. Commissioner)
Forestry Commission	Communications about deforestation and carbon (Bali)	Off-setting and how it is managed (England and Scotland have different approaches)
	Bio-fuels from wood	Land use and bio-fuels and planning for airports (ancient woodland)
		Adaptation
		Spread of infectious diseases
Department of Health	Recruiting staff from overseas	LAQ and Mortality/Morbidity
	Air ambulances	Noise and stress
	Local surface transport	Local surface transport
		Health tourism
		Spread of infectious diseases
		Health onboard aircraft -DVT, infection etc.
Scottish Government	Lifeline services	Balance growth with 80% target
	Sustainable economic growth	
Northern Ireland Executive	Sustainable economic growth	Balance growth and environmental impact
	Position as an island	
Department for Culture, Media and Sport (DCMS)	Tourism/jobs/business benefits/increase in growth	Balance between incoming and outgoing tourism
		Educating tourists and influencing changes in attitudes
Home Office		Migration/security

Government Departments and Devolved Administrations	Policy and (operational) benefits of aviation	Challenges caused by aviation
Department for International Development (DFID)	Overseas offices	Multiple offices, overseas offices
	Carbon offsetting	Food miles
	Access to markets	Environmental impact of food miles/tourism
Foreign and Commonwealth Office (FCO)	Business opportunities	Multiple offices overseas
	Sustainable development – offices overseas	
Natural England		Climate change impacts
		Localised impacts of airport (and associated) development on natural environment
		Sustainable leisure travel
		Tranquility and people's enjoyment of the natural environment
Department of Work and Pensions (DWP)	Employment benefits	Improvement in health and safety
	Accessibility	Affordability of travel leading to health benefits (and a reduction in state hand outs)

Plenary – discussion of matrices

Common policy benefits:

- Aviation is tied in with economic growth
- Position of being an island → both in Scotland and Northern Ireland and FCO and the practicalities of getting between own offices
- Profound benefit for devolved administrations
- Operational benefits around cohesion, engagement, communications
- Recruitment
- Overseas collaboration → often meetings need to be face-to-face
- Aerial mapping is also quite important, aviation it is not just for travelling
- Tourism and visitor economy → inward visiting, and outward visiting
- Educational benefits → need to broaden people's horizons and minds
- Economic development as part of globalisation
- Operationally advantageous not only in every day work
- UK technological input → we have a positive position which is quite high-tech and a challenge to keep ahead of the game
- Taxes → £2billion of air passenger duty for the Treasury
- Employment
- Access to markets for developing markets / countries and access to tourism
- Business benefits in terms of industry and then also another benefit in terms of access to the industry
- Liberalisation of airline traffic and where they can fly to and from
- Foreign students
- Recruitment of overseas staff e.g. health sector
- Meeting public demand
- Social benefits and contacts between remote communities and facilitates rural communities to access international markets
- Aerospace industry and all the jobs

Common policy challenges:

- Climate change impacts → around airport sites etc
- Local impact in terms of air quality and noise
- Finding the right regulatory balance → some areas highly regulated and some not
- Dealing with illegal activities such as drugs and illegal immigrants
- Ensuring departments are fit for purpose in relation to this e.g. developing policy on evidence and the right range of skills possessed by policy makers
- Planning and design of infrastructure → design of infrastructure to and from airports and the loss of land use for other purposes due to these developments as well as loss of communities to airports (including housing developments), but also a need to support the new developments with other infrastructure (office space, more housing etc)
- Land use issues → opportunity cost
- Disruption of play and children's well being → also can effect / disrupt their sleep patterns and level of noise can affect them at school, air quality
- Night flights – sleep disturbance; quality of life and lost productivity issue
- Loss of land for other forms of development and need to provide infrastructure

- Competition from global markets → especially for local communities (flip side of a global market and communities needing to compete with potentially cheaper markets)
- Implications of solutions → e.g. land required for bio-fuels
- Challenge of finding cleaner fuels (i.e. biofuels) and the implications of needing to grow and supply these fuels → biosecurity implications
- Making more energy efficient planes
- Challenges of offsetting and its implications → offsetting may be seen as a potential solution and how you deal with implementing this
- Implications of the Climate Change Bill and other policies
- Data collection and privacy implications → there is a lot of data collected on a person when they travel into a country
- Challenges of making carbon credits etc work → implication for housing and industry if aviation takes big chunk of carbon budget (what would be the knock on effect?)
- Land use issue related to expansion of airports → knock on effect on environment and people's enjoyment and being able to access that natural environment socially
- If one solution is to think about alternatives, how do you get people to change their personal mindset and do something differently
- Impact on domestic tourism industry → industry could have a potential loss because of cheap air travel overseas
- Competition for university places
- Brain drain
- How do you make alternatives work / viable (i.e. video conferencing)
- Aviation meets public demand but also society's needs are conflicting → creating confusion around competing needs
- Security impacts, impacts on civil liberties → i.e. government needs to plan for potential terrorist attacks / plane crashes and consider the international perspective and impacts on public morale if this was to happen again
- Aviation safety: policy space is a challenge (i.e. safety being absolute requirement in all aviation operations)
- Does aviation contribute to cohesion or extremism? → impacts of cohesion or lack of it
- Balancing UK and international regulation (competitiveness) → challenge of the regulation to security requirements may be a priority internationally but not UK, so the potential competitiveness and loss could be quite substantial
- Implications for national security of limiting aviation → if you limit non-civil aviation there are impacts on security as well
- Influence of media could have an impact on government policy which could become an overarching issue and limit policy space → media will look at how the government operate (i.e. if the government fly why shouldn't others be able to)
- Potential for democratic loss in the sense that aviation is a national infrastructure → how to negotiate on local infrastructure and the implications of a democratic process, wider community may see benefits though
- Local communities get disbenefits in addition to benefits
- How low cost air travel reflects on other transport networks and the potential around this → implications for alternatives
- Look at whether cheap air travel now is affecting or stifling / preventing improvements / development and innovation in alternatives that are more carbon friendly.

Devolved Administration issues:

- Geographical locations means that places like Northern Ireland are more reliant on aviation, and the air links are so vital for economy (i.e. to attract inward investment) → quality of air links major factor in inward investment
- For Northern Ireland, flying is only option compared with choice on mainland
- Same for places like Shetland: flying is a social necessity and essential for sustainability of remote communities
- Social aspect in terms of journey time can really affect the decision on how to travel → air travel is often the best bet
- Expectation of cheap mobility is a challenge in itself
- Managing society's expectations of being able to live in a remote location as it is relatively easy to get from remote locations to places of work
- Social inclusion issues (Welsh similar to Scottish) → in Wales the North / South air service bridges a divide
- Freight in terms of getting things to and from rural communities more easily
- Aviation is more suited / essential for transporting urgent high value goods → freight imports are a high proportion of GDP
- Maintaining links between more widely dispersed families → people now see it viable to commute long distances for both family and friends, which is difficult to put a value on as people have adapted to this
- Trade off between regional and central airports; central airports are often the ones that are expanded, however there is often a preference for regional airports because of superior quality of passenger experience (implications for policy).

Session 3: Other stakeholders and how they approach aviation

Session Tasks

To review stakeholder list considering the following issues:

Categories / interest → are these right?

Balance → who else do we need on the list?

Which areas of the aviation challenge do you think we could have further discussions on?

Measures of success → what do we need to do to make sure these are met?

Plenary – introduction to stakeholder list

The current stakeholder list included the following classifications:

Tier 1 Category	Tier 2 Category
Academic	
Civic Society / Think tanks NGOs	Environmental
	Social
Government	Devolved
	National
	Regional
	Local
Industry and trade associations	Competitors
	Influencers
	Providers
	Trade associations and unions
	Users

Comments on structure of categories

- Interest
 - o also should be at a local level
- Within industry and trade associations
 - o add 'Companies dependent on aviation'
 - o 'Users' may actually include consumers and actual individuals and therefore may not be suitable under industry and trade associations
 - o 'Providers' could be 'providers and operators'

Plenary – discussion on categories

General points

- Thin on regional stakeholders
- Media → are they missing or are we excluding them? Could be communicators such as Futerra
- Commonwealth / migrant workers associations are missing → bring in access to international markets

Plenary – balancing the needs of different stakeholders

How do we make sure we balance the needs of different stakeholders? Who do we talk to?

- Secure attendance of organisations that are representative of the individual companies/ groups → use as surrogates for actual companies or perhaps ask them to bring a team of 2-3 as individuals members have specific issues and make sure they are geographically dispersed – industries have to be directly involved (avoid just bringing trade association reps as they tend to take hard line because they are representing everybody)
- Much common ground among community groups but also individual issues for each airport (usually have at least one group per airport and it might be useful to talk to each of them)
- Academics should be represented beyond Omega as well so there is a need to include more academics (e.g. certain types that includes research in the aviation field etc) → important to note that representatives may be sent in their place
- Need criteria for types of academics and need to examine the role of academics → what's in it for them? They could bring specialised knowledge and they may know the technologies that will help to solve problems
- Could look at academics / some organisations as potential solution providers to join later process (Pippa Hyam – DbyD)
- Examine if we should include carbon traders (these are interests which people in various sectors hold)
- Need to agree areas of uncertainty and understand how to do this → this then leads to the need to agree who should go away and assist with carrying out this process (i.e. whether it is academics at the end of the process rather than throughout the process)
- Consultancies should be considered but not necessarily for expertise but as businesses that fly a lot → need for business travellers from large international consultancies to be included in discussions
- Be clear about why people are coming to the meeting in January and set their expectations → perhaps more building blocks for the next meeting in February (these may be societal issues, and the need to focus on the tensions and get into more detail)
- Who should represent sectors depends on purposes of 30 January.

Plenary – discussion on where future discussions could be had

(ideas for event on Jan 30th)

- Fact sheets on trends, drivers (undisputable facts that give people a common standpoint) as background: is there evidence supporting areas of agreement and disagreement?
- Needs in terms of food rather than actual flying for leisure, business
- Globalisation – looking at imports and exports → picture gram of imports / exports globally
- Potential for technological improvements and solutions (i.e. alternative fuels) both in industry and other alternatives to aviation
- Is there evidence we can agree on and if not, why not? → understanding the nature of disputes
- Tools available to reduce impacts → managing demand
- Identifying opportunities for quick wins, things we could do now that everyone supports and what the barriers are for not developing them yet → check list

- What would make stakeholders feel comfortable that government are meeting their needs and what policy interventions government should make to meet needs and address challenges
- Acknowledging concern that flying should continue but there are issues that have to be dealt with and that there is a basic societal need/desire to fly
- Acknowledging the need to tackle climate change, local air quality and noise
- Actively limiting the need to fly
- Social equity issues, inward investment and engagement growth → how do you fairly distribute the benefits of investment, and mitigate these
- Look at aviation from economic, social and leisure approaches → explore the issues around each of these
- How can money generated by inward investment be ring-fenced to mitigate negative impacts?
- Differentiating between economic, social and leisure flying is very difficult
- Is commuting a business thing or a lifestyle choice?
- Equity issues about controlling or not controlling....flying?
- Dialogue could help to expose pros and cons of certain activities and various options and this would then help to expose issues and help government to recognise these
- No conversations will end up as a commitment for people to act on.

**Plenary – discussion on where future discussions on scenarios could be had
(ideas for event on Feb 28th)**

- In principle scenarios potentially useful → it sounds helpful but it would be very much dependent on the scenario itself (be aware of different scenario methodologies)
- You could take existing trends and see where you will be 10-15 years from now or develop scenarios separately from this.

Proposed process will be passed to the core team of commissioning partners and then can be passed onto government departments for them to look at.

Stakeholder Assessment of Aviation in the UK

Attendance List - 13 December 2007

PopID	Title	First Name	Surname	Organisation
48974	Ms	Samantha	Armstrong	Environment Agency
48989	Dr	Mark	Broadmead	Forestry Commission England
48859		Doreen	Brown	Department for Regional Development Northern Ireland (DRD)
47545		Martin	Capstick	Department for Transport (DfT)
48679	Mr	Graham	Catt	Department for Culture Media and Sport (DCMS)
48033		Mark	Davis	Communities and Local Government (CLG)
48857		Andy	Deacon	Greater London Authority (GLA)
48047		Mark	Donnelly	Department for Children, Families and Schools (DCFS)
47722		Harriet	Festing	Sustainable Development Commission (SDC)
47543		Andrew	Jarvis	Cabinet Office
48596	Mr	Ian	Johnson	Ministry of Justice
48797	Mrs	Alice	Kehoe	Department for International Development (DFID)
47546		Khaleda	Khatun	Department for Transport (DfT)
47730		Matthew	Lockwood	Institute for Public Policy Research (IPPR)
48686	Ms	Anna	Mahoney	Strategic Aviation Special Interest Group (SASIG) - LGA
47723		Poppy	Maltby	Sustainable Development Commission (SDC)
48044		Jonathan	Millen	Cabinet Office
48854	Mr	Peter	Newton	BERR
48041		Eimer	O'Hare	Sustainable Development Commission (SDC) - Northern Ireland
49023		Shivani	Reddy	Sustainable Development Commission Scotland
48599	Mr	Martin	Ritchie	The Scottish Government
48037		Sarah	Samuel	Sustainable Development Commission (SDC)
47638		Rebecca	Smith	Natural England
48987	Ms	Christine	Swidenbank	Welsh Assembly Government (WAG)
48046		Joe	Turrent	Sustainable Development Commission (SDC)
48034		Shivani	Vasdev	Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (Defra)
47708		Caroline	Watson	Energy Savings Trust (EST)
48045		Kay	West	Sustainable Development Commission (SDC)