HEAVENLY AND GROTESQUE IMAGERIES (RE)CREATED IN THE CARNIVAL OF ORURO, BOLIVIA

Paul Gonzalo Araoz Sanjinés

A Thesis Submitted for the Degree of PhD
at the
University of St Andrews

2003

Full metadata for this item is available in St Andrews Research Repository at:
http://research-repository.st-andrews.ac.uk/

Please use this identifier to cite or link to this item:
http://hdl.handle.net/10023/11084

This item is protected by original copyright
HEAVENLY AND GROTESQUE IMAGERIES
(RE)CREATED IN THE CARNIVAL OF ORURO, BOLIVIA

Paul Gonzalo Araoz Sanjinés

Thesis submitted to the Department of Social Anthropology at the University of St Andrews for the Doctorate Degree in Philosophy (PhD)

St Andrews, 2 August 2002
A Mila y Mati, desde esta distancia
HEAVENLY AND GROTESQUE IMAGERIES
(RE)CREATED IN THE CARNIVAL OF ORURO, BOLIVIA

Paul Gonzalo Araoz Sanjines

ABSTRACT

The dissertation focuses on the creation of imageries in the Carnival of Oruro, in Central-Western Bolivia, where images from different sources are formed and transformed through the development of the festival over time. The production of mythological narratives, religious figures, choreographic performances, costumes, and masks gives place to a complex of icons representing natural and supernatural beings, all of which are intertwined in the enactment of carnival in Oruro. Following the imposition of a strict dichotomy between good and evil, “heavenly” and “infernal” imageries are constructed to depict a prescribed and proscribed behaviour, respectively. However, the morality underpinning such constructs is often contradicted by the actual behaviour of the individuals involved. The hyperactivity of the lower bodily stratum epitomises an effective degradation of the elevated during the local celebration of the festival, rendering Bakhtin’s approach appropriate for a study of the Oruro Carnival. Parallel to an analysis of the Carnival Parade, the dissertation provides a reflection on the discourses and practices inherent to the construction of a Bolivian national and cultural identity through the development of the festival. The symbolic oppositions observed in the Oruro Carnival Parade are linked to the transfigured images, which are analysed in relation to changes in the socio-cultural composition of the participants. Focusing upon the actual behaviour of the social actors involved, as much as upon representational activities, I intend to provide an insight into the relationship between the official imagery and the chaotic enactment of popular culture during carnival.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ONE Carnival</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TWO Carnival in Oruro</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Topographic Imageries</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Historical Imageries</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The Oruro Carnival Parade</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Carnival and the Mythological Narrative</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The Virgin and the Legends of Chiru Chiru and Nina Nina</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The Devil Dance and the Myth of Wari</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THREE The Official Celebration of Carnival</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The Official Discourse on Carnival</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The Events</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOUR Diablada/Morenada</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Diablada</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Morenada</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIVE Space/Dance</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Space and Place in Oruro</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The Social Construction of Space</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIX Time/Rhythm/Memory</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Temporal Perception</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Musical Temporality</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Musical/Temporal Perception in Oruro</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEVEN Imagery/Dreams/Identity</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Imagery and Craftsmanship</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Dancing/Dreaming</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Dancing Tradition/Dancing Identity</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The Mimetic Representation of Self and Other</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EIGHT Food/Sex/Drink</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Carnival and Eroticism</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Eating and Drinking</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 1</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 2</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glossary</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My sincere thankfulness goes to all the people (and institutions) who have supported me (directly or indirectly) in the development of the research and the final elaboration of the present dissertation. It is perhaps impossible to name them all here, but I am thankful to all those kind persons who have given me a hand in the last seven years. I assume, however, complete responsibility for all the shortcomings of this work.

I am deeply indebted with my supervisor, Professor Joanna Overing, for her constant encouragement and support. My PhD internal and external examiners, Dr. Mark Harris and Dr. Peter Mason have provided me with highly valuable feedback. I would also like to thank the Department of Social Anthropology of St Andrews for a very generous financial support during the last seven years. The Overseas Research Student Council has awarded me with a grant in 1996 and 1997. The Radcliffe Brown Trust Fund and the Sutasoma Trust Fund of the Royal Anthropological Institute have awarded me with another generous grant to finish writing the dissertation (I must apologise for the delayed date of submission).

In the different periods that I resided in the United Kingdom I have enjoyed the friendship and support of many people to whom I am deeply thankful. Amongst them are John and Mary Jane Orley, Toby Ellis, Esther McLeod and Matthew White, Tonton Pelczynski, Polly Ellis, David and Emily Orley, Hettie Malcomson, Tony Harriss, Philip Thomas and Celia Busby, Stephen and Sandra Kidd, Alan Passes, Guisela Pauli, Clare and Andrew Wright, Napier Russell Mr. and Mrs. Govan, Steven and Josie Entringuer, Carlos Londoño, Bill Bajor, Mark, Anna, Adam and Tom Harris, Lindsey Crickmay, Alex Greene, Claude and Rita Scheldeman-Declerck, Jenny Cardenas, Paulo Santilli, Anne Christie, Alan and Anna Patterson, Bodil Fjord, Maj-Brit Fjord, Catherine Ales, Adolfo de Oliveira and Tristan Platt, whose support towards the end of writing up was extremely helpful. I would also like to thank Kai Kresse and Joy Adapon, who have kindly offered me to stay in their place, where I made the final corrections of the thesis. Apart from providing us with the warmth of their friendship and their home, Tom, Mirella and Hannah Schreiber have offered me a very generous loan, for which I am deeply grateful. The period of writing up was a very difficult stage for me and I would not have finished the dissertation (or anything else) without Griet Scheldeman’s love, generosity and intellectual inspiration. Thus I am not only thankful for her encouragement to take a step forward in academia but also, most importantly, in life.

Fieldwork was a long endeavour, and considering the influence of my childhood memories (and those of my mother’s) over my current reflections on the Oruro Carnival, there is an endless list of people to thank. Therefore I wish to extend my thankfulness to all those who, despite not being mentioned here, did in fact contribute to the development of my research, or to the reflection on the issues discussed in the present dissertation. Amongst the people who helped me in Oruro are Lizandro García, Angel López, Nancy Maín, Erika Bilbao La Vieja and doña Martha, Demetrio Alcalá, Sergio Nina, Francisco Flores, Ezequiel Flores, Walter Zambrana, René Carvajal, Fabricio Cazorla, Arturo, Zdenka de la Barra, Amilcar Zambrana, Oscar Martinez, Abel Gonzalez, Victor Hugo Sepúlveda, Antonio Arauco, Juan Apaza, René Flores, Lucio Flores Mamani, Fermín Flores Calichaya, Marco Antonio
Romero, Fermín López, Berna Quispe de Cruz, Ramiro Laura Flores Mamani, Tito Aranda, Gladys Lobos Escalera, Lucio Ramirez, Alfredo Mañ, Ernesto Gonzalez, Francisco Corrales, Rafael Sejas, Sr. Bravo, Ofelia Lozano, Pablo Ayala, Rosemary Llave, Ricardo Rodriguez, Manuel Benavente, Paloma Clavijo, María Sol, and Ignacio Salgado. Some of the interviews carried out in the field have not been included in the present dissertation and I therefore present my apologies to the interviewees. My field research was enriched with the close collaboration of Rolando Barrientos, whose help has been extremely valuable to gather the information discussed here. I am deeply thankful for his professional engagement and for the warmth of his friendship.

In La Paz I received the kind support of Zulma Yugar, Yves de la Menorval, Silvia Rivera Cusicanqui, Luis Aníbal Piñero, Mauricio Virreira, Edmundo Alandia, Stephen and Elene Fernández, Cacho Ramírez and Corina Barrero. Carlo Matthews and María José Pareja have not only provided me with the warmth of their friendship and their home, but they have also offered me a generous loan to finish this work. I cannot thank them enough for this. The carnivalesque times and memories shared with my maternal relatives and with so many anonymous people with whom I found myself drinking and dancing in the streets and the bars of Oruro often return to me in dreams. I am grateful for the love that my parents, Luis Araoz and Mireya Sanjines de Araoz, and my brother Luis have given me during the last forty years. It is a source of strength that goes with me wherever I go. I am also thankful to Rebecca Ellis, for the times shared in the past and for taking good care of my children in the present.

If this dissertation is of any value, it will however never compensate the immense distance from my beloved daughters Luzmila and Matilde, to whom this work is dedicated, despite the discussion of issues and the use of a language that are, at times, inappropriate for children.

INTRODUCTION

On 18 May 2001, the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) approved the declaration of the Bolivian Carnival of Oruro as Cultural Oral and Intangible Heritage of Humanity. According to Yves de la Menorval, the representative of UNESCO in Bolivia,\(^1\) the concept of Oral and Intangible Heritage was introduced by representatives of Arab Countries during a general Convention in 1991, and it was approved by the UNESCO Executive Board in 1997. Although the concept of Immaterial Heritage had already been incorporated during a previous Convention (in 1972), it cannot be considered a synonym of the intangible, because the immaterial is always linked, according to Mr. Menorval, to a Physical Heritage, while the intangible may exist without any physical monumental presence.

Mr. Menorval asserts that a physical heritage can have only one appropriate explanation, whereas the intangible may be interpreted in different ways. Regarding the Oruro Carnival, I would suggest that, apart from its various interpretations, it involves both the materialisation of the intangible and the incorporation of physical-topographic features into the immaterial sphere of myth and dreams. Such a dialectical relation between the material and the intangible is complemented by the construction of colourful imageries through the fusion of physical and imaginary figures. These and other related issues will be explored in the present dissertation,

\(^{1}\) Interviewed in La Paz on 8 March, 2002.
which evolves around the creation and recreation of imageries through the
celebration of carnival in the Andean city of Oruro, in Central Western
Bolivia.

* 

In July 2000, five weeks before returning to the UK after my three years
fieldwork-stay in Bolivia, I witnessed something that would later help me
to deal with the psychological effects of the field and the difficulty of
writing a dissertation about distant people, places and events. I eventually
noticed that both problems were intertwined and that the “music in my
head”, far from being just a consequence of fieldwork, would become an
effective mechanism to cope with distance.

One afternoon, as I was shopping around La Cancha street-market in
Cochabamba, I heard someone shout: Oruro, Oruro! I turned around and
saw a man marching on the pavement, with both hands on his hips. He
was lifting his knees, one at a time, standing on the same spot, until he
raised his right hand up and shouted again: Oruro, arrr arrr! He moved
faster towards me. He jumped to the left, stopped again, always lifting his
knees, and then jumped to the right.

“Look at the Orureño” – said the lady selling moqochinchis\(^2\) in the corner.
The man standing at the other side of the street whistled a Diablada tune,

\(^2\) A soft drink made out of boiled dried-peat.
and other people laughed and started clapping to the rhythm of the dancer. He paused again, this time right in front of me. Although he was dressed in ordinary clothes, he used both hands to pull his (invisible) cape from above his shoulders. His eyes were fixed on the horizon, and he did not seem to be aware of the spectators’ presence. “His head is full of Diablada” – I thought, and considered the possibility of joining his (imaginary) troupe of devil-dancers, but I had other responsibilities in Cochabamba, as my mother was very ill. “Besides, my head is not full of Diablada, but of Morenada” – I thought again, as I saw him dancing away.

This experience, apart from contributing with ethnographic data to support the idea of a possible non-strictly-visible imagery of the Oruro Carnival, allows me to introduce several relevant issues discussed in the dissertation. The man seemed to be dancing in an inappropriate time and place, because it was not carnival season and this did not happen in Oruro, the Bolivian Capital of Folklore. Although many of the dances displayed in the Oruro Carnival Parade are also performed in festivals that take place at different times of the year and in different cities and towns of Bolivia, this particular performance was obviously enacted by a native from Oruro, who was either a visitor or a resident in the city of Cochabamba. Whilst the performance of Diablada is not restricted to the carnival season, the energetic performance of the one-man devil dance

---

3 Two of the most important musical and choreographic rhythms performed in the Carnival of Oruro. Both will be thoroughly discussed in the dissertation.

4 Daniel Goldstein (1998) shows how Orureño residents of a migrant neighbourhood in Cochabamba re-present themselves through the development of a local fiesta modelled on the Oruro Carnival.
group made clear reference to the famous Carnival Parade, deeply embedded in the minds of Orureños (people from Oruro), wherever they may be.

The spatial and temporal “displacement” of the performance was coupled with an absence of the appropriate music. That is, this man was dancing the most traditional carnival dance of Oruro in another city, in another time, without music and without costume. Several months later, as I was transcribing the lyrics of the Morenada tune Los Cocanis into my ethnography, I suddenly started singing it and the tune installed itself back into my head. I felt the urge to dance, to drink and to chew coca leaves, and I remembered then the dancer in Cochabamba. Although I had brought plenty of Morenada tapes to Scotland, I did not need to play them at all, because once the melodies enter my mind, it is difficult to erase them. The long distance that separated me from the field during the time of “writing up” was in a way shortened by the “music in my head”.

Perhaps something similar happened to the man described above, who, despite being away from his city and out of carnival season, may have embodied the Carnival of Oruro without the need of a costume, a mask, or a brass band.

I will provide in Chapter Six a detailed explanation of the phenomenon that I have been referring to as the “music in my head”. For the present introductory purposes it is sufficient to clarify that, after years of attending the celebrations of carnival in Oruro, the musical and choreographic
rhythms of the festival seem to encroach upon the minds of the participating subjects. After remembering the above-mentioned tune, for example, I need to make an effort to ignore the music and concentrate on this sentence, as I type these words.

It should be noticed that the “psychological effects” of the field do not refer in my case to the common “culture shock” with which most anthropologists working in “remote areas” have to cope. The city of Oruro, where I did fieldwork between November 1997 and August 2000, is the place where my mother and most of my maternal relatives were born. Most members of my family moved to La Paz and Cochabamba in the last three decades, but many of us meet in Oruro during carnival every year.

Thus if there was a “culture shock” in my anthropological research, it took place after the field, upon my return to Academia in the North. It is in this context that the “music in my head” helped me to cope with distance as, I suppose, something similar might have happened to the man dancing to the music in his head with an equally imaginary costume in Cochabamba. The imaginary/intangible folkloric paraphernalia displayed by the inebriated performer might shed light upon two central issues discussed in the dissertation. One is the need to include non-visually-perceptible (“imaginary” or “imaginable”) features within the study of the imageries displayed in the Oruro Carnival Parade. This is particularly relevant in relation to the central role of the mythological narrative in the

*

The Bolivian government’s submission of a project, presenting the Oruro Carnival Parade as a candidate for the proclamation of Cultural Oral and Intangible Heritage of Humanity triggered a series of reactions within the local population. The reactions ranged from the delivery of eloquent speeches praising the cultural richness of this famous event, to a special edition of the regulations for the Oruro Carnival Parade 2000, when representatives of UNESCO were expected to be among the audience. Similarly, the approval of the candidature on 18 May 2001 produced a popular euphoria that day, when the Bolivian population watched the live transmission of the official announcement from Paris. The news was spontaneously celebrated by Orureños residing in other cities of Bolivia and in different countries of the world, while the local residents were more occupied worrying about how to get organised for the celebration, according to the assertions of Mr Menorval and Mrs. Yugar.5

Amongst the locally organised events were the performance of folkloric dances, with the musical support of the brass bands of the Police

5 Yves de la Menorval (representative of UNESCO in Bolivia) and Zulma Yugar (former National Secretary of Cultural Promotion), personal communication. The interview took place in the central office of UNESCO-Bolivia in La Paz, on the 8th March 2002.
Department and the National Army, the organisation of a mini-carnival, and the celebration of a special mass in honour of the Virgin of the Mineshaft. "We owe absolutely everything to our mamita ('little mother') of the Mineshaft", exclaimed Walter Zambrana, the President of the Asociación de Conjuntos del Folklore de Oruro (ACFO), the institution in charge of organising the Carnival Parade.

Antonio Eguino, the Bolivian Vice-Minister of Culture asserted:

"A decennial plan has already been elaborated for the development of Carnival in Oruro... We must strengthen tradition, avoiding at the same time some stains, such as alcohol, dirt and disorganisation; we need a spotless carnival". (La Prensa, 19 May, 2001, my translation).

* 

According to Hyman (2000), modern carnival is divided in the officially sanctioned spectator events and the more communal, sometimes anarchic activities of the crowds. Both are observed in the Andean city of Oruro, where the official celebration of carnival is enacted mainly through Catholic rites and choreographic representations, while anarchic activities embody much of popular behaviour.

The official discourse tends to stress the importance of keeping order in the performance of the Entrada or Carnival Parade. This is not, however, an easy task, considering the overwhelming participation of inebriated

---

6 According to La Prensa (19 May 2001), a mini-carnival was also organised in the streets of Paris.
crowds. The authorities generally have to struggle to keep order in the Carnival Parade and often underline the need to avoid the excessive consumption of alcohol during the event. The official discourse also gives special emphasis to the religious character of the festivity which, despite having the Diablada or Devil Dance as a central feature, develops around the image of the Virgin of the Mineshaft, Saint Patroness of the city of Oruro.

There are three myths - related to the apparition of the Virgin (the legends of Chiru Chiru and Nina Nina) and to the Devil Dance (the myth of Wari) - that are often identified with the origins of the Carnival of Oruro. Nevertheless, it is not possible to attain any certainty about a particular origin of the festival, which is characterised by its transformativity and the increasing heterogeneity of its cultural ingredients. The images incorporated in the celebration of carnival illustrate the historical complexity and cultural dynamism of the festivity, shedding light on the particular context in which they emerge. Imagery, understood as “the corpus of images – concrete and allusive, stable and changing, patterned and chaotic, mimetic and inventive – developed by individuals from many sources in the course of their interaction” (Whitten and Whitten, 1993: 7), constitutes an appropriate conceptual tool for the study of such an intricate phenomenon.

The (trans)formation of concrete images through the development of the devotional Entrada or Carnival Parade is to be observed in relation to the
allusive images underlying mythological narratives, as well as to the images of dreams and other “imaginary” features of carnival. Therefore, in parallel to the discussion of certain iconographic elements displayed in the Carnival Parade, one should also consider the creation of “imaginary worlds” and their incorporation into the actual enactment of carnival.

Peter Mason provides detailed analyses about the links between imaginary worlds and the representation of otherness (1990), and about the ideological transformation of images, as they move between different cultural contexts (2001). Both topics are relevant for the study of the images displayed at the Carnival of Oruro.

“An imaginary world cannot be seen, but it can (and must) be named... An imaginary world is thus an ensemble of names. These names interlock with other systems (chronological, topographical, etc.) which all contribute to the establishment of the ‘reality’ of a particular imaginary world” (Mason, 1990: 16-17).

Thus we may assume that conflictive imaginary worlds give rise to different names to denominate (and often to dominate) specific spaces. This can be observed in Oruro, where distinctive imaginary worlds are inherent to the different names given, by different people and in different historical periods, to the City and its surrounding hills. Furthermore, I would suggest that such imaginary worlds originate distinctive imageries, which are juxtaposed within the celebration of carnival in Oruro. That is, imaginary worlds may become visible, through the formation and transformation of specific images, which give in turn place to distinctive
imageries. The images originated from a specific imaginary world may however entail completely different connotations, as they move from one cultural context to another.

“The ability of an image to move freely from one context to another has a number of consequences. First, it makes it impossible for us to view the image as an ideological product. Of course, when it enters a specific cultural or historical context, an image can be given an ideological role to play, but when it moves on, it is capable of shaking off this ideological accretion and of fulfilling other, sometimes contradictory roles. Images can make history, but they have no consciousness of doing so.” (Mason, 2001:16).

Images can also embody history, as they may incorporate distinctive features of their historical contexts. However, as Mason underlines, they do not have a consciousness of doing so, because their ideological transformations take place first and foremost in the minds of the people who re-interpret them. In relation to the Carnival of Oruro, it is necessary to distinguish man-made images (like the masks and costumes of the dancers) from natural images (like the snake and toad-like rock formations in the hills surrounding the city). However, the gap between both spheres (the “cultural” or man-made and the “natural” or topographic) is eventually closed, as the “natural” images of snakes and toads are incorporated into the “cultural” images of masks and costumes. Similarly, the “cultural” behaviour of social actors often transforms the “natural” rock formations, through the use of fire in ritual offerings, or the use of dynamite in reactions against such practices, for example.
I would suggest a dialectical relationship through which imaginary worlds may condition the interpretation and/or the production of images, as much as the latter may be introduced into (and affect) the former. Therefore, the images depicted in the Oruro Carnival are to be observed within the processes of their formation and transformation, according to the specific contexts and imaginary worlds of their development. The different levels in which carnival is celebrated impose the need to limit the analysis to one specific form of celebration, or to find an alternative approach that provides a general overview of the distinctive layers, avoiding at the same time the risk of producing a superficial account.

Considering the iconographic richness, the historical complexity, and the different levels of the Oruro Carnival, it is indeed a difficult task to provide a general overview of the festival that includes some in-depth analysis. I hope to achieve this through a detailed discussion of a limited number of issues and elements, complemented by an account of their place within the more general context of the celebrations. Thumbnail sketches are thus examined within the more general contexts in which they are depicted, introducing at the same time specific theoretical discussions. The following theoretical overview is therefore to be taken into account as a general “backdrop” of the different issues discussed in the dissertation, rather than as a “fixed” and “all-encompassing” theoretical framework.

---

7 Concrete examples of this will be provided in Chapter Two.
As I suggested earlier, carnival activities in Oruro may be divided in the official celebration of Catholic rites and spectator events, and the unofficial, often chaotic behaviour of the crowds. Matters are however more complicated, because the official celebration of carnival is often encroached upon by chaotic behaviour, which arises from within. That is, the crowds who transform the “sacred” space and time of the official Catholic celebrations are to a large extent also the ones who attend and therefore contribute to the construction of the official ceremonies. The different levels of the celebrations relate, then, not simply to different social actors and different places and times, but often to the same actors, whose transmogrified behaviour also transforms the spatial and temporal context of the official celebration of carnival.

The difficulty of providing a general overview of the different carnival levels does not relate then necessarily to the search of distinctive places, times and individuals representing them, but to their differentiation within the same spatial, temporal and social contexts. In this sense, it will be useful to introduce different understandings of the concept of cultural performance, to observe the distinctive levels of carnival performances by the same individuals, when such a case applies.

According to Victor Turner (1992), Milton Singer introduced the notion of cultural performances as units of observation composed by cultural
media, within an appropriate framework. He underlines that the 
"orchestrations of media" do not refer to the emission of a single message 
through different media, but rather to subtly variant messages, resulting in 
"a hall of magic mirrors, each interpreting as well as reflecting the images 
beamed to it" (Turner, 1992:24). So, apart from a possible multivocality, 
we must also consider different sensory codes. This will be observed in 
Oruro, where the observer may perceive the fusion of images, textures, 
sounds, smells and tastes.

In relation to the different levels of the carnival celebrations, Turner 
suggests that:

"The many-levelled or tiered structure of a major ritual or 
drama, each level having many sectors, makes of these 
genres flexible and nuanced instruments capable of carrying 
and communicating many messages at once, even of 
subverting on one level what it appears to be 'saying' on 
another" (ibid.).

The various genres of cultural performance derive, according to Turner, 
from "social drama", as the empirical unit of social process:

"[T]he truly 'spontaneous' unit of human social performance 
is not a role-playing sequence...it is the social drama which 
results precisely from the suspension of normative role-
playing, and in its passionate activity abolishes the usual 
distinction between flow and reflection, since in the social 
drama it becomes a matter of urgency to become reflexive 
about the cause and motive of action damaging to the social 
fabric". (op.cit.:90, emphasis in the original).
Therefore, we must also observe the development of cultural dramas (Turner, ibid.) and the presentation of self in everyday life (Goffman, 1980) to complement the staging of theatrical dramatisations in carnival.

“Thus, if daily living is a kind of theatre, social drama is a kind of meta-theatre, that is a dramaturgical language about the language of ordinary role-playing and status-maintenance which constitutes communication in the quotidian social process” (Turner, op.cit.:76)

Both of these views, of social drama (Turner, 1992) and the presentation of self in quotidian processes (Goffman, 1980) will be considered in relation to the sober-folkloric performances of the official celebration and the inebriated-unofficial performances of the crowds in the Carnival of Oruro.

* 

In contrast with the general view that analyses carnival as the liminal period (Turner, 1969) in which roles are reversed (Leach, 1972, Ivanov 1984) and the black and the white, the poor and the rich are all brought together through the enactment of the festival (Da Matta, 1984, 1991), I argue that the performative reversal of roles (far from eliminating them) confirms the distances between different social strata based on socio-economic, cultural and racial features. Role reversal is thus considered here as an integral part of the official celebration, which includes Catholic rites and dramatic-choreographic representations.
Max Gluckman (1973 [1956]) suggested that, although rites of reversal may include a protest against the established order, they are intended to preserve and even to strengthen it. Socially, the lifting of normal taboos and restraints obviously serves, according to Gluckman, to emphasise them (ibid.). Although I do suggest that socio-economic distances may be enhanced through the performance of role reversal, I would not agree with Gluckman’s functionalist explanation.

Normal taboos may indeed be emphasised through role reversal, but the celebration of rites can have different interpretations, according to the contexts and to the specific social actors involved. Instead of stressing the functional role of ritual (Gluckman, op. cit.) or its anti-structural connotations (Turner, 1969), I would rather emphasise its different levels and their relation to actual practice.

Abner Cohen (1993) suggests that the creation of what Turner called \textit{communitas} through the expression of freedom, sensuousness and merrymaking is just a formal “ideal type” of carnival. He asserts that in concrete historical reality, carnival is a much more complex phenomenon the political significance of which changes with variables ranging from the proportion of people participating to their class, ethnic, religious, age and sex composition (Cohen, 1993:4). Similar complexities will be considered in relation to the celebration of carnival in Oruro.

*
Catholic-religious imageries and folkloric imageries often merge in religious rites, such as a Catholic mass in honour of the Madonna, and in dramatic-choreographic representations, such as the Diablada or Devil-dance. The leading role of the Madonna in front of the devil dancers, is complemented by the devils’ presence in the temple. However, this does not constitute a transgression, as the devil dancers take their masks off before entering the chapel to worship the Virgin in her shrine. I argue that transgression is most often achieved through the hyperactivity of the lower stratum of the body, which effectively contradicts the discourses of the officially sanctioned events, through inebriation, gluttony and lust. It is this sphere of carnival, where social actors do not necessarily perform a “drama” (Turner, 1987) or a “personal front” (Goffman, 1980) that I refer to as the carnivalesque-grotesque (or simply “the grotesque”).

In a study on the grotesque in literature, Philip Thompson (1972) argues that this genre is associated to the comic or the terrifying, and that a disproportionate mixture of both would be a comparatively recent view. However, the same author stresses that disharmony and a mixture of the heterogenous is a distinguishable characteristic of the grotesque (ibid.). The paradox of attraction/repulsion and a sadistic pleasure in the horrifying, the cruel and the disgusting (op. cit.:51) are also characteristics of the grotesque, which has as a hallmark the conscious confusion between fantasy and reality (op. cit.: 24). However, Thomson underlines that
“far from possessing an affinity with the fantastic, it is precisely the conviction that the grotesque world, however strange, is yet our world, real and immediate, which makes the grotesque powerful” (Thomson 1972:23).

Thus instead of focusing solely upon the “grotesque” features of the fantastic and diabolical masks of the devil-dancers, for example, I will also concentrate on the grotesque nature of some earthly activities which, apart from being enhanced during carnival, tend to take place in everyday life too. The representational sphere of carnival will therefore be observed in relation to the actual behaviour of the individuals involved.

* 

I would suggest that a many-levelled phenomenon, such as the one analysed here, requires an eclectic approach. This is not to say, however, that mutually contradictory definitions of specific concepts (i.e. “performance”, “tradition”, etc.) will be used in the dissertation to explain the phenomena described in the ethnography. In a rather opposite way, I intend to show how specific events might not be most suitably studied through one or another theoretical approach, and that they might rather illustrate the bias of the specific theoretical stance. That is to say, the socio-cultural context will probably tell us more about the theoretician than s/he tells us about the context. On the other hand, such a rich and
complex phenomenon as carnival could probably not be discussed at all without the required dose of theory. I therefore consider different theoretical views (e.g. functional-structuralism, phenomenology) of the various issues discussed in the dissertation, without necessarily communing with any of them.

Nevertheless, Mikhail Bakhtin’s monumental essay (1990) on the expression of popular culture in the work of Rabelais underpins much of the analysis. I would suggest that certain features identified by Bakhtin in the work of Rabelais may be observed in the contemporary celebration of carnival in Oruro, where Carnival, far from constituting a symbolic representation of marginality, encroaches upon the city from within the inner lives of the population, as an expression of the human condition.

Bakhtin located carnival between art and life:

“Carnival is not the purely artistic theatrical spectacle and, in general, it does not belong to the sphere of the arts. It is situated on the border between art and life. It is life itself, presented through the characteristic elements of play...In carnival there is no distinction between actors and spectators. Spectators do not attend carnival: they live it. During carnival there is no other life apart from Carnival’s. It is impossible to escape, because Carnival has no spatial frontiers...Carnival is a peculiar state of the world.” (Bakhtin, 1990: 12-13. My translation).

It is notable that this “peculiar state of the world” is often overlooked in the study of carnival, which usually focuses solely on the enactment of sacred and profane dramas. The performance of religious processions and
carnival parades is undoubtedly of the highest relevance for the study of the festival. However, Carnival-as-a-phenomenon must also be taken into account, as it is its overwhelming presence that takes possession of social space and time. Carnival seems to form and transform the bodies and souls of the participants, often transcending representation through the presentation of the Self. Thus we must pay attention to Carnival as the popular grotesque, in the Bakhtinian sense of an anti-body “living within a pathological social body, always threatening to rupture it from within” (Gardiner, 1993: 37).

* 

Finally, regarding the relation between performers and spectators in the enactment of carnival as “play”, I find Gadamer’s observations relevant for the present purposes:

“[a]ll play is a being-played. The attraction of a game, the fascination it exerts, consists precisely in the fact that the game tends to master the players…The religious or profane drama, however much it represents a world that is wholly closed within itself, is as if open toward the side of the spectator, in whom it achieves its own significance” (Gadamer, 1975: 95-98).

Accordingly, in order to observe the life of Carnival, it is relevant to consider the preparation and organisational activities prior to, during, and following the development of the Carnival Parade, as much as its interpretation by dancers, spectators and the public in general. I therefore carried out interviews with social actors of different social strata, different
dance groups, musical brass-bands, religious beliefs, and so on. Although my formal fieldwork period took place between November 1997 and August 2000, much of the information and the reflections included in this dissertation refer to my memories of former years and decades, and I also returned briefly to the field in early 2002. The basic methodology of participant observation is combined with a general review of the written and verbal testimonies about recent and more remote carnival performances in Oruro. Sources may vary from old newspaper clippings to more recent highly theoretical essays and a web-site on the Internet. Similarly, the interviews carried out in the field include those evolving around informal conversational drinking meetings and the very formal interviews with the local authorities.

*  

The dissertation is divided in eight chapters. Chapter One reviews the history and etymology of carnival, taking into consideration the representation of carnivalesque images in art and literature. Chapter Two provides an introduction to the local historical and geographical imageries, suggesting their creation and recreation in relation to the mythological narrative and the development of the Carnival Parade. This chapter also provides a general introduction to the celebration of carnival in Oruro, its origins and related mythological narrative. The transformations in the mythological imageries are to be observed in relation to the transformations in the actual enactment of the festival and
in the social composition of the participants. **Chapter Three** constitutes an introductory ethnography of the official celebration of carnival in Oruro, and it includes a discussion of the general schedule of the celebrations. **Chapter Four** introduces a more detailed ethnography of the two most traditional dances, their related imageries (choreography, masks and costumes) and the way they have been transformed through the decades. **Chapter Five** analyses the spatial configuration of carnival in Oruro, including the transformation of the official route in relation to the changes in the social composition of the participants. In **Chapter Six** I discuss the musical/temporal sphere of carnival, its relation to memory and its dramatic effects upon the temporal perception of the participants, mainly in reference to the performance of a particular musical rhythm (*Morenada*) during a particular event (the *Alba* rite). In **Chapter Seven** I discuss the construction of a national Bolivian identity, as well as the representational distinction of Self and Other through the creation and recreation of “traditional” dances. The imageries of carnival are also analysed in this chapter in relation to the dreams of artisans, dancers and other participants. Many relevant issues discussed in previous chapters are linked together in **Chapter Eight**, with regards to the eating, drinking and debauching activities of carnival. Although Bakhtin’s ideas of the carnivalesque-grotesque underpin much of the dissertation, their central place becomes explicitly clear in this chapter, through a review of the transformation of carnival imageries in relation to the degradation of the elevated.

***
In a study of carnival and other festivities, Jacques Heers (1983) provides very useful descriptions and a historical review of the festival. The origins of carnival are sketched, according to Heers, not in relation to a well-defined chronological pattern, but through the evolution of customs and tastes. It is heir or imitator, and at the same time rival, of the clergymen feasts (amusements linked to the liturgical cycle) (ibid.). On the other hand it is also said to be heir to the satirical and burlesque games organised by the cities or festive companies. For instance, as a citizens’ game,

“Carnival launches and displays an unbridled cavalcade through the city. Like in Saturnalia and clergymen winter amusements, ancient and often uncontrollable memories vanished under Christian influence, made apparent by signs of a ritual that slowly develops and ripens with time.” (op.cit.:193, my translation).

Memories of carnival are often inebriated with images, accumulated and transformed through centuries. It is not possible to attain any certainty about a particular origin of carnival, which is characterised by its transformativity and the increasing heterogeneity of its cultural ingredients.

\[1\] Hyman underlines the link between Carnival and Saturnalia, “the period of license and excess, when inversion of rank was a central theme” (2000:9).
The historian Maximilian Rudwin (1920) affirms that there are very meagre sources of information about phases of carnival comedy before the fifteenth century, secular plays being referred to only in the attacks made upon them by the reforming ecclesiastics of the thirteenth century. He notes the general agreement regarding the pagan origin of the carnival comedy, despite the diversity of opinions concerning the particular ceremonies in which it might have germinated. According to Rudwin, carnival in its original form was

“[...] a heathen agricultural festival, and, like all feasts and festivals in the pastoral and agricultural days of the Irano-European peoples, was originally connected with a change in Nature. [...] In its origin the carnival was a ploughing and sowing festival, and formed a part of the public cult of the fertilisation spirit. The Church did not institute it, but adopted it from the heathen ritual and changed it into a Christian observance as was done with many other indigenous festivals surviving in all essentials beneath a new faith which was but skin deep. Room was found all the more readily for this festival in the scheme of the Church, for it offered the converts an opportunity to recompense themselves for the forty days of abstinence, which were ahead of them. Moreover, the connection between carnival and lent may also go back to pre-Christian days. Lent, perhaps, may have derived from an old pagan period of abstinence intended to promote the growth of the seed, and the Church converted this pagan custom, too, into a Christian solemnity now so rigidly observed as commemorative of the fast of Jesus in the wilderness.” (Rudwin, 1920: 2-3).

While the period of abstinence as a pagan practice (i.e. “to promote the growth of the seed”) may have been transformed by the Church into a Christian solemnity before the fifteenth century in Europe, the Catholic conception of carnival and lent – which was imposed upon Andean populations during Spanish colonialism, and is today reinforced by the State’s
official Church in Bolivia – is also transformed and reinterpreted through actual practice in the present. In fact, the seemingly endless succession/transformation of carnivalesque images gives rise to a proliferation of interpretations, my own work being one of them.

Although I will not suggest the existence of a historical link or continuity between Medieval European pagan customs and (pre-colonial) Andean fertility rites, it is illustrative to consider the adoption of non-Christian rites as a strategic feature of the Catholic Church’s expansive policies in different historical and geographical contexts. The adaptation of non-Christian rituals into Christian observances and its links with carnival and lent will be relevant in the discussion of the Carnival of Oruro.

* 

Jacques Heers (1983) underlines the relation between carnival and lent, and considers reasonable the etymology that points out the last license days previous to lent, when the consumption of meat is not proscribed (carne vale).2 Perhaps the transition between carnival and lent could be observed in Sebastian Brant’s descriptions of a fifteenth century Ash Wednesday ceremony:

---

2 Hyman (op.cit.) translates *carne vale* or *carnem levare* as a “farewell to meat”, or “giving up meat”. We must notice that parallel to an actual reinterpretation of carnival, a new meaning is provided by the popular grotesque discourse: *carne vale* is often understood as “meat-treat”, with both gastronomic and sexual connotations (see Chapter Eight).
"The chapel itself is no longer a shrine. Only few people offer their foreheads in devotion; it is more common to observe women running in all directions away from men who try to catch and smut them". (Brant, quoted by Heers, op. cit.:58, my translation).

I will analyse the transformation of solemn acts through popular/chaotic behaviour in reference to both the spatial and temporal sphere of carnival in Oruro. However, let us consider at this point further etymological discussions on the subject. The English ecclesiastical term Shrovetide stresses, according to Rudwin (1920), the Christian origin of the festival by pointing out a period of preparation for a forty days’ fast through shriving and confessing. But the German terms fastnacht, fassnacht and fasenacht that designate carnival illustrate the different (even mutually opposed) meanings attributed to the festivity (ibid).

At first sight fastnacht is understood as “the eve of fast”, but Rudwin stresses the fact that this is a popular corruption of the term fassnacht (or vasnacht) - meaning “an evening of carousing, of diligent application to the fass [the cask]” (1920:3) - as the festival is (or was in the 1920s) colloquially called. Finally, Rudwin points out that fasenacht (or vasenacht) is a perfectly correct form by which the carnival season was universally known in Germany, up to
the turn of the twentieth century. *Fasenacht* does not refer to the verb *fasten* ("to fast"), but to *fasen* or *faseln* ("to talk nonsense, to have great fun"), thus denoting an evening of feasting and fooling.

The indiscriminate use of the German terms *fasten* and *fasen* to designate carnival is as contradictory as the confusion of "fasting" and "feasting" would be in English\(^3\), and it illustrates the semantic ambiguity of the festival.\(^4\) This is reinforced by the transformed ("carnivalesque") behaviour and by the double discourse of social actors. It is not rare for the official Catholic discourse on carnival to be contrasted with the recurrent drinking, feasting, and fooling during the celebration of carnival in Oruro.

The Latin root of *carnival*, most often related to *carnem levare*, or the removal of flesh as food is, according to Rudwin, more correctly derived from *carrus navalis*, or the ship-cart that was at the centre of festive processions in many parts of Europe and Western Asia (op.cit.:4).\(^5\) The presence of floats or allegoric carts during the celebration of carnival festivities in different parts of the world may or may not be related to the aforementioned *carrus navalis*, but the images and actions exhibited in

---

3 I am not suggesting that there is a common etymology for the words "feasting" and "fasting", but that their mutually contradictory meanings are somehow confused in relation to the celebration of carnival and lent.  
4 See Leach's comments about "Mardi Gras" as "a feast to end all feasts; but just change a vowel and move the clock past midnight and we enter a fast to end all fasts." (Leach, 1984:357).  
5 Rudwin (ibid) traces the ship procession back to the Egyptian cult dedicated yearly to Isis, the Egyptian goddess of femininity and fertility, and proposes that the worship of Isis was introduced to Rome and Italy through Greece.
representational practices certainly embody significant preoccupations of the historical and geographical contexts in which they are performed.

I will not discuss the validity or invalidity of Rudwin's claims, but his arguments and descriptions are highly relevant for the present study, mainly to stress the different interpretations of the festivity, of its origins and its meanings, and the permanent introduction of current political/satirical comments in its development, like the burning of a Martin Luther effigy in eighteenth century Catholic Germany (op.cit:20) or, as a more contemporary example, the legs of Monica Lewinski disappearing under Bill Clinton's desk (Hyman, 2000:7).^6

Another form of socio-political commentary characteristic of carnival is the presence of the grotesque body, which is related to the transformation of solemnity into chaos, and to the relation of opposition/complementarity between carnival and lent. Heers (op.cit.) provides a description of the combat between Carnival and Lent, as represented in a sixteenth century painting by Pieter Bruegel:

"Lady Lent, dry and meagre, dressed in grey, sits with a truly unfortunate look on a miserable chair, carried by two

^6 Clinton's unfortunate misdemeanours seem to constitute an appropriate subject for parody during carnival, because they involve one of the most powerful men in the world being caught with his pants down. The fact that a description of how president Clinton used his private parts in the White House was followed through mass media all over the world reveals certain lust to unveil the vulgarity and the grotesque bodily functions of the powerful and privileged, beyond carnival's symbolic role reversal. It also concerns the blurring of boundaries between the private and the public, often discussed in studies of carnival.
also sad characters: a monk and a harsh woman. The only pittance are three poor herrings, wisely arranged on a line, but very dry. Carnival rides a great barrel, a good ham leg is fixed on the prow by a butcher's huge knife. He is a large individual with a rubicund face, followed by joyful companions dressed with colourful garments. Carnival holds a great roasting jack with roasted meats and the head of a wild boar; by his feet, wine jars, goblets and scattered cards. Just by him, some old women make crepes.” (Heers, 1983: 194-195, my translation)

The battle between Carnival and Lent (painted by Bruegel in 1559) does not conform, according to Kavaler (1999), to the usual denunciation of carnival excess, nor does it affirm Lent as a virtuous successor that “brings an end to the follies of sensual indulgence” (Kavaler, 1999:111). The same author also notes that Bruegel provides a neutral treatment of the working classes, whose celebration of carnival is not portrayed as the wild and raucous festivity that the pictorial conventions of his time would have called for.

An analysis of Bruegel’s painting and the characteristics of his contemporary socio-cultural context lies beyond the reach of my own work, but many of the features of carnival and lent that he depicted are of great relevance here.

Kavaler (op.cit.) affirms that carnival and lent are portrayed as two antithetical aspects of life, as an essential opposition between restriction and gratification, between the sombre and the festive. The domain of carnival is characterised by the presence of red meat, beer barrels, masquerade, kitchen

7 For a detailed analysis of Pieter Bruegel’s work, see Kavaler (1999).
tools, and people gambling, drinking, dancing and acting. On the left side of Bruegel’s canvas, there is an

“[I]mposing tavern that serves as a haven for the adherents of Carnival. It houses the enthusiastic audience peering from the window at a performance of the farcical Dirty Bride, as extra barrels of beer lie outside in reserve. The sign of the inn hangs from the second story, which is inhabited by a few additional characters: a small child, a couple kissing, and a bagpiper who lowers his instrument to vomit out the window” (Kavaler, 1999:118).

On the opposite side, the church signals the domain of Lent, which is characterised by the presence of fish (herring), pretzels, dried bread, and children carrying rattles. The veiled sculptures inside the church signify, according to Kavaler, the need to avoid any source of sensual distraction during lent, “even from art created in the service of the church” (ibid.). Cripples are present in both realms, which meet in the centre of the canvas, where some women wash fish by a well, behind which a vomiting pig is depicted.

These images illustrate the significant opposition between carnival and lent, which is but one aspect of the wider antagonism that separates the official ceremonies from the popular festivals, the pompous sobriety from the excessive drunkenness, the solemn acts from the informality of laughter: all

---

8 The sign that identifies the large tavern reads: “This is in the Blue Boat”, or “Inn of the Blue Boat”, according to Kavaler (op.cit.), who points out the relevance of a legendary Carnival Society (called the Blue Boat) that was known for its members being required to disregard particular ethical standards, as
of the latter pointing to the grotesque body discussed by Mikhail Bakhtin as an essential feature of popular culture.

* Hyman (2000) asserts that Bakhtin reconstructed the grotesque canon through the distinction of four great themes: the tumultuous crowd, the world turned upside-down, the comic mask, and the grotesque body. Thus, he identified in the writings of Rabelais the degradation of the “sublime” through laughter, the deadly weapon of the victorious popular-grotesque body. It may be precisely where laughter is most forbidden that the carnivalesque becomes, according to Hyman (ibid), most meaningful.

“Just as Carnival challenges the narrow authority of Lent, so carnivalesque imagery has acted as a corrective to each successive hegemony in the visual arts; breaking in upon the prevailing aesthetic norm, (...) as laughter breaks in upon the body” (Hyman, op.cit.:72).

While Hyman refers mainly to the visual arts, my own reference to them will be very limited, mainly to illustrate some points with examples that are not restricted to anthropology. The “carnivalesque imagery” that will be discussed here is related to the complex of images described by Bakhtin in his analysis of popular culture (1990), and to the images observed and evoked in the performative and discursive enactment of Carnival in Oruro.

through the overindulgence in drink and sex. Kavaler also suggests a relation with Sebastian Brant’s Ship
I would suggest that Bakhtin’s carnivalesque ethos is incorporated into the grotesque body: the tumultuous crowd may be identified in the great (collective) popular body that enacted the comic cult (op cit.). The world turned upside-down (i.e. the exaltation of the fool and the ugly) and the comic mask (i.e. with deformed mouths and noses) are also incarnated in the grotesque body, which through the excessive ingestion of food and alcohol becomes a representative figure of carnivalesque imagery.

Eating, drinking and laughing are activities associated with the degradation of the “elevated”, which is, according to Bakhtin, an outstanding feature of grotesque realism. Thus the exaltation of the grotesque body through carnival constitutes a counter-discourse, opposed to the hegemonic aesthetics that dictates a sober behaviour.

Gardiner (1993) notes that a “counterfactual” is required, in order for an ideological or cultural criticism to be viable, which is at the same time not restricted to the deconstruction or demystification of hegemonic ideologies and discourses. This is provided, according to Gardiner, by Bakhtin’s utopian vision related to the anarchic and carnivalesque deconstruction of official ideologies. The carnivalesque enactment of the utopian community helps thus

---

9 This will be developed throughout the dissertation, mainly in the ethnography of Chapter Eight.

---
to create a transgressive or "liminalised" social space of freedom and authenticity (op.cit.:44).

Nevertheless, the confinement of such liminalised social space within the context of carnival may unveil a lack of freedom and authenticity. Eco (1984) questions the factuality of carnivalesque transgression, since it is enacted within the permitted temporal and spatial limits, thus constituting an "authorised transgression". He argues that the establishment of an upside down world during carnival liberates us from the fear imposed by the existence of the rule, but that an important requisite for the appropriate development of carnival is that the rule must be so deeply introjected that its presence is overwhelming at the moment of its violation. Similarly, Brandes (1988) points out that while fiestas incorporate humour as a means to ridicule appropriate behaviour, they nevertheless sanctify culturally approved behaviour through sacred drama.

I will dwell on both aspects of carnival (sacred drama and role reversal), but - considering Eco's critique of "authorised transgression" - I will concentrate on the embodiment of the carnivalesque-grotesque in the actual behaviour of social actors, beyond the choreographic and/or dramatic representations enacted during the celebration of the festivity.\(^{10}\) Such an analysis of sacred drama reveals, for example, socio-cultural issues underpinning performance,

\(^{10}\) A discussion on representational activities will be provided, but not without a proper analysis of its links/contrasts with the actual behaviour of the groups and individuals involved.
and shows how “role reversal” may paradoxically stress the strength and prevalence of the established boundaries.

Two main instances of carnivalesque role reversal are those related to the appropriate behaviour of men and women, and to the position of the rich and the poor. Both issues will be discussed in Chapter Four, drawing on the particular significance of performative transvestism within a homophobic society, and on the atomisation of some traditional dance groups due to the socio-economic differences between the distinctive social actors involved. First I shall review some general aspects of the celebrations of carnival in Oruro.

***
TWO
CARNIVAL IN ORURO

The following geographical and historical overview will draw mainly on the images directly or indirectly related to the celebration of carnival in the city of Oruro. In this context, imagery is not exclusively linked to the visually perceptible elements and actions (incorporated in the artistic production of painters, mask and needle craftsmen, dancers and choreographers), but also to the visualised or imagined rhetoric underlying mythological and historical narratives (which are embodied in the local artistic production as much as in the landscape).

Topographic Imageries

Herbert Klein describes the Altiplano (Andean High-Plateau) as

"[A] great elliptical sphere with the enormous lake at its top, the altiplano is the most level and largest plateau in the Andes, which in its turn is the most extensive mountain range in the world...The western mountain range is called Cordillera Occidental and is an extremely narrow and well defined range averaging some 16,500 feet, rising at its highest point to over 21,000 feet...Quite different is the eastern range of mountains known variously as the Cordillera Real, Central or Oriental. Far broader and much more broken than the Western Cordillera, the Royal Cordillera contains numerous fertile plains and river valleys at altitudes from 14,000 feet down to a few hundred feet above sea level.” (1982: 4-6).

The department of Oruro is located in the Highlands of Central Western Bolivia. It covers an area of 53,588 Km2 and includes approximately 340,000
Figure 1. The Department of Oruro.
inhabitants. It lies between the departments of La Paz in the north, Potosí in the south, and Cochabamba and Potosí in the east, and the Republic of Chile in the west. The city of Oruro lies on the edge of an extensive steppe, at the foot of ten successive hills: San Felipe, San Pedro, Santa Bárbara, Luricancho, Huaka Llusta, Corral Pata, Viscachani, Pie de Gallo, Cerrato, and Argentillo. The Pampas near the city of Oruro are interrupted by the presence of Lake Uru Uru, which is connected to Lake Poopó (Guerra Gutierrez, n.d.). Hills, mountains, rivers and lakes play a central role in local ritual life and mythological narrative.

The historian Carlos Condarco (1999) explains the names of several sacred/ritual sites located among the hills of the city of Oruro: the Aymara name for San Pedro Hill is Jampattu Qullu, a toponymy clearly related to the Toad-like shape of the hill, when observed from the east. Between San Pedro and Viscachani, there is an elevation called Waqallusta (or Huaka Lusta), which, according to Condarco, means “where the Waka glides”. Further south we find Jararankani Hill, which means “place inhabited by lizards”. There is another toad-like rock formation on San Felipe Hill, and a condor-like rock formation by the foothill of Luricancho. Finally, further south, on

1 According to the National Census 1992.
2 See figure 1.
3 The Aymara Dictionary (Apaza, et al., 1984) defines jamp’atu as toad, and q’ullu as rotten egg.
4 Waka is defined in the Aymara Dictionary (ibid) as sacred stone inhabited by spirits (especially of animals), while llust’a is defined as slippery. The Quechua Dictionary (Gonzalez Holguin, 1952) defines huacca as idols, little statues of men and animals, while huacca muchana is described as a place for idols and for worship. Huacca muchay means idolatry and huacca muchak idolatrous. Sacred places and/or the idols related to them are variably referred to as waka, wak’a, huacca and guaca. According to Condarco (op. cit.), some pre-colonial tombs were found in this site.
Asiruni\textsuperscript{6} Hill, a snake-like rock formation lies on the back of Chiripujio (1999:79-80).\textsuperscript{7} It is not only possible to observe these figures in the surroundings of Oruro, but people often describe local geography in relation to the mythological narrative on such topological features.

Libation ceremonies commonly take place in these sites on Tuesdays and Fridays, and the numbers and socio-cultural heterogeneity of the attendants rise dramatically during carnival season. Variations may be observed in the performance of the libations and in the composition of the ritual offerings, according to the time of the year and the cultural and socio-economic conditions of the individuals involved. The rites performed in these sites usually include offerings for \textit{Pachamama} or Mother Earth, a generic term often used to describe deities related to rocks, mountains and hills.

New interpretations of the local hills and their related mythological narrative emerged, as historical processes led to a series of transformations in the social and cultural composition of the population. As the area became an important mining centre, the indigenous communities were gradually replaced by immigrants involved in the mining enterprise. Although the Indians were used for the hard work in the mines where their ritual practices were regularly enacted, the flux of immigration gave rise to a new population, which introduced also different socio-cultural practices. In relation to the depiction

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textit{Jararankha} is defined by the Aymara Dictionary (op cit.) as lizard.
  \item \textit{Asiru} is defined as snake in the Aymara Dictionary (ibid).
\end{itemize}
Figure 2. The Hills of Oruro. (Source: Condarco 1999)
of pre-Christian deities, it is important to keep in mind the particular shapes
of toads, snakes and lizards, in order to observe the processes of
transformation expressed through these images up to their incorporation
within the present day Carnival Parade.

* 

The local writer Guerra Gutierrez asserts (n.d.) that the territory occupied
today by the city of Oruro has been the habitat of a succession of different
cultures. The Urus - who according to this author arrived at the Inter Andean
area 4,500 years ago from the Pacific Ocean Coast in search of calmer waters
- were probably the first society that inhabited the area, remaining until
Spanish colonial times and bestowing upon the area the name Oruro (Uru
Uru).

The Urus who inhabit today the Iru-Itu reed islands on Lake Titicaca call
themselves Kot’suna, which means “men of the Lake”, whereas the Uru
Chipayas, the old inhabitants of the steppes that extend all the way to Lake
Coipasa, call themselves Jas-Shoni, or “men of water” 8 (Condarco, 1999).
Both groups, together with the Uru Muratos who inhabit the borders of Lake
Poopo, represent the descendants of a remote and enigmatic people: the Urus

7 Figure 2 illustrates the location of these hills.
8 It is relevant to stress the importance of water for the Urus, who appear to have always lived near (or on)
lakes and rivers, and developed a complex symbolical system where water is the element most often
represented through the presence of toads, snakes, and lizards.
Although there are endless theories on the possible origins of the Urus, there is general agreement that their presence in the area predates any other social group inhabiting the Andes today.

According to Condarco\textsuperscript{10}, the Urus themselves explain their origins in relation to a different time and a different world, and in relation to a pre-humanity whose annihilation was due to several catastrophes: floods, epidemics, petrifaction, and the advent of the sun (1999:15). Thanks to the maternal protection of water, the Urus survived to construct an intelligible cosmos with the development of certain symbols: \textit{Wari} was Fire, and \textit{Qucha} Water. But \textit{Wari} and \textit{Qucha} do not only mean “fire” and “water”, for they are linked to the other elements (earth and air) through the symbolisation of \textit{Wari} and \textit{Quwak}\textsuperscript{11} as two protagonist deities of local mythology. The relationship between the Urus, \textit{Quwak} and \textit{Wari} is not limited to the existence or availability of the four elements, but is also related to female and male principles, linked in their turn to silver and gold.

The report that Felipe Godoy submitted in 1607 to the President of the \textit{Real Audiencia de La Plata} confirms the practice of pre-colonial mining activities in the hills surrounding the city of Oruro (see Pauwels, 1999). Condarco (1999) suggests that these places might have been Uru ritual sites in the past,

\textsuperscript{10} Who bases much of his arguments on the writings of the chronicler Santa Cruz Pachacuti.
particularly *Wari Toq’o* which is interpreted as the “hole” or place of origin of the deity Wari (see below), probably located around Iroco, between the two main ranges of hills. According to this author, the Serranias of Uru Uru are a cosmological and cultural *Taypi* (“centre” or “place of encounter”), divided from north to south in two halves: on the west is *Uracharku* (Aymara), as the place of Wari, fire, and gold, and on the east is *Warsicharku* (Uru), the place of *Quwak*, water and silver.  

*Wari* was at the same time the God of Fire and an underground deity, whereas *Quwak*, the snake, was a multi-semantic symbol, signifying water, earth and thunder. We must notice that both deities are not necessarily symbolised as a fixed dichotomy, because *Quwak* as snake and thunder implies, for example, both water and fire. The sites for the performance of ritual activities directed to *War*\(^3\)i were most often located next to a lake:

"The worship sites for *Huari* were known as *Huari-Vilcas*, and two of them were famous: one by the brook of Lake Titicaca, where Huarina is located today, the other site was close to Lake Poopo, where the Royal Town of Huari was founded." (Paredes Candia, 1963:50, quoted by Condarco op.cit. My translation).

\[\text{\textsuperscript{11}}\] Condarco uses the terms *Qucha* (lake, or water) and *Quwak* (snake) as interchangeable. I will refer mainly to *Quwak*, because snakes also symbolise water and are very important characters in the imagery developed around the Carnival Parade.

\[\text{\textsuperscript{12}}\] See figure 2.

\[\text{\textsuperscript{13}}\] Tristan Platt (257) asserts that *Wari* is the name of an ancient Andean God whose cult still flourished during the seventeenth century in the labyrinthical temple of Chavin (built between 1000 and 800 BC).
Huari\textsuperscript{14} is today a town best known for the presence of one of the most important beer breweries in Bolivia, which had been until a few years ago the official sponsor of the Oruro Carnival Parade\textsuperscript{15}. Quwak, as the cosmological deity that provided the bridge between the sky (upper world), the earth (intermediate world), and the underworld or sub-aquatic world, established a cosmic order related to the three differentiated domains. The symbol of a reptile assumed a benign and creative nature,\textsuperscript{16} through the identification of the snake with water. Snakes and toads are usually considered temporal indicators and bearers of water in the Andes. Their presence in the fields signals the transition between dry season and rainy season. Bouysse (1988:93) asserts that toads and snakes tend to hide during the dry season between May and July, coming out during the rainy season which is signalled by thunder.

According to Condarco (1999), Quwak and Wari are fortunate gods who survived the attacks of Aymaras, Quechuas, and Spaniards, and are brought back to life every year in a rather transfigured form, during the Carnival of Oruro. I would suggest that the representation of devils and snakes during the Carnival Parade constitutes the manifestation of an imposed Christian dichotomy between "good" and "evil", rather than a true evocation of Wari and Quwak. Thus although people often relate these images to the ancient pre-Christian deities, they are more often than not

\textsuperscript{14} I chose to use different spelling, to differentiate Huari (the town) from Wari (the spirit of the mountains and hills).

\textsuperscript{15} The relevance of this will become clear throughout the dissertation, particularly in Chapter Eight.

\textsuperscript{16} Compare with contemporary simplified versions of the myth, where Wari, along with a snake, a lizard and a toad are interpreted as an "evil god" and his "destructive monsters" (see the section on the Devil Dance and the myth of Wari, below). See also Bouysse 1988, and Bouysse and Harris, 1987.
compartimentalised within such a dichotomy, in a stark contrast with their former ambiguous attributes.

Although there seems to be not a single Uru participant in the official Carnival Parade today, the above descriptions are relevant to understand the transfiguration of Wari, the snake, the lizard and the toad through the development of the festivity. The ambiguity that characterised these figures - as linked to rain and thunder, water and fire, gain and loss - is gradually transformed into a fixed duality, according to the more recent and most common interpretation of the myth and its related Devil dance. Such a contemporary interpretation is described and discussed in the section on the Devil dance in Chapter Four and the myth of Wari, below. However, it is necessary first to introduce some historical considerations, which are to be considered mainly in relation to the transmutation of the carnivalesque imageries displayed in Oruro.

**Historical Imageries**

The contemporary wide use of Aymara and Quechua languages in the area can be considered a result firstly of the domination of the Urus by Aymara confederations, and secondly of the expansion of the Inca Empire in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. Thus the introduction of Spanish in the sixteenth century constituted the imposition of a third language, in a series of invasions experienced by the Urus, whose own language can be considered in the present as almost completely lost.
After the discovery of rich silver mines, a new mestizo ("hybrid") society was formed in Oruro during the time of the Spanish Colony.

“Speaking both their native languages and Spanish, these new urban Indians often gave up their traditional costumes and began to dress in an adaptation of the Spanish manner and consume Spanish-style foods, such as bread. They became urban cholos, even though they were of a pure Indian stock.” (Klein, 1982:54).

Although racial and cultural mestizaje (or “hybridity”) underpins much of the imageries transformed during carnival, I will not elaborate an extensive analysis of the concept. However, it must be clear at this point that something we can call a mestizo society was established in Oruro by the time of its foundation.

In 1606, on November 6, Manuel Castro de Padilla ordered a Catholic Mass and gave Spanish saints’ names to the (indigenous) hills, founding a city with the name of Villa Real de San Felipe de Austria de Oruro (Beltrán Heredia, 1956). The hills and mountains were what drew the conquerors to the area, not because of their mythological/ritual significance, but because they were rich in silver. Two of the most important tasks of Spanish colonialism in the Andes were the extraction of minerals and the extirpación de idolatrías, the extirpation or destruction of local shrines and idols. Given the sacred/mythical character of mountains and hills in the area, I suggest that these two colonial enterprises were linked, but did not remain uncontested.
According to Duviols (1977, quoted by Gisbert 1999), the first official text against idolatry was issued in 1541. It ordered the construction of chapels and the identification and destruction of any pagan monuments, guacas, or other places where the Indians would hold any ceremonies or rites. A cross was often erected in the site, to replace the idolatry with a symbol of the new religion.

Given that the “idolatrous rites” of the natives were often believed to be enacted through musical and dance performances, the need to control such expressions emerged. The historian Juan Carlos Estenssoro (1989) asserts that the Catholic Church was - since its arrival to Peru in the sixteenth century - in charge of organising and controlling musical manifestations. Fiestas were then used for cultural assimilation, with the assignation of the organisation of the performances to the cofradías - religious fraternities (groups organised for prayer, or other religious activities) - which ensured the participation of the locals in the process of conversion (Estenssoro, 1992 a: 181).

The same author argues that for the (early seventeenth century) Spaniards, idolatry was not only found in the sphere of the Andean dances that had survived as such, but also within those that the evangelisers themselves had incorporated into the Catholic ceremonies. One thing was to eliminate the

---

17Philippe III, the Spanish King who was the only surviving son of Philip II and Anne of Austria (the union of Austrian and Spanish monarchies). He reigned from 1598 until 1621, when he died.
and a completely different matter was to start prohibiting the traditional dances that already formed a part of Catholic rites (1992b: 374). The prohibition of musical representations in the colonial society was almost always directed against the group who performed it, rather than against the attitudes themselves (Estenssoro, 1989).

Similarly, although it was perceived that a great deal of the danger of the indigenous celebrations was related to drunkenness, this did not refer to a general state of inebriation, but to a specific form of inebriation experienced by the Indians. Francisco de Avila, one of the pioneers of the “extirpation” movement, thought that it was necessary that the Indians danced and even got inebriated, as long as they did not dance their old taquis, but the new cachuas, played with guitars and harps in the urban context (Estenssoro, 1992b). “Idolatry” was therefore identified with the traditional Andean ceremonies, as much as with the sites where they were performed. Thus the movement of “extirpation” involved the destruction of both the sites and the performances themselves.

On the other hand, the destruction of images, shrines and other sites for cults produced a local reaction that materialised in a movement called Taqui Oncco\(^{19}\), literally translated as the “illness of dance”. This movement called

\(^{18}\) The native ceremonies involving dances and songs, see below.

\(^{19}\) There are different ways of spelling these words. I choose to use the one provided by Gonzalez Holguin (1952), where taquini or taquicuni is defined as “only singing without dancing”, or “singing and dancing”. Oncco is defined as illness.
for the rejection of everything that typified the dominant (Spanish) group, especially their religion (Gisbert, 1999: 46). *Taqui Onccoy* was described as follows:

“In preparation for the return of their gods, the natives danced without resting until falling into trance. Then, shivering and in spasms, they rejected their own Catholicism. After recovering from the trance, they solemnly declared being possessed by one of their *guacas* that, detaching themselves from the mountains, clouds or springs, used the bodies of humans to express themselves” (Gutierrez de Santa Clara, quoted by Gisbert, op. cit.: 46, my translation).

Therefore, the movement of resistance against the “extirpation of idolatries can be considered a religious resistance.” I would not claim any direct link between such colonial movements of religious conversion and resistance with the modern celebration of carnival in Oruro, but it might be relevant to keep them in mind, as part of the historical background of Andean festivities in general and, more specifically, in relation to the transformation of drinking and dancing in the contemporary urban context.

* 

As suggested earlier, the expansion of Spanish colonialism in the Andes was led by the Catholic cross and aimed at the exploitation of silver and gold. It may be argued that the act of changing the names of the hills of Oruro was equivalent to a baptism, because new Christian names replaced the old
indigenous (profane) names. Nevertheless, the hills never lost their sacredness; the Indian miners who were exploited by the Spaniards developed a specific cult to the spirit owner of the mines. While the mines were the main source of wealth for the invaders, they also constituted a dark and inaccessible sphere for the Catholic priests in charge of the destruction of local shrines and idols.

*  

An intense search for mineral deposits took place in the late seventeenth century. The biggest silver mine near the city of Oruro was discovered in 1695. Klein asserts that the city of Oruro was strategically located, not only because it was the largest free mine centre in all Charcas, but also because it turned out to be the closest highland city to the Pacific Coast Port of Arica. Mercury produced in Huancavelica, a Lower Peru mine, was shipped from Lima to Arica, and then transported by mule to the highlands, for the extraction of silver ore from other minerals by amalgamation (Klein, 1982).

The mineral production was reduced in Potosí and Oruro, during the late seventeenth and early eighteenth century crisis, bringing about a dramatic demographic decline in the urban centres. According to Klein (ibid), the urban and mining decline had as an effect an increased rural population,
giving rise to a major period of growth for the free communities. This resulted in the growth of non-Spanish market systems in some areas, which brought about an extension of the tribute taxation system.

The increased pressure and control over the economic, social and religious life of the indigenous communities by the Crown and the Church (through their local representatives) gave rise to a series of Indian rebellions in the eighteenth century.

The great Túpac Amaru rebellion of 1780-82 probably encompassed over 100,000 rebel troupes (Klein, op.cit.:75). The capture and execution of the Indian leader in Cuzco did not stop the spread of the massive revolt. Tomas Catari, Andrés Amaru (the nephew of Túpac Amaru) and Túpac Catari (Julián Apaza, who combined the names of the two leading rebels) organised massive rebellions in Upper Peru, culminating with a long siege of the city of La Paz, which lasted until the end of the year, when loyalist troops arrived from Buenos Aires to capture and execute Túpac Catari.

A mixed (criollo, mestizo and Indian) urban revolt had also begun in 1781 in the city of Oruro, which became then the largest Spanish city taken by the rebels. However, the socio-cultural and racial differences entailed the distinctive definition of goals, which were not shared between the Indian rebels and the criollos and mestizos alike. The loyalist forces eventually clearly observed as opposed to each other.
seized the town and executed the leaders. (op.cit.:77). Abercrombie (1992) suggests that the attempt of some criollos (Spaniards born in America) to escape using their servants’ Indian clothes as a disguise might have been the first “Indian Dance of Carnival”. Although all the uprisings were defeated by the royalist troops, a movement of independence followed in the early nineteenth century, with the liberation of Upper Peru and the Declaration of Bolivian independence in 1825 (Klein, 1982).

* 

After Independence and the creation of the Republic in 1825, the great period of hacienda or Land State construction (between 1880 and 1930) broke up the de facto control of the indigenous communities through the creation of an individualistic Indian “peasantry”21 (ibid). In the post 1880 period, Bolivian mine-owners seized control of the government and managed to direct its undivided efforts at lowering the costs of transportation, which was the most expensive element in the mining process. The fiscal resources of the government were devoted to massive railroad construction. By the late nineteenth century, the city of Oruro became, thanks to its strategic location, the most important mining and railroad centre of the country.

21 The cohesion of the communities was destroyed, Klein argues, by purchasing a few small parcels from individual title holders (Klein, 1982).
The Great Depression and the Chaco War of 1932 to 1935 marked the end of the expansion, and even the capitalisation of the mining industry. After the conflict with Paraguay, mine production began to decline. A series of major mine strikes took place between November and December 1942 in Oruro and Potosí. Hundreds of unarmed workers were slaughtered, when troops opened fire on the miners and their families. Another major massacre of miners was carried out in June 1967 (masacre de San Juan) under the orders of president Barrientos, who unsuccessfully sought to eradicate the movement of the Miners' Union. Most mines of Oruro were closed in the mid 1980s.

During the Republic, the city of Oruro remained one of the most important economic centres of Bolivia. The great tide of immigration to Oruro during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries - related mainly to mining activities - gave rise to the first cosmopolitan city in Bolivia. One of my interlocutors mentioned Croatian, German, French, Italian, Belgian, Turkish, Arab, Chinese, Japanese, and English immigrants. Their presence introduced the consumption of European products, like Italian, French and German bread, or the custom of drinking tea at 10 o'clock in the morning and 4 o'clock in the afternoon, in the English style. Likewise, the production and

---

22 Paradoxically (or perhaps symptomatically) president Barrientos, who apart from ordering the massacre of the miners prohibited the performance of rites for the Tio in the mines, was the one who signed the decree that established the nationalisation of folklore.
consumption of chocolate was the result of Croatian influence,\textsuperscript{23} as the production of biscuits and pasta was an influence of Italian immigrants\textsuperscript{24}.

International influences have been incorporated in, and re-interpreted through, the Carnival Parade. Formerly known as the Mining, Industrial and Railway Centre of the country, Oruro is today known as the Folklore Capital of Bolivia, its Carnival Parade being the most important social, cultural and economic activity for which most citizens prepare throughout the year. The flux of national and international visitors rises dramatically during the week of carnival celebrations, when many of them participate in different ritual activities enacted in distinctive sites of the city. The relationship of local citizens with the different elements that build up the whole scenario for carnival permeates everyday life, and their engagement with the different sites for ritual activities is developed throughout the year.

**The Oruro Carnival Parade**

As suggested in the previous chapter, the Catholic concept and practice of carnival was introduced into the Andes in the sixteenth century. In an attempt to replace local deities and in order to get a positive response from the natives, Christian celebrations were adapted to local non-Christian festivities, to render them commensurable to the indigenous religious life. Rudwin

\textsuperscript{23} A very important social club that has been the host of carnival parties throughout the 20\textsuperscript{th} century was formerly known as “The Yugoslavian”, and is today known as “The Croatian”.

\textsuperscript{24}
suggested (1920) that a similar process of adaptation took place in the European continent before the fifteenth century. Thus in order to identify the origin of the Oruro Carnival Parade, one should investigate the origins of both, the European carnival and the pre-colonial festivities to which the former was adapted. Such an endeavour lies beyond the scope of my research. Nevertheless, most local interlocutors and writers agree on the relevance of three particular myths in relation to the origin of their Carnival Parade. The myths (which are transcribed below) are usually considered in reference to the Virgin of the Mineshaft (the legends of Chiru Chiru and Nina Nina) and to the Devil Dance (the myth of Wari), central figures of the local festivity.

Carnival and the Mythological Narrative

“Lucifer - wearing an imperial crown, colossal spurs, a black mask with toads, lizards and other animals of native sorcery, and covered with an enriched red velvet cape - is the unchallenged king of carnival” (Beltrán Heredia, 1962:52. My translation).

Beltrán Heredia points out that although the Devil is the most important character in the Oruro Carnival Parade, the celebration of the festivity starts and ends at the home of the Virgin of the Mineshaft. Every year the carnival season starts officially in November (the first Sunday after All Saints day) with the Primer Convite. This is a ceremony (that takes place after the first full-route dance rehearsal) in which all new dancers take a vow, in front of

24 It is notable that the Morenada Ferrari (one of the carnival dance groups) was created and is supported still today by the Ferrari family (of Italian descent) who are the main stockholders of one of the most important biscuit and noodles factories in Bolivia.
the Madonna, to participate in the Carnival Saturday Pilgrimage for the following three years. Likewise, the official procession on Carnival Saturday is led by the image of the Virgin and representatives of the Catholic Church, followed by local authorities (mainly the Municipal Mayor, the Prefect of the department of Oruro and the President of the Asociación de Conjuntos del Folklore de Oruro, all accompanied by their wives). The official authorities are then followed by the first and oldest Devil Dance group of the Oruro Carnival Parade: the Mañazos or Gran Tradicional y Auténtica Diablada Oruro, led by their own image of the Virgin.

A description of the Devil Dancers' masks, costumes and choreography will be provided in Chapter Four and Appendix 2, but it is necessary to discuss at this point the protagonist roles attributed to the images of the Virgin and the Devil in the Carnival Parade. Two of the aforementioned myths are directly related to the apparition of the Virgin of the Mineshaft, while the third one is said to be linked to the Devil Dance, and narrates the defeat of an evil pre-Christian demigod by an Andean Princess.

25 See Chapter One.
26 ACFO, the Association of Folkloric Dance Groups of Oruro, which is officially in charge of organising the celebration of carnival in Oruro. It is notable that the directorate board of the ACFO is composed only by men, although their wives tend to hold similar roles in the Cofradía or "religious fraternity", in which only women participate. I would suggest that male chauvinism is only another form of discrimination in Bolivia (alongside homophobia, racism and class-discrimination).
27 It is written on the ACFO regulations that every single group that participates on the Carnival Saturday Pilgrimage must be led by the image of the Virgin: "La imagen de la Virgen del Socavón debe encabezar el peregrinaje de cada conjunto" (Chapter 1, Article No. 5, ACFO's Official Regulations for Carnival1998).
The Virgin and the Legends of Chiru Chiru and Nina Nina

The Virgin of the Mineshaft is the central image in the shrine of the homonymous temple. It is argued that it was found in the eighteenth century within a mineshaft of the Pie de Gallo Hill, where a chapel was erected for the worship of the Virgin. The image was precariously painted by an anonymous author on a mud-brick wall, and was restored by an Italian specialist in 1992. After its restoration had been completed, the original image was taken in a procession for the first and only time at 8:00 pm on February the 22nd 1995, before its definitive installation in the shrine of a newly refurbished and extended temple.28

Replicas of the Madonna can be purchased in the Secretary Office of the parish, where they also sell tickets to visit the mine-museum. At the back of the temple, on the opposite end to the shrine, there is a doorway that leads downwards to an old mine that was converted into a museum. Apart from the display of different mining tools and minerals, there are two anthropomorphic figures exhibited in the museum. One of them is the Tío or Devil of the mine.

There are actually two images of the Tío, located towards the end of a gallery and locked behind iron bars. The figure in front resembles the devil dancers, sporting certain costume features that are usually not observed in the Tío of the rural mines. He is dressed with a cape, a chest protector, and a belt that

28 La Razon, La Paz, 24 January 1999.
Figure 3. The *Tío of the Mine*. (Source: Vargas Luza 1998)
covers his genitals.\footnote{See figure 3. One of the most important features of the Tío in the rural mines is his enormous phallus. The way this specific image is folklorically dressed (with a covered or non existent phallus) seems to be an imposition of the Catholic parish priests, who direct and manage the museum.} By his feet there is an accumulation of coca leafs, cigarettes, and bottles of alcohol and beer. At the end of the gallery, behind the first image of the Tío, there is another image that can only be seen from far away (because of the locked iron bars that block the entrance). It seems to be the original Tío, constructed by the miners who worked in this particular mine.

The other anthropomorphic figure exhibited in the museum is a replica of the thief Chiru Chiru. It is the first image encountered on the way down into the old mine, in a small cave at the left hand side of the stairs. Chiru Chiru is portrayed dead, lying by the foot of an image of the Virgin.\footnote{See figure 4.} What follows is an account of the legend of Chiru Chiru or Nina Nina.

"The entrails and scenery of the Pie de Gallo mine – opulent silver vein of inexhaustible riches – serves as a refuge to a man, who is a beggar and a thief but a good soul, nevertheless. Nobody knows his origins, which are as dark as the earth that surrounds his poor and lonely cave. His roots are lost in the darkness of times and the people in the village ignore his past. In reference to his shaggy hair, they call him Chiru Chiru. He has no other name and only precarious tatters are seen hanging from his weak and squalid body. No one would think that he is the owner of two secrets: one which turns the poor man into a defender of the weak, and the other that provides his soul with an emanation of divine light.

When night falls, Chiru Chiru steals from the sleeping rich hacendados of the village, to leave the booty by the door of the
Figure 4. Chiru Chiru or Nina Nina. (Source: Vargas Luza 1998)
poor. He is the solace of the pariah, angel of the helpless. His hands are always ready to help the wounded. During the day he is a helpless wanderer, but at night he is transformed into a born again Robin Hood. Who could imagine that the saddest beggar is the portentous donor worshiped by the poor? When the daylight returns, after he is finished with his nightly deeds, his soul is illuminated as he enters his shelter. He is not alone. Prodigiously, a beautiful and sweet image of the Virgin of Candlemas printed on the wall illuminates his cave. Chiru Chiru dialogues day and night with her. She scolds him for his misdemeanours and assaults, but he is also blessed by her with motherly love. He kneels by her feet to pray and chat. He lights a candle, which is a votive live coal of his soul.

One dark and sad night, Chiru Chiru is wounded, when he assaults a wanderer. He escapes quickly to his cave, leaving behind him a trace of blood. As he arrives, bleeding Chiru Chiru demands forgiveness and care by the foot of the Madonna. The image, embodied in a solicitous nurse and a tender mother helps the deadly wounded man and takes his final confession. The Virgin collects Chiru Chiru’s last breath and shows him the path that leads to glory…” (Elsa Dorado, extracted from Tres Leyendas y la Sagrada Imagen de la Candelaria, La Patria, Oruro, March 4, 2000. My translation.)

There are many different versions of the legend, but most of them coincide in general terms. Zaconeta (1970) points out that the nick-name Chiru Chiru might make reference to the shagginess of his hair or to the shape of his refuge, because it is the name given to a small bird whose nest is constructed with the thorns of a carob tree, starting from the deep end towards the very small entrance (similar to the entrance of the thief’s cave). According to this author, some say that the Virgin carried Chiru Chiru to a hospital where he died, a version that would be more compatible with the legend of Nina Nina.
Nina Nina is also said to be a thief devoted to the Virgin, who lived at the foot of the silver mine Pie de Gallo. The main differences between both characters are the causes and places of death: while Chiru Chiru was killed by a wanderer who defended himself against the thief’s assault (and died in his cave), Nina Nina was killed by a jealous father who caught his daughter embracing the thief, who then died in a hospital. Both characters were carried and blessed by the Virgin, whose image was later found on a wall of the thief’s cave. The story of Nina Nina is provided with personal names: Anselmo Belarmino was the thief who fell in love with Lorenza Choquiamo, whose father (Sebastian Choquiamo) killed him. The parish priest, Carlos Borreomo Mantilla, received Belarmino’s final confession in the year 1789.

Vargas Luza (1998) asserts that Anselmo Belarmino is the name of both, Chiru Chiru and Nina Nina. According to him, Chiru Chiru was the womaniser caught and fatally wounded (stabbed in the throat) by his lover’s father when they planned to escape together on Carnival Saturday in 1789. It was a lady with a child in her arms who carried, according to this version, Belarmino to the San Juan de Dios Hospital, where he died after confessing and telling the priest Borromeo about the miraculous image of the Virgin in

31 It should also be noted that the version of the legend of Nina Nina collected by Nash (1979) makes reference to an unemployed miner who turned thief. This may be related to the fact that Nash’s main informants were miners, but it is in any case very relevant, given that the Virgin of the Mineshaft is usually considered to be the Saint Patroness of the miners.
33 It is notable that the year 1789 is commonly linked to the myth, and therefore to the origin of the Carnival Parade. I cannot claim that this is directly linked to the French Revolution and/or to the indigenous rebellions which took place in the Eighteenth century in the Andes. It is however worth considering a reflection about this particular historical period.
his cave. *Nina Nina* is depicted in this version as the picaresque Robin Hood-like thief who lost the Virgin’s protection when he fell into sin trying to steal from a needy family. Vargas Luza underlines that the fact that there are personal names, dates and other elements related to the legend transforms it into history. He asserts then that the miraculous events related to the apparition of the image are true historical facts (op.cit.:13). It is not for me to discuss the veracity or fallacy of such assertions, but I must account for the relevance of the legends in relation to the Carnival Parade.

Although it is notable that, the events that originated the Carnival Parade are claimed to have taken place the year of the French Revolution, I could not find any direct references of this. However, perhaps it is more adequate to consider this in relation to the Andean indigenous rebellions of the late eighteenth century. The central square of Oruro, *Plaza 10 de Febrero*, is named in remembrance of the 1781 rebellion, when local-born Spaniards, or *criollos*, joined Indians and *mestizos* against the Spanish Crown. None of my interlocutors suggested a link between these events and the origin of the Carnival Parade but, as I suggest in the following chapters, Bolivian nationalism is a central issue in the celebration of carnival in Oruro. It might also be relevant to consider the socio-cultural and racial differences of the 1781 rebels and the attempt to bridge them through a unified devotion to the *Virgen del Socavón* ("Virgin of the Mineshaft") - a cult that is believed to originate in the legends of *Chiru Chiru* and *Nina Nina*, and the construction
of a chapel for the Madonna at the foot of the Pie de Gallo Hill, where the Pilgrimage on Carnival Saturday ends.

The attribution of the origin of the Carnival Pilgrimage to these legends corresponds to Michael Sallnow’s (1991) third phase of his characterisation of religious colonisation in the Andes. Sallnow suggests that the stage of cult regionalisation started from the end of the sixteenth century onwards, after the first phase in which the indigenous movement of *Taqui Oncco* was suppressed, and the second phase of cult location. He characterises this third stage in relation to the attribution of miraculous powers to the images of saints, whose shrines – which “typically hallowed indigenous sacred sites, or at least were located in the latter’s precincts” (Sallnow, 1991: 139) - became a foci of pilgrimage. According to Sallnow, miraculous shrines

“...are replete with symbolic meanings, expressed through such media as mythHistories of origin, miracle stories, iconology and so forth, all of which tend implicitly or explicitly to combine Christian ad indigenous notions of divinity” (Sallnow, 1991: 142).

*

Regarding the above legends, let us consider some of their main features: both describe a cave or mineshaft at the foot of Pie de Gallo mine, where the thief expressed his devotion to the Virgin lighting candles. In both legends the protagonist is a marginal character whose sins are absolved by the Virgin
whom he secretly worships. His marginality\textsuperscript{34} is characterised by his illicit activities and by the darkness and secrecy of the cave he inhabits, which is nevertheless blessed and illuminated by the miraculous Madonna. Belarmino is clearly described as an individual experiencing a transformation: a thief who steals for the poor, a man who inhabits darkness but lights candles for the Virgin, whose blessings finally incorporate him within the realm of good. It is also suggested that his death triggered the cult to the Virgin of the Mineshaft, since it led to the discovery of the image. Many interlocutors asserted that the Madonna was discovered by the miners, who decided to change the name of the mine \textit{Pie de Gallo} for \textit{Socavón de la Virgen} (or “Mineshaft of the Virgin”).\textsuperscript{35} It is also stressed that the festivity is directly linked to the \textit{Fiesta de la Virgen de la Candelaria} (or the “Festivity of the Virgin of Candlemas”) which takes place on February the 2\textsuperscript{nd} and - since the miners only had three days off during carnival – was adapted to the carnival calendar.

Locating the origin of the cult at the moment in which \textit{Chiru Chiru} or \textit{Nina Nina} is definitively incorporated within the realm of good, is congruent with the dichotomy at the foundations of the official celebration of carnival. Ambiguous mythological characters need to be defined as either good or evil,

\textsuperscript{34} Note that some similar marginal characters have actually inhabited different caves of the Pie de Gallo Hill. Some of them are described by Guerra (1998). This will be discussed in the last section of Chapter Seven.

\textsuperscript{35} Note the similarity with the “christening” of the local hills, when the city was founded in 1601 (see the section on Historical Imagery, in this chapter).
to correspond to the official narrative on the Carnival of Oruro. This will also be considered in relation to the myth of *Wari*.

After reviewing the legends related to the image of the Virgin of the Mineshaft, I will now discuss the other protagonist figure in the Oruro Carnival Parade, also linked to the miners: the Devil. Although it is usually argued that the Carnival of Oruro has always been a patrimony of local miners (Debrou, 1970; Murillo Vacarreza, 1970), the presence of dancing figures with some similar characteristics to those of the Devil Dancers in ancient pottery (Murillo Vacarreza, op.cit.; Varas Reyes, 1970), has been suggested as an evidence of the uncertain origin of the Devil Dance. There exist several interpretations of the origins of this particular dance, more often than not related to local mythological narrative.

**The Devil Dance and the Myth of *Wari***

The myth of *Wari*, as currently told and represented by certain elements in the choreography, costumes and masks of the Carnival Parade, refers to the struggle between the supernatural forces of good and evil to control the religious life of the Urus. There is general agreement on the direct relation between the Devil Dance and the myth of *Wari*. Nevertheless, there are endless versions of the myth, and the comparison of only a few of them illustrates how they incorporate the particular preoccupations of the sources.
June Nash’s paraphrasing of Beltran Heredia’s version of the myth constitutes an appropriate introduction.

**Version 1**
(Beltrán Heredia, paraphrased by Nash, 1979:18-19, my emphases)

“The community of Uru Uru [pre-Hispanic name for Oruro] was one of fishermen and pastoralists devoted to the worship of the Sun. Every day Huari [the spirit of the hills] was awakened by the first-born daughter of the Sun, Ñusta. He fell in love with her and pursued her with arms of smoke and volcanic fire. Her father came to her aid and hid her in the caves. Huari swore that he would bring vengeance against the town by turning it against the true religion. He became the apostle of a new religion and preached against Pachacamac and his religious and social work. He thundered against Inti, the Sun God, and the old social hierarchy. He exalted in the superiority of material goods over spiritual, and of the labour of the mines over that of the field. The Urus resisted, but when Huari showed them gold and silver, they rebelled against their old beliefs and sacred authorities. Desirious of riches, they abandoned the daily hard but healthy work in their fields. They stopped praying to Inti and turned to wild drinking and midnight revels with chicha, a liquor unknown before then. In their drunken state there came forth serpents, toads, lizards, and ants who, in the acts of the witches’ sabbath, overwhelmed them. The inhabitants of neighbouring towns and even their friends and parents appropriated their goods. The people, abject with vice, were transformed into apathetic, silent and loveless beings.

The town would have disappeared because of internal fights had not Ñusta appeared on a rainbow one day after a heavy storm. Accompanying her were the chiefs and priests who had been exiled from the town when the people were perverted from their old ways. Little by little, men returned to what had been. They revived their traditions, costumes, religion, and social order. They imposed Quechua on the Uru dialect. The fields would have recovered and even surpassed their fertility if Huari, in vengeance, had not sent four plagues on the repentant town: a serpent, a toad, a lizard, and ants. The monstrous serpent moved from the mountains of the south and devoured their fields and flocks. The Urus saw him and fled in terror, when suddenly someone shouted for Ñusta and the monster was divided in two.
by a sword. The other three plagues, advancing from the other compass points, were also killed by the intervention of Ñusta, who overwhelmed the vengeful Huari. Today a chapel stands on the hill where the giant lizard was killed. It is said that the lake [near Cala Cala] still turns red at dawn from the blood of the lizard that flowed into it. The ants were turned into sand dunes that can still be seen on the southern borders of the town. Peace returned to the town.”

Version 2
(Terán Erquizia, 1970:14,16,19, my emphases, my translation)

“The Uru-Uru llama shepherds were the most solicitous in their cult to the Sun: They offered him llamas, and every morning they worshiped him on their knees, raising their hands in the air with their bodies inclined, and chanting hymns until sunrise. Jealous of Pachacamac (a luminous benefactor, represented by the Sun Inti), Huari (a demigod of highland mythology, a sleeping monster in the Cordillera’s entrails) decided to rival him, and tried to take possession of Dawn [daughter of the Sun]. After his unsuccessful attempt, spiteful Huari manages to trick the Sun’s children, who fell into his nets of intrigues and became warlike and rancorous. But a protective Ñusta [Andean Princess] appeases the Urus, and speaks to them about a new God. This further enrages Huari, who sends monsters in revenge. Giant ants infested the Urus’ towns, a giant snake approached from the south, a giant lizard from the east, and a giant toad from the north. Finally, Ñusta defeated Huari, who, hiding in the entrails of the hills, occasionally ruts and sends his igneous anger to the skies, trying still to rival with fire the magnificent and resplendent sunlight.”

Version 3
(Guerra Gutierrez, 1970:154.155, my emphases, my translation)

“Huari was the Andean dominating evil God who punished the Urus for regretting the sins he gave them as a norm for living, and for trying to return to their good ways.36 A giant snake arrived from the south, a toad from the north, and ants from the east. The defending Ñusta defeated Huari who sent a giant lizard that she decapitated. Huari succumbed and sought for a home in the deepest parts of the earth. The toad, the snake, and

36 ...por arrepentirse de todos sus pecados, que él les entregó como norma de vida, y trataban de volver por los caminos del bien... in the Spanish original.
the lizard were petrified and the ants turned into sand. Today Nusta is the Virgin of the Mineshaft.”

**Version 4**
(Vargas Luza, 1998:49, my emphasis, my translation)

“Enraged because of their forgetfulness, Huari - the demigod that protected the Urus - decided to punish them and destroy all their offspring. He sent an enormous snake through the hills in the south with a giant condor; through the Kala Kala chain of hills he sent a giant lizard; through the pampas near town millions of ants; and through the northern region a toad, all of them ready to implement Huari’s terrible decision. But the apparition of Nusta, holding a thunder bolt in her right hand, transformed the fierce animals into stone and the ants into sand.”

*The first version presents Wari as the apostle of a new religion, closely linked to gold and silver mining activities. Condarco (1999) suggests that gold and silver mines were exploited by the Urus before the Incas and the Spaniards, and that they probably used both minerals in their ritual activities. The negative fashion in which the new religion and the new productive activity are described contrasts with the positive way in which the author of the second version introduces us to a protective and civilising Nusta, who speaks about a new religion.

I would underline the way Wari is depicted in general as an angry, spiteful and rancorous monster, or as an evil god that imposed sin upon human beings...*
as a norm for living, whereas *Pachacamac* is described as a luminous benefactor, and *Ñusta* as a peaceful and protective Andean Princess who speaks about a new God. The patronising flavour of a typical postcolonial discourse is evident in the form and contents of the transcriptions above. The negative description of *Wari* is contrasted with the positive description of *Pachacamac*, who nevertheless needs the intervention of a protective, civilising (potentially virginal) Princess. As mentioned in the Introduction, mythological narratives may provide us with "allusive" images which can be materialised and used for the construction of a carnivalesque imagery. The production of a comic strip\(^{37}\) depicting *Wari* with Andean racial features and *Ñusta* with Caucasian ones, contributes in this case with concrete images that illustrate the role of myth in the creation and recreation of local imageries. That is, the figures depicted in the Carnival Parade are more often than not explained in relation to the myth of *Wari*. However, it is not the old myth described by Condarco,\(^{38}\) but the transformed and "Christianised" version that people usually refer to.

It is also notable that while the first version transcribed in this section identifies *Ñusta* with the daughter of the Sun (Dawn, in the second version), all other versions refer to her as an apparition with no link to previously existing local deities. It is stated in the second version that *Ñusta* spoke about a new religion, and in the third version she is identified with the Virgin of the

\(^{37}\) See figure 5.

\(^{38}\) See above, the section on Topographic Imageries.
WARI Y LOS URUS

WARISEMIDOS EN LA MITOLOGÍA ALTIPLANICA, TENÍA EL ATRIBUTO DE LA FUERZA. ERA UN MONSTRUOSO QUE DORMÍA EN LAS ENTRANAS DE LA CORDILLERA QUE MIRABA HACIA EL MAR

DIBUJOS: RAMIRO ORTEGA
LEYENDA: VICENTE TERÁN E.

UN DÍA, SUPÓ QUE LOS HOMBRES ADORABAN A PACHACAMA, REPRESENTADO POR INTI, LUMINOso Y BIENHECtor.

Un día apareció una NUSTA sin explorar su procedencia, tampoco nadie avistó quién ni dónde venía. Era blanca y esbelta.

LA APARECIDA CON DULCE Y PERSUASIVA PALABRA, HABLO A LOS URUS.

Solo Dios sabe en qué lengua se dirigía a aquellas gentes. Les recordó el pasado en que vivieron, sobre la maldad.

LES EXURD PARA QUE RETORNEN AL BIEN, LES PIDIO LA VUELTA HACIA LA BONDAD Y EL AMOR AL SEÑOR, LOS PECHOS Y PERVERSIONES EL ENGAÑO, LAS INMORALIDADES.

LA LUZ ASOMÓ A LAS MENTES DE LOS QUIRIS DE BOMBAR DEL MAL SEVOLVIO OTRA VEZ A REINAR LA PAZ Y ENTONCES LA TRANQUILIDAD A LA COMARCA.

BURLADORES DE WARI, BRAMO DE COLEó DESPERTANDO SUS DESEOS DE VENGANZA. IMAGINO SÉNISTROS PLANES PARA ACABAR CON LOS URUS CON PLAGAS DESTRUCTIVAS. ES QUE ENVIO DE SUS LANZAS...

Figure 5. Wari, with diabolical/Andean features and Nusta with Caucasian features. (source: Terán Erquizia).
Mineshaft. Thus, it is possible to observe a shift in the narrative: Wari’s rage against the Sun God (Inti) is firstly explained in relation to his love for Inti’s daughter (Ñusta). But later Wari is described as jealous and revengeful, enraged by the Urus’ good ways. Similarly, the struggle between Ñusta and Wari is firstly described as taking place within a local pantheon, whereas later it is described as the diabolic nature of Wari combated by an external Ñusta, who is further identified with the Virgin (i.e. the new religion). Such a shift may be linked to a parallel process of strategic religious indoctrination, which might be reinforced through a metamorphosis in the local mythological imagery.

* 

According to Beltrán Heredia (1970a), the Virgin of the Mineshaft gradually evolved into the Saint Patroness of the miners and of their Devil Dance groups which originally used to have cults dedicated to the Uru God Supay.39 The same author asserts that,

"...the first Devil Dance groups originated from the Uru myth of the devil custodians of the subterranean riches [...] The masks, generally ornamented with toads, lizards and snakes were, according to local mythology, the animals that the demigod Huari sent for the destruction of the Urus, the old inhabitants of this Highland site."(Beltrán Heredia1970a: 50,53, my emphases, my translation).

---
39 Another way of designating Wari, see below.
Bullaín suggests an older origin for the Devil Dance, related the agricultural rites of the ancient inhabitants of Tiwanaku, Nazca, and Socotiña:

“Dancers, masked as rogue Supayas performed rites to mother earth as soon as the ulalas bloomed on the ridge of mountains. Under colonialism, the worship of flora was elevated to a Marian veneration. [...] There is no doubt that the master of the Mineshaft festivity is the Devil, whose father was the sly Supaya, and whose grandfather was the restless dancer Aucacallu.” (Bullaín, 1970:41,45, my translation, my emphases).

The unilineal evolutionism evident in the last paragraph does not only tell us about the author’s bias, but also illustrates the general attitude of non-indigenous Bolivians towards pre-colonial religions. Eurocentrism is incorporated in the discourses of social actors at different levels, and it may be argued that it was initiated with the satanisation of local deities.

According to Taussig (1993a), Hahuari is an old version of the term Supay that was used in colonial times, and is still used today to designate the Devil or Tío of the mine. Taussig underlines however that the native inhabitants had no conceptions of a Supreme God and a Supreme Devil, and that the spirit owner of the mines is ambivalent, because it represents both the power of life and the power of death. As the political and economic context changes, so does the ambivalence. New meanings and transformations in the symbolisation and comprehension of the spirit that owns nature emerge with every economic and political change. (Taussig, 1993a:187). However, Tristan
Platt ( ) underlines that the Devil or Tío, as a feature of rural and mining belief systems, is one half of a dualistic symbolic system, complemented by the presence of Pachamama or Earth-Mother, and he is critical of those interpretations (such as Taussig's) that emphasise the relation between the Devil's Cult and the wage-relation within capitalism.

Beltrán Heredia asserts that Supay is a Quechua word that refers to the Devil, a little, solitary and destructive God that inspired fear. But the same author points out the difference between the God of Suffering (Supay) and the Prince of Evil (Satan). Supay rejected Satan's invitation to join him after the locals' defeat by the Spanish invaders, and hid within the cracks of the mountains and the rocks of the underground, becoming ever since the protector of Indians and miners (Beltrán Heredia, 1970b). I would argue that the underground exile of Supay symbolises the clandestine status of pre-colonial religious beliefs and practices (except those interpreted as Catholic rites or disguised in Catholic elements or practices). Rituals directed to Wari were performed in underground temples before the Conquest (Condarco, 1999). It is also suggested that they were later adapted to the (colonial and republican) mining activities in the entrails of the mountains, through the rites offered to Supay and the Tío of the mine. Condarco (op.cit.) establishes a

---

40 Ludovico Bertonio translated hahuari as "ghost" in Aymara, and it has been suggested that it means "soul" in Uru (Condarco, 1999). In the present context, it refers to Wari.

41 Gerald Taylor (1978) suggests that the Quechua word Supay seems to have meant "soul of the dead" or "ancestor", and that the ancestors were transformed into devils, and their home (supaywasi) into hell, by ideological mutation.
difference between a generic Supay and a specialised entity for the mines: the Tío.

Aguilar (1996) argues that the mines became places for refuge and religious resistance, due to the depth of the mineshafts, which made them inaccessible to the missionaries and their policies for extirpación de idolatrías (destruction of idolatries). He also asserts that the Tío is today the entity that has the power to make the minerals accessible for the miners, and suggests that he might actually be a symbolic representation of the Inca, since it was the latter’s religious power that endowed the miners with the necessary moral and material strength for their work (ibid). I am not going to question or support the validity of Aguilar’s suggestions, but would rather point out the general notion of a counter-ideology underlying the presence of Wari, Supay, Tío, and other images observed in the celebration of carnival in Oruro.42

The profusion of different descriptions and names related to similar characters causes much confusion, even amongst local residents who are quite familiarised with the mythological narrative. It should be noticed that while Wari, Supay and Tío refer to the Spirit of the Hills, the two latter terms are most often interpreted in urban contexts in relation to the interior of the mines. I would insist that most of the important transformations in the

---

42 In relation to a counter-ideology, it is also relevant to mention that Harris (1982) and Bouysse and Harris (1987) relate the Devil dance to an Andean rural religious practice that asserts the participation of the dead in the celebrations of the living. Such a practice would contradict the religious beliefs of the Catholic
mythological narrative (reflected in the local imagery in general) refer to the imposition of a strict dichotomy between good and evil. The reduction of ambiguous deities within such a Christian dualism is often associated with processes of “elevation” and “degradation”, a topic to which I shall now turn.

* 

According to Mikhail Bakhtin (1990), “degrading” means bringing close to the earth, as a principle of absorption and birth. This is echoed by the opposite concept of “elevation” within the official discourse on the Oruro Carnival Parade. The transformation of pre-colonial non-Christian festivals into the Catholic celebration of carnival has been described as the worship of flora being “elevated into a Marian veneration” (Bullain, 1970: 42). Some features of local non-Christian ritual elements and practices were considered benign, and apt for an adaptation to the Catholic doctrine, hence the elevation of Nusta or Dawn into the Virgin of the Mineshaft through her estrangement from nature. The inverse movement is observed in the degradation of Wari (the Spirit of the Hills), who is demonised through his confinement in the entrails of the earth.  

---

performers and is therefore generally rejected. This is a highly relevant topic to discuss the origins of the devil dance, but it would demand a central place in an altogether different dissertation.

43 Bakhtin’s notion of degradation as a “bringing close to the earth” will be thoroughly discussed in Chapter Seven.
Condarco (1999) asserts that there were typically malign divinities in the Andes, before the arrival of the Spanish invaders. However, the same author points out the notable similarities between the drawings of Andean Devils (made by the indigenous colonial chronicler Guamán Poma) and those found in European texts of specialised demonology. It is thus suggested that Guamán Poma’s drawings\(^{44}\) were influenced by European imageries of demonology. Non-Catholic divinities have been stigmatised as evil by external agents during the time of the colony, and are still stigmatised (if not veiled) in the present, due to biased processes of translation. But non-Christian local religious practices did not cease to exist, and are performed in the present either under Catholic guise or overtly (e.g. the presence or absence of Christian elements in “traditional” Andean rites). Nevertheless, it must be underlined that urban rites are mainly performed today by mestizos (“racially and culturally mixed people”) which implies ways of conceiving and executing the ceremonies that are clearly differentiated from rural traditional ritual practices.

*  

Liminal regions constitute, according to Bouysse and Harris (1987: 26-27), the domain of the dead amongst the Aymara.\(^{45}\) They are placed at the border

\(^{44}\) See figure .

\(^{45}\) Aymara is a language spoken by different Andean ethnic groups. Although the indigenous language most spoken in the region of Oruro is Quechua, the Aymara influence remains strong. I will not develop upon
of socialised space, up in the mountains, called *Achachilas* ("Grandparents" or "Ancestors"), or in the open and dark depths of great expanses of water. Today, mountains and hills are still considered places for ambiguous forces, within which the powers known by the ancestors are conserved.

"During ch’alla [libation ceremony] - when all deities are invited to drink, and when alcohol is sprinkled drop-by-drop on the floor - Aymara peoples review all the places of their territory name by name, and introduce them into a much wider, powerful space, through the almost endless recitation of every place, every hidden corner where a special power is recognised." (Bouysse and Harris, ibid.:93, my translation).

The term *ch’alla* is also used to designate the libation ceremonies performed by urban settlers in the cities of the Andean region in general. Although there are many variations in the libations performed by people in urban areas (according mainly to their cultural and social background), they are more often than not different from the Aymara rites described by Bouysse and Harris (op. cit.). Carnival Tuesday is the day when the citizens of Oruro (and other Andean cities) perform *ch’allas* for *Pachamama* ("Mother Earth"). It must be noted that the libation ceremony to feed the earth is often also intended to bless the material possessions of urban residents, such as a house, a car, a refrigerator or a computer.

---

the indigenous languages and ritual practices in detail - for my research focused upon urban practices – but it will be relevant to follow Bouysse and Harris’ descriptions for a brief comparison.

Abercrombie (1992) reminds us that for the rural settlers the underground feminine deities inhabit a dangerous space that is sometimes considered demonic. He also points out that in eighteen months of rural fieldwork in the area, he never heard of any libation offered to *Pachamama*, a folkloric deity who, despite inhabiting the underground world of *Wari* and its monsters, is in conflict with them. It is suggested that *Pachamama* is in the vision of the elite a less chaste version of the Virgin, more Indian and earthly.
Nevertheless, Oruro’s urban settlers still perform libation ceremonies for the hills and mountains today, and they are usually directed to the petrified monsters in the sub-urban surroundings. Mythological animals have been incorporated at different levels into the daily life of the city. Toads, condors, snakes, lizards and ants are recurrent topics in carnival imagery, as depicted in its costume and mask designs. Their presence in local topography is not only evidence of the incorporation of the landscape into mythology (or mythology into the landscape), but its importance in ritual activities throughout the year is remarkable.

*  

In the introductory chapter of *Play, Text and Story*, Edward Bruner writes:

"Stories and their sites have a complex relationship. Once a feature of the landscape is named, it is thereafter marked as a special place and distinguished from the unlabeled earth and rock and vegetation that surround it. Without at least a name, there would be no culturally significant site, just raw natural environment. Labels, as cultural artefacts, transform nature into marked, delimited places. (...) Names may construct the landscape but stories make the site resonate with history and experiences. Stories introduce a temporal dimension, making sites the markers of the experiences of groups and historical periods, not just markers of space" (Bruner, 1984:5).

The hills surrounding the city of Oruro are marked by both: history and mythology. As we have seen above, the local hills and mountains received

---

47 There are special ceremonies and elements for blessing a house, most often recognised by both rural and urban settlers.
new names when the city was founded in 1606. Such “christening” reflects
the imposition of new religious beliefs (with its consequent attempt to
“extirpate idolatries”) and the importance of the hills and mountains for the
Spanish invaders. While the European conquerors were attracted by the silver
mines, the indigenous settlers gave different meanings to these sacred places.
Although a new practical use accompanied the changes in the names of local
hills, the latter never lost their multi-semantic value, as people from different
origins interpreted them differently.

The mythological narrative linked to the sacred hills was also transformed
through the development of the Catholic celebration of carnival. Similarly,
the previous contemptuous attitude against the ceremonies enacted at the sites
of the Snake and Toad has been transformed, giving rise to the
implementation of policies to protect the rock formations, as the mythology
embedded in the stones became the official narrative of the Devil Dance.

I will refer here to the more recent versions of the myth of Wari, which
explain certain topographic features through the alleged petrifaction of the
giant snake, toad, lizard and ants. It will be relevant to observe the
transforming attitudes towards these places, in relation to the changes
introduced into the Carnival Parade during the last few decades.

*
As mentioned above, the myth of Wari is embodied in the hills and mountains of Oruro. It is maintained that the monsters were petrified by Ñusta before they reached the town. Nevertheless, the urban expansion of the city resulted in the incorporation of three of them within the city limits. The Snake, which is a long volcanic rock-formation lies in the south, on Asiruni hill, behind the chapel of Chiripujio. The Condor is a rock that stands on a hill in the western side of the city. The ants are sand dunes that move (with the different directions of the wind) in the north-eastern side of town, still outside the urban district. The lizard is a hill on the east that lies also outside the urban site. Finally, there are some black rocks that can be seen in the north, as one enters the city coming from La Paz or Cochabamba. A sculpture of a toad stands next to the rocks, which are the remains of the original Toad that was blown up with dynamite some decades ago.

It is well known in Oruro that the Toad was destroyed following the orders of a local authority, although there are different versions about the time and the specific individual involved. There is also general agreement on the fact that the man who ordered the destruction of the idol died shortly after the event. One interlocutor asserted that his body swelled until it burst, without a single doctor being able to explain the mysterious disease. It is said that before dying, he ordered the construction of the new concrete Toad-idol, which

---

48 Although the Condor is not included in the myth of Wari, Nash (1979) provides a version of the myth linked to this site.
stands in front of the *waka* ("sacred rock") today. It is nevertheless remarkable that *mesas* ("ritual offerings") are mainly offered to the original Toad-rock, while the rites offered to the concrete toad are more superficial and rapid. As I pointed out before, most versions of the events surrounding the myth display individual interests and biases. This may also be observed in the following extractions of my field diary.

* 

Although Tuesdays and Fridays are normally the days of the week for ritual activities in the Andes, people offer rites to the Toad on Ash Wednesday, during carnival season. In the year 2000 I spent the evening of Ash Wednesday at the site of the Toad. As we watched people wrapping streamers around the toad sculpture and the remaining pieces of the petrified monster (while some mesas burned by the foot of the latter), doña Marfa\(^9\) told me what she thought about this place:

"This Toad - she said - is magical. This place is culture, but the municipal authorities don't care about it. They were supposed to leave a whole hectare free, for the construction of a park here".

There were many stalls around the idol, where ladies sold beer, *te con te*, and *sucumbé* (warm alcoholic drinks, made with Singani, a grape spirit). Less than 100 people were squeezed between the walls that surrounded us. The pavement across the street was full of people gathered around ladies selling
chicha (corn beer) and anticuchos (llama heart brochettes with spicy peanut sauce). "Perhaps they could have used the space of a big park (to keep some distance from the cars), but the houses around us seem to be used by people who need this space too" – I thought.

"But the problem is that the authorities sold these lands through illegal loteamientos (division into lots) - she replied. This has always been a special place. There was a Toad with its 3 little frogs. Truck and bus drivers always used to stop here and offer a rite for the Toad, before starting their trips. This would ensure a safe journey. You know, if you see toads and frogs jumping around on the road to Cochabamba, it means it will rain. But around 30 or 40 years ago a military officer49 said 'I'm gonna blow up this damn toad. It's a stupid superstition that only brings up drunkenness and perdition'. And he did blow it up with dynamite. Soon he and his family died. Some decades ago, this ch'alla ["libation ceremony"] was opened by municipal authorities and the bands they brought. It is not happening anymore. As you see, it is all urbanised. The same happens to the Snake and the Condor. But we still come here and offer our rites to the Toad”.

Doña María and her family dance with the Morenada Mejillones, which is a dance group composed mainly by members of the transport trade. When I asked her how the military man’s family died, she told me she did not know. The most probable way for an entire family to die at once must be an accident, and the road La Paz-Oruro/Oruro-Cochabamba is one of the roads with the most casualties in Bolivia. The presence of sacred stones at the end/start of roads is characteristic of the Andes; public transport drivers usually offer at least a few drops of alcohol at these sites, before continuing their journeys.

49 A fictitious name.
I used to see the Toad from the bus, when I came from La Paz with my parents to see the Carnival Parade, in the late sixties and early seventies. It is notorious how the city has expanded during the last three decades, if one thinks that the Toad used to lie outside the city, and now it is a site located in the middle of a popular neighbourhood. It also illustrates the dramatic changes in attitude of the local authorities. While the rites performed at these sites used to worry the authorities in the past, they are now deeply concerned about the gradual disappearance of the Ants (converted into sand dunes by Ñusta, according to the myth of Wari) in Northeast Oruro, due to urban expansion and the use of the sand in construction.51

The two other main topographic features constituting the scenario for ritual activities in the present are the Snake and the Condor. The Snake is the biggest of the petrified monsters within the urban limits of Oruro. It lies behind the chapel of Chirimujio, on the southern side of the city. People used to visit this place not just to perform their ritual offerings, but also to walk in the countryside, as it was part of the rural area. There are usually ladies at the front yard of the chapel, selling incense, coca leafs, cigarettes, sweet wine and the sweet figures that compose the mesa blanca ("ritual offerings"). Now some houses are so near that one can buy everything that is needed, and

50 According to don Francisco Flores Quispe (interviewed on 14 February, 2000), the man was the Commander of the Camacho Regiment.
51 La Razón, La Paz 20 December, 1998.
borrow glasses for the beer from the house next door. A couple - who kindly invited me once to join them - commented that there should be limits to the urban expansion, because the site is being encroached by the construction of houses.

When talking about the Condor, doña Marfa said:

"You know, the custom of people taking pieces of rocks with them as charms in the Fiesta de Urupiña\(^\text{52}\) was originated in the San Felipe hill. People used to take stones below the condor as charms here. Until one day part of the hill collapsed."\(^\text{53}\)

I remembered Amilcar (an anthropology graduate student at the local University) telling me about his friend whose foot was injured for life when offering a mesa for the condor. "He was offering a mesa ("ritual offer") to have some chance in life, he was really economically miserable then - Amilcar said – but he has been a very lucky and prosperous man ever since".

The hills surrounding the city have been incorporated within the general imagery of the Oruro Carnival Parade. Apart from being used as popular landmarks for spatial orientation, they constitute special places for the enactment of libation ceremonies. The petrified monsters are also depicted in the dancers' costumes and masks. As it will be discussed in the following chapters, the petrified monsters are also depicted in the dancers' costumes

\(^{52}\) A similar pilgrimage-festivity in the city of Quillacollo, in the department of Cochabamba.

\(^{53}\) Later on, during the weekend I observed that some people keep on taking stones from the San Felipe hill.
and masks, as space, pace and myth are reinterpreted and intertwined through the dance performances.

***
THREE

THE OFFICIAL CELEBRATION OF CARNIVAL

According to Hyman (2000), modern carnival is generically divided in the officially sanctioned spectator events, and the more communal, sometimes anarchic activities of the people. It is possible to observe both instances in the development of the Carnival Parade in Oruro. The institutions in charge of the organisation of the official celebration (i.e. the Church, the *Asociación de Conjuntos del Folklore de Oruro* [ACFO]) often have to struggle against the encroachment of transgressive-carnivalesque behaviour upon the realm of the sacred-official.

In what follows I will provide a general description of the official discourse on the *Entrada* or Carnival Parade, and of the institutions involved in its organisation, regulations and actual "controlled performance." I will return to the latter in the following chapters, to compare the images of the official carnival to those of the grotesque body incorporated into the popular celebrations.

The Official Discourse on Carnival

"The Carnival of Oruro – a splendid metaphor of the popular spirit’s profound vein – is the most accomplished paradigm of what the creativity of the people may achieve, when artistic sensibility is paired by a rich and refined millenary religious feeling. The transculturation produced by the encounter between the Spaniards and the Andean Native Peoples was the genitive agent of the complex religious syncretism expressed in myths, rites, choreography and the exalted spiritual passion of the city of Oruro". (Edgar Bazán
Ortega, Mayor of the City of Oruro; March 2000. My translation)

The paragraph above (extracted from the Welcome Note signed by the Municipal Mayor of the City of Oruro in the Programme for the Carnival Parade 2000) illustrates some features of the official discourse on the Carnival Parade. It is usually described in terms of a religious syncretism. Nevertheless, the Catholic nature of the rites and the procession is always underlined. The excessive use of epithets seems to be a characteristic feature of the official discourse on carnival, which is not confined to the oratory of public figures (like the Mayor or Alcalde, quoted above), but is also embodied in the formal language (written or spoken) generally used by Orureños in reference to the religious nature of the festivity. Let us consider the welcome notes signed by the President of the Asociación de Conjuntos del Folklore de Oruro (ACFO) in the official programmes for the years 1998 and 1999:

“The High Land of the Urus - cultural synthesis of America - opens its doors to the pilgrims of the world. We invite them to witness the main vernacular festivity of Bolivia in honour to the Virgin of the Mineshaft, patroness of the Orureños who express their devotion through a multi-chromatic complex of folkloric and autochthonous dances that epitomise the cultural identity of our nation. The dancers and the people in general express their religious credo to the Patroness of National Folklore, through the magic and colourfulness of the magnificent Carnival of Oruro” (Walter Zambrana B. ACFO’s official programme 1998. My translation).

It is relevant to observe how this paragraph starts by mentioning the Urus and the vernacular nature of the festivity, to then underline the devotion to the Virgin of the Mineshaft (as Patroness of National Folklore) and the
expression of the cultural identity of the nation. Accordingly, the construction of a "national cultural identity"—through the incorporation (and re-interpretation) of certain indigenous elements in the Catholic celebration of carnival— is often stressed by the official discourse. The cultural diversity that exists within the political frontiers of the country is often said to be epitomised in the musical, choreographic and iconographic representations enacted in carnival. It is often asserted that different "cultures" and "races" merge around the unifying image of the Virgin of the Mineshaft. The official discourse thus underlines the important role of the Catholic Church in the creation of a national cultural identity and the central place of Oruro in the process.

"Women and men of many bloods, of many races and colours, but united in a single heart by the faith in the Virgin of the Mineshaft. The High Land of the Urus receives with open arms all pilgrims of the world, who arrive brandishing the banners of friendship. Oruro - religious telluric centre since time immemorial – welcomes you. Do participate of the colourfulness of the festivity in movement, of the ancestral tradition of Huari, the Toad and the ants, of the religious pilgrimage mixed with human warmth. Enjoy the greatest expression of Faith and Culture in the whole world!" (Walter Zambrana B. ACFO's official programme 1999. My translation).

Here the "vernacular" nature of the festivity is also related to the Urus and to the city as a telluric religious centre, with the presence of Wari, the Toad and the Ants. Nevertheless, the central role of the Catholic celebration of carnival is stressed again in this paragraph - which goes beyond suggesting a national unity around the image of the Virgin, to affirm the incorporation of people from all over the world into the
devotion of the Madonna.¹ I would suggest that this also illustrates the
degree to which the cultural complexity of the country is oversimplified
by the official discourse: it is often stressed that the cultures of the
different peoples who inhabit Bolivia are represented in the Entrance or
Carnival Parade of Oruro. Nevertheless, the representations enacted in the
Entrada are more often than not performed by urban mestizos ("mixed
blood"); they are urban interpretations of the "Cultural Other", within a
process of construction of a "national cultural identity".² This is a source
of pride for Bolivians in general, but particularly for the local
representatives of the official discourse.

* *

Perhaps the pomposity of the official discourse has been enhanced by the
presentation of the Oruro Carnival as a candidate to become Cultural Oral
and Intangible Heritage of Humanity. According to Zulma Yugar³, and as
mentioned in the Introduction, UNESCO has been working for the last 20
years on the development of a legal framework to address issues related to
intangible, immaterial and oral manifestations of Traditional and Popular
Cultures. Although I will not discuss UNESCO's international policies, it
might be relevant to consider some of the factors that triggered the
presentation of the Oruro Carnival for such an important recognition. Mrs.

¹ Needless to say, the ethnocentrism characteristic of local fanaticism is expressed in the last sentence
above.
² As it will be discussed in the following chapters, the representation of the Cultural Other refers to a
pre-existing image of what the Other might or should be, rather than what they "actually are". Peter
Mason (1990) provides a discussion based on visual-historical information on this particular topic, in
relation to the images of alterity during the Spanish conquest of America.
Yugar explained that the chance emerged when the concept of Oral and Intangible heritage was approved by the UNESCO executive board in 1997, while she was still the Bolivian National Secretary of Cultural Promotion. As a famous local singer and a proud Orureña, she told me that she always loved her city and its carnival, and this was a unique opportunity for her to do something in favour of both of them.

On the other hand, it must be noted that the festival’s international recognition followed a series of national declarations. In 1968 popular culture was nationalised by the Bolivian State, through the presidential decree number 08396 signed by René Barrientos. In 1970 the government of Hugo Banzer issued a number of regulations to register and produce inventories of the various dances and musical genres classified as “folkloric”, declaring - through a new presidential decree - the city of Oruro as “Folklore Capital of Bolivia” (Guerra Gutierrez, quoted by Goldstein, 1998). However, which were the specific historical factors that gave rise to these official policies?

As it will be illustrated in the discussion of the spatial enactment of carnival\(^4\), the transformation of the festival’s image in the eyes of the upper middle classes started after the Chaco War (1932-1935) against Paraguay. Formerly rejected as an “Indian affair”, the carnival became a space for the upper middle classes to adopt, transform and appropriate the celebrations, in an attempt to construct a Bolivian cultural identity. This

\(^3\) Interviewed on 17 August 2000 in La Paz.
\(^4\) See Chapter Five.
slow process of transformation\textsuperscript{5} probably reached its peak with the current overwhelming participation of the upper middle classes, and the recognition of UNESCO in 2001.

The need of a national unity during the post-Chaco War period played a central role in the movement to construct a national cultural identity - through the incorporation of indigenous features into the ideal imageries of the nation (i.e. “Indigenism”). However, one can identify tensions between different sectors of society - defined according to a wide range of factors, such as class, culture, region, neighbourhood and even dance group – and changes in the features adopted for the definition of Self-identities. It is also notable that the cultural pride about carnival is manifested at different levels, according to specific circumstances; Bolivians in general are proud of the festival when they are abroad, but \textit{Orureños} claim it as their own heritage in Bolivia. At a local level, Devil dancers are proud to perform the oldest and most traditional dance of carnival, while the \textit{Mañazos} (the fraternity of Butchers) claim that they are the oldest Devil-Dance group of Oruro.

\textbf{*}

Mrs. Yugar expressed her deep concern regarding the necessity of a world-wide recognition of the local origin of the traditions that are materialised during the Oruro Carnival Parade. She stressed the fact that

\textsuperscript{5} It took more then half a century for the dominating upper middle classes to transform and appropriate the Carnival Parade, from the post-Chaco War period to the end of the twentieth century.
the scope of this festivity transcends the local level, to reach national and international importance. She underlined—as she did during an informal conversation before, and as it is stressed in the official discourse in general—the necessity to struggle against plagiarism or cultural pillage by neighbouring countries.

The presence of Devil Dancers in other countries’ festivities is often pointed out as an instance of plagiarism, mainly in relation to the closest neighbour: Chile. There are Devil Dancers in the festivity of Nuestra Señora del Carmen in Paucartambo-Cusco, Peru. Nevertheless, they belong to the Andean tradition of Saqra Danzantes, discussed by Cánepa-Koch (1998) and Gisbert (1999). The Chilean case is often used as an example of cultural pillage. A parody was introduced into the Corso or Sunday Carnival Parade in Oruro the year 2000, with the presence of a farcical dance group called La Diablada Chilena. The dancers who performed this “Chilean Devil Dance” exhibited endless ridiculous features (both in the choreography and their costumes) that were quickly identified by the public in general who reacted with laughter. However, serious reflections upon the necessity to struggle against “cultural pillage” followed, given the nationalist tone of the official discourse on carnival.

* *

---

6 There is a general animosity against Chile, the country that deprived Bolivia an access to the Pacific Ocean in 1879. Some people say that Bolivia was defeated in the War of the Pacific because everybody was drinking and celebrating carnival when the Chilean invasion took place.
The Asociación de Conjuntos del Folklore de Oruro (ACFO) also expressed its aspiration for the Carnival Parade to be declared Cultural Intangible Heritage of Humanity, and its determination to prevent plagiarism:

"Gifted with a high civic sentiment we express our total rejection of the cultural pillaging of our expressions, such as the Diablada, Morenada, Caporales, Tobas, Pujllay, etc. Dances of Bolivian origin, expressions of the Carnival of Oruro, jewels of our culture that, despite being presented as expressions of other countries, will never be properly imitated nor will they display the telluric contents they enclose" (Ascanio Nava Secretary of relations ACFO. Extracted from the ACFO’s official magazine for the Carnival Parade 1999, page 5. My translation).

As mentioned before, the official discourse usually refers to both, the telluric and the Catholic aspects of the Oruro Carnival Parade. Nevertheless, it tends to emphasise the latter, and the construction of a national Bolivian identity through the expression of the official religious faith. It also stresses the centrality of Oruro regarding “national folklore”. In fact the acronym “ACFO”, that used to stand for Asociación de Conjuntos Folklóricos de Oruro (“Association of Folkloric Groups of Oruro”) now stands for Asociación de Conjuntos del Folklore de Oruro (“Association of Groups of Oruro’s Folklore”). The subtle change in the Spanish name of the institution retains the old abbreviation, but it implies a shift in the noun affected by the possessive interjection de (“of”). While the original name affirmed that the folkloric groups belonged to Oruro, the

---

7 In newspaper articles and general discussions about the role of the institutions in charge of organising the Entrada or Carnival Parade.
new name suggests that the folklore displayed in carnival belongs to Oruro.  

The Events

The celebration of carnival starts officially the first Sunday of November after All Saints day, in a ceremony called Primer Convite. It coincides with the first official rehearsal of the dance groups, when all dancers have to complete the full route of the Entrada, or Carnival Parade. Upon their arrival to the chapel, those wearing head-dresses, helmets and hats take them off, and all dancers kneel in front of the altar. The priest delivers a short speech and takes the new dancers’ vows, which refer to their commitment to dance for the Virgin of the Mineshaft for at least three consecutive years. After the short ceremony, they are invited to go, still on their knees, around the altar and pass under the image of the Virgin. The musicians play a diana, a particular tune reserved for this event, and follow the dancers to complete the route around the altar, also on their knees. When the dancers, musicians and other members of the group reach the end of the shrine, they never turn their backs to the Madonna, they walk backwards down a few stairs, cross themselves and turn around only when they leave the chapel.

---

8 In an interview with Walter Zambrana, the President of ACFO, he stressed the fact that his institution does not recognise dance groups from other cities, only dancers (who then have to be integrated into an Oruro dance group).
Given that the number and variety of events developed during the carnival season may cause some confusion, the reader can identify in the Chart provided in Appendix 1 the specific events described and referred to in this dissertation.\(^{10}\)

In the remaining space of this chapter I will describe certain aspects of important events, like the Primer and Ultimo Convites, the Candlemas Procession, the Entrada and the Corso de Carnaval. In the following chapters I will provide a discussion of different issues (spatial behaviour, temporal perception, mimetic and meta-mimetic practices) involved in the construction of imageries through these major events.

* 

I have witnessed Convites, Veladas and Entradas for many years during my childhood and youth, but the actual anthropological field research that preceded the writing of this dissertation started on Saturday November the 10\(^{th}\) 1997, on the eve of the Primer Convite for Carnival 1998. That evening, after arriving from La Paz, I decided to have a meal and drink a few beers in the Bar Huari, known as a popular place for drinking ice cold Huari Beer and playing cacho (a dice game). When I was drinking the last

\(^9\) The tune is best known as A tus pies Madre ("at your feet, Mother"), which is the most popular version of it.
beer after my supper, a couple of guys entered the bar making a lot of noise, one of them looked at me and started singing an old *Iracundos* song. I was impressed by his voice, that clearly resembled that of the late lead singer of the famous pop group. He laughed at my compliment and sat next to me, while his companion joined us without saying a word.

Arturo (the singer) looked at me and said: “If you love something, set it free. If it’s yours it will return to you and if it doesn’t it never was”. “Write it down” - he said, pointing at my diary, which I had on the table at the moment – “one day you will find it useful”. He asked if I would share a beer with them, and I agreed. We asked for two more bottles and spoke about the *Primer Convite*, which was going to take place the next day.

I asked Arturo about where I could find any directions for visiting a *Velada*, and he suggested to go to the *Mañazos’ Kermesse* (Food Faire) which was taking place at the Avenida Cívica, near the Virgin’s Chapel.

Arturo’s friend started speaking, but I could not understand what he was saying. Besides being completely drunk, he was speaking Russian. Arturo explained to me that this Russian young man had been living in Oruro for a while, but never learned to speak Spanish fluently. After a few attempts to speak to me, he grabbed my diary and wrote three words, which I have not been able to decipher for years. I met Arturo again when I was gathering final information about the Carnival Parade 2000, before returning to the UK. He was working at the *Alcaldía* (the Municipality),

---

10 The chart in Appendix 1 is based on the official programme for the Oruro Carnival Parade 2000, and it takes into consideration the most important events that take place every year. Some events occur in a slightly different order in different years, but the chart displays the general chronology.

11 Uruguayan Pop Music group, popular in the seventies.
and provided me with some statistical data. When I asked about his Russian friend, he told me he had died some time ago, apparently of alcoholic intoxication.\footnote{I finally made some sense of the Russian young man’s words on my diary: \textit{Ego is frito} which in a mixture of Latin, English and local Spanish slang probably meant “I’m fried” or “I’m fucked up”.
}

I arrived at the \textit{Mañazos’} Food Faire when the vendors were already putting everything away, but I managed to speak to a few people, who invited me to a \textit{Velada} organised by the \textit{Gran Tradicional Auténtica Diablada Oruro} (or \textit{Mañazos}) in a house on Av. Brazil. The \textit{Velada} is a meeting organised by the different dance groups, with the presence of the image of the Virgin. People gather around the image of the Virgin, to pray and sing, “chewing” coca leaves, smoking cigarettes and drinking \textit{ponches} and \textit{te con tes}.\footnote{Hot alcoholic beverages; the first one is made out of condensed milk and the second one of tea with lemon. Both are mixed with \textit{Singani}, a typical Bolivian grape spirit.} Sometimes funds are pooled during the \textit{Velada} through the organisation of a raffle, to help covering different costs related to the organisation of meetings, practices, and so on. The first \textit{Velada} of the Carnival season takes place the evening before the \textit{Primer Convite}.

There were nine people sitting on the chairs placed against the walls, at the \textit{Velada} improvised by the \textit{Mañazos}. The image of the Virgin occupied the central space. Don Lizandro García, who had been the president of the \textit{Mañazos} for 12 years and has been a member of the institution for the last 32 years, told me that their image of the Virgin was the richest one in Oruro. He explained that there was no \textit{pasante} (“ritual sponsor”) that year, and that the Union of Butchers and the \textit{cofradía} (“fraternity”) took the
responsibility of passing the celebration. The pasantes are the couple who will take care of the image of the Virgin for the next year, taking responsibility at the same time of much of the costs related to the organisation of Veladas, Ensayos (Practices), Convites, and other meetings of the group. Every Dance Group has an image of the Virgin, and every year a different couple takes care of it. According to Don Lizandro, letting the image go is such a sad experience for the pasantes couple that in many cases there were fights between the new and old ritual sponsors, influenced by inebriation. The change of the pasantes couple takes place on the day of the Devil (Carnival Monday) through a ceremony in which a duplicate image of the Virgin is passed from one couple to their successors. The woman receives the image of the Virgin and the man receives the banner of the group.

I noticed that the Velada of the Mañazos was a quiet and intimate affair. Everybody knew each other well, and they all were aware of my presence. Some children peered at me from behind the door, and I shared some Singani, coca leaves and cigarettes with my interlocutors, while I carried out an interview with Don Lizandro (the contents of which will be discussed in the next chapter). When I was returning to my hotel, I saw many people gathered in the headquarters of the Morenada Central (another dance group), on Avenida 6 de Agosto, and I decided to see if I could participate in their Velada. As I was entering the building, some youngsters approached me and gave me some voting pamphlets, as the
election of a new board of the institution (Morenada Central) happened to be taking place at the same time of the Velada.

I looked for the room where the image of the Virgin was and, as I went in, I immediately realised that this was a completely different Velada from the one I was coming from. The room was very long. I thought that it must have been around ten times bigger than the place where the Mañazos were keeping their Madonna. The shrine had velvet curtains and the Virgin was illuminated with spotlights. There were some posters on the walls, one was an advertisement for Singani San Pedro, La Genuina Bebida Boliviana (“The Genuine Bolivian Drink”), and another one was advertisement for one of the candidates for the presidency of the group.

Considering the size of the room and the crowd gathered outside, I noticed that there were very few people in the Velada itself, but I cannot assume from this that the members of this group give less attention or importance to their image of the Virgin. I probably arrived too late for this Velada, and more in time for the election and the celebrations surrounding it. Out in the patio there were small groups gathered in circles, most of them laughing and drinking. A guy asked me whom I was going to vote for, and I explained my situation. As they realised that I was doing research, he and his 3 friends invited me to drink with them, and one of them took his jumper off, to show me his muscular biceps. “He is the local Body Building Champion”, said one of his friends, “you can stay at my place” said another one. I thanked him for the offer and explained that I already
had a place to stay. They emphasised then that I could visit their houses anytime, and that I was welcome to stay with them during carnival. I told them how I really appreciated the offer, being aware that during the week of carnival it is very difficult to find a place to stay.

Despite the differences in number of participants and the size of the buildings where they took place, in both Veladas I was treated with great warmth and hospitality. The creation of an open and receptive space during the Veladas in general is also illustrative of certain openness characteristic of the celebration of carnival in the city of Oruro.

* 

Early in the morning the next day (Sunday 11 November 1997), musicians, dancers and other members of the dance groups gathered in the corner Villarroel – 6 de Agosto, which is the starting place for the Convites ("rehearsals") and the Entrada (Carnival Parade). The group that always opens the first Convite and the Entrada is the Mañazos or Gran Tradicional Auténtica Diablada Oruro, which is the oldest Devil dance group, founded before any other dance group of Oruro.14

The Mañazos were all wearing their practice uniforms, which consist of white shirts and dark trousers. Some leaders wore also Vicuña shawls. All

---

14 The hierarchical position of the dance groups that participate in the Carnival Parade is thus related to their place in the programme, according to their antiquity. This has given rise to a proliferation of disputes around the proper order (and the correct hierarchical position) of some dance groups, which in
the devil dancers were holding a red handkerchief on the right hand, and a blue handkerchief on the left hand, which helped to mark the compass as they marched or jumped to either side. The *Mañazos* took around 3 hours to reach the chapel from the starting point. They all looked very tired (some exhausted) by the time they entered the church. The priest welcomed the dancers and gave them a brief speech about the importance of their devotion, and about the central place of the Virgin of the Mineshaft in the celebration of Carnival. Then he took the vows of the new dancers who promised to dance for the Virgin and to be committed to participate in the Pilgrimage for the following three years. After the brief ceremony, the priest invited the group to go around, and pass under the image of the Virgin. The musicians prepared their instruments and the leader gave the guiding tune to start the performance of the musical piece that frames this emotive moment. All the dancers passed under the Image of the Virgin on their knees, looking up to her, crossing themselves, and many of them crying.

The eight dance groups that participated in the *Primer Convite* in 1997 (in preparation for the Carnival Parade 1998) were:

1. *Gran Tradicional Auténtica Diablada Oruro* (or *Mañazos*).
2. *Morenada Zona Norte*.
3. *Conjunto Folklórico Caporales Ignacio León*.
4. *Morenada Central* (or *Morenada de abajo*).

some cases involve fights at the starting point of the *Entrada*. This will be discussed in the next chapter.
5. *Conjunto Folklórico Tobas Zona Sud.*


7. *Fraternidad Artística y Cultural la Diablada (Fraternidad or Frater)*

8. *Fraternidad Morenada Central Fundada por la Comunidad Cocanis (or Cocanis).*

The new dancers of other groups took their vows during the following weekends, and all of them confirmed their vows during the *Segundo Convite*, which takes place a week before the Carnival Parade. Within the four months between the *Primer Convite* and the *Entrada*, there are several activities organised by the different dance groups. They usually practise at night during the week and in the daytime during the weekends. The streets of the city are often blocked, to facilitate the dance practices. There are also fairs, raffles, parties, *veladas*, and other activities related mainly to the collection of funds for the different dance groups.

*  

According to the Official Programme of the City Hall, the celebration of Carnival started in 1998 on Sunday January the 18th, with a formal salutation celebrating the 35th anniversary of the ACFO. On Sunday 1 February, the *Procesion de Cirios* or Candle Parade was programmed to start at 5 p.m. This is a special event dedicated solely to the image of the Virgin of the Mineshaft, also known as *Virgen de la Candelaria* (or “Virgin of Candlemas”) in whose honour a tumultuous procession takes
Figure 6. Procesión de Cirios, or Candle Procession.
place. Over 20,000 candles were lit in 1999, and carried by the devotees following the image of the Virgin. Prayers and ovations were dedicated to the image of the Virgin at different points of the route, where improvised shrines had been erected by the neighbours. The procession started at the chapel and returned to it after travelling through different central streets of the city. The next day (February the 2nd) is the day of the Virgin, when a special mass is dedicated to her and her image is incorporated into another procession through a specially constructed archway. A similar event takes place on Carnival Monday, when the dance groups' replicas of the Madonna are taken in a short procession through an archway. The latter is constructed by several members of the different dance groups, which are usually identified in small banners or stamps attached to the side-walls by safety pins.

On Sunday February the 8th 1998, there was a final practice through the whole route, before the last full-route rehearsal or Ultimo Convite. The Ultimo Convite for the Carnival Parade 1998 took place on Sunday 15 February 1998. This last Convite, which occurs a week before the Entrada (Carnival Parade), could be considered a more complete performance than the first, since all members of the dance groups participate, making it a much more tumultuous event. Some dancers who could not make it for the first Convite may join in the second one. After months of practising, all the dance groups are ready for the Carnival Parade, and many visitors are already arriving for the main event. Some local interlocutors told me that

15 See figure 6.
they prefer to watch the last Convite than the Entrada, because it is not as crowded and there are many chances to observe the choreographic performances without paying any money for a place on the rows of seats. Usually most of the tiers have already been constructed by the time the last Convite takes place.

* 

The following Thursday, after the Ultimo Convite, the Anata Andina or “Andean Carnival” takes place. This is a dance parade performed by representatives of the surrounding provinces of the department’s rural areas.\textsuperscript{16} This event, organised by the Federación Sindical Unica de Trabajadores Campesinos del Sur de Oruro (FSUTCSO, the Union of Peasant workers of the Southern part of the Department of Oruro), constitutes to some an opening or a preamble for the week of celebrations that reaches its peak the following weekend. Nevertheless, the Anata Andina\textsuperscript{17} is a separate and very different event altogether. All the dancers come from the rural areas of the department, carrying samples of their products. According to Olivia Harris (1982), Anata - which means in Aymara “the time of play” - is also known by the Aymara-speaking Laymi as the feast of the devils (in reference to the spirits of the ancestors) and the festival of First Fruits.

\textsuperscript{16} See figure 7.
La cultura ancestral es paradigma de los pueblos originarios. En la foto, una delegación de Pakajes, presente en la Anata Andina.

Figure 7. Anata Andina (Source: La Patria, 4 March, 2000).
“As the festival of First Fruits it is a time for rites of increase; armfuls of wild flowers are collected and placed on the houses, the ritual altars, in the animal corrals and in the ritual bundles carried by individual sponsors of the feast” (Harris, 1982: 57).

Although the *Anata Andina* performed in Oruro finishes at the Avenida Civica, which is the site of the last set of stalls on the route for the *Entrada*, the dancers do not enter the chapel. Moreover, during the *Anata Andina* was the only time when I ever saw the gates of the church shut during daytime. This particular celebration, which seems to have been strengthened during the last years, may resemble the old celebration of Carnival, when it was considered an *Indian* affair.18

The groups that participate at the *Anata Andina* are not “dance groups”, but communities. They do not seem to dance for any spectators. This may be observed in different aspects of their performance. Firstly, they are all under the effect of alcohol, carrying proudly their own bottles of drink.19 Although they follow specific patterns during their performance, such patterns do not constitute a choreography to be observed from the outside, but rather a communal/ritual enactment to be perceived and lived from the inside. There is a mixture of seriousness and playfulness in their dances: they seem to be playful with each other, but do not appreciate at all the presence of spectators carrying cameras. I have seen dancers telling some tourists off, when they wanted to take pictures of them. This is in

17 According to Harris (1982), *Anata* – which means in Aymara “the time of play” - is also known by the Aymara speaking Laymi as the feast of the devils, the Aymara name for Carnival
19 Most probably pure alcohol.
complete contrast to the attitude of the *Entrada* (or Carnival Parade) dancers, who are very keen on being photographed and filmed.

The *Anata Andina* dancers who wear costumes do not seem to be in competition with each other, and their fancy dresses are in most cases a mixture of the remaining parts of old costumes, corresponding to different folkloric dances. In contrast, most of the other dancers wear elegant dresses that should not be called “costumes”, although some of these dresses are imitated and re-presented by the urban performers during the *Entrada* as costumes. I also observed the use of sunglasses, particularly by a group of old ladies during the *Anata Andina* 2000. I found it ironic that the *coolness* of the dancers wearing sunglasses during the *Entrada* was somehow mocked by the old ladies during the *Anata Andina*.

The representatives of the ACFO gave a special prize\(^{20}\) to the community that was perceived as the “best dance” at the *Anata Andina* 2000. These acts seemed to be directed to include more formally the *Anata Andina* into the city’s carnival celebrations, but the rural visitors never stopped displaying a general sense of liminality in relation to the official celebration of carnival taking place in the urban setting. After their performances, the communities gathered on the spacious opening at the foot of the chapel. Many of them had brought their own foods to celebrate an *ajthapi* or “communal meal”, while others shared some of the dishes served by ladies in the kiosks by the temple.

\(^{20}\) A type writer.
Later that evening I saw some of the communities dancing towards the East, where the roads to their villages start. They took different routes in their return, which caused some extra disorder and traffic congestion in the city. I noticed again that all of them were inebriated, a state that might have accumulated over several days.

A Verbena or “street party” was programmed for Friday March the 3rd 2000. However, the eve of Carnival Saturday coincided then with the first Friday of the month, a special day for libation ceremonies offered to the Snake and Toad.\textsuperscript{21} I went to Chiripujio, to buy a mesa (ritual offering), some coca leaves, cigarettes and sweet wine to offer to the snake. When I heard the noise as soon as I arrived to the bus stop, I realised that there were many outsiders at the site. These ceremonies are usually a very quiet and familiar affair. People gather to share and reflect upon their worries, fears, and expectations, offering the Snake (or the Pachamama –“Mother Earth”) a mesa, some coca, alcohol and cigarettes. I was expecting to find many people offering rituals to the snake that particular evening, but I did not foresee that so many teenage outsiders would be at the site. While I was preparing the fire for my offerings\textsuperscript{22} by the mouth of the Snake, some gentlemen and ladies offered me some beer and cigarettes. I must say that every time I go to these sites on Tuesdays or Fridays I meet such friendly

\textsuperscript{21} Every first Tuesday and Friday of the month are particularly good days for libations in the Andes.
and generous attitudes from the locals. I am used to going there on my
own, which is not the proper thing to do, since it is usually expected that
couples or families offer their libations together. However, this is often
solved by the couples or families gathered around the site inviting me to
join them. The youngsters gathering at the site that evening were
particularly noisy and boisterous. “They are too drunk” - said one of the
ladies. “They don’t know how to drink” - said her husband, who served
me some more beer. After sharing a few beers and watching my offerings
burn completely, I returned to the city centre. There I walked around the
main streets, where some neighbours were finishing building their stalls.
Others were dancing on the streets, following the rhythm of different
groups along the Avenida del Folklore, the first main avenue of the
Carnival Parade Route. The festive atmosphere had already been
established for the Great Entrada.

* 

The Entrada which takes place on Carnival Saturday, starts officially at
6:00 am, when the groups that open the parade must already be at the
starting point - where Av. Villarroel and Av. Del Folklore meet - in
readiness for the main event. The parade itself does not usually start
before 7:00am, when the policemen guarding the leading authorities turn
their sirens on and start patrolling the Av. del Folklore with their
motorcycles. The Procession is led by representatives of the Catholic

---

22 I usually buy a mesa or ritual offer at the entrance of the Chiripujio chapel (by the foot of the hill), as
I do not have an appropriate knowledge to create my own mesa.
Church carrying an image of the Virgin and a large silver recipient containing burning incense. The smoke is aired to the sides by the altar boy who carries the incense receptical, moving it like a pendulum.

The representatives of the church are followed by the official authorities who walk side by side, following the ladies who carry the ACFO’s image of the Virgin. The marching authorities may include some special guests, but they invariably include the President of ACFO (and other representatives of the leading folkloric association), the Municipal Mayor and the Prefect of the Department. While the church, departmental and ACFO authorities march, the bands and dance groups remain at the starting point, ready and waiting to start dancing. The opening of the Dancing Parade is marked by the cymbals. The fast rhythm of the Diablada opens every year the Entrada. Every dance group is preceded by their image of the Virgin and their cargamentos. Devil dancers are seen all dressed up, marking the rhythm with their spurs and colourful handkerchiefs. Most cross themselves before starting to dance and the nervousness of the new dancers is mixed with excitement and joy. The beginning of the Dance Parade is usually marked by the sobriety of both

23 While the Mayor is the highest authority elected by the inhabitants of the city, the Prefect is the highest departmental authority, appointed by the central government.
24 An exception was made in Carnival 2000, when a whole block of new dance groups was introduced before the main first group. I was first shocked to hear some lowlands music leading the Gran Entrada de Oruro, but later I realised it was only a way to give some visiting authorities time to have the chance to see the Maiiazos and the other oldest dance groups. This will be discussed in the following chapters.
25 The cargamentos are considered the offerings of the dancers for their image of the virgin. They usually consist of silverware and other valuable objects displayed on an ornamented car. In the past, there used to be more cargamentos (carried by ornamented mules) than dancers, but most dance groups display only one or two cargamentos in the present. However, some dance groups also use mules in the present. See figure 8.
Figure 8. A Cargamento of a devil-dance group. Note the image of the virgin on top of the car approaching the Temple of the Madonna, the snake and lizard on the devil-mask on the back of the car, and the cargamento mules (in the “old fashion”) by the temple.
the dancers and the public. This usually progresses into a more chaotic event with the flow of time. The Av. Del Folklore is not very crowded at the early hour when the \textit{Entrada} begins. This changes progressively to reach a point where it is very difficult to cross it, or find seats in the area by midday.

After covering the whole length of Av. del Folklore (11 streets from North to South), the procession turns to the West on Calle Bolivar. The number of streets crossed on Calle Bolivar may change from year to year. In 1998, for example the Parade turned to the North on La Plata (after 6 streets), to turn West again on Calle A. Mier, and then South again on Presidente Montes. Then it returned to Bolivar facing West, before arriving to Av. Cívica and the Temple. In 2000, the procession did not turn to the North on La Plata, but one street further West, on Presidente Montes, and the last straight stretch facing West covered A. Mier, instead of Bolivar. There are certain places that the procession invariably covers, like Av. del Folklore, Plaza 10 de Febrero (the main Square where the Prefecture Building and the Town Hall are), Av. Cívica and, finally, the Temple of the Virgin.

Av. Del Folklore is a favourite one of the locals, for its width and length enables the groups to develop complex choreographic moves, with the

\footnote{Although there are parties the night before, most people manage to stay sober and go to sleep not too late, to be ready for the weekend. Some however stay up until very late, working on details for their costumes (sewing sequins on their hats, or putting rattles on their boots, for example).}

\footnote{See the Plan of the City, figure 9.}
Figure 9. The City of Oruro.

- To the Old Mine
- Central Square
- Temple of the Sun
Devil Dancers being the first ones to exhibit their complex spatial figures. The narrow calle Bolivar does not allow for the performance of complex choreography, but the numbers and strength of dancers and musicians are enhanced by the enclosed environment. Plaza 10 de Febrero is another place for special choreography, particularly at the foot of the Prefecture Building, where all national and international authorities are gathered. A. Mier is another narrow street that enables a different appreciation of the dances. Finally, there is the Av. Cívica, where all groups make their last special performance before entering the temple. The Devil Dancers perform a Relato, a dramatised dialogue between the forces of good and evil on Av. Cívica.

Most dancers are exhausted by the time they enter the Temple. Although the first and second Convites also demand a tremendous stamina from the dancers, they usually carry much more weight and wear less comfortable shoes during the Entrada. Once in the chapel, the dance groups follow a similar pattern to that of the Convites. They listen to the priest's speech and go around the altar to pass under the image of the Virgin on their knees. After resting for a while outside the chapel, most dance groups go to their own special parties, to celebrate until early in the morning, when they join the thousands of people dancing and waiting for the sun (or the morning star) to rise. This is the rite of greeting Dawn or Alba.

---

28 There have been many changes in the route of the Carnival parade during the last decades. This will be discussed in Chapter Five.
29 See figure 10.
Figure 10. Devil dancers on their knees in front of the Madonna.
It takes most groups between 3 and 4 hours to cover the whole route (approximately 3.5 Km), but due to delays, congestion and other contingencies, the schedules are never kept rigidly in the end. In 1998, for example, the last group to participate in the Entrada was supposed to start their performance at 8:00 pm, but they did not arrive at the chapel before 2:00 am on Sunday. Similarly, the last group to participate on the Entrada the year 2000 arrived to the Temple when the Alba rite had already started hours before. This means that the year 2000 the celebration of the Carnival Saturday Pilgrimage was directly connected with the Alba rite, which bridged the events from Saturday into Sunday.

The Corso de Carnaval is the Carnival Parade that takes place on Sunday, often presenting a different order in the participation of the dance groups, many of which do not wear masks. While the (excessive) use of alcohol is strictly prohibited during the Saturday Pilgrimage, this is much more relaxed on Sunday. Some alternative comparsas or dance and fun groups participate only on Sunday.

Monday is the Day of the Dancer. It is the Day of the Devil for the Devil Dancers, for example, or the Day of the Moreno, for the Morenadas. There are several religious services offered by the different dance groups. After mass, the images of the Virgin are taken into a procession through the archways especially constructed for the occasion by the different pasantes (“ritual sponsors”) of the dance groups and other institutions.
The different dance groups present special choreographic and dramatic representations on the Av. Cívica. Distinctive images (i.e. the Virgin, the Devil, the *Morenos* or African slaves, and so on) incorporate imaginary features of the mythological narratives into the visual sphere of carnival, giving place to particular imageries. Finally, there is a traditional *cacharpaya*, or farewell to the Virgin of the Mineshaft, by the dance groups. Some of these events will be described and discussed in relation to different issues addressed in the following chapters.

***

---

30 The order does not strictly follow the antiquity of the groups, so some old dance groups might enter following a new dance group. This makes it possible to organise more variety in the spectacle, which sometimes presents on Saturday three different *Morenada* or *Caporales* dance groups in a row.
FOUR

DIABLADA/MORENADA

Over 20 different dances are performed by more than 50 dance groups in the Entrada or Carnival Parade. A complete description of the history and iconography of the different dances lies beyond the scope of this dissertation. I will therefore concentrate on the two most traditional dances, Diablada and Morenada, which are registered as the oldest in the documents of the Asociación de Conjuntos del Folklore de Oruro.

Although newer dances often prove to be more attractive to “carnival neophytes” in Bolivia, there is no doubt that Diablada and Morenada constitute the paradigmatic image of the festival, at a local level. The trendy images of some new dances (e.g. Caporales, Tinku) are depicted in national TV commercials, usually advertising different brands of beer or Singani (Bolivian grape spirit), but the overwhelming presence of Diablada and Morenada in the carnivalesque imageries of Oruro demands our particular attention. However, the following chart of folkloric dances is provided to give a general idea about the different dances displayed in the Carnival of Oruro.
Chart 1. Dances of the Oruro Carnival Parade¹.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DANCE</th>
<th>DESCRIPTION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Diablada</td>
<td>Devil Dance that represents the struggle between forces of good and evil.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morenada</td>
<td>Represents the hardworking African slaves during the Spanish colony.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incas</td>
<td>Represents the Spanish conquest, and the death of the Inca.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negritos</td>
<td>Represents the rhythmic dance of the populations of African ascendance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahuatiris</td>
<td>Represents the Shepherds of the highlands.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Llamerada</td>
<td>Represents the llama shepherds of the highlands.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zampoñeros</td>
<td>Musicians dance while playing the zampoñas (Andean panpipes), musical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>instruments played in the windy season.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tinkus</td>
<td>Represents the ritual violence enacted every year in Northern Potosí.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caporales</td>
<td>A stylised version of Negritos, representing mainly the African foremen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>used to control the African slaves during the Spanish colony.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tobas</td>
<td>Represents the warrior ethnic groups of the lowlands.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kallawayas</td>
<td>Represents the travelling natural medicine practitioners of the highlands.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antawara</td>
<td>A stylised version of the shepherd dancers or Llamerada.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kallawada</td>
<td>Represents the spinners and weaving specialists of the highlands.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phujllay</td>
<td>Represents the dance, music and war rituals of the Yamparaes region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>in the department of Chuquisaca.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tarqueada</td>
<td>Musicians dance while playing the tarkas, Andean musical instruments played</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>in the rainy season.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wititis</td>
<td>Represents the hunting of partridges that harm the plantations of quinoa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>in the highlands.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kantus</td>
<td>Musicians dance while playing the sikus, putu ankaras, chiniscos and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>pututus, Andean musical instruments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potolos</td>
<td>Represents the dancers of Potolo (department of Chuquisaca), with the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>rhythmic and playful movements of the hips.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctorcitos</td>
<td>A satirical representation of lawyers and penpushers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dancas</td>
<td>Several other stylised dances (e.g. Suri Sicuris, Inti Llaqta ).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estilizadas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above chart gives only a basic and very general idea of the dances performed in the Entrada. It illustrates nevertheless the iconographic richness of the festival, which must be taken into account not only in reference to the local celebrations, but also regarding the construction of a national identity, with the Carnival of Oruro as a showcase of Bolivian nationhood. Similarly, the transformation of the characters depicted in the

¹ Most of the information provided in this chart is based on the ACFO’s official magazines for Carnival 1998 and 1999. The order of the dances in the chart follows their order of appearance in the Entrada, which is based on the antiquity attributed to the different dance groups.
different dances does not relate exclusively to the development of the festival over time, but also to more specific racial, cultural, socio-economic features of the social actors involved. I have already shown in Chapter Two how the mythological narrative of carnival was transformed over time, as the festival was appropriated and reinterpreted according to the Bolivian-Catholic hegemonic ideology. Likewise, new meanings are assigned to the dances, as they are enacted by performers belonging to different segments of society. The transformed imageries of carnival, apart from being linked to the different materials and images accessible to the artisans over time, relate also to ideological transformations (or imaginary worlds) of the (old and new) performers. These and other issues will be discussed in the following pages, mainly in relation to the most traditional dances in the Carnival of Oruro: Diablada and Morenada.²

**Diablada**

The mythological narrative behind the Diablada or Devil-Dance has already been discussed in Chapter Two, where I have shown how the ambiguous nature of the Andean deity Wari was transformed into the image of the European Devil. I would argue that new transformations take place today, through the performances enacted by different segments of society. New meanings are attached not only to the characters represented through the dance, but also to the dance itself, to the relations between dancers, and to the celebration of carnival in general. However, we must

² I will also discuss certain aspects of other dances, but a detailed account of all of them will not be provided.
review some hypotheses about the origins of the dance, before developing such a discussion.

It is clear that the *Diablada* or Devil Dance is considered today a representation of the struggle between the forces of good and evil. There are, however, different hypotheses about its origins, in relation to which the struggle between the forces of good and evil constitutes only the interpretation that is most aptly adjusted to the current official Catholic discourse on the Carnival of Oruro. The local writer, Josermo Murillo Vacarrea (1970), asserts that most folkloric phenomena have two main attributes: an objective expression and a subjective scope. Regarding the objective expression of the *Diablada*, as a folkloric phenomenon, he points out the existence of archaeological evidence suggesting the presence of dancing figures representing llamas with prolonged ears in ancient pottery, as a possible origin of the Devil Dance.\(^3\) He reminds us that the llama was a sacred animal in the Andes for whom ancient inhabitants might have performed ritual dances. In relation to the Spanish conquest, the same author points out that along with slavery and the general exploitation of the Indians in the mines, new mythic images were introduced into the Andes: angels and devils. He suggests that the old figure of *Supay* (the Spirit of the mines, often related to *Wari*)\(^4\) acquired the attributes of the European Devil, but that the natives – who were condemned to perish in the mines through forced labour or the *mita* –

---

\(^3\) See also Platt (:257), where he suggests that the notorious fanged mouths of the modern Devil masks might have originated in the iconography of the underground temple of Chavin (built between 1000 and 800 BC), where the cult to the ancient Andean God *Wari* still flourished.

\(^4\) See Chapter Two.
instead of fearing Satan, worshiped and paid tribute to the demonised Supay.

Murillo Vacarreza (op.cit) explains the subjective scope of the Devil Dance in relation to the expression of a longing for freedom. He argues that the zoo-theist dance might have become the Urus’ expression of an anxiety for freedom, after being confined to the borders of the river Desaguadero and the lake Poopó by the invasion of expansive and warrior Aymara-speaking peoples (the Carangas). During the Spanish colony, when the miners had very limited access to the surface, they used their only period of license in carnival to dance, representing their protective Devil-like mythical character. According to the same author, this miners’ dance expressed once again an anxiety for freedom. He also asserts that the Devil Dance is more richly and strongly represented when the inhabitants of Oruro experience the most oppressive social and economic conditions. Instead of discussing the validity or invalidity of his arguments, I propose to take Murillo Vacarreza’s assertions as an alternative reading of the Diablada. Thus, alongside the expression of devotion and Catholic faith, the subjective scope of the Devil Dance could also include certain features of the relation between the dominant and the oppressed sectors of society. Murillo Vacarreza also observes that during the early twentieth century another subaltern segment of the population adhered to the procession, creating a new dance group: the Mañazos, formed by the Union of Butchers (op.cit.: 128).
According to the documents of the *Asociación de Conjuntos del Folklore de Oruro* (ACFO), the *Mañazos*, whose official name is *Gran Tradicional Auténtica Diablada Oruro* is the oldest dance group of Oruro, founded on 25 November 1904. The same documents specify that the institution was born through the enthusiasm of young butchers devoted to the Virgin of the Mineshaft. The following roles were distributed among the 20 dancers of the original group: an Angel (director of the dance), a Lucifer, a Satan, a *Diabla* (Devil-Woman), a Bear, the Seven Deadly Sins and their respective deputies. Don Lizandro García, a longstanding member of the *Mañazos*, underlines the pioneering role of the Corrales family, who introduced a new rhythm in 1904. According to don Lizandro, only 15 people danced as devils that year, but the public was impressed and one would hear spectators saying: “there comes the Devil, to worship the Virgin of the Mineshaft”. In 1911 don Pedro Corrales Flores volunteered to be the first *pasante* (‘ritual sponsor’) of the group.

Nowadays, over 350 *Mañazos* participate in the *Entrada*, following the rhythm of three brass bands. Much of the expenses are financed by a percentage of the slaughtered cattle, which is saved for the *Gran Tradicional Auténtica Diablada Oruro*. The members of the group are still those of the Union of Butchers and - although there may be some of

---

5 Don Lizandro García has been a member of the *Mañazos* for more than 32 years and the honorary president of the institution for over 14 years. I interviewed him on 10 November 1997. Any reference of Mr. García in the thesis is based on this interview.

6 In 1997, all the expenses for the celebration of carnival 1998 were covered, according to don Lizandro, by the Union of Butchers, because there was no specific *pasante* couple (‘ritual sponsors’).
them who are in a better economic situation than the rest – they consider themselves of humble and popular roots.

The socio-economic conditions of the dancers in Oruro are highly relevant in relation not only to the particular dance they perform, but also to the particular dance group they belong to. A division of the *Gran Tradicional Auténtica Diablada Oruro* took place in 1944, due to the emergence of economic, social and racial differences between two sections of the members of their institution. According to don Lizandro, people of better socio-economic standings separated off to form a distinct group. Thomas Abercrombie (1992) points out that the division took place only four years after some members of the elite joined this particular dance group, in an act that was meant to express their solidarity to the working classes. Such “solidarity” responded however to specific goals of the new Bolivian Indigenism, a political movement that had as one of its aims the creation of a national Bolivian identity. Both issues, the construction of a national identity and the racial, cultural and class differences, are highly relevant in discussing the transformations of the *Diablada* and the Oruro Carnival in general.

* 

Don Tito Aranda⁷ has been since 1953 a member of the *Fraternidad Artística y Cultural la Diablada* (or *Fraternidad*), the new Devil Dance group founded in 1944. He told me that there was only one *Diablada* until

---

⁷ Who was the Vice-President of the Asociación de Conjuntos del Folklore de Oruro (ACFO), when I interviewed him on 14 July 2000. All references of Mr. Aranda are based on this interview.
Carnival Monday in February 1944, when after the religious service in the temple the *pijes*,\(^8\) as those of better economic position were called, founded a new institution called *Sociedad Artística y Cultural la Diablada*. The name was changed the next year to *Fraternidad Artística y Cultural la Diablada*, the current name of the institution\(^9\) (Vargas Luza, 1998).

The atomisation of the dance groups due to racial and socio-economic differences reveals a feature that characterises Bolivian society more generally. Social stratification is not based solely on categories of class (the economic activities and the actual income of the individuals and their families), but also on those of race, language and culture. As Thomas Abercrombie (1992) argues, the “Indian” festivals that used to be avoided by the “decent” (“white”) people of Oruro were later performed by the *cholos* (people of “Indian” origins who moved into the city) and *mestizos* (people of “mixed blood”), and they are now being appropriated by the (“white”) elite. Thus, we see that the transformations of the Oruro Carnival Parade are directly linked to the different social actors that have been the protagonists of the festival over time.

The atomisation of the dance groups could also be interpreted as the solution of internal conflicts. However, new distinctions often emerge

---

\(^8\) The Dictionary of Bolivianisms (Muñoz Reyes, 1982) defines *pije* as a person elegantly dressed, with expensive clothes.

\(^9\) According to don Tito Aranda, new dance groups emerged later from the *Fraternidad*, like *Artes y Letras* and the *Diablada Tradicional*. 
within the splinter dance groups, giving place to further divisions. There
are, for example, two opposed factions of the Fraternidad Artística y
Cultural la Diablada in the present; those of higher social status who call
themselves Supays, and those of lower status known as Nachos. The
persistence of such a conflict suggests the possibility of a new division of
the Fraternidad, based on social, cultural and racial differences.
According to Abercrombie (op cit.), cholos and mestizos are seen as the
vecino\textsuperscript{10} elite, or as the artisans of popular sectors in rural and urban
settings, respectively. They are rejected in both contexts, as they are
identified with the “whites” by the “Indians” and with the “Indians” by the
“whites”. Notwithstanding, I would underline the difference between
cholos and mestizos. While the former are indigenous peoples who
migrated to the cities and whose mother tongue is usually Aymara or
Quechua, the latter are people whose mixed ancestry is usually revealed
by the colour of their skin, and have Spanish as their mother tongue.

It may be argued that mestizos and cholos are the main actors of carnival,
but their differences must be stressed, since they often are antagonist
forces. Thus, the ruptures of the dance groups in Oruro - like those of the
Mañazos and the Morenada Central (another dance group\textsuperscript{11}) - reveal some
of the class and cultural antagonisms between cholos, mestizos and
“whites”. The terms most generally used to despise someone in Bolivian

\textsuperscript{10} A term used in rural areas to designate the people of indigenous or mixed origin who reside in the
cities and return every year to their communities, only for a limited period of time (usually during
festivals and other celebrations).

\textsuperscript{11} See below, the section on Morenada.
urban contexts are *cholo* and *indio*. Yet, as Abercrombie suggests, *cholos* and *mestizos* are often identified with the “whites”, by the Indian peasants in rural contexts. However, if *cholos* are identified with the Indians in the cities, the same may not be so readily said about *mestizos*. Bolivian upper-middle classes are composed by successful and/or professional “whites” and *mestizos*. The social position of *mestizos* may in many cases be uncertain, for if they do not behave appropriately nor assure the appropriate social links, they may be called *cholos*, or even *indios*. Nevertheless, I have known *mestizos* who belong to the national socio-economic elite and who manage to compensate the darkness of their skin through self-confident and polite behaviour,¹² and the use of an elegant intellectual language and fine European clothes. In contrast, although there are many successful and professional *cholos* in Oruro and in Bolivia, they may belong to an economically privileged social sub-stratum, but never to the national elite.¹³

In the ACFO’s official magazine for Carnival 1999, it is asserted that the decade of 1940 marks the initial incursion of “decent” social spheres into the Devil Dance. The Diablada - formerly performed by miners and butchers (that is *indios, cholos* and *mestizos*) - was then transformed into a “folkloric ballet” where “the Indian loses his leading role, and the *q’ara* (or the “white man”) takes his place” (ACFO Magazine, 1999).

¹² This is often achieved through an appropriate and convenient socialisation, and a (related) private, and often foreign, education.

¹³ The presence of economically powerful cholos is dramatically perceived during the Entrada del Señor de Gran Poder in La Paz: a fiesta through which the successful Aymara merchants encroach upon the “civilised” space of the capital.
In relation to the emergence of new forms of exploitation which contribute to the establishment of a permanent colonial asymmetry in Australia, Nicholas Thomas (1994) asserts that “having stolen Aboriginal land, Australians are now stealing the Dreamtime” (1994:183). Perhaps something similar might be said about (post)colonial exploitation in the Andes, where after having exhausted the mineral riches, the national elite attempts in the present to exploit the cultural richness of the natural (the hills) and supernatural (the mythological narrative) landscape.

The city of Oruro was declared the “Folklore Capital of Bolivia” in 1970 (Goldstein, 1998). The local carnival parade is generally considered both, a religious festivity and a folkloric festival. In an entry of the Encyclopaedia of Social and Cultural Anthropology,14 Michael Herzfeld underlines the historical link between folklore and nationalism. This will be discussed in relation to the Devil Dance and the Oruro Carnival Parade, below.

The stage of folkloric diffusion started, according to the ACFO, in the decade of 1950, with the proliferation of national and international performances of the Diablada. To only mention the official international presentations of the Fraternidad, they started in 1958 with a visit to Iquique, Chile, to continue the following years with performances in Peru, Argentina, Venezuela, France, Italy, Germany, the Netherlands,

---

Switzerland, Costa Rica, Spain, and a special performance at the FIFA World Cup 1994 in Chicago, USA. The Devil dance group that has had the most international performances is the *Fraternidad*, the splinter group founded by members of the local elite in 1944.

In relation to the performance of *Diablada* in Europe, it is relevant to consider Mason’s ideas about imaginary worlds (1990) and the lives (and ideological transformations) of images (2001), both of which I discussed in the Introduction. Let us remember that, according to Mason, an imaginary world cannot be seen but must be named. The imaginary world within the cultural baggage of the European invaders of the Andes was not commensurable with local imaginary worlds. Thus new names were imposed upon existing places and images. Local deities were demonised through the imposition of an European imaginary world (i.e. the Devil). However, matters seem to achieve enormous complexity if one considers that images and imaginary worlds move along with the voyages of intercontinental travellers.

The imposition of the image and the name of the Devil upon Andean pre-Columbian deities entails, for example, the movement of an European imaginary feature (the Devil) and the transformation without movement of an image (the Spirit of the Hills). However, the new image (the “demonised *Wari* or *Supay*) was appropriated and represented through dance and ritual by Andean miners. Later it was adopted by different sectors of society, and this may have reached a dramatic point when
members of the Bolivian elite “export” the *Diablada* (and therefore the exoticised image of Lucifer) to the Old Continent, the “home” or place of origin of such a devilish imagery.

*  

I provide below descriptions of the most important characters represented in the *Diablada* or Devil Dance.¹⁵ These descriptions combine my own observations and those of Vargas Luza (1998), which are valid for the Devil Dance in general:

**The Angel** (or Archangel Michael)¹⁶ is both, the choreographic leader of the group and the leader of the forces of good in the representation (Vargas Luza, 1998). His big blue eyes framed by long black eyelashes stand out on the pink mask. His grin produces a half open mouth - which gives room for the dancer to use a whistle – showing the white or silver teeth and the red lips, often surrounded by one or two moles. The long (often blond) hair disappears under the golden or silver helmet. The angel usually wears a cross on his chest and white boots and leggings. The colour of the top and cape varies, according to the group. He holds a wavy sword in one hand and a small shield in the other. Don Lizandro García stated that the dancer who represents Archangel Michael must be in very good physical condition, because it is physically a very demanding role.

---

¹⁵ For a full description of all the characters represented in the *Diablada*, see Appendix 2.

¹⁶ See figure 11, where an Angel dancer of Oruro can be compared to the Archangel Michael, as depicted by the colonial painter Melchor Pérez de Holguín. This will be highly relevant in relation to the dramatised performance of the defeat of evil by good (see the *Relato*, below).
Figure 11. Angel. Compare the costumed dancer above with Archangel Michael (as portrayed by the colonial painter Melchor Pérez de Holguín) killing the snake. Note also the dragon-like figure of the snake in the painting. Source: Gisbert, 1999.
Don Angel López - whose name coincides with his role within the Mañazos - is the choreographic leader of the group, while at the same time represents the leader of the forces of good in the dance.

Lucifer (Luzbel)\(^{17}\) is the fallen angel commanding the invasion of the earth by the forces of evil (ibid.). In contrast with the fine European strokes of the angel’s mask, the masks of Lucifer, Satan and the Devil Dancers are generally sharp-featured (described by Vargas Luza [ibid.] as “grotesque”). They exhibit two big horns and bigger noses and ears. The thick lips suggest rage, and the fierce appearance of the mask is enhanced through the enormous fangs. The masks are usually black, red or green, but the innovations introduced by the artisans in recent decades gave rise to a proliferation of new materials, shapes and colours.\(^{18}\) Lucifer’s mask includes a crown on top, and his richly ornamented cape is much bigger and heavier than that of the Diablo or Devil-Dancer. The Devil Dancers also wear a wig, and their masks generally include a lizard and a snake or a dragon on top\(^{19}\). A snake or a toad often emerges from the mouth, and some masks include ants, spiders and a condor. The devils, who also wear boots with spurs, leggings, chest protectors, gloves, a sash made out of old coins and a flap, usually hold a snake and/or a trident in their hands.

\(^{17}\) See figure 12.
\(^{18}\) The features of the devil mask have been developed and transformed through many generations of artisans and dancers. For a detailed account of their development, see Vargas Luza (1998).

\(^{19}\) Vargas Luza (1998) argues that the presence of a dragon in the devil mask emerged in 1939, as the result of the introduction of Hornimans Tea (the logo of which was a small red dragon) into Bolivia. However, Gisbert (1999) provides several examples where the figure of a dragon can be observed in colonial representations of evil (see figure 11). According to her, the Quechua term Amaru is used to designate both the serpent and the dragon, whose images seem to have been used also interchangeably.
Figure 12. Lucifer on horseback
(Source: ACFO’s Official Magazine 1998).
Figure 13. *China Supay* (Photograph: Manuel Benavente).
Figure 14. Devil dancer (Photograph: Manuel Benavente).

Figure 15. Diablesa (Photograph: Manuel Benavente).
Satan, the second leader of the infernal forces, is also in charge of directing the choreography (ibid.). According to don Tito Aranda, Lucifer and Satan (as the monarchs of Hell) are the main figures through which the institution (in this case the Fraternidad) is presented to the public.

China Supay\textsuperscript{20}, a female devil who is Lucifer’s faithful helper, tempts men to fall into sin. In the dance, she is the inseparable companion of Lucifer and gives the Devil Dancers time to prepare the next choreographic move (ibid.).

Diablos\textsuperscript{21} are devils who represent the incautious hearts of those humans who, following Lucifer and Satan, carry the seven deadly sins: arrogance, greed, lust, rage, gluttony, envy, and laziness (ibid.).

Jukumaris are Andean mythological beings who kidnap women and girls. In the dance they represent such seizure by pulling female spectators to dance with them (ibid.). Their costume is usually made of artificial fur, resembling a brown or black bear sporting big eyes, ears and mouths in the furry masks.

Bears are a transformation of the Jukumaris, who are also known as Andean bears. Vargas Luza (1998) identifies the brown bear with the Jukumari, to differentiate it from the white (polar) bear.

\textsuperscript{20} See figure 13.
\textsuperscript{21} See figure 14.
Most of the above characters are represented by the different Devil Dance groups in Oruro. It is nevertheless common to observe transformations of the figures over time. *China Supay*, for example, has been so transformed until new and different characters were created: i.e. the *diablas*. The same may be said about *Jukumari*, who was first transformed into a bear, later into a polar bear, then a panda bear, a Yogi Bear, a gorilla, an elephant, and so on. However, he maintains his role as the playful and charming character who captures ladies from the audience, forcing them to dance. A specific research could be undertaken on the development over the decades of each of the characters described above.

Vargas Luza (op cit.) also provides valuable information about the choreography of the Devil Dance, asserting that, although the dance existed before the creation of the *Fraternidad Artística y Cultural La Diablada*, it “lacked organisation and a clearly defined choreography”. According to him, only with the emergence of the *Fraternidad* were the steps and movements designed in accordance to the contents of the *auto sacramental* (*"eucharistic play"*) they refer to. The Devil Dance is characterised by its fast rhythm, rapid movements and jumps. The dancers

---

22 See figure 15,  
23 In an informal interview with Zulma Yugar (then the Bolivian National Director of Cultural Promotion) in 1998, she expressed her apprehension about the possible participation of people dressed as Godzilla in the Carnival Parade, given the success of the Hollywood film in Bolivia.  
24 I am not assuming that this was the original role of the Jukumari, but it is described as such in most documents that I had access to.  
25 See *Relato*, below.
advance jumping forward or to the sides, according to the particular choreographic figure they perform.

It is important to consider that Vargas Luza is a member of the Fraternidad, so he provides very detailed descriptions of the Devil Dance choreography and masks, being at the same time biased by his particular membership. However, his general description and interpretation of the Diablada’s choreography most often coincides with the descriptions obtained from the different devil dancers whom I interviewed. The choreographic and dramatic performances that I observed also coincide with Vargas Luza’s descriptions of the Devil Dance, which are summarised as follows:

The Devil Dance represents the invasion of the earth by the forces of evil (Lucifer, Satan and their helpers), in order to exterminate the Christians and perform their rite of gibberish. The apparition of Archangel Michael puts an end to the invasion, when the devils are defeated by the forces of good with the help of the Virgin of the Mineshaft. The representation is divided in 2 acts and 13 figures, all of which are described in Appendix 2. For the present purposes I must concentrate on the first figure of the second act, the Relato.

El Relato (the tale or the narration): this is a long dialogue, or a spoken performance divided in three acts, apparently written in 1818 by the priest Montealegre (Beltrán Heredia, 1956; Vargas Luza 1998). It starts with
the speech of Lucifer (or Luzbel) who after proclaiming himself victorious recalls his expulsion from heaven because of his vanity. After a brief dialogue, Archangel Michael defeats Lucifer and Satan. The Angel threatens to bring them both to the temple of the Virgin, but he then realises that the temple must not be profaned by the presence of demons, so he decides to judge all the devils outside the chapel. There he calls the seven deadly sins (arrogance, greed, lust, gluttony, envy, laziness and rage), to humiliate and defeat them with the use of counter-sins. Arrogance is counter-effected by humbleness, greed by generosity, lust by chastity, gluttony by moderation, envy by charity, laziness by diligence, and rage by patience. The climax of this particular performance is achieved when after his defeat, Rage, the last deadly sin, breaks his mask with the help of the Angel. 26

Finally, Archangel Michael calls China Supay, the faithful companion of Lucifer, and the following dialogue begins:

"Angel: And you, serpent who tempted Eve, why are you amongst the devils? What are you, intrigue, doing here?
China Supay: (jumping) I am here because I am the major evil-woman from hell... this world attracts me because it is composed by earthly despicable things, by perverse beings who are sometimes worse than demons...not only us devils deserve eternal punishment...man is naturally evil...
Angel: And what is your role within this evil group?
China Supay: I am carnal temptation, the symbol of human perdition. Do you know what kind of power I have? Don't you understand that men run after me like crazy? Don't you realise, oh Beautiful Angel, that I am the greatest helper of Satan? Don't you see that I am the one who fills hell...? Get away from me pure Angel (flirting), I may tempt you too and bring you down to hell...

26 See figure 16.
Figure 16. Rage Devil Dancer breaks his mask with the help of the Angel.
Angel: You miserable infernal creature, get away from me, because you will never tempt me, never…” (Beltrán Heredia, 1956: 144. My translation).

China Supay is also defeated, which brings the struggle between the forces of good and evil to an end, giving also place to the end of the Relato. This symbolises the defeat of evil, which enables the devil-dancers to enter (shortly after the Relato) the domain of good: the Temple of the Virgin.

*

At this point, it is necessary to review some features of the Devil Dance. It must be kept in mind that, while the Diablada emerged as the expression of the local popular classes (i.e. the miners and the butchers), it was later transformed/re-interpreted through its representation by members of the more privileged social strata. The expression of a “longing for freedom” does not seem to be, for example, an important feature of the dance performed by the members of the upper social classes. This is also echoed in the images depicted in the dance; while the devils and angels represented by the subaltern sectors of society tend to use humble costumes and to be of short stature, their upper-class counterparts tend to be tall and dressed in very fine costumes.

There are, however, certain features that characterise the Devil Dance in the present, regardless of the racial, cultural or socio-economic conditions
of the dancers. Firstly, all the devil dancers whom I interviewed confirmed that they dance in devotion to the Virgin of the Mineshaft. Secondly, most of them also underlined the importance of their performances in relation to the national identity exhibited in Oruro, as the Folkloric Capital of Bolivia. If the Carnival of Oruro occupies a central place in the construction of a Bolivian national identity, the Diablada is considered by the locals as the expression of identity of the Orureños. Although some admitted the long existence of Devil Dancers in other Andean cities of Bolivia, the slightest suggestion of a different origin for the dance would be immediately rejected.

One of my interlocutors asserted that Diablada is the only dance that truly identifies the Orureños. He said that, instead of dancing Caporales, local people of the upper classes should dance Diablada. He then said: “Caporales dancers often say that all other dance groups are composed by cholos, but that’s not true”. The same interlocutor, whose name will be kept anonymous, made the following comments about the division of the Mañazos (the butchers’ devil dance group) and the current existence of two antagonist groups within the Fraternidad:

---

27 Murillo Vacarreza (1970), see above.

28 Most of the dancers belonging to different dance groups (Diabladas, Morenadas, Tobas, and so on) stated their devotion to the Virgin of the Mineshaft.

29 I will not concentrate on the possible origin of the Devil Dance (which is also claimed to be based in other regions of the country, mainly mining centres like Colquechaca, Uncía and Llallagua in the department of Potosí), but on the imagery of the dance and on the local discourses about it.

30 The dance that became most popular amongst the upper middle classes in the last decades (see the two last sections of Chapter Seven).
"The social differences within the Diablada in the 1940s were abysmal; we are talking about the differences between butchers and lawyers. There are also class differences within the Frater today; those who went to State schools and gather in karaoke and chicherias (places for drinking cheap corn beer) are the Nachos,31 and those who went to private schools and gather in the evenings at the disco-club "Sounder" are the Supays. There isn’t an identifiable point of conflict, it’s only a matter of differences. They (the Nachos) take difference as their platform for struggle. These are already lisuras de llocallas (Indian kids’ effronteries”).32 They should think before they speak, but there are no brains… I don’t understand with what morality they wear the Devil Dancer’s costume. The Devil Dancer’s costume is much too serious to speak about such crap…”.

The particular conflict that gave rise to these comments happened to be irrelevant, as my interlocutor (who obviously belonged to the Supay section) explained. Nevertheless, the contemptuous attitude towards those of lower socio-economic conditions shows how these differences are constantly underlined in conflictive circumstances. It is notable that people of the upper middle classes use the Aymara word llocalla (“young indigenous man”) to express contempt towards the members of the other (cholo) faction, while at the same time they claim the name of the indigenous deity Supay to identify their own faction.33 Perhaps the appropriation of the name Supay responds to an attempt to claim authenticity and proper knowledge of the mythological narrative underpinning the Devil Dance.

31 After the nickname of their leader.
32 The Dictionary of Bolivianisms (Muñoz, 1982) defines lisura as “shamelessness or effrontery”, and llocalla as "young indigenous man or boy; it is used despectively to verbally abuse a man of low social stratum”. Thus the lower social condition of the (cholos) Nachos is underlined, while it is also stressed that they should not go beyond their (social) limits.
33 The distinctive places where they meet at night also illuminate certain aspects of their differences; while the Nachos most probably drink chicha (cheap corn beer) in the chicherias where they meet, the Supays probably drink bottled beer, rum, vodka, whisky and other expensive drinks in the disco-club
Regarding the seriousness of the costume, don Tito Aranda (the Vice-President of the ACFO and a member of the Fraternidad) expressed it in relation to the enormous responsibility of the dancers:

"When the dancer puts on his mask, he becomes like a soldier who has to fight for his country, or like a footballer defending the national team. One feels accountable to the institution and to the local population, it is a cultural responsibility mixed with emotions. The responsibility increases when performing in foreign countries: one does not only represent Oruro then, but the whole country".

It must be clear that don Tito does not refer here to the devil dancers only, but to all the dancers of Diablada, and that the role of the dancers as "soldiers" or "footballers" does not refer to the symbolism of the characters depicted, but to the dancers themselves. Furthermore, one can argue that there is a representation of Bolivian nationhood through the different performances enacted in Oruro. The national representativeness of the Diablada and all the other dances that take place during the Carnival of Oruro is stressed by an article of the ACFO's regulations which specifies that all dancers must exhibit the colours (red, yellow and green) of the Bolivian national flag in their costumes.34

Basically, there are three columns in the choreographic arrangements of the Devil Dance performed by the Fraternidad Artística y Cultural La Diablada. The dancers hold red, yellow or green handkerchiefs, according to their columns. Besides alluding to the national Bolivian flag (red,
yellow and green), the distinctive handkerchiefs are also useful for the uniformity of movement in the choreography of the dance. Although the compulsory incorporation of the national flag into the costumes of the different dance groups is an innovation introduced in the last three decades, the use of coloured handkerchiefs seems to have been present in the first performances of the Devil dancers in the early twentieth century.

* 

When asked about a possible link between the Tío of the mine and the present-day performances of the Diablada, don Lizandro García rejected such a suggestion. He stressed that although the dance might have represented a cult to the demonised being of the mines in the past, it is entirely devoted to the Virgin of the Mineshaft in the present. Nevertheless, while recalling some of the traditions related to mining activities and carnival, don Lizandro mentioned the tink’a, a present given to the miners by the owners or administrators of the mines on Carnival Tuesday.

The tink’a present used to consist in streamers, alcohol, coca leaves and sweets, wrapped in colourful handkerchiefs for the miners to use in their offerings for the Tío of the mine. Such presents were given in exchange for the miners’ present of the toros (“bulls”), which were very special pieces of mineral saved for the event. Since all the mines of the city have

34 “Es obligación de todo danzarin portar en su vestimenta la Enseña Nacional, para identificar el folklore boliviano” (Chapter 2, article No. 18, ACFO’s Official Carnival Regulations 1998).
been closed for the last 15 years, these practices do not take place in Oruro any more. Nonetheless, an interlocutor suggested a nostalgic resemblance of the tink’a in the use of colourful handkerchiefs by the different dance groups that participate in the Entrada. I am not insinuating there is a continuity or even a link between the tink’a present and the handkerchiefs exhibited in carnival today. On the contrary, I would rather point out the discontinuity, the transformations, and the different possible interpretations of certain features that have characterised the colourful imageries of the festivity over time.

If nothing else, the different uses of colourful handkerchiefs in the present (to display the Bolivian flag) and the past (to wrap presents for the Tío of the mine) illustrate the transformations in the meaning and purpose of the celebrations. While the festivity was directly linked to the mining activities in the past, it is now explicitly conceived in relation to the construction of a national Bolivian identity. The Carnival of Oruro is not a celebration of the miners anymore; it is not even an exclusive celebration of the popular classes, the participation of higher socio-economic sections of the population being one of its main features during the last two decades. The official discourse constantly underlines the paramount role of the Oruro Carnival Parade in the creation (or empowerment) of a cultural identity for the nation.

35 See Chapter Two.
36 See Chapter Two.
37 Represented not only by local authorities (ACFO, the Municipal Town Hall, and so on), but also by the highest representatives of national politics.
The construction of a Bolivian national identity through the Oruro carnival may be linked to the “invention of a tradition”, and to the creation of imageries of self and other. In reference to the invention of traditions, Hobsbawm differentiates old practices from invented practices:

“The former were specific and strongly binding social practices, the latter tended to be quite unspecific and vague as to the nature of the values, rights and obligations of the group membership they inculcate: ‘patriotism’, ‘loyalty’, ‘duty’, ‘playing the game’, ‘the school spirit’ and the like” (Hobsbawm, 1983:10).

Hobsbawm notices the virtually compulsory nature of the practices symbolising patriotism, where the invention of emotionally and symbolically charged signs seems to be crucial.

“The National Flag, the National Anthem and the National Emblem are the three symbols through which an independent country proclaims its identity and sovereignty, and as such they command instantaneous respect and loyalty” (op cit.: 11).

I already mentioned the introduction of the Bolivian national flag colours in the costumes of the dancers in Oruro. Red stands for the blood shed in the historical battles for independence and sovereignty, yellow stands for the productive richness of the Bolivian territory, and green stands for hope. I will not describe or analyse the Bolivian national emblem, but there are at least two elements of it that are incorporated within the imagery of the Carnival Parade: the Bolivian flag and the Condor.
Although the role of the Condor is completely different in the dancing activities, it nevertheless constitutes a strong resemblance of the national emblem, mainly when it stands on top of the Devil Dancer mask (as it stands on top of the emblem). Both, the flag and the emblem are usually present whenever the Bolivian national anthem is played. However, the national anthem is not performed during the Oruro Carnival Parade.

Although the lyrics of the national anthem are extremely difficult to understand, everybody knows them by heart as they are repeatedly taught to most citizens, who sing it throughout their lives in an almost compulsory fashion. It is notable that the national anthem is not played as often in urban contexts as in rural ones, where one can see very small children singing every morning about “the propitious fate that crowned our vows and longings...”. However, it is a common place in Bolivia (mainly in the highlands) to hear about a second national anthem; the cueca Viva mi Patria Bolivia. I would suggest that most people might have a stronger rational and emotional link to this musical tune than to the national anthem. The lyrics are simple and the rhythm is a favourite one for dancing. This is the specific tune played by the brass bands when the devil dancers dance the cueca in the Avenida del Folklore and the Avenida Cívica. Therefore, although the national anthem is not played during the Entrada or Carnival Parade, the presence of the flag colours and the emblem’s condor is complemented by this “second national

38 The lyrics of the national anthem display a language similar to that of the official discourse of carnival illustrated in Chapter Three. I doubt it that a normal citizen who is not a poet, a philosopher, and/or a philologist could understand them without the use of a dictionary.

39 A particular rhythm performed before the Relato (see Appendix 2).
anthem” which is played, sung and danced in an emotionally charged context. Thus, it can be argued that the three main symbols of the Bolivian national identity are displayed through the performance of the devil dancers. This will be further discussed in Chapter Seven, but I should discuss now the “indigenous” features incorporated into the contemporary celebration of carnival in Oruro.

* 

Abercrombie describes the “post-colonial paradox” of the festivity in reference to the existence of two contradictory discourses on the Indian Other, within a single narrative form (1992:280). He suggests that the true sin of the Oruro dancers is to let their “hidden Indian” emerge. Such a sin is directly linked to the introduction of Andean rites as “Indian magical practices”, in parallel to the Catholic celebration of carnival. Those Indian pre-colonial strengths and practices would then be only intelligible through their articulation with orthodox Christian powers and practices that “tame” them in a cosmological struggle. It is this dual nature of the spectacle that renders, according to Abercrombie, the pilgrimage as a fertile ground for the construction of a national Bolivian identity (op cit.:281). He underlines the fact that in order to construct a Nation-State, the citizens of a State have to be converted into a “Nation”, with a common past, as much as a common flag and government. Although I would not think that the governing elite really wishes to share a common

---

40 The notion of a “sin” is inherent to the performance-as-a penitence, which is constantly underlined by the official discourse (i.e. representatives of the Catholic church, local authorities, and so on).
past with the Indians, it needs to claim certain particular cultural features strongly linked to the territory. The State cannot ignore its Indian elements, if it wants to create a distinctive cultural identity.

Abercrombie goes on to state that a post-colonial State has to attempt to legitimate its pre-colonial roots, and its leaders must be firmly established as authentically indigenous of the country (op cit.:283). Since the elite could not (and would rather not) claim the condition of “natives”, Bolivian nationalists have used – Abercrombie asserts – certain sophisticated semiotic techniques that allowed them to be their own Indians and, at the same time, transcend them through celebratory dramas that invoke the old Christian topic: diabolic temptation (op cit:285). That is, their incursion into the carnival celebrations enabled them to represent both the (displaced) Indians and carnal temptation through the Diablada.41

In relation to carnival as a pre-lent festivity, a completely civilised citizenship can only be achieved through a redemption of the sinful situation produced by dangerous temptation, which is localised, according to Abercrombie, in the bodies of the indigenous women (op cit.:282). In the comments following Abercrombie’s essay, Xavier Albó objects that there can be different readings of the festival, and that the North American anthropologist falls into an interpretative exaggeration. However, although I agree on the multivocality of carnival, the official discourse does stress the redemption of sin as a central issue in the performance of
the *Diablada*. While one cannot assert that the official discourse explicitly locates dangerous temptation in the bodies of indigenous women, I would agree that the stigma of “indianness” is much more difficult to erase than a “simple sin”, which can be easily dealt with through confession and communion. In urban Bolivia, it is a “common place” to hear about people “falling” into drinking, talking, or generally behaving like an “Indian”. Similarly, having a sexual affair with an Indian woman may carry grave social implications (i.e. a stigma), not necessarily because of sinful lust, but because of the contact with “indianness”. I suggest that such sinful stigmata are clearly depicted in both the concrete and allusive images of the Oruro Carnival, a topic to which I shall now turn, in relation to the interpretative transformations of the *Diablada* characters.

* 

The figure of *Wari* - as described by Condarco (1999) and by Beltrán Heredia (1956) in Chapter Two – is finally introduced as the image of the European Devil in the representation of the *Relato*, as an *auto sacramental* or "eucharistic play"\(^{42}\) of the Catholic official discourse. I have also come across different interpretations of *China Supay*, the faithful companion of Lucifer in the Devil Dance. Echoing the dialogue between the Angel and

\(^{41}\) Although the Devil Dance is not considered in the present a representation of the Indians, it was perceived as an Indian affair in the past. Regarding the “invention of tradition”, it might be more accurate to describe the phenomena described here as an exoticist “displacement of tradition”.

\(^{42}\) The *Relato* is most often referred to as an “eucharistic play” in Oruro. However, there are no specific references of thanksgiving and the consecration of bread and wine as the flesh and blood of Christ (which would be required for an eucharistic act) in the dramatisation. Therefore, perhaps it would be more accurate to call it a Christian, or Catholic Play.
China Supay displayed in the *Relato*, one interpretation suggests that the latter character resembles Lilith, or the “first Eve”. It is asserted that in contrast with Eve, Lilith is

“...the black one, the seductress, the evil one, the wicked one, the lustful one... [Furthermore.] although it is said that Eve impersonates temptation, because she encouraged Adam to sin, the figure of *China Supay* reflects Lilith, who is referred to as the Devil’s prostitute” (Miralles, X. *Lilith o Eva: La figura de la China Supay en el transcurso de los años*. La Patria, Oruro, 4 March 2000. My translation).

One common practice of (both young and old) men of the Bolivian upper middle classes is to *negrear*, or to have sexual affairs with girls of the lower social strata. The above paragraph seems to refer to the *negra* (“black woman”, or “woman of dark skin”), as the “low-class woman who tempts our husbands and boyfriends.” Although these insignificant affairs are not a practice approved by the wives, girlfriends, mothers and sisters of the men involved, they are forgivable, as long as they do not become a public matter. Perhaps it is during carnival that men most widely and overtly engage in such relations with the local “Liliths”.

The literary critic, Richard Schell (1992), identifies different interpretations of Lilith over the centuries, from the Old Testament to recent feminist literature, with carnal temptation as her main attribute. Some interpretations conform to the idea that she was Adam’s first wife,

---

43 See above.

44 The direct translation would be “to get black”, which refers to “picking up girls of dark skin”. Although these girls may not necessarily have dark skin, they always belong to lower social strata. Married and single men will make enormous efforts to avoid the embarrassment of being seen with
but others propose that both (Adam and Lilith) filled the world with
demons after Adam parted from Eve. However, Schell reminds us that in
Shaw’s Back to Methuselah,

“the serpent tells Eve of a Lilith who is a pre-sexual first
creature who through a strenous exertion of the imagination
regenerates herself as Adam and Eve. Primal parent of
humankind, she embodies creative evolution from matter to
spirit.” (Schell, 1992: 455).

Miralles’ article on China Supay obviously refers to the figure of Lilith as
the diabolic temptress, and perhaps it would be incoherent to link it to the
latter image of a pre-sexual imaginative and hermaphrodite creature.45
Nevertheless, besides the central place of incoherence and contradiction in
carnivalesque imageries, the inclusion of different readings of the same
figure gives place to a necessary multivocality in the interpretation of
carnival. Thus, the negative image of the evil temptress portrayed by the
(misogynist) former description of Lilith may be contradicted or
complemented by the positive interpretation referring to the creative
hermaphrodite Goddess used – according to Schell (1992) - by feminist
writers of the twentieth century.46 That is, we can take the analogy
Lilith/China Supay proposed by Miralles (2000) as a corollary of carnival
multivocality. Not only does Miralles compare two characters of
(previously) unrelated mythological narratives, but her own discourse

---

45 The suggestion of a continuity between Lilith and China Supay seems also to be absurd (mainly in the absence of a proper research to support it).

constitutes an extreme (misogynist) reading to be contrasted with Shaw’s (quoted by Shell, above) opposed (feminist) interpretation. I would suggest that, similarly, mutually contradictory readings of China Supay can be observed in Oruro. This takes place not only at the symbolic level of representational activities, but also in relation to the actual behaviour of dancers and spectators.

The aforementioned article (Miralles, 2000) underlines another transformation in the representation of China Supay: the figure was originally represented by male dancers, as only men used to dance in the Carnival Parade until the decade of 1970.47 It is asserted that with the incursion of female dancers, China Supay is today more representative of the flirty and tempting figure of Lilith. I would argue that China Supay and other erotic characters of the Carnival Parade do not only represent temptation, but they may effectively embody it through the dancers’ serious flirting with spectators and other dancers. This will be discussed in the following chapters, but it is important to explore at this point the attempted elimination of transvestism from the Oruro Carnival Parade.

* 

In a structuralist analysis, Ivanov (1984) explains carnival transvestism as the inversion of semiotically significant binary oppositions which,

47 According to Tristan Platt (personal communication), the reason for the exclusive participation of men could have been the fact that the dance parade was originally a miners’ affair, when women’s presence was strictly prohibited in the mines. The presence of a woman in the interior of the mines was thought to cause bad luck and even catastrophes.
according to him, had already been outlined by Mikhail Bakhtin. In the same volume, Umberto Eco points out that, although the establishment of a world upside-down liberates us during carnival from the fear imposed by the existence of the rule, a requisite of carnival is that the rule must be so deeply introjected that its presence is overwhelming at the moment of its violation. Therefore, Eco suggests that although Bakhtin’s view of medieval carnival as a profound drive towards liberation was right, the

“...hyper-Bakhtinian ideology of carnival as actual liberation may be wrong, ... [because] Carnival can exist only as an authorised transgression”, within a specific temporal and spatial frame (Eco, 1984: 3; 6. Original emphases).

It is necessary to distinguish Bakhtin’s discussion on medieval carnival from the modern celebration of carnival in which, as pointed out by Hyman (2000), one may observe different forms of celebration, most notably the official and the popular. If there needs to be a comparison between medieval and modern carnival, I would argue that the former might best be equated to popular and chaotic revelry, rather than to the official dance parades of modern times. I would suggest that Bakhtin’s attention to the symbolic level of carnival must be observed in relation to both the work and the world of Rabelais, as he stressed the unity of both spheres of the monk’s life. That is, symbolism (of Rabelais’ work or of the dances performed in carnival parades) must be considered in relation to the specific historical context in which it is enacted. In the carnival of Oruro, apart from the aforementioned distinction between the official

48 Edited by Eco, Ivanov and Rector, 1984.
celebration and the chaotic popular revelry, one may also observe culturally and historically specific perceptions of the dance performances.

In reference to carnival in Martinique, David Murray (1998) asserts that a structural analytical approach to cross-dressing may on the one hand underline the mockery of a colonising society, while it may also show, on the other, how the cross-dresser’s heterosexual masculine identity remains safe through the presence of bearded transvestites. Murray stresses the importance of contextualising specific acts of carnival cross-dressing.

* * *

“Yes, we have rid the Carnival Parade of all ‘poofs’” – proudly and publicly asserted a representative of the Asociación de Conjuntos del Folklore de Oruro (ACFO), when I asked him about the dismissal of male transvestite participation from the festival.49 I have argued elsewhere (Araoz 2000) that the incorporation of certain moral values of the Bolivian hegemonic ideology into the regulations of the Oruro Carnival Parade has ironically rendered transvestism defiant. Indeed, after the participation of male transvestites had been banned from the Entrada, I observed their persistent performance in the festivity, which constituted, after its prohibition, a rebellious act. It is notable that a particular feature of the local hegemonic ideology (i.e. homophobia) triggered the banning of a universal rule of carnival: role reversal, epitomised by transvestism.

49 “El Significado de Algunas Danzas del Carnaval de Oruro”, a paper presented By Antonio Revollo at the Seminar on Andean Folkloric Costumes, Museo Tambo Kirikincha, La Paz, December 1998.
In accordance with Eco’s arguments (op cit.), the participation of men dancing as women did not constitute a transgression in the past, because it was a representation performed by men whose “masculinity” was not at stake. This is stressed in the ACFO’s official magazine for Carnival 1999, where the presence of “feminine figures in a carnival of Machos” is notably enhanced by the unprecedented participation of a re-known lady dancing as a male-Devil: “she wore the most beautiful Devil cape ever worn by any Devil Dancer”. Thus both male and female cross-dressing were considered acceptable behaviour during carnival in the past.

Some suggest that it was when a few homosexuals (notably some local hairdressers) started dancing as women, that the local authorities looked for a solution, and finally decided to prohibit such behaviour. The ACFO’s official magazine for Carnival 1999 asserts that the attempt of some “poofs” to dance as Figuras in the Morenada dance triggered the general participation of women in the Carnival Parade, which is one of the main attractions in the present. This transformation, which refers to the Diablada, as much as to the Morenada dance discussed below, is illustrated in figure 17, where the reader can observe how the character of China Morena has evolved from its former representation by men to its present day performance by women.

On the other hand, many women dance as men, and they usually stress the enormous effort that implies to perform the difficult jumps of the devil
Figure 17. Two Chinas Morenas, late 1950’s (photograph: courtesy of Oscar Martinez). See next page for more modern versions.
Figure 17. *China Morena*, 1960's (above, photograph: courtesy of Oscar Martinez) and 2000 (below, Photograph: Manuel Benavente).
dancers and the *Caporales*, or to carry the heavy weight of the male *Moreno* costume. Role reversal is in this case just a temporary and performative action that, far from eliminating the differences between men and women, it reinforces them. As one dancer replied when I asked her why she danced as a male *Caporal*, “this way I feel the power and the strength of a man”. This seems to confirm Eco’s assertions about an authorised transgression. However, not every act of “carnival role reversal” is as submissive as the last example. As suggested earlier, the persistent participation of (disguised) male homosexual transvestites (mainly in the *Morenada* dance) constitutes a real transgression, since their presence has been officially banned from the Carnival Parade. It is thus possible to observe not only different levels of the celebration of carnival in Oruro, but also different interpretations of similar performances.

**Morenada**

The second oldest\(^{50}\) dance group of Oruro (after the *Mañazos*’ devil dance group) is the *Morenada Zona Norte*, founded on 9 March 1913 with the name *Morenada de Oruro*. Some interlocutors affirmed that it was founded by a group of candle-makers, when there was still no electricity in the city. Others say that brick and tile makers gathered with *chicha* beer makers to create the *Morenada Zona Norte*. Unfortunately I did not

\(^{50}\)There is no general agreement on this issue. Some interlocutors argued that the second dance group founded in Oruro was the *Comparsa de los Incas* and the third group the *Tobas Centralistas*. Others say that the *Tobas Centralistas* – founded by a group of loaders - was the second group. I chose to
manage to establish proper contact with members of this particular group, but relevant information about the dance was gathered through interviews with members of other Morenadas.

There are different interpretations of the Morenada, but all of them underline the representation of African slaves through the dance. This is expressed in the dance steps, as much as in the masks, costumes and rattles used by the dancers. In contrast with the Diablada, the rhythm of the Morenada dance is slow. The great weight of the Moreno costume\textsuperscript{51} forces the dancers to move slowly, balancing their bodies with short steps of two and three movements to one side, and then to the other. The choreography displays

"movements forward and backwards, complete and three-quarter turns, and positions of the feet that contribute to the general cadence of the group that collectively displays a sinister progression towards death" (Albó and Preiswerk, 1986: 64. My translation).

The dancers use a rattle to mark the rhythm and to signal a change in the choreography. It is believed that the short steps of the dancers represent the difficult movements of the African slaves, who had to drag along the weight of the chains around their feet. The ACFO's official magazine for carnival 1997 points out that the classic clattering sound of the rattles would be a reminiscence of the crucial long walks forced upon the "black

\textsuperscript{51} According to Rosemary Llave (daughter of don Isidro Llave, famous embroidery specialist), the Moreno costume weights between 20 and 30 Kilograms.
pieces” in their introduction from Panama to the Andes, with the continuous creaking of the old carriages and heavy chains. The Moreno masks clearly resemble the African slaves, but with exaggerated features, such as those expressed in the bulging eyes of the exhausted men, and their enormous lips and tongue.

African slaves were imported into the Andes in the sixteenth century, and it is asserted that most of them were captured in Angola and collectively blessed in Luanda by Catholic priests, in preparation for their long and tragic journey (Murrillo Vacarreza, 1980). Since the Africans could not adapt to the high altitude of the mines in Potosí and Oruro, they were transported to the valleys and the foothills of the Andes (or Yungas) - mainly for the production of coca leaves (ibid).

According to Murillo Vacarreza (op cit.), there were very small numbers of African slaves in the Andes, and they became very “expensive”, with only the rich being capable of purchasing them. The same author also asserts that because of their reduced numbers, the African slaves were a very cohesive group and – although still slaves – had more freedom in the Andes than those in tropical areas. Although their collective work under the whip of the robust foremen did not last long, a memory of the collective forced labour remained in the minds of the individual African slaves. This might have given origin, according to the same author, to the emergence of the Morenada dance. The ACFO official magazine for
carnival 1997 insinuates the existence of a micro-kingdom of the African Bonifacio monarchs in the foothills of the Andes. It is also suggested that the Aymara and Quechua peoples viewed the African slaves with both pity and awe, a vision that might have also given origin to the dance.

As the description of the Moreno costumes and masks will show, the characters represented in the dance exhibit a mixture of royal elegance and exhaustion. Murillo Vacarreza (1980) explains that, in their eagerness to flaunt, the masters forced the African slaves to dress in an ostentatious hard cylinder-like tunic.

“This costume was embellished with shiny applications and embroidery, and such efforts gave rise to the fantasy of handicraft that has given with time rise to the fantastic silvery and golden armour-like costume, which harmonises with the slow movements of the dance. The authentic blacks [Africans] started to disappear, but their figure was replaced by the artisans who reproduced their faces in the masks ... Grey hair bobbles were used to represent the old slaves; big hats - similar to those used by the Spaniards in the seventeenth century - were used to represent the foreman dressed in the style of the Spaniards’ butlers” (Murillo Vacarreza, 1980:5. My translation).

Edwin Guzmán (nd),\(^5^2\) suggests that the tunic might have evolved to become the wine cask figure within which the black man is “magically turned into wine today”.\(^5^3\) This leads us to another interpretation of the dance. A different hypothesis of the origin of the dance was reproduced in

\(^5^2\) Morenada: Orígenes de la Danza, an article included in the documents of the Fraternidad Morenada Central Oruro Fundada por la Comunidad Cocanis. The author is a dancer and researcher of the same dance group.

\(^5^3\) This will be later discussed in relation to the importance of drinking in carnival (see Chapter Eight).
the ACFO’s official magazine for carnival 1997: In a rebellious act, a seductive black woman attracted the abusive black foreman (or Caporal) of a colonial vineyard towards an inebriating stream. There, the slaves ridiculed him, forcing him to turn the winch and to press the grapes with his own feet. This way they transformed their hatred into a dance of ironic joyfulness and mockery of power. This interpretation is considered incoherent, because there never was a viticulture tradition in Yungas (the only place of relevant African settlements in Bolivia). Nevertheless, the production of wine has become a central topic in the local exegesis of the symbolism attributed to the dance, regardless of its historical incoherence. This is illustrated in the fact that the Relato or dramatic representation of the Morenada dance evolves around the image of the African slaves pressing the grapes.54

Similarly to the Diablada, transformations can also be observed in the dance, costumes and masks of the Morenada. The rattles, traditionally constructed with the shell of a quirquincho (armadillo), often take in the present the shape of a mask, a beer bottle, a truck, a computer, or a mobile phone. I would suggest that these modern artefacts are reinterpreted through the work of the artisans and the performance of the dancers. Thus, while in many cases the shape of mobile phones and beer bottles in the rattles might respond to the demands of the sponsors of specific dance groups, such commercial sponsorship is not passively assimilated by the dancers. The sponsors are often considered “ritual sponsors”, and the
practical effect of their products’ shapes in the rattles does not only refer to the commercial end of advertisement, but also to the iconographic and musical sphere of the Carnival Parade.55

Another transformation in the costumes of the Morenada is linked to the massive participation of Moreno dancers in the present. The costumes used to be almost completely embroidered (including the capes, coats, tube skirts, shoulder flash and chest protectors), but such fine work demanded much more time from the artisans than they could afford to invest nowadays. Since they have to design and construct hundreds of costumes every year, the artisans are now using a more practical technique that involves less embroidery and a more frequent use of appliqué. As a result, the Moreno costumes are now lighter, and cheaper to make. Also, many dancers choose today the option of hiring their dance costumes for the carnival season. Apart from the transformations in the costumes and masks, there have been changes in the social composition of the dance groups during the last three decades. The inclusion of women and people of the upper middle classes in the performance of the Moreno dance has had very important social implications, which I will discuss next in relation to the history of the Morenada Central Oruro.

*  

54 For a full description of the characters and the Relato (dramatised performance) of the Morenada dance, see Appendix 2. 
55 The role of the rattles in the musical sphere is obvious; they mark the rhythm of the dancers. I would suggest that the iconographic sphere of these two examples (the beer bottles and the mobile phones) implies on the one hand the introduction of the “official sponsors” within the dance group. On the other hand, alcohol (in the case of the beer-bottle rattles) is displayed as an important feature of carnival,
The second oldest *Moreno* dance group that participates in the Oruro Carnival Parade today is the *Fraternidad Morenada Central Oruro fundada por la Comunidad Cocanis*. The original name of the group was *La Morenada*, but later it was changed to *Conjunto Folklórico Tradicional Morenada Auténtica* in 1950; *Conjunto Tradicional Folklórico Morenada Zona Central* in 1955; to finally adopt the name *Fraternidad Morenada Central Oruro* in 1982. It was founded on 29 November 1924 by a group of migrant coca leaf traders or *Cocanis*, whose place of origin was the *ayllu* *Kairiri* in the province Aroma of the department of La Paz. Some interlocutors suggested that the *Cocanis* formed their dance group soon after their arrival in Oruro in the early twentieth century, and that their second place in antiquity after the *Morenada Zona Norte* might be mainly the result of the latter group dealing more promptly with the legal procedures involved.

It is important to observe that most dance groups are related to specific economic activities, which is illustrated by the popular identification of the dance groups with their trading name. The *Mañazos* are, for example, also known as *matarifes* ("butchers"), and the *Fraternidad Morenada Central Oruro* are also called *Cocanis* ("coca leaf traders"). This takes particular relevance in view of the current division of the *Morenada*

---

56 For images of the *Morenada Central fundada por la Comunidad Cocanis*, see figures 18 and 19.

57 A rural Andean social unit, most often composed by two moieties.
Figure 18. Morenada Central Oruro, fundada por la Comunidad Cocani, 1940’s. (Photograph: courtesy of Oscar Martinez).
Figure 19. Costume details of the Morenada Central Oruro, fundada por la Comunidad Cocani, 1990’s (Photograph: Manuel Benavente).
Central in two groups. Like the division of the Diablada, the rupture that took place within the Morenada Central illustrates the emergence of differentiated social strata within the group. However, it is important to discuss the particular way in which this Moreno dance group was divided, since it gave rise to an ongoing conflict that permeates the different spheres of social life in the city of Oruro.

What follows is a brief review of the processes that preceded the division of the Morenada Central in two separate groups. This review is based on the study of the existing documentation and on interviews with key social actors. The information gathered through a series of interviews with Rolando Barrientos,⁵⁸ who has been a member of the Fraternidad Morenada Central Oruro for 22 years, will shed light on the evolution of the institution during the last three decades, and on the paramount importance of dancing for an Oruro citizen. Rolando’s stance will be complemented with interviews to other social actors (dancers, musicians, artisans) and with my own ethnographic accounts.

Rolando Barrientos was born in the late 1950s within a middle class family for whom folklore was, according to him, completely alien. When Rolando was a child, he and his brothers used to watch the Entrada from their house on calle Junin, which was an important street of the old route for the Carnival Parade. Later, as young men, they were impressed by the

⁵⁸ After several interviews with Rolando Barrientos, he became a key interlocutor who introduced me to many influential social actors. The references of Rolando are based on different interviews and informal conversations carried out mainly during the year 2000.
Moreno dance. He first learned to dance Morenada in parties, where the rhythm was privately enjoyed by people of the middle and higher social classes without the risk of undermining their prestige, for dancing Morenada in the streets was still considered an “Indian” or “cholo” affair. Rolando told me that his own mother’s decision to dance Morenada with the Cocanis shocked people within Oruro’s middle class spheres. With time, he and his brothers accompanied their mother and participated in parties and other meetings organised by the group.

The majority of the members were Cocanis, an appellative used by the locals to designate the migrant coca traders, most of whom were settled in calle Cochabamba. The term Cocani was (and still is in many cases) used derogatorily by the locals. According to Rolando, when he and his family entered the institution, the coca traders tried to hide their origin and did not use to explicitly claim their own identity. Nevertheless, they always practiced their traditional rites, used the quirquincho (armadillo) rattle, and wore their Vicuña shawls in their meetings and celebrations. When the Catholic Church formed groups of prayers or Cofradías around the trade and dance groups, the Cocanis had already their own rites; they arrived at the city carrying their own cultural baggage.

According to Rolando, the pasantes59 (or “ritual sponsors”) have not only been the ones always in charge of organising the dance group, but they are also the embodied history of the institution. One particular practice that

---

59 This is an Andean rural tradition that establishes that a couple must be the sponsors of the celebrations every year. It involves reciprocity, prestige and responsibility.
characterised the organisation of the Cocanis is the Rodeo; a ritual invitation that involves communal reciprocity. The pasantes couple (in charge of sponsoring the group’s celebration of the festival) and other members of the group visit some Cocanis kin with beer, to invite them to dance Morenada. This is understood not just as a mechanism to summon or recruit dancers for the group, but also as a social strategy for unity, reciprocity and participation.

The first great crisis of the Morenada Central took place in the late 1970s and early 1980’s, when the fall of the sales of coca leaf (related to the fall of mineral prices) harmed the economy of the Cocanis and prevented them from sponsoring (or “passing”) the fiesta. Although previously there used to be Cocanis couples on a waiting list to be pasantes for the next 10 or 12 years, this suddenly halted and many of them had to change their economic activities. Rolando asserts that the last great pasante of the Cocanis left the group when he changed trade, leaving behind his coca leaf trading activities and becoming a truck driver. He founded in 1977 the Morenada Mejillones, a dance group formed around the union of truckers. The year 1979 Pagador - the official band of the Cocanis, and the most prestigious brass band of Oruro - followed the new dance group (Mejillones), which was also joined by many former members of the Morenada Central.
The general economic crisis that affected the coca leaf traders in the early 1980s coincided with the unrestricted participation of dancers from the urban middle classes in the *Morenada Central*. The role of Ricardo Escobar M. in the transfiguration of the *Morenada Central* is illustrative of the racial and cultural stigmatisation of the *Cocanis*, and how it was used by outsiders to encroach upon the directive spheres of the institution until its final appropriation. Ricardo Escobar M. was, according to Rolando Barrientos, an authority within the *Morenada Central* in the late 1970s, when the directorate board of the institution was still composed exclusively by *Cocanis*. His name used to be Ricardo Mamani Escobar, but when his father was dying, he asked don Ricardo and his brother to change their names and replace his surname (Mamani, an Aymara name) with their mother’s surname (Escobar, a Spanish name).

Don Ricardo Escobar M. inherited money, houses and a new name, hence becoming an influential individual in all spheres of society, except among the elite. He reciprocated his welcome within the local middle class with an open invitation to join his *Morenada*, which was soon followed by important structural transformations of the group. In 1982 the dance group was converted into a “fraternity” and acquired a new legal status. This implies a different organisation, since the institution is no longer founded on the traditional practices of the *Cocanis*, such as the *pasantes*, the *rodeos* and the general notion of reciprocity, which was replaced by the payment of a monthly fee by the members. The new rules allowed any dancer who had participated in the institution for five years to be elected
president, regardless of their cultural background. The Cocanis were no longer in charge of their Morenada, while people without any knowledge of their traditions took over the directing roles of the institution.

The Morenada Central acquired a new “look”, as a new entrepreneurial vision replaced the old traditions based on reciprocity. According to Rolando Barrientos, the objectives of the institution were transformed with the introduction of beauty contests (and other activities completely unrelated to the traditions of the Cocanis) in the prestigious Oruro Social Club. The replacement of the ritual invitation or Rodeo with the membership through the payment of monthly fees symbolises, according to Rolando Barrientos, a cultural death for the group. The vision of the dominant classes was imposed and the Cocani members of the Morenada were soon displaced and discriminated against. Rolando remembers that Willy Tapia - a former president of the Morenada Central - used to say

“when I was elected president, I found a group of disorganised Indians, I improved it and transformed it into the prestigious enterprise that it is today.”

The documents of the Fraternidad Morenada Central Oruro fundada por la Comunidad Cocanis assert that individuals alien to the cultural origin of the Morenada appropriated the institution, distorting its manifestations and showing little clarity in the financial administration. The Cocanis, led by don Marcelino Flores Llusco - a legitimate heir of the founding members - initiated a movement of cultural vindication. According to
Rolando, don Marcelino was living in the lowlands, because his health did not allow him to live in high altitudes anymore. When he was summoned by his fellow Cocanis, he immediately returned to Oruro and organised the movement. He was rejected by most of the middle class members of the dance group, a rejection that gave place to the division.

Rolando remembers that some individuals of the dominating non-Cocani section of the group asked him “Rolo, what movement are you talking about? They are only twenty cocani guys amongst hundreds of dancers”. He was then aware that, effectively, there were only twenty Cocanis left in the group, but he asserts that:

“[T]hose twenty guys were strong enough to achieve the reunion of the Cocani movement and to create in only four years the greatest Morenada in Bolivia... Those twenty Cocanis organised emergency commissions to visit old Morenos and their families and friends to convince them to dance. This massive urban Rodeo ["ritual visit"] was not only directed to gather people to dance, but to consolidate the reciprocity within the group and to recuperate the veiled identity of the Cocanis.” (Rolando Barrientos; 1 June 2000, personal communication).

The children of the old Cocanis were those who decided to defend and recuperate their cultural heritage and, despite the fact that it was traditionally established that parents and children do not dance together, they united different generations around the Moreno dance. Previously, it was a custom that the son of an old Cocani would wait until his father stopped dancing or died, before he started participating as a dancer. This

---

60 This is a clear case of the derogative use of the word “Indian”.

was transformed the year 1992, when in an emergency *Rodeo*, parents and grandparents gathered around the younger generations to finally create a group of 110 dancers (most of them *cocanis*) for the Carnival Parade 1993.

After the division, the *Cocanis*, or *Fraternidad Morenada Central Oruro fundada por la Comunidad Cocanis* participated in Carnival 1993, singing and dancing to the *Morenada* tune *Los Cocanis*, composed by Gerardo Yañez.

*Los Cocanis*

"Virgencita del alma

dueña de mi esperanza

vamos bailando en la Central

con gran devoción

mantillas y polleras

orgullo de mi tierra

con amor cocani

hacia el socavón”

(Gerardo Yañez, 1993, my translation)

The lyrics make reference to the confirmation of a *Cocani* identity, through the performance of the dance towards the Mineshaft wearing their traditional clothes. The *Cocanis* introduce every year at least one new musical composition for carnival, which is usually learned by heart by the

---

61 According to Rolando, don Marcelino was a mature man who organised the group for the following
local population and is thus incorporated within the local popular knowledge. It is well known that the Morenada Central is the home of the most popular and prolific composers of Morenada tunes. Undoubtedly, one of the most famous local composers was Jose Jacha ("The Great") Flores, who in 1994 composed Retorno ("Return"). This musical piece is, according to Rolando Barrientos, particularly meaningful. After 15 years of their departure, the brass band Pagador returned to play for the Cocanis in the Carnival Parade 1994.

**Retorno**

| Ya no lloro mas negrita               | Don't cry any more little black girl |
| la Pagador ha vuelto                 | The Pagador has returned |
| a la Central                         | to the Central |
| A la Morenada de mis amores         | To the Morenada of my love |
| a la Morenada de mis abuelos        | to the Morenada of my grandparents |
| a la Morenada de mis amores         | to the Morenada of my love |
| a la Morenada de los cocanis        | to the Morenada of the Cocanis |
| Veinte y cinco años negra            | Twenty Five years black |
| voy caminando buscando tu amor       | girl I've been |
| como el aire puro de mi Oruro       | walking in search for your love |
| como el agua dulce del Illimani      | like the pure air of my Oruro |
|                                       | like the sweet water of Illimani |

(Jose Flores, 1994, my translation)

two years, after which he weakened completely until he finally died.
Retorno marks in effect the return of the Pagador brass band to the Cocanis, as it also stresses the return of the Morenada led by the legitimate Cocani heirs. Many lyrics of Morenada tunes describe the actual events that affect the lives and performances of the dancers. As mentioned earlier, a particular characteristic of the Cocanis is the prolific composition of musical pieces by many of its members. The famous composer, Jose Jacha Flores died before I could conduct an interview with him. Some relate his death to the fact that he had been head-butted by a Moreno dancer of another group; others link it to his persisting drinking. Both explanations are linked to his involvement in the dance.

*

Don Francisco Flores Quispe, the father of Jose Jacha Flores, was born in Puerto Perez, at the edge of Lake Titicaca in the province Los Andes of the department of La Paz. He was brought to Oruro when he was seven months old, and when he was twelve years old he danced, along with other Oruro residents from Puerto Perez, as a Piel Roja ("Red Skin") in a group that no longer exists. After the Chaco War (which lasted between 1932 and 1935) don Francisco joined the Kullawada Zona Norte, a group that later disappeared due to financial problems. He then danced for a year with the Morenada Zona Norte, to fulfil a promise he made during one evening of drinks. The next year, he organised the group Conjunto

---

62 Like the return of the brass band in the above case, or the death of a loved person, in the case of Juan Apaza's Donde Pueda Verte and Quiero la Felicidad (see Chapter Six).
63 However, I managed to interview his father and brother, see below.
64 Interviewed together with his other son Ezequiel on 14 August 2000.
Folklórico Típico los Morenos de Oruro Moderno, where he danced between 1955 and 1965. According to don Francisco, by 1955 there were four Morenadas in Oruro; Zona Norte (formed by brick makers), Oruro Moderno (formed by candle makers), Zona Sur (formed by mattress makers) and Central (formed by coca traders or Cocanis). In 1955, when don Francisco was the "ritual sponsor" (or pasante) of the Morenada Oruro Moderno, don Donato Miranda supported him, and danced as a Moreno. In 1977 (22 years later), when don Donato was the pasante of the Morenada Central, don Francisco was expected to return the favour. His oldest son, Ezequiel, represented him and danced as a Caporal with the Cocanis, to return the favour and fulfil the Ayni (Andean ritual commitment of reciprocity). Ezequiel remembers that he never considered the possibility of dancing before, but that he could never stop doing it, until the year his brother, the great Jacha Flores, died. This example illustrates the importance and long-standing memory of ritual reciprocity for the Cocani dancers. The year 1979 Jose Jacha Flores joined the Morenada Central, and two years later he presented his first musical composition (Mantilla de Vicuña) for the group.

Jose Flores was an economist, specialised in agrarian planning. Like his father, he was born in the Titicaca village of Puerto Perez, but considered himself an Orureño whose most cherished dream was to see all the dancers singing, as they participate in the Oruro Carnival Parade. He is remembered as a great defender of Andean traditions and customs.
According to Rolando Barrientos, the middle class sector of the Morenada Central never forgave him for mentioning the cocanis in his compositions and, therefore, never gave him any recognition for his musical and poetic contributions to the group. There is no doubt that the musical compositions of Jose Flores enriched not only the heritage of the Morenada Central, but of the Oruro Carnival in general, where people of different social strata sing his Morenada tunes.

Jacha's compositions are so popular that even the members of the Morenada Central de Abajo, who were in opposition to his beloved Cocanis, dance singing his Morenada tunes. I did not manage to develop a proper interview with representatives of this “upper-middle-class” Morenada Central. Notwithstanding, the president of the institution (Oscar Ponce de León) was the local representative of the German Co-operation Agency (GTZ), with whom I had to liase in order to organise the opening of an international health support project in the rural area of Oruro. In view of the imminent arrival of the British Ambassador and the Minister of Health to the opening ceremony of the project, Oscar Ponce de León insisted upon hiring Llajtaymanta, the favourite folkloric group of the Minister of Health, an Orureño himself. Despite the last minute cancellation of the minister's visit, Llajtaymanta performed at the

65 In a manuscript entitled Jose Jacha Flores y la Morenada Central, written in October 1998.

66 The splinter group of the original Morenada Central, composed mainly by people of the upper middle classes.

67 This was a project were I worked as a translator and consultant anthropologist, but it is completely unrelated to the present work. Nevertheless, some issues linked to carnival emerged during the organisation of the official opening of the project, as it will be explained below.
opening ceremony. They played Morenada tunes composed by cocanis, but the lyrics were altered to make publicity for the governmental health reform.\(^68\) This is a common practice in Oruro, where local and national politicians use different elements of carnival and the carnival Parade itself as an opportunity for political propaganda. I will return to this issue, but it is necessary first to underline certain aspects of the division of the Morenada Central.

*  

The particular circumstances in which the division of the group took place resulted in the final (and probably definitive) appropriation of the institution by the middle-class members of the Morenada Central. Don Lucio Flores Mamani\(^69\) (a member of the Cocanis since 1968, whose brother danced since 1954) remembers the meeting where despite the support of the Cocanis, the opposed sector of the Morenada Central did not recognise don Marcelino Flores as a legitimate candidate for the presidency. After many hours of discussions the Cocanis, apparently under the influence of alcohol, decided to leave. Their departure was interpreted as a departure of the Morenada Central which, as they underline, is a heritage of the coca leaf traders. In the year 1993 there

---

\(^{68}\) The members of Llajtaymanta seem to be also members of the Cocanis. Paradoxically, they never mentioned the cocani authorship of the tunes they played at request of the president of the institution that appropriated the Morenada Central. Juan Apaza, another Cocani composer, mentioned that he did not mind if Llajtaymanta played his tunes, but he did mind the alteration of the lyrics.

\(^{69}\) Interviewed on 14 June 2000.
were two groups called *Morenada Central* in the Carnival Parade, one led by the *Cocanis* and the other one led by the Middle-class members opposed to the *Cocanis*. While the latter group followed the new route (through *Avenida 6 de Agosto*) established by the ACFO for the Carnival Parade that year, the former was the only dance group that danced through the “traditional” route starting from the *Parque de la Unión* and following *Avenida 6 de Octubre*.

The local population saw the *cocani* movement as chaotic, as an example of the excessive drunkenness that is usually attributed to the “Indian” and “cholo” celebrations. The anarchy of the drunken *Cocanis* might have helped their opponents in getting more sympathy from the authorities of the ACFO, who usually give them (the middle-class *Morenos*) a more privileged position in the programme for the Carnival Parade. Nevertheless, as Rolando Barrientos stated,

“the *Morenos de abajo* (the non-Cocanis) are used to their position, while the *Cocanis* are used to the fight, they push and pull, and they punch if it is necessary to enter at the appropriate time”.

As mentioned earlier, the order of appearance of the groups reflects their antiquity and their status within the carnival celebrations. Therefore, the *Cocanis* are always concerned about their position in the Carnival Parade, for it might suggest their old or recent foundation (in 1924 or 1993). The ACFO often places them with the new groups that emerged in the 1990s, suggesting its foundation as a group in 1993 (when the division took place). But the *Cocanis* always manage to enter in the main block of the
oldest groups. It may be argued that the struggle of the Cocanis involves certain kind of manipulation of time and space. They not only manage to alter the established order for the Carnival Parade and to enter within the block they claim they belong to, but through these means they also claim and reaffirm the antiquity of their institution.

In the year 2000 a whole block of new dance groups entered before the oldest block, presumably to make sure that the important visitors (representatives of UNESCO) were already seated when the oldest dance groups performed. That year I was surprised and confused to hear music from the lowlands at the start of the Entrada. The starting point is every year crowded with Devil Dancers, and the only melody to be heard then is Diablada. That year, however, the Entrada was “opened” by the dance group that had most recently been incorporated into the Carnival Parade, and whose members followed a lowland taquirari rhythm that is not at all representative of the Oruro Carnival. Nevertheless, the second block was leaded by the Mañazos, the oldest dance group of Oruro. It is clear that, although the pilgrimage was opened as usual by the image of the Virgin and the local authorities, the “traditional” Dance Parade only started with the performance of the second block. The ACFO gave the Cocanis a “privileged” position in the first block of the year 2000. Rolando told me that they were placed “outside carnival”, as the last group in the first block. They managed, however, to delay their participation and enter immediately after the Mañazos, overtaking the Morenada Zona Norte

---

70 At the junction of Avenida Villarroel and Avenida del Folklore (or 6 de Agosto).
whose members were scattered around the starting point. Paradoxically, the characteristic chaotic behaviour of the Cocanis had to be very carefully organised to gather all the dancers and impose their presence in the block from which they had been removed by the ACFO.

Thousands of dancers participate every year in the Entrada, and their performances are observed by hundreds of thousands spectators. The organisation of the Carnival Parade is not a simple matter, considering the number of participants and spectators, the struggle between different groups, and the narrow width of most streets in the city of Oruro. Many policies have been implemented during the last decades to organise the performance of the Entrada. The route of the Carnival Parade has been transformed, for example, several times. These are issues that will be discussed in the following chapter, in relation to the spatial organisation of carnival in Oruro.

***
FIVE

SPACE/DANCE

In this Chapter I will discuss the spatial behaviour of social actors (individuals and groups) during the celebration of carnival in Oruro. Dancing - as a predominantly spatial action - will be central to the discussion. Along with the official carnival dancing activities, I will also consider the more informal and spontaneous dances performed by spectators and the public in general. Particular features of social and cultural interaction may be observed in the construction of space and the re-interpretation of place in Oruro. Emphasis will be given to the creativity of the user, the importance of which has been underlined by Michel de Certeau (1984), and applied to the study of the construction of space in urban Latin America by Setha Low (1996).

Space and Place in Oruro

The historian/ethnologist Michel de Certeau understands place as an instantaneous configuration of positions, and space as composed by intersections of mobile elements. That is, "space is a practised place" (1984:117). This may appear to be contradictory to the general notion of place as an occupied space, but I would rather suggest that it illustrates the dynamic inter-relationship of both concepts. Hence the necessity to consider the mutual implications of space and place: whilst (potential)
movement makes space possible, each pause actualises place.\(^1\)
Furthermore, I would argue that space and place are coterminous and relative to each other, as are movement and pause.

Certeau draws on Foucault's analysis of the politics of architecture in the spatialised configuration of social control, but stresses the necessity to appreciate the constructive capacity of consumers: the background potentiality of space becomes an actuality, space is (re)created by the user. Walking is conceived as a space of enunciation in Certeau’s structuralist approach to the study of space. Henrietta Moore (1986) underlines that the structuralist/semiotic approach fails to take into account the activities of social actors, and the meanings they ascribe to them. She stresses that the organisation of space is above all developed through practice, that is, through the interaction of individuals. Moore argues that

"[i]ndividual actions, even those often repeated and re-identified as the same in their repetition, are more akin to speech-utterances than to acts of writing. Movement through and action in a spatial context may be analysed as discourse, but it is a discourse delimited precisely by the strategic intentions of the actor, by the responses of the individuals to whom the action is addressed or who become embroiled in it, and by the shared immediacy of the spatio-temporal context of the various individuals concerned." (op.cit.:82-83).

Nevertheless, as Buchanan (2000) reminds us, Michel de Certeau was aware that “there are as many spaces as there are distinct spatial

\(^1\) The geographer Yi Fu Tuan (1977) understands place as an essentially static concept that refers to an organised world of meaning, and space as related with freedom and the ability to move.
experiences", and that we should focus on "ways of seeing" rather than on "what is seen" (ibid.). The French ethnologist also identified the transformation of spaces into places and places into spaces, through their relation to specific stories. This is particularly relevant in reference to the embodiment of mythological narrative in the landscape of Oruro, and to the changing perceptions (and changing official policies) regarding the "petrified monsters". Different spatial practices have emerged, with the transformation of the stories linked to the local landscape. Similarly, it is possible to observe distinctive spatial behaviour in relation to specific events enacted during carnival in the streets and squares of Oruro.

Setha Low (1996) considers Spanish American plazas a product of colonial control, but also of indigenous forms of political and economic control. She distinguishes the social production of space from the social construction of space. While the former implies those factors "the intended goal of which is the physical creation of the material setting", the latter refers to "the phenomenological and symbolic experience of space as mediated by social processes such as exchange, conflict, and control" (1996:861-2). Drawing on Certeau's notion of the creative consumer, Low identifies class-based social constructions of urban space, in a comparative study of social behaviour in two plazas of San José, Costa Rica.

---

3 See the myth of Wari, in Chapter Two.
Miles Richardson (1982), who also worked in Costa Rica, claims that human intersubjectivity is epitomised in material culture. He argues that in Spanish America the market and the plaza constitute two places where individuals create and re-create what he calls 'their own being-in-the-world'. Material culture, as the objectification of our subjective experience of social interaction assumes, according to him, dramatic qualities and becomes a scene. Richardson proposes that being in the plaza in Spanish America is equivalent to being 'onstage', while being in the market is more like being 'offstage'. As people approach the market and the plaza, preliminarily defined situations are constructed:

"During the course of their interaction with the natural setting and with each other, people respond to the material setting by incorporating its preliminary definition into their behaviour" (1982:430).

Through his assumption that the material setting (the plaza and the market in this case) predetermines the behaviour of individuals within it, Richardson appears to be oblivious to the ways in which human activity redefines place and creates space. The market in Spanish America is not always restricted to the specific setting built for commercial activities: markets are temporarily created on the streets and in different public spaces. The plaza, for example, can be (and often is) converted into a market. It also becomes the scenario for diverse activities at different times of the day and the year. Richardson ignores the great capacity of improvisation of Spanish American settlers and, in so doing, he downplays one of the fundamental aspects of their spatial practices: just as much as the stage dictates the roles to be played on it, actors tend to
redefine it in their performances. They re-interpret place through their actions. It is thus necessary to stress the creative role of consumers pointed out by Certeau (1984), and rightly developed by Low (1996) in the case of Spanish American plazas.

*

Taking into account Low’s notion of the social production of space (op cit.), the construction of Spanish American plazas may be interpreted as an instance of the architectural configuration of social control (Foucault, 1977), for it aimed at the centralised imposition of the European gaze upon the local populations. Nevertheless, it will be argued that the users reinterpret places through their social construction of space.

The spatial configuration of central squares in Bolivian cities and villages incorporates certain political features. Buildings of the central and local governments, and of the official Catholic Church often flank Bolivian plazas. Plaza 10 de Febrero (the central square of Oruro) is surrounded, for example, by the Cathedral, the City Town-Hall and the Prefecture. The latter is the site from where all visiting VIPs observe the Carnival Parade every year. Most dance groups perform a special choreography in front of the Prefecture, to amuse the guests of honour. This is not an easily accessible place during the development of the Carnival Parade. People

\[4\] Which may include the Bolivian President with representatives of his cabinet, diplomatic representatives of the different embassies, and the local authorities.
who have rented seats in the tiers in front of the Prefecture usually hold special tickets which enable them to return to their places whenever they need to do so. All registered journalists and photographers also hold special badges to identify them and allow them to enter many exclusive places. Following Richardson (1982), this may be interpreted as the predetermination of the social actors’ behaviour by the material setting. This issue will be further discussed and problematised, but first I must describe some general spatial arrangements previous to the development of the *Entrada* or Carnival Parade.

The flow of vehicular traffic may be interrupted in Oruro through the enactment of different events during the year, but it is most dramatically altered during the carnival season, which starts with the *Primer Convite* in November and lasts until the end of carnival in March. The citizens of Oruro are used to the fact that many of the central streets and avenues are often closed to the traffic, due to activities related to the preparation or the development of carnival. However, this spatial restriction is obviously related to specific activities that entail other changes in the spatial arrangements. It is thus possible to observe different levels of the spatial transformations that take place in relation to carnival: from the general alteration of the vehicular traffic in the roads, to the more subtly differentiated movements of the distinctive social actors involved in specific activities. In what follows, I will provide some descriptions of the general spatial arrangements evolving around the Carnival of Oruro. It
will be noticed that - following the chronological order of the events\(^5\) - the spatial complexity increases as the *Entrada* develops towards the *Alba* rite, on Saturday evening and Sunday morning.

* 

The *Primer Convite* (or “first official rehearsal”) is usually observed by the local population, friends and relatives of the dancers, and the eventual visitors and tourists. The vehicular flow in the streets is already altered for this event, but pedestrians have unrestricted access to all the streets and plazas of the city. Some local spectators park their cars at the junctions of Avenida 6 de Agosto (or Avenida del Folklore), to watch the rehearsal from their cars.

Although there seems to be no significant traffic congestion, the *Primer Convite* marks the start of the continuous alteration of the traffic until the end of carnival in March. After the *Primer Convite*, the different dance groups program independently their own informal rehearsals. This means that, after the first official rehearsal, different dance groups may alter the vehicular traffic at different points of the city (in the evenings during the week and in the daytime during the weekends). When I was following one of such practices, I once saw a taxi crossing a street junction just when a block of dancers was approaching the junction. One of the dancers shouted *Mierda!* (“shit!”), *and* jumped forward to hit the top of the car

\(^5\) As listed in Appendix 1.
with his fist. The dancers are aware of their privileges when they perform (even when they are “only” practising), and this is manifested, for example, in the spatial re-configuration of the city’s vehicular traffic. This clearly affects thousands of people who need to use (public or private) transport to move between different parts of the orb. I was surprised not to hear any complaints about this from the drivers and from the public in general. People are generally used to such changes, and they seem to know different strategies to avoid traffic congestion.\textsuperscript{6}

* 

Both the traffic congestion and the participation of the local population increase dramatically during the weeks previous to the \textit{Entrada} or Carnival Parade. This is clearly marked by the \textit{Procesión de Cirios} or “Candle Procession” which, as mentioned in Chapter Three, is enacted every year during the first evening of February. A tumultuous procession takes place in honour of the Virgin of the Mineshaft, also known as \textit{Virgen de la Candelaria} (or “Virgin of Candlemas”). The thousands of candles lit and the great amount of incense burnt in this event create the atmosphere for an official “blessing” of the city and its inhabitants. The improvised shrines in front of which the procession halts mark the specific places, as much as the general rhythm of the blessing. Policemen riding motorcycles lead the procession, often using their emergency lights. The smoke of the incense, the lights of the helmets worn by the (former)

\textsuperscript{6} The local municipal government provides plans of the city illustrating the exceptional flow of traffic during carnival. See figure 20.
Figure 20. Exceptional flow of traffic in Oruro. Public transport during Carnival.
miners (who carry the image of the Virgin on their shoulders) and the candles contribute to the construction of a "sacred" place.\(^7\)

It may be argued that the presence of a replica image of the Madonna constitutes the concrete personification of the sacred. The route of the Candle Procession synthesises the itinerary of the carnival celebrations, which start in November at the foot of the Virgin of the Mineshaft and end also at the foot of the Madonna, in February or March. Turner and Turner (1978) make a distinction between procession and pilgrimage. The former is characterised by the mobility of the central image (the Virgin of the Mineshaft in this case) that leaves its shrine to visit/bless the houses and streets of the city. The latter, on the other hand, consists on the people travelling towards the central image, to receive its blessings at the central shrine.\(^8\) Both instances are observed in the celebration of carnival in Oruro, but alternative spatial practices inject further complexity into the festival.

The day after the Candle Procession is the day of the Virgin (February the 2nd), when a special mass is dedicated to her, and her image is incorporated into another procession through a specially constructed archway. A similar event takes place on Carnival Monday, when the dance groups' replicas of the Madonna are taken in a short procession through an archway. Surely all these spatial arrangements can be interpreted in semiotic terms. The passage of the images and the

---

\(^7\) See figures 6 and 21.

\(^8\) Sallnow considers pilgrimage as "the bodily mapping of socio-religious space" (1991: 138).
Figure 21. Miners carrying the image of the Virgin, Procesión de Cirios or Candle Procession.
individuals through the archways may, for example, be explained as the threshold between the sacred and the profane. Although I often mention the “sacred” status of certain places and images, I do not intend to discuss their “sacredness” in terms of a duality sacred/profane. It is the solemnity of these ceremonies that I describe as “sacred”, in relation (and often in contrast) with the quotidian behaviour of the social actors involved. Given my focus on the actual behaviour of the social actors, I will not engage into a structuralist analysis of the celebrations. My spatial analysis of carnival is rather linked to down-to-earth activities, such as the dance rehearsals, the organisation of the festival and the construction of tiers.

* 

Usually most of the tiers have already been constructed when the *Ultimo Convite* (or “last rehearsal”) takes place. There is a greater participation of the local population during this event. Spectators already occupy many of the streets, watching the last rehearsal from the place they choose. The rows of seats under the Prefecture are, for example, easily accessible for anyone. Some spectators follow the brass bands, dancing to the different rhythms of carnival, but there are already strict regulations and a jealous control to avoid disorder. Fluorescent yellow tape is already used to prevent the spectators from entering the *Avenida Cívica* and the *Plaza del Folklore*, where special choreographic moves are performed. There is a complete festive atmosphere when the *Ultimo Convite* takes place. Many tourists and other visitors arrive already for this event.
A completely different event takes place the following Thursday, after the *Ultimo Convite*, when representatives of the surrounding provinces of the department's rural areas perform the *Anata Andina* or "Andean Carnival".

As mentioned earlier, although the *Anata Andina* finishes at the Avenida Cívica, which is the site of the last set of tiers on the route for the *Entrada* (or Carnival Parade), the dancers do not enter the chapel. The doors are closed, undoubtedly to prevent the entry of the drunken "Indians". On the other hand, the rural dancers do not seem interested in entering the chapel in the first place. This marks a stark contrast between the Carnival Parade and the *Anata Andina*; while the former is developed around the image of the Virgin in the temple, the latter is completely independent of it.

Although there is an increasing number of communities participating in the *Anata Andina* of Oruro every year, they would surely dance somewhere else, if the carnival celebrations of Oruro were cancelled. The same cannot be said about the dancers of the *Entrada*. As a matter of fact, representatives of most of the "traditional" groups (created before the 1930s) emphasise the fact that the only years when they did not dance were between 1932 and 1935, when the Chaco War with Paraguay took place and the official Carnival Parade was cancelled.  

9 I have not carried out research on the activities of these rural dancers, but it is clear that they are completely separate from those of the official

---

9 In contrast, the year 1999 the rural communities of Qaqachacas, Q'ultá and Cruce Q'ultá decided not to vote on the national municipal elections, because they had to dance in the *Fiesta de Santa Barbara* (La Razón, La Paz, 4 December 1999).
Catholic celebration of carnival. It might be relevant to consider the
distinction between folklore festival and fiesta, in relation to the
differences between the Entrada and the Anata Andina. According to
Rockefeller, the term fiesta refers to

“[C]elebrations, normally in some sense religious, organised
by the campesinos. (...) Festivals on the other hand (...) consist largely of representations of what are taken to be the
most significant performative elements of the fiestas. These
representations are performed by the same people as would
sing and dance in fiestas, but in the folkloric festivals they do
so in front of an audience.” (Rockefeller, 1999: 122).

Perhaps the Anata Andina may in this sense be considered the folkloric
festival representation of their rural fiestas, because it is performed in
front of an audience by the same people who participate in the fiestas.
However, Rockefeller also points out a dramatic contrast between the
indispensable consumption of alcohol during the traditional rituals
performed in fiestas and its general avoidance in folkloric festivals (op
cit.: 132). As I have already suggested, the performers of the Anata Andina
are in general strongly affected by the consumption of alcohol, and
although their initially contesting attitude has somehow been “tamed” and
“ordered” by their official incorporation within the urban celebration of
carnival,10 their performances are still perceived as chaotic. The
transformation of some features of the fiesta, for their display in front of
an audience during festivals, is a relevant issue regarding the celebration
of carnival in Oruro. Nevertheless, instead of labelling the different events

10 For a detailed account of the first irruption of rural dancers upon the Carnival of Oruro, see
Abercrombie (1999).
according to a strict dichotomy, I would rather suggest the importance of observing the processes through which they are transformed.

The distinctive spatial behaviour of the performers may further illustrate the differences between the *Entrada* and the *Anata Andina* dancers. The latter use different routes in an almost chaotic fashion. The movements of the communities performing in the *Anata Andina* display different spatial arrangements from those of the dancers of the official Carnival Parade. They are more chaotic in their general unpredictability. Both the route and the choreography do not seem to be pre-established. They seem to be performed as they develop, producing an increased disorder in the streets.

Different social constructions of space and place may be observed in the distinctive ways in which movement and pause are organised. The *Entrada* and the *Anata Andina* dancers clearly create different spaces. The apparently more spontaneous movements of the community dancers radically contrast with the orderly *Entrada* displayed for the public. Similarly, the distinctive ways in which both performances end may reveal certain aspects of the social construction of place. The *Plaza del Folklore* (the open space at the foot of the chapel) is always kept free during the *Entrada* for the urban dancers to enact their last choreographic performance before they enter the temple, whereas the *Anata* dancers transform it into a place for their communal meal.
The Anata Andina may be interpreted as an encroachment of the “drunken Indians” upon the urban space, which is not always an attractive view for the locals. Although it has been incorporated into the official programme of the carnival celebrations during the last five years, this event is not really intertwined with the official celebrations. Nevertheless, this particular event, which seems to have been strengthened during the last years, may resemble the old Entrada or Carnival Parade, when it was considered an “Indian” festival.

* 

Many old-aged interlocutors asserted that in the early twentieth century the Carnival Parade was a disorganised affair; each group chose their own schedule and route. A newspaper article (Cabezas, 2000)\footnote{Humberto Cabezas, *Todas las Rutas nos conducen hasta el Santuario del Socavón*. La Patria, Special Supplement, Oruro, 4 March, 2000.} describes the different routes that were adopted for the Carnival Parade through its development. It points out that when the Diablada was still performed by miners, they came dancing from the mines and used the narrow streets and marginal paths to approach the temple. Beltrán Heredia (1956) presents a photograph where the Devil Dancers are seen dancing on the sides, while the pasantes ("ritual sponsors") and over a hundred mules with the cargamentos\footnote{Silverware and coins carried to the temple of the Virgin in a symbolic gesture of thankfulness. The presence of the cargamentos used to be central to the Carnival Parade of the past, where their numbers were greater than the number of dancers for every group. Nowadays, there is generally one single cargamento in every group, usually carried by automobiles.} march in the middle of the road. The aforementioned
article suggests that the picture had been taken in the early twentieth century, when although the dancers did not go near the central plaza, they already used some central streets (like Soria Galvarro, Cochabamba, Washington and Junín) for their performance.\textsuperscript{13}

It is also suggested that, since some groups were already dancing near the Central Square, the local municipal government issued specific prohibitions and ordinances, to avoid the display of the "Indian’s bad customs" in the centre of the city. Abercrombie (1992) quotes a newspaper article published in 1924, where the local attitude towards the “Indian” carnival is typified:

“As usual, the groups of Devils, Incas, Sicos, Tundikis, Llameros and so on, keep on dancing through the streets of the city. These uncultured customs persist this year again, but we embrace the hope that they will be banned for next year” (Manuel Rodríguez, La Palestra, Oruro, 28 February 1924. Quoted by Abercrombie, 1992:298. My translation).

Cabezas (2000) mentions that a municipal mayor once banned the entry of the dancers in the central part of the city, because it was the site where the local social “cream” used to celebrate their carnival. However, he also points out that after the Chaco War (which finished in 1935), the local Municipal Government and the Prefecture were already involved in the organisation of the Entrada.

\textsuperscript{13} For a graphic illustration of such changes in the route of the dance parade, see the city plan in figure No. 22.
Figure 22. Transformation of the Carnival Parade's Official Route
For many decades (more or less between mid 1930s until mid 1980s), the official route started in the Parque de la Unión Nacional (the “National Unity” Park) on Avenida 6 de Octubre. This gave origin, according to Cabezas (ibid), to the following lyrics of a Diablada tune: “Por la 6 de Octubre, por la plaza principal, vamos a cantar, vamos a bailar”. The lyrics mark the spatial transformation of the Entrada, from a marginal “Indian” festival rejected by the authorities and the elite of Oruro, to the official festivity of the upper middle classes. It was established then that the dancers have to perform in front of both, the Alcaldía (Municipal Town-Hall) and the Prefecture. In 1998 the route was redirected around the central square, avoiding the Municipal Town-Hall (through La Plata, Adolfo Mier and Presidente Montes), because the city mayor did not provide the expected economic support for the organisation of the festivity.

There have been several changes in the route during the last decades, mainly due to the need of wider spaces, given the increased number of dancers. Avenida 6 de Octubre was first replaced by Avenida Pagador, and later Pagador was replaced by Avenida del Folklore (or 6 de Agosto), to go from North to South. The current route starts at the junction of Avenida del Folklore and Villarroel, going South until Bolivar, then West until Presidente Montes, where the Prefecture building in the central

14 "Through the (Avenue) 6 de Octubre, through the main plaza, we’re going to sing, we’re going to dance". This is another instance of a self-referential social commentary in the lyrics of the carnival tunes. It is sung in Spanish and it also underlines the fact that the dancers will perform in the main central places of the city.

15 Pagador is wider than 6 de Octubre, and Avenida del Folklore is the widest avenue in Oruro.
square lies. After the plaza, the procession turns to the West again on Adolfo Mier until reaching Avenida Cívica, before approaching the Plaza del Folklore and the Temple of the Virgin.¹⁶

The above mentioned transformations of the official route pertain to the most general level of analysis of the spatial configuration of the Carnival Parade. After illustrating how the elite and the local authorities held in contempt the Entrada of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, it becomes clear that their new view of the festivity is directly related to the changes in the social composition of the dance groups. As a matter of fact, the authorities that used to criticise the Indian Fiesta were then in charge of organising the urban event. The rejected and marginal presence of the “Indian” celebrations in the city was replaced by an official parade with a route specifically designed to pass in front of the main official buildings, in the central square of the city. This basically illustrates the transformation of the Oruro Carnival Parade from an “Indian” (and later cholo) affair into a mestizo festival. The increasing participation of representatives of the elite in the present suggests the final appropriation of the festivity by the dominating social stratum. However, a closer look at the events developed through the celebration of carnival reveals the coexistence of multiple spatial practices, which also illustrates the heterogeneity of the festival. A more detailed account of popular behaviour will show, at a more specific analytical level, how carnival is

¹⁶ For a graphic illustration of the spatial development of the Carnival Parade, see figure 22.
chaotically re-interpreted, as gluttony, drunkenness and lust are incorporated into a counter-discursive enactment of carnival.  

The Social Construction of Space

Having discussed the route of the Carnival Parade and its transformations, it is now relevant to consider the social construction of space and the re-interpretation of place through the Entrada. As mentioned earlier, the start of the Saturday Pilgrimage is characterised as a relatively quiet and solemn act led by representatives of the Catholic Church and the local authorities. A couple of policemen riding motorcycles and using their sirens precede the official opening of the event. In a similar way to the Candle Procession, the official Carnival Parade is led by representatives of the Catholic Church and the “Forces of Order”, which marks the solemnity and seriousness surrounding the Saturday Pilgrimage.

Most of the tiers are still empty, and it is easy to watch the dancers from any place in the early hours when the Entrada starts. The public begins to fill the streets and the tiers framing the route, as the Mañazos perform in front of the Prefecture, two hours after the opening of the Entrada. The seats flanking the official route of the Carnival Parade are completely crowded before noon on Saturday.

---

17 This will be discussed in Chapter Eight.
18 The oldest Devil Dance group, which is usually the one that opens the dance performances of the Carnival Parade.
Only when the esplanade is clear may people wander around through the official route. Many enthusiastic (unofficial) dancers follow the brass bands playing behind the blocks of dancers. The pedestrians who wish to cross the streets within the official route need to wait until there is no dance performance at that particular point. The passageways for pedestrians are usually full of people pushing and waiting for their chance to cross or to enter the esplanade.

Many spectators wear raincoats during the Entrada, for there is general water splashing in the streets.\(^{19}\) The only ones that are completely protected from being splashed with water or foam are the official members of the dance groups and the brass bands\(^{20}\). Thus it is possible to observe a general pattern of water splashing, following the performance of the dance groups on the esplanade: there are water balloon battles between the spectators sitting on opposed rows of seats, but they stop immediately when a dance group approaches.\(^{21}\)

This gives place to a particular configuration of the (mutually coterminous) official and unofficial celebration of carnival. The dance performances mark the presence and passage of the official celebration through a particular place, while their departure from that particular place

---

\(^{19}\) Water splashing can be typified as the general activity developed in the whole country during carnival.

\(^{20}\) There are special regulations and laws that prohibit splashing the dancers with water. Perhaps this is one of the most strictly obeyed rules, strongly reinforced through its general assimilation by the public.

\(^{21}\) Another water splashing pattern refers to cross-gender teasing and flirting: boys and girls walk around the esplanade (between the performances of two groups) looking for someone of the opposite sex to splash with water or foam.
marks the re-establishment of water splashing and general chaos. I was often surprised to see that even old people would be splashed without much disapproval of the public in general. However, there would be general condemnation if anyone threw a water balloon to a dancer. The dancers are protected from water splashing, but not from the rain. I have seen dancers performing under heavy rain, until a hailstorm literally forced them to halt and wait for some time. When the dancers stop performing before the end of their participation in the \textit{Entrada}, they usually rest and have some refreshments, but they always stay within the official route on the esplanade.

\* \* \*

\textit{Avenida del Folklore} is a favourite one of the locals, for its width and length enables the groups to develop special choreographic moves, with the Devil Dancers being the first ones to exhibit their complex spatial figures. The narrow \textit{calle Bolivar} does not allow for the performance of complex choreography, but the numbers and strength of dancers and musicians are enhanced by this enclosed context. \textit{Plaza 10 de Febrero} is another place for special choreography, particularly at the foot of the Prefecture Building, where all national and international authorities are gathered. \textit{Adolfo Mier} is also a narrow street that enables a different

\begin{flushleft}
\begin{footnotesize}
\footnotesize
22 Usually because they have to wait, before the dance group in front of them conclude performing their special choreography at the plaza or the Avenida Cívica.

23 Calle Bolivar is a street that is closed to the vehicular traffic on a daily basis through the year, but there are plans to transform it into a permanent pedestrian walk, with movable flower pots in the middle, for their convenient removal during carnival (\textit{La Patria}, Oruro, 6 March 2000).
\end{footnotesize}
\end{flushleft}
appreciation of the dances. Finally, there are the Avenida Cívica and the Plaza del Folklore, where all groups make their last special performance before entering the temple. The Devil Dancers’ Relato (a dramatised dialogue between the forces of good and evil24) is performed on Avenida Cívica.

As mentioned earlier, there are particular places within the official route that are off limits for those who do not hold a special ticket or badge. One of them is the plaza, particularly in front of the Prefecture on Presidente Montes Avenue. Nevertheless, people often dance following the brass bands around the plaza; something that they would usually not be allowed to do in the other two main exclusive places, Avenida Cívica and Plaza del Folklore. These are the two last places for the groups’ dance performances, before they enter the Temple of the Virgin of the Mineshaft. People who do not carry the necessary credentials are not allowed on the esplanade in these particular places, during the development of the Entrada.

However, these two places are also the scenario for other events at different times of the month, the week and the day. I have already mentioned that Plaza del Folklore is the place where the dancers of the Anata Andina finish their performances and gather to have their communal meal. It is also the place where several fairs are held in the months that precede carnival. Thus, the Plaza del Folklore is often

24 See the section on Diablada, in Chapter Four.
crowded by people selling or buying food, drinks, handicrafts, raffle numbers, and so on. The *Alba* rite takes place in this same location - after all the groups have performed at the *Entrada* - early in the morning on Sunday Carnival.

* 

Thousands of people gather in the *Plaza del Folklore* to dance, sing, eat and drink, while waiting for the sun to rise.25 I always perceived the *Alba* rite as the climax of the carnival celebrations in Oruro, as the place and the time where most formalities and regulations are overlooked. While temporal perception can be altered through the effects of alcohol and the cacophony produced by hundreds of musicians during the *Alba* rite,26 a chaotic spatial scenario is created by the crowds. People of different races and social strata are “indiscriminately” mixed during this event. But far from this being the result of a peaceful atmosphere produced by the joint celebration of carnival, the public is forced, pushed, and almost squashed together by an overpopulated space/place, created by their own presence. Standing in the middle of the *Plaza del Folklore*, absorbing the chaotic musicality through the pores, following the massive *Morenada* rhythm of the crowds I felt, time and again, the fusion of space and place during the *Alba* rite. Considering Certeau’s (1984) conceptualisations of space and place as the intersection of mobile elements and the instantaneous

25 However, many interlocutors have stated that the *Alba* rite is directed to Venus, rather than the sun.
26 This will be discussed in Chapter Six.
configuration of positions, respectively, I propose that both, space and place melt together during this event. Mobile elements simultaneously intersect and configure new positions while people dance and wait for the sun to rise (or greet Venus, the morning star), “moving without moving” and with no specific direction.

One could easily panic, if trying to leave the crowded centre of the plaza at once, or if resisting the rhythm of the massive movements. I learned to melt into the crowds by just following the rhythm around me. I also learned to move in different directions by fastening myself around the appropriate flow of crowds. It is possible to observe different flows of people at the Alba rite, and one just needs to identify which one is going in the desired direction. It is important to approach it slowly and always dancing Morenada - not just because people will be more sympathetic and let you go through if they see you dancing, but also because it is the general rhythm of both, the dance steps and the circulation of the people. I often found myself dancing Morenada unwittingly during carnival. This happened usually during or after the Alba rite, when after so many hours of cacophony, drinking and dancing, the rhythm had taken possession of my body and my mind.

The closeness of the people during the Alba rite does not necessarily suggest the existence of social harmony, or the creation of “communitas”. On the contrary, the general drunkenness and the effervescence of the festival create an appropriate atmosphere for violent aggressions between
different groups of people. In 1995 I observed, for example, a fight between two groups composed by six and three young men, respectively. This happened behind one of the brass bands, on the southern side of the Plaza del Folklore. The guys of the larger group seemed to belong to the high class of La Paz\textsuperscript{27} while the other three were certainly cholos, as they had more “Indian” features. The three men defended themselves bravely, but were eventually defeated by the other six.

After the fight was over, I watched the young men from La Paz follow the one that seemed to be their leader, apparently looking for another group to fight with. The subject that acted as a leader was the tallest and blondest of his group. He pointed out some place in the middle of the square and they disappeared. The defeated men were talking about the possibility of winning the fight if they had just one more man on their side. Hours later I saw them together with a fourth man, apparently looking for the other group. I do not know if they found them, and I never saw them again. However, the next day, as I was watching the Sunday Carnival a friend of mine laughed and pointed at a very sad drunk boy who looked like a dwarf. He was dragging his feet and had a long string of snot hanging down from his red nose. It was the young man that proudly led the group of six the night before. As I looked at him, I noticed that he did not look like he was beaten up, but he seemed to be very lonely.

\textsuperscript{27} They were probably from the Zona Sur; I could tell this from their looks and their accents.
I would argue that if carnival brings people together, it does not mean that it eliminates socio-economic and cultural differences. While I have shared drinks and chats with people I never saw before, I also witnessed many cases of violence, mainly between people of different social classes. Social differences may also be observed in the representational sphere of carnival: if a common carnivalesque image is the poor dressed like the rich, this, instead of dissolving the distances between the rich and the poor rather highlights them even more.

*

In his essay on Brazilian Carnival, Roberto Da Matta (1984) asserts that the distinction between the main social domains of Brazilian society - the house, the street and the other world – are blurred through the "democratisation" of carnival in Brazil. In a typically structuralist approach, he points out the equivalence of these three social domains with the main three social spaces he observes in the carnival ball: the tables, the dance floor and the private rooms or boxes. As Da Matta himself later clarifies, different house styles correspond to the different social strata of Brazilian society. While the plaza is to the city what the drawing room is to the urban house (of the upper middle classes), the streets of the favelas ("shanty-towns") are an extension of the house (Da Matta, 1991: 66-67).

Da Matta also argues that carnival brings people of different socio-economic strata together, through the freedom that the individuals have to
choose their preferred dance group and carnival ball. However, he admits
that it is money that brings people together, allowing anyone to “buy an
invitation” to participate in the different carnival balls, because even the
most exclusive private clubs “open up” during carnival. Needless to say,
some of them are much more expensive than others. Da Matta claims that
there are no hierarchical relations between the different carnivals:

“if there are different carnivals, they all follow the same
rules and use the same crucial elements for dramatisation.
They are like soccer [football] games played by different
teams – some poor, some rich, some white, some black”

I think Da Matta’s comparison is rather unfortunate, because it is unlikely
that a football team of a favela could share the pitch with the highly
successful international Brazilian footballers (although some of them may
have very humble origins), unless it was a demonstration. Similarly,
although the rich may join the poor in the carnival demonstrations in the
streets, and the private clubs “open up” during carnival, the latter
maintain their exclusivity through the prices of their “invitations”. In
relation to the spatial/social stratification of the spectators, I have no
doubts that the famous Brazilian Maracanã stadium incorporates similar
distinctions to those of the hierarchically constructed grand-stands of the
equally famous Sambodromo of Rio, especially constructed for the
carnival parade. Da Matta informs us that the prices of the sambodromo’s
seats range from $5 to $733 (op cit.:83), hardly a choice for the poor.
Similar features are identified in Oruro, where the “people’s carnival” can be observed from different perspectives, more often than not related to class differences. Some may, for example, watch the dance parade from above, if they have access to the Prefecture building at the Central Square, while others may watch it from behind, when following a brass band. Others may choose not to watch the Carnival Parade, but to experience carnival in alternative ways (e.g. drinking and dancing in private houses, in bars, or in the streets). However, if there is a particular moment when people of different cultural and socio-economic backgrounds are “closer to each other” during carnival, it must be the Alba rite. After describing the spatial enactment of this event - in which people are practically “squashed” together – I will discuss in the following chapter how the temporal dimension of carnival also achieves a dramatic peak during the tumultuous Alba rite.

***
The coterminous and dialectic relation between movement and pause, which is often linked to the notions of space and place, is also useful to explain the other grand dimension of everyday life: time. While Aristotle specified that time is not motion, but its measure, he also recognised the circularity of his definition: “We measure the movement by the time and vice versa” (Gale, 1967:3).

According to Richard Gale, the problem of time refers to a corpus of intimately related questions concerning truth, knowledge, things, events, causality, identification, action and change (op.cit.:vii). Using such concepts - and many others, such as motion, repetition and succession - have scholars struggled to define time through thousands of years. As it is clearly illustrated in St. Augustine’s famous lament:

“What, then, is time? If no one asks me, I know: if I wish to explain it to one that asketh, I know not” (op.cit:40).”

Thus although time constitutes a completely familiar dimension of our daily lives, an attempt to define it introduces endless puzzles which might be related to its overall relation to life and death, as much as to its inapprehensible nature. Regarding the Oruro Carnival, I would suggest that its status of cultural intangible heritage of humanity could probably be most
clearly identified in relation to the temporal dimension of the festival. It is rather notable that the documents submitted by the Bolivian government to UNESCO do not specifically and directly link the temporal dimension (and its inapprehensibility) to the cultural intangibility of the Oruro Carnival Parade. However, they do underline the musical richness of the festival, which is arguably an important component of carnival temporality in Oruro.

* In this chapter I will discuss the temporal and musical dimension of carnival, which often permeates the imageries depicted in both the official and unofficial-chaotic celebrations. I will suggest that, as the musical richness of carnival achieves a dramatic climax during the development of the Alba rite, it may transform the participants’ temporal perception. Although I will not provide a semiotic analysis, it is necessary to pay a brief preliminary attention to the symbolic representation of time, given its central place in anthropological studies of carnival.

* Edmund Leach (1972) asserts that repetition and irreversibility constitute two notions that are inherent to our modern understanding of time. According to Leach, repetition marks each interval of time, which has also a beginning and
an end. He argues that religious dogmas have the tendency to deny the irreversibility of time, by equating it to the (opposite) concept of repetition. That is, for example, equating death with birth.\footnote{Bloch and Parry (1982) discuss the relation between the denial of the irreversible and terminal nature of death and the avoidance to recognize time's irreversibility, in funerary rituals.}

In his second essay on the symbolic representation of time, Leach asserts that amongst those societies where there are no calendars of the Nautical Almanac type, the progress of a year is marked by a succession of festivals. Each festival representing a temporary transit from the Normal-Profane sphere to the Abnormal-Sacred sphere of experience, and back again (Leach, 1972: 207-8). This gives rise to four distinct phases or states of the “moral person” (sacralisation, marginal state, desacralisation and normal secular life) and three distinctive kinds of ritual behaviour (formality, masquerade and role reversal).

Leach considers formality and masquerade as a pair of contrasted oppositions, while role reversal is seen as symbolising a complete transference from the secular to the sacred (op cit.:210). Role reversal is thus explained in reference to the logical opposition between the state of normal secular life and the marginal state, symbolically represented in the performative reversed behaviour of social actors.
Max Gluckman (1973 [1956]) asserts that, although such rites of reversal may include a protest against the established order, they are intended to preserve it, and even to strengthen it. On the other hand, Turner (1969) argued that the liminal period constitutes a phase of anti-structure and that long periods of liminality lead to the creation of a social togetherness, which he termed “communitas”.

These issues are undoubtedly highly relevant for an analysis of the symbolic sphere of carnival, and they are usually incorporated within a semiotic approach (Cf. Da Matta 1984, 1991; Ivanov 1984). However, symbolic representations are considered in the present work mainly in relation to local discourses and the actual behaviour of social actors. I would therefore argue that both formality and masquerade pertain in this context to the local official discourse on carnival, rather than constituting a pair of contrasted oppositions. Instead of concentrating on the symbolic representation of time, I will focus on the effects of music upon temporal perception. I shall first provide a brief review of the philosophical and anthropological literature on time, to discuss it then in relation to the musical sphere of the carnival celebrations in Oruro.

**Temporal Perception**

The literary critic Hans Meyerhoff (1968) pointed out the need to contextualise the questions we ask about time, and underlined the irreconcilability between
time in experience and time in nature, which led to divergent philosophical interpretations. Experienced (subjective) time differs radically from the regular, uniform and quantitative units of an objective metric (op.cit.: 13). Meyerhoff considers that the human mind can be thought of as a recording instrument and that memory relations, unlike time in nature, exhibit a non uniform, dynamic order of events:

"Things remembered are fused and confused with things feared and hoped for. Wishes and fantasies may not only be remembered as facts, but the facts remembered are constantly modified, reinterpreted and re-lived in the light of the present exigencies, past fears, and future hopes." (Meyerhoff, op cit.:21-22).

In contrast, the philosopher D.H. Mellor (1981) asserts that our perception of the flow of time is only an accumulation of memories, and that the flow of time takes us into the future (rather than the past) because a memory is an effect (not a cause) of what is remembered. According to him, causal order fixes temporal order, distinguishing it from spatial order. This is to say that causes precede their effects in time, rather than in space.

Mellor's approach is thus strongly supported by the idea of causation, and it is in reference to causes and effects that he explains the impossibility of cyclical time. For him, the direction of time is the direction of causation (op.cit.:150), and the impossibility of 'time travel' is explained by the impossibility of backward causation. Future events can only be predicted, not yet perceived, because backward causation (which the perception of future events would
require) is impossible (op.cit.:166). Therefore, according to Mellor, we cannot act on what we have perceived, or perceive what we will act on.²

The anthropologist Alfred Gell (1992) draws on Mellor’s philosophy of time to reject metaphysical assumptions based on ethnographic research, such as time-reversal:

"... there is no fairyland where people experience time in a way that is markedly unlike the way in which we do ourselves, where there is no past, present and future, where time stands still, or chases its own tail, or swings back and forth like a pendulum..... [he also states that] ...there is no contradiction between allowing that time can be studied in many different cultural and ethnographic contexts, and can be understood with the aid of many different analytical frameworks, while simultaneously maintaining that time is always one and the same, a familiar dimensional property of our experienced surroundings." (Gell, 1992:315).

Gell underlines that mundane social processes constitute the background for the ritual reconstruction of the world, according to human desires. While it is accepted that rituals dramatise time, and even manipulate it, they do not create it or modify it, except rhetorically or symbolically (ibid). Gell also emphasises the importance of distinguishing time from the events that happen in time, as well as the interplay between objective and subjective aspects of temporality, which requires the development of a theory of time cognition.

²Mellor presents these ‘impossibilities’ as axioms. However, he does not take into account the perception of dreams, which could add further complexity to the subject, given the special temporality of dreams and the alleged oneiric perception of future events, often linked to cases of paramnesia or déjà vu. Although I have no ethnographic examples of the latter, cases of oneiric premonitions are provided in the section on Dancing and Dreaming of Chapter Seven.
Husserl's theory is, according to Gell, the most careful and intricate account of subjective time available to us. Both Brentano (Husserl's teacher) and Husserl have used musical examples to explain the problem of continuity of the subjective/perceptual present, and the model of internal time consciousness, respectively (Gell, 1992).

Brentano explained the perception of a temporally continuous time-object in relation to the following question: how can we hear a continuous tone played in an oboe for five seconds as a continuous duration? He supposed

"...that we only hear the now-present tone, but that we enrich this hearing with 'associations' derived from earlier hearing-experiences in the sequence" (op.cit.:222).

In relation to such "associations", Husserl introduced the concepts of 'retention' and 'protention', distinguishing the former from 'reproduction', which is an action-replay of past experiences of events. While retentions are what we have of temporally removed parts of experiences (from the 'now' moment), protentions are their future-oriented counterparts (ibid). Therefore, retentions and protentions form the horizon of a temporally extended present, where the 'knife edge now' is replaced by the 'thick present'. Retentions and protentions should not be thought of as fixed and static, but always in a dynamic context.
Thus as the present progresses, the past changes its significance, and is evaluated differently, according to the development of present events (op. cit.:226). Gell suggests that perspectival diminuitions and attenuations could be a powerful metaphor to explain this process, but that we should be aware of the differences between temporal perspective and visual perspective. While the former is related mainly to the sphere of time and memory, the latter refers mainly to the sphere of space and vision.

In a posterior work, Gell (1995) evaluates how his own visually-oriented notion of reality had prevented him (during fieldwork in Melanesia) from understanding the Umeda’s distinctive perceptual framework, because they defined objective existence in terms of audibility (Gell, 1995:238-239). A similar reflection should prevent us from imposing the visual bias characteristic of the anthropological gaze, so we could allow ourselves to perceive and describe the temporal/audible sphere of events.

**Musical Temporality**

The philosopher of music Victor Zuckerkandl (1956) conceives music as a temporal art, in the sense that in it time reveals itself to experience. According to him, the feeling of rhythm - taken as a genuine experience, is the experience (or even the cognition) of time itself.
Zuckerkandl also underlines the differences between the musical and the physical concepts of time: while the physical concept takes time as order and form of experience, the musical concept takes it as content of experience. While physical time measures events and is - according to physics and its models - divisible into equal parts, musical time produces events and knows no equality of parts. The musical existence of time is the same as its activity; meter and rhythm are the effects of the flow of time in the tones (ibid.).

"Because tones have duration, because time elapses in them, and for no other reason, we have the rhythm of our music. Only time can be the agent and source of the forces active in meter and rhythm." (Zuckercandl, 1956:206).

Such a musical concept of time makes it possible to compare Husserl's "protentions" with a "musical-temporal anticipation":

"...our foreknowledge is concerned with the stream of events; our hearing is concerned with the stream of time. So far as I know and represent to myself what is to come, I do not hear; and so far as I hear, I do not know and do not represent to myself what is to come." (op.cit.:233).

This does not necessarily run against Husserl’s arguments, for he also specified that protensions are not representations of the future, but rather some sort of temporal (and musical) anticipation. Similarly, while Husserl underlined the importance of distinguishing retentions from repetitions, Zuckerkandl reminds us that the past and the future can be there, without being remembered and being foreknown. According to Zuckercandl, it is thanks to music:
"... that the past is not stored in memory but in time, and that it is not our consciousness which anticipates time but that time anticipates itself. The possibility of music and of every temporal Gestalt rests entirely upon the premise of a time so constituted, of a time that stores itself and anticipates itself." (op.cit.:235)

Not only Husserl's theory of internal time consciousness, but many of the concepts generally linked to the definitions of time become more comprehensible in relation to musical rhythm, in the light of Zuckerkandl's work. Motion, according to him, cannot be without time:

"Motion in a realm from which things and space are absent is, thanks to music, a substantiated fact; motion in a realm from which time is absent is self-contradictory" (op.cit.:151).

The succession of beats and the duration of tones are also explained in reference to the flow of time, taking into account the combination of progression and recurrence in the notion of temporal succession. Finally, Zuckercandl states that musicians are led, from their observations, to opposite conclusions than those of philosophers and psychologists: "Change does not create time; time literally creates change." (op.cit.:185). The discussion of such a philosophical dilemma lies beyond the scope of this dissertation. However, the concepts of motion, succession, progression, recurrence and change will underlie my discussion on the (altered) temporal perception through musical performance during carnival.
Musical/Temporal Perception in Oruro

The celebration of carnival marks, within a broader yearly festive cycle, the end of the rainy season in the Andes. According to Olivia Harris (1982), the Aymara-speaking Laymi - who are rural inhabitants of the department of Oruro – divide the year

“into two contrasted halves, each marked by a feast of the dead; one half is a time for sorrow and hard work, while the other is dedicated to feasting, pleasure and rest from their labours” (Harris, 1982:45).

Although there are notable differences between the ways in which All Saints and Carnival are celebrated in rural and urban contexts of Bolivia, there are also some common features of these feasts which, according to Harris (op.cit.), are perceived by the Laymi as *muntu intiru* or world-wide celebrations. While All Saints is a spring festival that marks the time for sowing and planting and the start of the rains in the Andes, Carnival marks the end of the rains and the harvest of the new year’s first fruits (op.cit.: 56-57).

The distinctive features of such calendrical rites are enhanced by the musical sphere of the feasts. Harris points out that All Saints initiates the time of *wayñus* - “melodies played on wooden flutes [*tarkas*] whose explicitly mournful tones pervade the whole season and attract rain” (ibid.) - and stresses that it was through music that she realised how the souls of the dead are believed to remain in the world of the living throughout the rainy season. Thus
the flutes that provided the mournful melodies during the rainy season are piled
together after performing a ritual dispatch of the dead (represented by the devil
dancers amongst the Laymi), and the charangos (small mandolin-like
instruments, made of armadillo shells) are then used to perform a radically
different musical style (kirki). This marks not only the end of the rainy season,
but also the departure of the dead, which proscribes the performance of wayñus
and the use of the wooden flutes (tarkas) at this dramatic point of time (Harris,
1982). Harris explains that this is attributed to the fact that

“Flute music attracts rain\(^3\); it is a form of dirge and thus will not
cause offence to the dead, whose co-operation is essential to bring
the crops to fruition. In stark contrast, the music of the dry season
is joyful and celebratory. The wayñu music of the rainy season is
said to weep (q’asi) while the kirki of the dry season is happy
(kusisi).” (Harris, op.cit.: 60).

Similarly, Henry Stobart (1996) suggests that music, as the culturally
determined formation of sound, constitutes an appropriate basis for the analysis
of cultural and cognitive categories and concepts of growth and regeneration in
the Andes. Thus sound may be equated, according to him, with the animation
of living beings, for musical performance is an essential and generative part of
life (ibid.). Stobart shows how distinctive musical instruments, tunings and
genres are understood to directly influence climatic conditions and plant
growth.
Some propitiatory rites are also performed in urban areas through mimetic acts that, although in some cases are closer to the rural traditions, hold little (if any) resemblance to the latter. The participation of musicians playing traditional Andean musical instruments does not constitute a main feature of the Entrada or official Carnival Parade. The overwhelming majority of brass instruments during carnival 2000, for example, clearly illustrates the predominance of brass bands and the comparatively small proportion of tarkas and other traditional instruments. That year, 105 brass bands (with a total number of 4010 musicians) participated in the Entrada, while only 5 groups played traditional Andean musical instruments (which could not have surpassed the number of 200 musicians).4

However, I would question a strict dichotomy between traditional and modern instruments and melodies, since many of the musicians who play in Oruro play also traditional instruments in their rural villages, while some of the most popular rhythms of the Oruro Carnival are said to have their origins in traditional music performed in rural contexts. Don Juan Apaza,5 who is a prolific composer of Morenada tunes, asserted for example that the Morenada

3 In an appendix of his book "the masked media", Hans Buechler states that, on the contrary, in Irpa Chico (a community in the department of La Paz) the tarka was played when too much rain was falling, because its hoarse sound was considered to attract dry spells (1980: 358).
4 The information was obtained from the ACFO's statistic charts. While the numbers of brass band - musicians are specified in the documents, they do not provide detailed accounts of the traditional instruments.
5 Interviewed in August 2000.
has developed as a slight modification of wayñu, but that it actually has a rhythm of its own. He argues that composing Morenedas is not as easy as it seems, because the rhythm has to be accurately paired and balanced.

Don Juan was born in 1953 in the community Villa Kairiri of the Umala cantonment in the department of La Paz. Both of his parents were also from Umala and migrated to Oruro during the decade of 1930. All their relatives moved to Oruro during the 1920s, to commercialise the coca leaf, alcohol and aniline dying powder. They organised themselves and created a musical group, playing the tarkas. Don Juan learned to play the instrument in Kairiri when he was young, and he later heard about the Morenada of the Cocanis (coca leaf traders), his relatives. He remembers that he used to call the Cocanis tíos and tías ("uncles" and "aunts"), because they were all considered kin.

Don Juan asserts that his musical compositions are always inspired in strong feelings, like Marcelino Flores, the tune dedicated to the President of the Cocanis, or Quiero la Felicidad and Donde Puedo Verte, both dedicated to his late wife. He recalls that when his wife died, he felt so deeply sad that he looked for her everywhere. She had left him with so many memories that he did not know where to find her, in heaven or on earth, and this dilemma is exactly what his lyrics describe. Musical compositions constitute an important feature that complements and often permeates the carnivalesque imageries of Oruro.
Another recognised local composer and musician is don Sinforiano Gonzalez. Unfortunately I could not manage to establish an interview with him, but I did interview his son, don Abel Gonzalez, who is also a musician. Don Sinforiano Gonzalez is the director and founding member of the famous Poopó Brass Band. Don Sinforiano is one of the few local composers who can write and read music. After working in the mines for 20 years, he worked for some time as a peasant, until he learned to write and read music from his father in law, who learned in the army during the first half of the twentieth century. In 1964 don Sinforiano founded the famous Poopó Band in the Poopó province of Oruro, with the support of the miners.

Don Abel Gonzalez remembers that as a child he used to admire his father as a musician. He asserts that his father never pushed him to play music, because he wanted him to go to school. Nevertheless, don Abel wanted so badly to be a musician that he asked his mother to cut the lids of large lard tins, so that he could play them as cymbals. He used to hide the tins and go to the top of a hill, where he would imitate the brass instruments with his mouth, accompanying the melody with his improvised cymbals.

6 "Where can I see you?".
7 Another exception is Gerardo Yañez, a member of the Morenada Central Oruro fundada por la comunidad Cocanis.
8 Interviewed on 22 August 2000.
When the members of the Poopó Brass Band gathered to play, little Abel used to steal bottles of beer from his parents’ store, to offer to the musicians. They were all very fond of him. When he was eleven years old, don Abel moved to Oruro and played the trumpet at the school band. Then he told his father that he wanted to play with the band, and his father bought him a small pair of cymbals. He has been playing with the Poopó Brass Band ever since, and is today the leader of the Cymbal players. The cymbal players are very important components of the bands, because apart from displaying playful choreographic moves and marking the rhythm, they also mark the start and end of the performances. Before discussing the actual musical performances in the Oruro Carnival, let us review briefly some relevant issues concerning the history of festive musical performances in the Andes.

*  

According to Juan Carlos Estenssoro, trumpets were introduced early during Spanish colonial times in the Andes, where music may be seen as an important element of political representation. He asserts that the Catholic Church was in charge, since its arrival in the sixteenth century, of controlling the musical performances. In a first period, this entailed the introduction of Western instruments and the instruction for their appropriate use, as well as the

---

9 See figure 23, don Abel Gonzalez playing his cymbals close to Rolando Barrientos of the Morenada Central Cocanis (see Chapters Four and Seven).

10 Amerindian Seminar, given at the Centre of Indigenous American Studies and Exchange, University of St Andrews, 28 July 2002.
Figure 23. Rolando Barrientos of the Morenada Central Oruro, fundada por la Comunidad Cocani, dancing next to don Abel Gonzalez of the Banda Poopó.
prohibition to perform other non-sacred music (Estenssoro, 1989:79). However, given the apparent impossibility of eliminating the fiestas, colonial authorities searched for ways to regulate them, in order to ensure on the one hand that such cultural manifestations were directed to the “true God”, and to keep them under control, on the other (Estenssoro, 1992 a). Thus through the incorporation of Andean fiestas into the colonial system, the Church managed to absorb them as another institution of the new regime, transforming an important part of its forms and contents (op.cit.: 181).

_Cofradías_, or “religious brotherhoods” of Indians and blacks were then introduced as a useful mechanism to organise and control the performance of fiestas, which were to be enacted in public (ibid.). This gave place to a simultaneous representation of different types of music, dance and political authorities in the streets, a phenomenon that Estenssoro (1992 a) calls a “multi-corality characteristic of a Baroque aesthetics. However, the reforms introduced by the first illustrated archbishop of Lima in 1750 prohibited any medium which might make possible a festive behaviour, including profane music and excessive sensuality. Therefore, a “formula of the unison” was imposed against the aforementioned “multi-corality”, with Gregorian chants as the only music to be performed during any religious celebration. According to Estenssoro, the indigenous rebellions of the eighteenth century marked the definitive rupture of the “colonial tolerance” towards indigenous authorities and cultural manifestations, giving place to the prohibition of using any
traditional instruments (op.cit.:188-9). Popular festive manifestations barely survived for a while, according to the same author, being used to create a local urban identity. Cultural manifestations of indigenous origin were however directly rejected by the elite towards the first half of the nineteenth century (op.cit.:193).

Estenssoro identifies three periods between the seventeenth and nineteenth centuries: the establishment of an urban colonial society (1680 – 1790), when the Catholic Church acted as a “controller” of cultural manifestations; the rupture of a consensus regarding the function and value of music (which coincides with the introduction of ideas of illustration, between 1755 and 1820), when the Church tends to cancel any “alien” music; and the defeat of a possible consensus of an illuminist aesthetics (1813 – 1840), which marks the end of the ecclesiastical intervention (Estenssoro, 1989: 127-128).

The Spanish trumpets that first caused awe amongst the indigenous peoples were later used by foreign and indigenous authorities as a sign of power and prestige, being transmitted in a hereditary way and used, together with other Western instruments, to demonstrate the power of the Caciques (local indigenous authorities recognised by the Spanish crown). The introduction of brass bands into rural Andean festivities also entails relations of power and prestige in contemporary Bolivia.
As mentioned earlier, the musical sphere of the carnival season in the city of Oruro is marked by an absolute predominance of brass bands. One probable exception could refer to the private parties held in different houses and clubs of the city, where brass bands may be replaced by other musical groups using electric instruments. Late in the evening of Carnival Saturday (during the early hours of Carnival Sunday), when all dance groups hold such private parties, a distinct, more popular and public affair takes place. It is the Alba rite that, I would argue, encapsulates the popular celebration and the musical frenzy of the Oruro Carnival. After having discussed the spatial configuration of the Alba rite, I shall now discuss its temporal and musical sphere.

I have already mentioned that the tumultuous Alba rite takes place between Saturday evening and Sunday morning. However, I must stress that this entails more than just a fixed position of the event within the schedule of the local celebrations. As a matter of fact, I would argue that it is not possible to determine exactly when the Alba rite starts and ends. In the year 2000, for example, it started before the Saturday Pilgrimage was over, and in 2002 it had not finished yet, when the Sunday Parade approached the Plaza del Folklore.

These bands usually play morenadas, diabladas, and other rhythms of the local carnival, apart from the popular Latin American cumbia and salsa.
Given its "intermediate position", between the official Catholic Pilgrimage of Saturday and the more popular (and pagan) Sunday Parade, this rite could be interpreted as a threshold, or as representing the phase of desacralisation, in Leach's terms. Nevertheless, I would suggest that interpreting it in symbolic terms would downplay its effectiveness in transforming the "sacred" into the "profane", in degrading the elevated. I am not arguing that symbolic representations are not effective, but that instead of concentrating on the symbolic agency of the events, I focus on their actual enactment. Therefore, instead of trying to explain what the musical sphere of the Alba rite means, I will concentrate on what it does. That is, I will describe its effects upon temporal perception.

The temporality of the Alba rite can be addressed at different levels. I shall first consider its temporal location within the general carnival celebrations. The "intermediate position" (between Saturday and Sunday) of this tumultuous event denotes its temporal liminality within the official schedule: it does not belong to Saturday or Sunday. At the same time, this enables the Alba rite to transform - through its very presence and development - the event that precedes it and the one that follows it.

---

12 See Chapter Five.
13 See Leach (1972), above.
14 See below and Chapter Eight.
Both, the Saturday Pilgrimage and the Sunday Parade always require some kind of order and form. They also tend to be dividable, like the aforementioned physical concept of time (Zuckercandl, 1956) (i.e. there are several blocks of dance groups- each block dividable into groups and each group into smaller sections, and so on- which follow an order established by the institution in charge of organising the events, the ACFO). On the other hand the Alba rite, like the musical concept of time, does not depend on any strict order and form, it is not dividable and, I would suggest, constitutes the content of experience. As Zuckercandl suggests, the musical existence of time is the same as its activity; meter and rhythm are the effects of the flow of time in the musical tones (ibid.). Although it may be objected that there is an important meaning in the Alba rite (greeting the Sun or the Morning Star), I would stress that its strength resides in its performance, which transcends a monological meaning.

Early on Carnival Sunday the Plaza del Folklore is crammed every year with people dancing, singing, eating and drinking in a tumultuous and chaotic gathering called the Alba rite. Perhaps it is easier to “visualise” the effectiveness of this event in spatial terms, but Husserl’s and Zuckercandl’s (1956) theories on temporal cognition and musical temporality, respectively, contribute with adequate conceptual tools for an approach to its temporal dimension. As I suggest above, the Alba rite transforms - through its chaotic enactment - the orderly events that precede and follow it. The last dance groups and the first dance groups participating in the Saturday and Sunday parades,
respectively, encounter upon their arrival at the Plaza del Folklore the chaotic and drunken crowd that forces them to alter their performances at their final stage. The site, which is strictly reserved for the dancers earlier on Saturday and later on Sunday has been temporarily appropriated by the inebriated revellers. The temporal liminality of the Alba rite has encroached upon the official schedule of carnival, denoting a “specious present”, or a “thick present”, in Husserl’s terms. This achieves even greater complexity, when considering the musical framework.

* 

Every year during the Alba rite, between twelve and fifteen brass bands play Morenada tunes exclusively. This slow and cadenced rhythm (2/4) could be compared to the oscillation of a pendulum, clearly marking its own temporality. This is enhanced through the use of rattles: the dancers often turn the handles - which are connected to the gear-teeth inside the rattle - in short movements that resemble both the tick-tack and the winding up of a clock. Spectators tend to dance, clap and shout following the rhythm marked by the rattles. The recurrent musical and choreographic performances of Morenada rhythm could be interpreted as the flow of carnival time in Oruro.

\[15\] See Gell (1992), above.
\[16\] In 2002 I was surprised to find only three bands playing by the foot of the temple. However, later in the morning there were already seven bands playing at the Avenida Cívica. I have occasionally heard other
Figure 24. *Alba* (Source: ACFO’s Official Magazine 1998).
There are two "gaps" within the Morenada rhythm; one refers to a slight "stretching" of a tone which demands a short halt, a sudden double beat, or a slight and brief alteration of the tempo, to immediately start over again. The other one refers to a silence after a stanza and before a chorus. This silence is filled with a playful comment, of the trombones (playing either a single prolonged distorted tone, or the same tone in repetitive fashion) or the voices of performers and spectators (a vocalised version of the trombone notes), to return again to the main rhythm and melody. Although these "gaps" may seem to distort the "clockwork rhythm" of Morenada, far from altering its clearly marked temporality; they tend to signal a new start. The concepts of motion, succession, progression, recurrence and change are all present in this rhythm. However, the simultaneous interpretation of different Morenada tunes during the Alba rite contributes to the musical construction of a chaotic scenario and temporality.

Anthony Seeger (1987) has suggested that music is also defined by what it is not: silence. Apart from measuring rhythm, silence also creates rhythm. If silence and rhythm are fundamental musical/temporal features (one creating and being created by the other), how must we consider their absence (and excess) during the Alba rite?

---

rhythms then, but never at the foot of the temple during sunrise. For a graphic illustration of the Alba rite, see figure 32.
Tens of thousands of people participate in the *Alba* rite every year, most (if not all) of them dancing *Morenada* and many using their rattles. However, returning to the clockwork metaphor above, although the marked temporality of each *Morenada* tune may still be perceived within the immediate surroundings of the performing band, the general cacophony produced by the hundreds of musicians does not allow for the distinction of *motion, succession, progression, recurrence* and *change*. Their fusion creates a peculiar temporality, where the “specious” or “thick” present described by Husserl is prolonged for many hours, without any protention or retention.

Every instant of silence within a particular *Morenada* tune is saturated by the loudness produced by the bands playing in the vicinity. There is no specific musical anticipation of what is to come, or a musical memory of what just passed, because there is an excessive input of rhythmic information. The predictable rhythm of *Morenada* becomes unpredictable during this event.

However, despite my inability to distinguish temporal features in a short-term musical memory during the *Alba* rite, the excessive input of sound had a dramatic effect on my long-term musical memory. Several times I found myself looking around for the (non-existent) bands performing the *Morenadas* in my mind, up to ten days after the event. I was frightened the first time this happened, because I could not explain where the music (that only I heard) came from. Later I got used to this, to the extent that once I was surprised when
someone commented about the music performed by a band in the vicinity, when I thought that this was only happening in my own mind.

I never found any other person who lived similar experiences many days after the festival, but some agreed that they do hear morenas in their heads while celebrating carnival in Oruro. I must clarify this, for I unwittingly submitted myself to an experiment, using headphones to record the music at the Alba rite. Perhaps the amplified loudness through the use of headphones enhances the (similar but milder) effects that many other participants might perceive during the event. After participating in the Alba rite, I often found myself in the streets of Oruro, dancing Morenada with strangers, following the rhythm in our heads.

Time, space and place seemed to chaotically merge every time I experienced this phenomenon. I would suggest that the extraordinary sonorous sphere of the Alba rite, far from providing a backdrop for the enactment of this particular event, constitutes the sound of the intangible and transcendent temporality of the celebration of carnival in the city of Oruro.

***
As I have already pointed out in the Introduction and in Chapter Two, there are different activities and forms of expression that give place to the construction of imageries (i.e. the corpus of images created through socio-cultural interaction) in the Oruro Carnival. Historical and mythological narratives (as the main forms of verbal expression) contribute to both the content and the form of the images developed in the performance of the festival.

However the content and form of the narratives tend in turn to be reinterpreted, as the images are transformed through the action of the individuals involved (dancers, artisans, members of the ACFO, spectators). Verbal and visual expressions are intermingled; they may condition and alter each other. The visual aspect of the hills surrounding Oruro might have conditioned, for example, their related mythological narrative. The ritual practices and official policies linked to the mythological and historical narratives can also - as we have seen in Chapter Two - alter the visual nature of the landscape. After having reviewed some spatial features of the landscape linked to the mythological narrative, I will now briefly consider the work of artisans (mask makers and needle craftsmen) in relation to the embodiment of mythology within the Carnival Parade.
Figure 25. A craftsman’s workshop at Avenida La Paz.
Imagery and Craftsmanship

The images of snakes, toads, devils, Morenos, and other characters incorporated within the Carnival Parade cover the walls of different streets of the city. Avenida La Paz is probably the most “picturesque” in this sense, since it is flanked through much of its length by the workshops of mask makers and needle craftsmen. At La Paz 4973, for example, the observer may spend some time reading the five colourful notices painted on the wall and the doors of a shop. They do not only advertise the professional quality of the mask maker, but they also provide a detailed map for the customer to find the workshop itself (since the house functions only as a shop for selling finished pieces). One of the signs reads:

“EL KIRQUINCHO (armadillo)
FOLKLORIC MASK WORKSHOP
of GERMAN FLORES O.
WITH INTERNATIONAL PRESTIGE
ARTISTIC QUALITY IN MASKS of
DIABLOS, CHINAS, REY MORENO, ACHACHIS, OSOS, TOBAS
AND MINIATURES. RESTORATION OF RELIGIOUS IMAGES”

I did not manage to speak to don Germán Flores, but I spoke to his brother, don René Flores, who is also a mask maker. Both brothers learned from their father Pánfilo Flores who was the disciple of the Nicolás brothers in the 1930s and produced his first mask in 1938 (Vargas Luza, 1998). Pánfilo Flores became one of the most prolific mask makers in Oruro. According to Vargas Luza, despite his efforts to maintain the elements of the “traditional” mythological narrative, don Pánfilo finally

---

1 See figure 25.
had to adapt his work to the demands of the dancers, including in 1959 a three-headed dragon on top of a devil mask (op cit.:59).

The figure of a dragon was first introduced by Santiago Nicolás in 1939 when, according to Vargas Luza, the arrival of foreign products brought along new images, such as the logo of Hornimans Tea: a dragon² (op cit.:53). Craftsmanship innovations tend to be introduced with time in both, the design of the masks and the different construction techniques. Although the most common basic technique involves the use of plaster, it has been combined with materials that range from bull horns to light bulbs.³

The most common way of learning the craftsmanship seems to be to work as an assistant of a specialist and, since there is an important level of cooperation within the households of the artisans, the knowledge is often transmitted from the parents to their children. The family of don Pánfilo Flores is a case that illustrates this point. His two sons are famous mask makers, and don René’s sons are also working in their father’s workshop in the present. Don Rene’s workshop is filled with images of devils, angels, morenos, saints and virgins. All kinds of masks are exhibited on the walls, from the very old models to the newer bigger versions.⁴ Some unfinished pieces are covered with linen, to protect them from the dust while they dry on shelves and tables. When I asked him about the mixture

² However, Gisbert (1999) points out that the figure of the dragon was already linked to that of the snake in the sixteenth century.
³ For a full description of the evolution of the Devil Masks, see Varas Luza (1998).
⁴ Figure 26 illustrates some devil masks in different stages of construction, in don René’s workshop.
Figure 24. Masks at different stages of the construction process, don René Flores' workshop.
of figures in his workshop and about his personal beliefs about the images of saints being displayed together with those of devils, don René underlined that when he works a devil mask, he never touches the images for cult. Apart from the different techniques for their construction, they also have opposed meanings and completely different uses. While the masks are used for folkloric dance performances, the images of saints and virgins are exclusively destined for religious devotion. Although there is a high demand for images of saints and virgins, the dancers’ demands for masks and costumes constitutes the main source of income for the artisans.

The workload of most mask makers and needle craftsmen increases dramatically between November and February, when the dancers are getting ready for carnival. Doña Berna Quispe de Cruz owns the folkloric mask workshop “Berna,” where she sells masks, rattles, whips, and other ornaments used in carnival. She told me that they used to co-ordinate their work with the needle craftsmen, but today they deal directly with the dancers. Her husband, don Benito Cruz Pabón, learned to weld when he was a child. He used to escape from home at night to help a neighbour who was a welder and pyrotechnic: he learned both arts. Don Benito used to be in charge of the fireworks show for the Morenada Central, but he stopped doing that “because they made him drink a lot”. He first learned to make torches, but soon he also learned how to repair the masks.

5 It also lies on Avenida La Paz. I interviewed doña Berna on 15 August 2000.
Doña Berna says that they mastered the art of making masks together: husband and wife working beside each other for forty years. Although their studies keep them busy, all their children help in the workshop; the oldest one, Gonzalo Cruz, designs his own masks and “he has already outdone his father”. The dance that demands most work from don Benito and doña Berna is Morenada, for they provide not only the masks, but also the rattles, whips and sceptres. The rattles can have many different shapes, from the traditional armadillo rattle to the most recent mobile phone rattle which, according to doña Berna, was a demand of the cell-phone traders. Changes are introduced every year in the different elements of the dances performed in carnival, including the Moreno masks that are made nowadays in one single piece.

According to don Lucio Flores Mamani, before the 1970s the Moreno mask consisted of three pieces; the mask, the hat and the wig. The dancers could then not take their masks off until they reached the temple. There is an ACFO regulation that specifies this restriction in the present. However, most dancers do take their masks off before completing the route, mainly when the congestion of dancers forces them to stop. As don Lucio recalls, this was not possible in the past, for only the wives or the mothers of the dancers knew how to tie the three pieces together, and they waited for their husbands or sons in the temple. The hats and wigs are attached to the

---

6 A member (since 1968) of the Morenada Central Oruro fundada por la Comunidad Cocani.

7 See Canepa Koch (1998) for a comparison with the dancers’ need to take the masks off in specific places, during the celebration of the Peruvian Fiesta de la Virgen del Carmen.
Moreno masks today. This makes them easier to wear than the old three-piece masks.

There have also been many changes in the dance costumes, which were much heavier in the past. Don Lucio told me that in the 1950s they were completely embroidered and ornamented with shiny stones and pearls. Today much of the embroidery is replaced with the use of shining applique. According to don Fermín Flores Calichaya, whose embroidery workshop also lies on Avenida La Paz, the old costumes used to weight up to 65lb, while the heaviest one in the present would weight 50lb. His mother was also a specialist of the trade. She learned from an artisan of La Paz and she taught her son to use the needle. After his final exams at school, don Fermín would help his mother, and he learned to embroider when he was 8 years old. He finished his school education and studied economics in the local university, but then he dedicated his life to work as a needle craftsman and “worked the earth for 45 years” having received great satisfactions from his work.

The Municipal Town Hall of Oruro awarded don Fermín with the silver trade medal, and people who live overseas have used his work in international exhibitions, being awarded several times with the first prize in different contests. Nevertheless, he never got any recognition for the latter. Don Fermín complains that hand craftsmen are not seen positively in Oruro, despite their enormous contribution to the famous carnival.

---

8 A successful local needle craftsman (see figure 27), whom I interviewed on 15 August 2000.
Figure 27. Don Fermín Flores Callichaya showing an embroidered Devil cape.
parade. He mentioned that the local authorities have extorted the artisans, imposing great tribute obligations upon them, instead of providing them with incentives for their creativity and hard work. There are, according to him, four handcraft specialties for any dance costume: needlecraftsmanship, mask maker, shoemaker, and wig maker. They all have their distinctive trade unions and work independently, but they do gather to complete the whole costume.

The prices of the costumes depend on the demands of the dancers. A Moreno costume may, for example, cost between £200 and £700 depending on the material used and the detail of the embroidery. A first-class costume needs more or less 2 months work. Don Fermín told me that he only sells 3 to 5% of the costumes he creates. He asserts that the dancers of Oruro rent 85% of the new costumes every year. After the costumes are used in Oruro, the dancers of the rural provinces and mining centres rent them for their use in rural festivities. I have seen different pieces of old Morenada costumes used by the rural dancers of the Anata Andina and other festivities outside Oruro (i.e. in San Pedro de Condo, and Challapata).

Don Fermín is married to doña Felicidad Guzmán and they have four children. He told me that he asked God and the Virgin of the Mineshaft for his four children to become professionals, which they all did: two of them are sociologists and the other two are engineers. They all know how

---

9 Rental prices vary between 150 and 300 Bolivianos a day, which were around £15 and £30 when I interviewed don Fermín.
to draw and embroider, and his son “makes beautiful designs, he embroiders and paints beautifully”, but don Fermín never asked him for help. He is aware that such knowledge is always useful, given the high demand of his work, but he insists that his children should concentrate on their professions. He told me that he is very proud of his family and his work, and he stressed (crying) that all his work is dedicated to the Virgin of the Mineshaft who has given him the gift of life. I was informed that a series of dreams usually precede don Fermín’s work. In his dreams, a man gives him instructions for the embroidery design, and when he wakes up he concentrates in solitude to make the first drawing with a pencil. Nevertheless, he also bases his work on his previous pieces, transforming some shapes in his memory, combining images of his dreams with the specific suggestions of the dancers.

Dancing/Dreaming

There is usually a strong emotional involvement of the people participating in the Oruro Carnival Parade, particularly the dancers. The strength of such involvement is often unfolded in dreams. In this section I will examine a few cases in which some individuals interpret their own dreams in relation to their participation in the festivity. However, instead of speculating about the oneiric manifestation of subconscious archetypes, I will concentrate on the rational/emotional involvement of the social actors, and on the role of dreams in the (re)creation of carnivalesque
imageries. I have mentioned above that a needle craftsman receives instructions in dreams for the creation of dance costumes. Apart from don Fermín’s personal involvement in his professional activities, this also tells us about the incorporation of the carnival imagery into the sphere of dreams, and vice-versa.

The dreams of don Fermín refer to the creation of dance costumes for the representation of devils, angels, *morenos*, and so on, but he did not specify the presence of the Virgin in his dreams, although he did stress his devotion to her.  

10 Nevertheless, many people talk about their dreams of the Madonna and about the messages they convey. The dreams of doña Laura Flores are a clear example of the alleged communication between the Virgin and her devotees. Doña Laura Flores Mamani is a member of the *Morenada Central Oruro fundada por la Comunidad Cocani*. She claims that the *Morenada* dance (one of the most important dances performed at carnival) has always been in her roots, since her parents and grandparents were *Cocanis* from Villa Kairiri. She remembers that as a child she used to follow the *Morenada*, wearing her small vicuña shawl, and carrying incense at the side of the image of the Virgin.

Only in the mid seventies were women allowed to dance, and doña Laura was 16 years old when she started dancing for the Madonna. She danced

---

10 Perhaps some mask makers receive instructions from the Virgin when they create religious images, but none of the ones I interviewed reported such cases.

11 Interviewed on 22 August 2000.
during 16 years and then she became a member of the Cofradía).\textsuperscript{12} Later, in 1999 doña Laura was elected president of the Morenada Central Oruro fundada por la Comunidad Cocani. One of her dreams refers to that event:

“I remember I dreamed of the Virgin calling me, when the Morenada was about to pass in front of my house. She was standing on the final step of my house. A very cute old lady with white hair, wearing used clothes. I saw her light-blue apron. It was old, but very clean. I was climbing the stairs towards her. That night I won the elections for the presidency. She was calling me to become part of the Morenada, that is how I interpret it”.

Doña Laura kept the image of the Virgin\textsuperscript{13} in her house for a couple of years. She claims that she has always had conversations with the Virgin in dreams, but that their communication was even stronger when she had the image in her house.

“I always dream of the Morenada, and of myself walking next to the Virgin. We were going up, where the big cross is - we call it the mineshaft. And the virgin turns her head to look at me. Then, I don’t know, I think she sends me these messages asking me not to abandon her. That must be it, I imagine, when I had her here, the little Virgin of the institution, the one don Zenón Apaza wanted to take. Then they made me responsible of the Virgin for two years. I was in charge of the little Virgin and I’ve had great affection for her, and sincerely, the image has been part of my life. Later, when don Zenón took her to his house, it affected me a lot. Every night I dreamed, and the Virgin called me. I saw her naked, without any clothes, covered only with a sheet. She was looking at me, crying. She opened her arms and wanted to get closer. I don’t know, these are things that make me think a lot. Since then, I used to get closer and I asked her to turn towards me. When Wilson Vargas was in charge of the presidency, Zenón brought her to me. He left the Virgin in the shop. And since then I had the virgin again for two more

\textsuperscript{12} Every dance group has a Cofradía, which is a fraternity organised by the women. They usually take care of the image of the Virgin, and organise different activities around her.

\textsuperscript{13} That is, she kept the Cocanis’ replica.
years. And then I got closer to the Virgin, I used to talk to her every day, during daytime and night time. I told her my sorrows, my joys, and everything that happened to me. When I was elected president, the same; I asked her what I should do. It was the first time I had such a responsibility. The only thing that the Virgin used to tell me in dreams was that...she would hold my head, she caressed me, she held my cheeks, my hands. Something like that, as a way of thankfulness.... But then later the moment came when they pushed me to quit, they almost obliged me to give up. I also had to return the image. I took a picture of her, and I'm still with her. I keep on seeing her in my dreams, we still have our conversations. I see her very sad, I see her abandoned. I don't know where the image is now. I'm very suspicious that they misinterpret her..."

It could be argued that dreams constitute the appropriate means for communication with supernatural beings and with the dead. Although I will not discuss the communication between humans and supernatural beings, it is necessary to consider the intimate contact between human beings and those images considered sacred and miraculous.

According to Gisbert (1999), the seventeenth century counter-reform Catholic policy of using visual arts, as a powerful means to reach illiterate people, was transferred to America, where the Baroque was combined with persistent medieval features. She asserts that both trends (medieval and baroque) merged together into an "exacerbated religiosity that fetichicised whatever it touched" (op. cit.: 223). This gave rise to the search of an intimate and personal relationship between the image and the

---

14 People say they get messages from the dead also through dreams. Many commented upon their conversations with Jach'a Flores after his death (his father and brother confirmed this, as well as doña Laura, see below).
faithful believer, which was often achieved through the possession of a relic or the blessing of a replica figure\textsuperscript{15} (ibid.).

The image of the Virgin of the Mineshaft is at the centre of the Oruro Carnival Parade. It makes sense that, as the saint patroness of the city, she does not only occupy a central place in the official celebration of carnival, but also in the minds, dreams, hopes and fears of her devotees.

The other central image of carnival is the devil or, more appropriately, the demonised figure of \textit{Wari} and \textit{Supay}. However, generally when people in Oruro mention \textit{Wari}, \textit{Supay} and the \textit{Tio} of the mine, the image evoked is that of the European Devil. As I pointed out earlier, the mask makers whom I interviewed did not mention the presence of devils in their dreams.\textsuperscript{16} Nevertheless, don Ezequiel Flores told me a dream in which his late brother, the great \textit{Jach'a} Flores,\textsuperscript{17} appeared dressed with a devil costume. He says that \textit{Jach'a} was not wearing a traditional Oruro devil costume, but one of those red tight-overall fancy costumes. Don Ezequiel heard music and the voice of his brother, but he did not see his face, because he saw him from behind. Don Francisco Flores also saw his son in dreams; the last time he saw him, \textit{Jach'a} said “I’m leaving dad”.

\textsuperscript{15} Note that the replica images of the Oruro Virgin of the Mineshaft are very often blessed, which facilitates, according to Gisbert, the direct and intimate relation between the believers and the Virgin. Gisbert (1999) also presents a relic depicting the Madonna defending the Bolivian army, which could imply a “nationalistic” specificity of the devotion.

\textsuperscript{16} Although I suppose that the images of devils with which they work on a daily basis must be somehow present in their dreams.

\textsuperscript{17} The famous composer, see the section on \textit{Morenada}, in Chapter Four.
I find the image of Jach’a with a devil costume interesting, considering his central place in the popular enactment of carnival, both as a composer and as a dancer. I have already discussed the central role of music in carnival (and I will relate it to the popular celebration of the festival in the following chapter) but let me continue with the oneiric image of Jach’a in relation to the dance he loved the most, Morenada.

Doña Laura Flores also dreamed of Jach’a, two days before he died:

“It was noon and he came to visit me at the shop. Jach’a was drunk, he sat down to talk to me. I asked him why he continued on drinking, he said he had gone to Challacollo to a fiesta they have there. Then I asked him to play a new composition for me, and he whistled two tunes for me, as he often did. I later wondered which morenadas he whistled for me, and I found out that they were Hombre Solitario and La Nusta mas Linda del Mundo. He also asked me to take charge of the Cocanis, as he didn’t see any other responsible person at the moment. I told him that he was crazy to suggest that, but that year I was elected secretary of finances, and after that I was elected president”.

This dream reveals a link that must be considered in relation to the Oruro Carnival Parade. Although the festival develops around the image of the Virgin, the popular enactment of carnival is indispensable for its appropriate celebration. Doña Laura’s dreams include both, the (Catholic) religious image of the Virgin and the popular (secular) image of the drunken composer. The Madonna visits her at home, while Jach’a comes

18 Despite being one of the most prolific and popular composers of Morenadas, Jach’a never learned to write music: he used to compose the tunes whistling and singing. They called him el silbador, or “the whistler”.

229
to see her at the shop, where (among other items) she sells mainly coca leaves, cigarettes and alcohol. Instead of speculating about the dualities home/work; sacred/profane, I would suggest that both spheres (home and work) are permeated by the imagery of carnival, which includes the “sacred” Virgin and the “profane” composer (or the official and popular enactment of carnival). Despite the common rejection of the excessive drinking that characterises the festival, the dances that constitute the official representation of carnival are generally accompanied with alcohol. I will discuss the role of alcohol in Chapter Eight, but let us review at this point one more example of the dancing activities incorporated into the dreams of the participants.

Doña Nancy Maín Vargas\textsuperscript{20} has been a member of the Cocanis (the Morenada dance group of the coca leaf traders) all her life, although she only started dancing when she was 29 years old, in 1991. She remembers that her grandfather used to give his house (on calle Bolivar, between Pagador and Velasco) for the Morenada’s Primer Convite (“first rehearsal”). Doña Nancy’s father was also a very important dancer who developed a special dance step with the Cocanis.

“I always saw him from my aunt’s house on Pagador. I used to see him dancing with tears in his eyes. My sisters and I didn’t like to see our dad looking ridiculous. When we were 15 or 16, the Entrada (Carnival Parade) became a bigger event, and he used to get drunk; we didn’t like that at all. We didn’t understand then, but now our time has come. My uncle, who used to guide the left column of the barrel-dancers encouraged me to dance. Then I danced as a barrel too”.

\textsuperscript{19} Two of Jacha’s most popular latest tunes.  
\textsuperscript{20} Interviewed on 20 July 2000.
Figure 28. *Barrilitos* or Little Barrels. (Photograph: courtesy of Oscar Martinez).
Figure 38. Don Lorenzo Quispe as an old Barriliito dancer in 1960. (photograph: courtesy of Oscar Martinez).
The “barrel-dancer” is a particular *Moreno* figure that resembles a wine cask.\(^1\) It is usually performed by men, and the fact that doña Nancy danced as a barrel entails a double transformation. Firstly, she danced as a male figure and secondly, the character that she represented was the one that most obviously depicted what she used to despise of the *Morenada* dance: drunkenness.

When doña Nancy joined the dance group, her father taught her how to dance, how to hold the rattle in the appropriate position for every turn. When he accompanied her to participate for the first time in the dance, he drank a few beers and got emotional, so he followed the band dancing in his own special style. People of the national television filmed him dancing, and commented how different the old dance steps were. Apart from teaching her how to dance, doña Nancy’s father also recommended her not to dance to show off, but in devotion to the Virgin of the Mineshaft. “The Virgin will decide when you have to stop dancing, not you” - he told her. She says that he was right, “once you start dancing it’s difficult to stop.” Doña Nancy affirms that she never left the dance group, but she had to stop dancing when she joined the directorate board. She remembers the last year she danced,

“I was at the starting point, and felt this strong desire to cry. I rarely took my mask off, and I was crying all the time, throughout the route. I didn’t know why I was crying, I cried with a lot of emotion. I didn’t know that I was going to be

\(^2\) See figure 28.
part of the directorate board that year, and now I know why I was crying.”

Before being nominated as a member of the directorate board, doña Nancy had the following dream:

“The Cocanis were dancing at the Entrada (Carnival Parade), and I wasn’t dancing with them. I walked around and between the turning barrels, but nobody saw me. I was the only one who was not wearing a dance costume. Then I saw my uncle who had already died; he was not dancing either. He was sitting on a chair inside his house. I passed between the dancers and entered the house; he was sitting by himself. I felt this emotion to see him and wanted to hug him, but he didn’t let me. Then I woke up.”

Doña Nancy relates this dream to the fact that she never danced at the Entrada (Carnival Parade) again. She joined the directorate board of the Cocanis in 1998, and since she has a lot of work there and in her own shop, she cannot dance anymore. She explains her dream and her emotive participation during the Carnival Parade in 1997 in relation to both, her last performance at the Entrada and her change of status within the institution. She asserts that she feels even more affection for her dance group since she joined the directorate board. Many dancers get involved in such a strong affectionate relationship with their dance groups that they spend most of their time and energy developing strategies to defend the rights of their institution. This is clearly exemplified by the case of the division of the Morenada Central Oruro. There are many people involved
in the Cocanis’ struggle to vindicate their rights, and Rolando Barrientos is one of them.

* 

Although Rolando is not a Cocani, because he is not a coca trader, nor a descendant of people from Villa Kairiri, his emotional and rational involvement with the institution is remarkable. He spends a lot of time and energy investigating, negotiating, and writing reports related to the rights of the Cocanis. However, his involvement is not limited to the level of rights and policies: he is an enthusiastic dancer of the Morenada Central, despite his health impediments. Rolando had an injury in his left foot during his youth, and has experienced a series of surgeries during the last 13 or 14 years. He recalls that these surgeries have almost left him out of any dancing activities.

Since Rolando should not carry much weight, he decided first to dance as a Rey Moreno (“Black King”), because the costume includes a light cape and the appropriate boots to hold his feet firmly. He danced as Rey Moreno for three years, accomplishing his promise to the Virgin. After those three years, the pain in his foot grew stronger and he realised he had to leave the dance. However, Rolando resisted giving up, and searching solutions decided to dance wearing a Vicuña shawl, which is the main piece of the uniform for the Ultimo Convite (last official practice before

---

22 See the Morenada section in Chapter Four.
23 He is in his mid forties now.
the Carnival Parade). He then had problems with the people at the directorate level. They said that he should either dance (that is, wearing the costume) or not, and that he was welcome to be part of the directorate board.

Many members of the directorate board who do not dance participate in the pilgrimage wearing their vicuña shawls, walking in front of the group. Then Rolando decided to dance with his vicuña shawl, not in front of the group, amongst the representatives of the directorate board, nor within the blocks of dancers, but closer to the brass band, following a block of dancers. This way he managed to avoid disrupting the uniformity of the dancers’ costumes and established at the same time a special communication with the band and the dancers in front of him.

Rolando has created a distinctive figure in the Carnival of Oruro which was commented in an article published in the local press, where his passion for the dance and his influence on the public are exalted. Every year, when the Morenada Central Oruro fundada por la Comunidad Cocani enters the Carnival Parade, one can see the man dancing with the Banda Poopo, wearing a black hat, a vicuña shawl and (sometimes) a walking stick. Although he has had periodic (almost yearly) surgeries on his foot during the last years, he has managed to co-ordinate so far the dates of the surgeries in relation to the dates of carnival. Rolando says that he prioritises his dancing over his devotion. However, he also gives

---
24 See figure 23.
emphasis to the religious sense of the dance and he asserts that when he is in front of the Madonna, he asks for another year of dance, as “another year of dance means another year of life”.

Dancing Tradition/Dancing Identity

Although some dancers asserted that they gained very important economic favours from the Virgin, many others confirmed that the only thing they ask from the Madonna (that is, in return for their devotional dance) is the chance to dance for her again. Perhaps dancing should not be seen as a sacrifice since, as Rolando affirms, “another year of dance means another year of life”. It cannot be denied that dancing at the Entrada entails an enormous effort: the costumes tend to be expensive, heavy, and uncomfortable to wear while performing along the 3 Kilometres-long official route. However, it becomes apparent that the joy of dancing is bigger than the sacrifice. Despite the dancers’ enormous efforts, I found it difficult to conceive of the dance performances as penitence, even in the case of Rolando, whose own health is at risk.

* Abercrombie (1992) suggests that the true penitence of the Oruro dancers is to wear “indigenous clothes” but, as Rockefeller argues,

“The ‘traditional’ dress of rural people, now largely falling into disuse outside of special occasions, follows the broad pattern of clothing imposed on highland Indians by the Spanish in the late eighteenth century” (1999:120).
This implies that the “traditional Indian clothes” worn by the urban dancers during carnival in an attempt to imitate the “Indians” incorporate a previous imitation. Thus we must pay attention to the processes through which images of self and other are constructed in relation to patterns of dressing and cross-dressing. The costumes used in carnival often tell us more about a pre-conceived image of the “Indian-Other” than about his/her “true nature”. Nevertheless, it is pertinent to observe both, the represented images of alterity and the embodied preconceptions of the Other as a means for differentiation and self-assertion. Thus I would suggest that the dancers wearing “Indian” clothes represent “otherness”, rather than the Other.

The representation of otherness constitutes an important mechanism for the assertion of self-identity, for it delineates the limits between self and other. Perhaps this is particularly relevant in cases where self-identity is not well defined and/or where it is being constructed. Zigmund Bauman\textsuperscript{25} pointed out that it is when there is an identity crisis, or when identities are being constructed, that such issues become dramatically important. The discourses of national identity enacted during carnival in Oruro may illustrate the relevance and complexity of Bauman’s arguments.

As I have mentioned before, the creation of a Bolivian national identity is at the heart of the imageries constructed through carnival in the present. It

\textsuperscript{25} During the opening lecture at the School of Philosophical and Anthropological Studies of the University of St Andrews, in September 2000.
is a common place to hear about “the importance of our identity and our traditions” in Oruro. However, as I pointed out in previous chapters, those “traditions” claimed to be “Bolivian” by the dominating social classes in the present were rejected as “Indian superstitions” in the past.

In his controversial essay on the Post-Colonial Carnival of Oruro, Thomas Abercrombie (1992) argues that there is an “invented tradition” in Oruro, but he does not develop a further discussion on the subject. I agree with much of what Abercrombie suggests, mainly in relation to the attempt to construct a national Bolivian identity in the Oruro Carnival. However, I would also agree with Albó’s26 critique that underlines the pluri-semantic nature of the Oruro Carnival Parade. The meanings attached to the dances change, not only according to the particular historical period, but also in relation to the specific individuals involved. In relation to the “invention of traditions”, Hobsbawn (1983) asserts that traditions do not need to be revived nor invented, where the old ways are alive.

What is peculiar about Oruro is that the “old ways” claimed as “national traditions” in the present were despised in the past. However, these practices have been transformed to the extent that they cannot be said to be the “old ways” anymore. Hobsbawn finds it interesting that ancient materials are used to construct invented traditions for completely new purposes (ibid.). Thus perhaps this might be rather a case of “displaced” or “exoticised” traditions.

As I have already discussed, there have been successive transformations of the mythological narratives and of the specific dance performances enacted during carnival in Oruro. Furthermore, Abercrombie (1999) points out that even the Indian dancers who participate during the Anata Andina today perform in a stylised way, using borrowed elements (such as Morenada costumes) and playing musical instruments that do not correspond to the carnival season. These indigenous dancers do not need to revive or invent a tradition, since their everyday practices are usually permeated by their particular traditions. However, their use of borrowed elements in their urban (decontextualised) performances entail certain exoticism which we may also identify in the dances performed by the urban settlers.

* 

According to Nicholas Thomas (1994:173), exoticism “has more to do with difference and strangeness than an antithetical relation to modernity”. This implies that “the modern” can also be subject of exoticism, through its estrangement from “modernity”. More accurately, Peter Mason (1998) asserts that:

“the exotic is produced by a process of decontextualisation: taken from a setting elsewhere (it is this ‘elsewhere’ which renders it exotic), it is transferred to a different setting, or recontextualised.” (Mason, 1998:3).
Thus the exoticism of the *Anata Andina* dancers may be attributed to their recontextualised performance of traditional rural dances in an urban setting, as much as to their use of modern elements (e.g. modern *Moreno* costumes and sunglasses) in such traditional dances. On the other hand, the exoticism of the urban dancers can also be explained through the presence of ultra-modern elements (e.g. mobile phones) in their dance performances, for which they often borrow “indigenous” costumes.

Such shifting of elements and practices between rural and urban contexts implies an increasing confusion of the “original” meanings and contexts of the performances. However, Mason underlines the indifference of exoticist representation with regards to ethnographic or geographic precision (ibid.). Furthermore, he argues that the degree of exoticism is directly related to the distance between the original and the new context in which the exoticised object is inserted (op.cit.:131).

“...The turning of everyday activities into spectacle required that the exotic be transplanted to a different spatial context – the exotic is never at home – which accounts for the presence of a fence, platform, stage, or reconstructed village to mark the scene of the action off as something which is more exotic than everyday domestic life”. (Mason, 1998:113-114).

Everyday domestic life may also be rendered exotic, through physical, visual or ethnographic displacement, as in the examples of human, artistic, and photographic exhibitions provided by Mason (1990, 1998, 2001). However, the search for appropriate examples of exoticism in the Oruro Carnival is not necessary: not only do ethnographic examples of exoticism...
abound in this dissertation, but the production of this ethnography for an European audience is in itself an act of exoticisation too.

Exoticism may indeed permeate the mimetic relation between the reader and the text, between the observer and the observed and between Self and Other. I will discuss in the next section some mimetic practices enacted during carnival. But let us first review some of the possible readings of the dances performed in the Oruro Carnival Parade.

* 

There seem to be multiple layers of signification in these representational performances, according to the exoticism of the costumed dancers and their degree of identification with the subjects they represent. The enormous complexity of this phenomenon makes it very difficult to provide a clear description of its multiple semantic nature. For the sake of clarity, I will list certain significant features in relation to specific dances in which they are particularly clear. However, I must emphasise that the different semantic layers may be variably observed in most of the dances discussed here.

First there is the image of “Absolute-Otherness”, represented by the devil, the slaves and the savages. I have already discussed the link between the devil dance and the myth of Wari, where in a transmogrified version the Spirit of the Hills (i.e. pre-Hispanic religious beliefs) is represented as an
evil god. Slavery is portrayed in the Morenada and Negritos dances, while savagery is represented in the Tobas dance, which I have not discussed in the dissertation.

This particular dance illustrates the extreme exoticist and essentialist representation of the Other, incorporating different troupes and blocks of dancers allegedly representing various ethnic groups of the Bolivian Lowlands. The characters represented in this dance are variably named in relation to particular ethnic groups (Tobas, “Chiriguanos”), specialised social roles (“sorcerers”, “shamans”), or a generic term to designate savagery (“chunchos”). The “savagery” displayed in the Tobas dance illustrates the fantastic images of otherness represented in carnival. The Tobas, who used to inhabit the Chaco region in south-east Bolivia, do not have an important presence in the country today, their main area of settlement being the North of Argentina and Paraguay.

I have met a Toba man in 1997, who is apparently one of the very few (if not the only) Toba inhabitants of contemporary Bolivia. He laughed at the description of the Tobas dancers of Oruro. Although the Tobas were indeed warriors, much of the costumes and makeup of the Oruro dancers resembles the images of “red-skins” observed in Hollywood Western films. After meeting and working with people of various ethnic groups of the Bolivian Lowlands, it is for me obvious that the images of “savagery” used to depict the different native cultures of these varied and vast areas
Figure 29. Toba dancers.
constitute a case of extreme exoticism. In this case it is the name (“Toba”, “shaman”, “Chuncho”) that is being exoticised, because no concrete features of the referent are actually included in the representation.

In the above first semantic layer, the dancers usually tend not to identify themselves with the characters they represent. A second layer would correspond to the images of the “good and hard-working Indian” represented by the llama herders (Llamerada), the spinning and weaving specialists (kullawada) and the traditional medicine specialists (kallawayas). Although the dancers do not seem to identify themselves with these romantic and picturesque images of the “Indian Other”, they may be understood as a “positive” or “optimistic” representation of the Other.

There is a third layer, where some groups represent the “borderline savage”, such as Tinkus (of Northern Potosí) and Phujllay (of Chuquisaca), which would be an intermediate layer between the first two. I would explain their intermediate position in relation to the violence of their performances and to their use of “traditional” clothes in the dance. Some of these dancers claim to have knowledge of the traditional clothes they use, and point out that other similar groups lack such knowledge, using clothes that do not correspond to their specific dance. I would not

27 This essentialised image of the “savage other” (see figure 29) can be compared to the phenomenon of “tupinambisation” identified by Mason (1998) in the representation of Amazonian societies.
think that these latter dancers identify themselves with the characters they represent either.\textsuperscript{28}

In the fourth layer, the dancers play their own instruments. Some of these dancers (\textit{tarqueada}) can also claim that their performances are more “traditional” than others (\textit{zampoñeros}), since they do not only dance to the music they play, but they also play the seasonal instrument, \textit{tarkas}. Although these dancers identify themselves as musicians of a participating community and often claim to have a deeper knowledge of the traditions they represent, they do not constitute an indigenous community like the dancers of the \textit{Anata Andina}.

Finally, we may observe a fifth layer, where the “traditional” dances have been stylised and transformed in the official folkloric performance, until new dances (\textit{Caporales, Antawaras}) emerged. I would suggest that these new dances epitomise the search of a Bolivian national identity by the middle and upper middle classes of Bolivia, because it is in these dances that one can observe an exoticism that moves in the opposite direction: Instead of depicting the other with exaggerated features characterising it as more different from urban Bolivians (“wilder”, or “more devilish”) than they really are, these stylised dances depict a “more civilised” other, with whom urban Bolivians can identify.

\textsuperscript{28} Most of the dancers I interviewed (representing different dance groups) asserted that they identify themselves as Bolivians, rather than as “Indians”, “\textit{Kallawayas}”, “\textit{Tobas}”, and so on.
The case that most clearly exemplifies this is the increasing participation of upper class Bolivians in the performance of some Caporales\textsuperscript{29} dance groups. However, it is important to avoid any kind of generalisation regarding the relationship between a specific dance and a specific social stratum, because the dynamism of the festivity allows for a recurrent re-appropriation of the dances by different segments of society.

* 

Caporales is a dance that may be linked to the Morenada (described in Chapter Four), but it is undoubtedly more closely related to the Saya, Tundikis and Negritos dances. The common denominator between all these dances is the representation of African slaves. However, in contrast with Morenada, the latter three dances seem to have their origins in Afro-Bolivian communities themselves. This is perceived in the way the participants enact the musical and choreographic performances. While Morenada dancers tend to represent the African slaves using masks and dancing to a slow rhythm played by brass bands, the Saya, Tundikis and Negritos have their faces painted black (if they are not Afro-Bolivians themselves) and dance to the (faster) rhythm they play with their own percussion instruments.

Thus Morenada seems to originate as a representation of the African Other by (most probably Aymara) Andean indigenous peoples, whereas Saya, Tundikis and Negritos may have originated in celebrations enacted by African communities. At first sight, the representation of Self and

\textsuperscript{29} See below.
Other seems to be a distinctive feature to differentiate these dances. Nevertheless, while most *Saya, Tundikis and Negritos* dancers represent the oppressed African slaves, a few of them represent the Africans used by the colonial agents to control and exploit their own brothers and sisters, the foremen or *Caporales*.\(^{30}\)

The *Caporales* dance emerged as a stylisation of the *Saya* dance. It consists basically of a new dance composed by performers representing the foremen and their female companions, dancing to a similar rhythm to that of the *Saya, Tundikis and Negritos*, but played by a brass band. The African syncopatic rhythm that so much appeals to the audience has been used, together with the most eye-catching costumes of the *Caporales* performers of the *Saya, Tundikis and Negritos*, to create a new dance.\(^{31}\) As some of my interlocutors underlined, this dance used to be performed by people of the popular lower middle classes in La Paz,\(^{32}\) but with time it has become an almost exclusive feature of the upper middle classes.

Luis Anibal Piñero,\(^{33}\) one of the founding members of the block of dancers representing La Paz among the *Caporales Centralistas*,\(^{34}\) told me that it was very hard to convince people to dance, when he and three friends gathered to create the group. Most of the (upper middle class) people they asked rejected the idea, stressing that dancing in carnival was

---

\(^{30}\) Note that there are also *caporales* in the *Morenada* dance.

\(^{31}\) See figures 30 and 31.

\(^{32}\) Mainly in relation to the performances of *Tundikis and Negritos* in the celebration of the *Fiesta del Señor del Gran Poder* of La Paz.

\(^{33}\) Interviewed on 28 August 2000.
Figure 30. Negritos.
Figure 31. Caporales.
a *cholo* affair. So the group they founded was composed by people of different social strata, and this allowed him – after decades of relating exclusively with people of his own social environment – to finally get involved with people of lower social spheres.

It is notable that the same group was later transformed into a paradigmatic representation of the national elite, within the celebration of carnival in Oruro. Luis Anibal saw this transformation in the context of his own family:

"When I first danced, my mother and brother used to avoid the topic, and often denied the fact that I danced in Oruro if someone asked. Years later, *Teta* [Roberto, his brother who always complaints about Luis Anibal not dancing and drinking anymore, when I meet him every year in carnival] became the official carrier of alcohol for the group."

Luis Anibal described how he and his friends used to collect all sorts of things to ornament their own dance costumes: from burnt Christmas light bulbs to pieces of very expensive European chandeliers. He then pointed out that the members of the same group have now an exclusive designer for their costumes. When I asked some current members of the group about the restrictions to join them, they stressed that the group was open to anyone. Nevertheless, the expensive fee to join the group constitutes a very strict social and economic restriction. Luis Anibal added to this the fact that preference is given to candidates who are over 1.80 meters tall (hardly a chance for an Aymara or Quechua individual).

---

34 One of the dance groups that most clearly exemplify today the participation of the national elite in the Carnival Parade.
Figure 32. *Caporales* costumes made by designers (Source: Fraternidad Caporales Centralistas, San Miguel).
I have interviewed several *Caporales* dancers, and their explanations of the meaning and personal significance of the dance vary, not only according to the specific dance group they belong to, but also to their specific individual positions. Most of my interlocutors explained their decision to join the *Caporales* in relation to the feelings of happiness, rhythm and strength that the dance inspired in them. Interestingly, these were also the most common concepts used to explain the meaning of the dance, despite the obvious references to colonial slavery. It would seem that the dance has achieved a new meaning in the present, more closely linked to the feelings of the performer than to a representational-semantic field.

However, I will attempt to show how the semantic shift of the *Caporales* dance implies a process through which the Self-presentation of African slaves might have been transformed, through the representation of the Exotic-Other, to finally establish a new presentation of the Self by members of the elite. This will be discussed into more detail in the next section on the mimetic representation of self and other, but it is important to stress at this point the importance of these issues in relation to the construction of a national Bolivian identity.

The Oruro Carnival is generally considered, as a whole, an expression of the national Bolivian identity. Nevertheless, it was rare to observe the

35 See figure 32.
active and voluntary participation of members of the elite in (rural or urban) festivals before the late 1980s and early 1990s, when they started to join certain *Caporales* dance groups. Thus, although it was generally accepted that a national Bolivian identity was represented in the folkloric performances of the festival, these performances were not adopted as their own by the elite before their massive incursion in the *Caporales* dance. Many politicians and other public figures participate in the *Entrada* or Carnival Parade today, most of them having joined a *Caporales* dance group.

In 1998, I had the chance to watch the performances from the official stands at the Central Square, in front of the president’s box. President Banzer was not present, but I could observe Vice-President Quiroga and the Prefect of La Paz watching the *Entrada* from their seats. Although both danced with the different dancers who pulled them into the esplanade, I only saw them jumping voluntarily to join a dance group when the *Caporales Centralistas* arrived. The serious gesture that characterises the young face of (Vice) President Quiroga did not change for almost the entirety of the festival, with the clear exception of his spontaneous performance with the above mentioned group.

In 1999 the Minister of Education - who is also a re-knowned *Caporal* dancer – publicly complained that he was the one who lost out when

---

36 With the exception of the city of Oruro, where members of the elite had already joined the local dance groups in previous decades.
37 Who became the Bolivian President after Banzer’s death.
38 The son-in-Law of President Banzer.
Maestros no fueron al diálogo con el Ministro

Dicho y hecho, los dirigentes del magisterio no asistieron ayer a la reunión con el ministro de Educación, Tito Hoz de Vila, quien esperó hasta las 12:45 horas de ayer para reanudar el diálogo que pone fin al conflicto escolar.

Recordemos que el dirigente Javier Baldovinos señaló el viernes que no asistirán a una nueva reunión porque constataron que no existe disposición del gobierno para negociar.

Hoz de Vila dijo que por esperar a los maestros no pudo asistir al Carnaval de Oruro. "Yo no quiero que los maestros digan lo hemos buscado en el Ministerio, pero se había ido a bailar a Oruro, por eso me quedé, y ustedes son testigos", señaló Hoz de Vila a los periodistas.

Anunció que esperará hasta el miércoles de la próxima semana para que se pueda retomar el diálogo y los maestros muestren predisposición para solucionar el conflicto que ya tiene dos semanas de duración.

Afirmó que lo más importante es que se reanuden las clases, pero tampoco se puede dejar de aplicar el decreto si es que hay escuelas que no están pasando clases. Sin embargo, las que están pasando clases normalmente, aunque los maestros hubieran faltado los seis días anunciados, no tendrán ningún tipo de problema, garantizó.

Hoz de Vila manifestó que los decretos supremos no pueden ser anulados. "Sería hacerlos la burla de cientos de ciudadanos que se han inscrito acudiendo a una convocatoria para asumir la tarea de dictar clases y, si se retrocede, parecería que sólo los hemos utilizado", enfatizó.

**Comités de Padres de Familia**

El Ministro anunció que el 25 de febrero se cumplirá una jornada Nacional para que en los establecimientos escolares se elijan a los Comités de Padres de Familia, los que en coordinación con las Juntas Vecinales conformarán las Juntas Escolares que ayuden a que el proceso educativo no sea el de hace 20 años.

El Ministro dijo que están decididos a romper el círculo vicioso de las huelgas: "Para ello estamos sacrificando todo en aras de restituir las clases y que ya no se interrumpan. Agradecemos a los padres de familia por su participación en este esfuerzo", finalizó.

Figure 33. Newspaper clipping depicting the former minister of Education, Tito Hoz de Vila.
representatives of the teachers did not show up for a meeting with him in La Paz on Carnival Saturday. He regrets that he could not dance then as a Caporal in Oruro. Although the construction of a national Bolivian identity in the Oruro Carnival started long before these public figures joined some Caporales dance groups, the latter phenomenon marks the effective incorporation of the elite and the official representatives of the country within such a nationalistic endeavour.

* 

As I have already suggested in Chapter Four, the three main symbols of the Bolivian national identity (the flag, the national emblem and the “second national anthem”) may be perceived in the performance of the devil dancers. However, I also pointed out that extreme otherness is represented through the Diablada: how can the same dance incorporate such mutually contradictory features? I believe this is a good example to examine the pluri-semantic nature of the events developed during carnival.

The devil dancers do indeed represent the extreme alterity of evil, and this achieves dramatic qualities during the Relato. Nevertheless, the introduction of the Bolivian flag in their costumes does not refer to the representation of evil, but to the national cultural heritage of the folkloric event. On the other hand, the dancers take off their masks before they

39 See figure 33.
40 See the section on Diablada in Chapter Four.
dance the *cucoa* ("second national anthem") and before they enter the Temple of the Virgin. I would suggest that in both cases the dancers stop representing the devil, to present themselves as Bolivian Catholics. This needs however to be problematised, in relation to the difference between discourse and practice, and to the non-representational actions of the individuals involved. Let us first return to the representation of otherness in the Carnival Parade.

As mentioned above, local discourses about the other are epitomised in picturesque images of savagery and evil. Nevertheless, the costumes used in Oruro have little or no relation at all with the festive clothes worn by the indigenous communities in their rural *fiestas*. Some dances involve the use of "Indian" garments, such as *ponchos, poleras* (Andean multi-layered skirts), and *Borsalino* (bowler) hats. However, as Abercrombie (1992) points out, many of these "traditional" items were actually introduced by Spanish colonial agents, for their use by the Indian servants of the New World. For example, the *polleras* and bowler hats that characterise the normal attire of the *cholas* (urban Aymara and Quechua migrant women) in Bolivia originate from the items worn by people of the lower social stratum in the eighteenth century Spain. Such elements, introduced by foreign agents in the past, have become part of local "tradition" over time. It may be argued that such features are re-interpreted and appropriated by local cultural practice.
The overlapping of multiple cultural re-interpretative performances gives rise to highly complex phenomena, where it is difficult to establish the links and differences between the signifier and the signified. Matters achieve further complexity when one considers that many of the dances performed in carnival are meant to represent self and/or other.

**The Mimetic Representation of Self and Other**

Canepa Koch (1998:5) asserts that when pre-Hispanic contents are masked under colonial forms in the Andes, this entails a representational process that implies a reflection upon the self (and the negotiation of the right for self-representation), as much as a reflection upon how one is seen by the other. She argues that in Andean urban contexts, ritual and folkloric practices constitute alternative means for the self-representation of marginal groups, and for their participation in the national and global scene (op cit.:16). These are issues that need to be addressed in relation to the Carnival of Oruro, where the representation of self and other is often complemented by the actual interaction between both (e.g. the non-Indian selves “representing” and at the same time rejecting the Indian other).

Regarding the participation of marginal groups within the “national scene”, I would argue that it does not take place in the official celebration of carnival in Oruro. Only when the indigenous dancers had already been displaced (or at least “sanitised”) by the performers of the middle classes, has the Oruro Carnival Parade become a Bolivian national heritage. However, although there is probably not a single (self-asserted and
permanent) “Indian” participant in the Entrada (or Carnival Parade), as Abercrombie (1991) points out, the tension generated by the class and racial differences between cholos, mestizos and “whites” sheds light on the actual struggle between differentiated self-identities during carnival.

I have already provided an example of the violence enacted on the basis of such differences. There is, however, a more subtle manifestation of the (explicit and implicit) struggle between self and other in the processes of transformation observed in Oruro. These include transformations in the mythological narrative, \(^{41}\) changes in the social composition of the dance groups, \(^{42}\) and the extreme transfiguration of certain dances for their (almost exclusive) assimilation by members of the elite. \(^{43}\) The distinction between self and other is obvious in the case of violent confrontations, and it is usually based on racial, cultural and socio-economic differences. Even when the individuals in conflict seem to belong to similar social groups, racial and cultural differences are stressed in the ways they verbally abuse each other. \(^{44}\)

The distinction between self and other seems to be more ambiguous in representational processes. Although the performative construction of otherness may also be based on racial and cultural differences, it is difficult to assert whose alterity (or sameness) the dancer represents (e.g. that of the Indians?, or of the “savages”?, or the African Slaves?). Who is

---

\(^{41}\) See the Myth of Wari, in Chapter Two.
\(^{42}\) See Chapter Four.
\(^{43}\) See the discussion on Caporales, in the section “Dancing Tradition/Dancing Identity”, above.
\(^{44}\) As mentioned earlier, it is a common place to hear the words “indio” and “cholo” as insults.
the other in Oruro? I am tempted to suggest that most (conscious) acts of representation depict the Other in Oruro.

When discussing different semantic levels of the representational activities taking place in Oruro, I have underlined that in most cases the dancers do not identify themselves with the characters they represent, with the probable exception of the Caporales.\(^{45}\) This is highly significant, given that most of the Caporales dancers whom I interviewed could not explain with clarity the meaning of the characters they represented, and they often tended to stress the rhythm, elegance and happiness displayed by the dance. That is, their identification with the dance seems not to be related to the representation of the colonial African foremen, but more so to the choreography, the rhythm, the clothes, and the general attitude that characterises this dance, as the “folkloric” expression of the upper middle classes. Although this cannot be generalised - because there are some Caporales dance groups composed by members of lower social strata – I could confirm the feelings of “superiority” of some Caporales dancers during a return trip to La Paz after the Segundo Convite 2000.

All the buses were full and my companion and I were very lucky to find out that the Caporales Centralistas San Miguel had two spare seats in their bus. We were sitting behind the video technician of the group, who – after everyone prayed – showed them a video of their final practice before

\(^{45}\) It is important to underline that, at a more general level, the dancers (as Bolivians) might affirm the presentation of their own cultural identity, through the display of national folklore. This is directly linked to the construction of a Bolivian national identity, which has already been discussed in Chapter Four.
carnival. After the dancers admired and praised themselves for an hour or more, the leader of the group turned the video off (to the regret of some dancers who wanted to watch a porno film). He sat next to the video technician and explained to him (for two hours) why they were different from any other dance group in Oruro. The main argument was that there were no cholos in their group, and that they were all professionals. “I am an engineer”- he loudly repeated, over and over again.

It is notable that a characteristic feature of the Caporales attitude is certain arrogance displayed in the way they dance and flirt, looking from above. This is facilitated by the boots and heels they wear, and by their general tallness.\(^46\) As a popular Caporales tune composed by the world-famous Kharkas\(^47\) states:

“Cuando yo bailo
   tiembla la tierra,
porque yo soy Caporal...
   Con mi sombrero
   y mis espuelas
   te hago suspirar”
   (Hermanos Hermosa)

“When I dance
trembles the earth,
cause I’m a Caporal..
   With my hat
   and my spurs
   I will make you sigh”.
   (My translation)

\(^46\) I once heard a girl making a comment about the shortness of a Caporal dancer; she thought he looked ridiculous.
\(^47\) Famous folkloric musicians.
I believe these lyrics illustrate how well the Kharkas have perceived the sense of dancing Caporales. This particular tune is a favourite one in private parties of the elite, where two decades ago it was considered a lack of taste to listen to any Bolivian folkloric music. Therefore, I would argue that there is finally a general representation of a national Bolivian identity in the folkloric performances displayed in Oruro, including the presentation of the self by members of the elite, through the Caporales dance.

But how does the representation of otherness take place in Oruro? As I have already pointed out, the Other is represented as the Devil, as the mystical, or savage, or hard-working Indian, as the African slave. A separate thesis could be written on each of the representations performed by every dance group, but that lies beyond the scope of the present work. I will therefore concentrate on a more general level of the mimetic representation of otherness in Oruro, taking into consideration not only the different semantic layers of the representational performances, but also the different levels of participation of the dancers, musicians and the public in general.

* 

Michael Taussig (1993) considers mimesis as a “space in between”:

“A space permeated by the colonial tension of mimesis and alterity, in which it is far from easy to say who is the imitator and who is the imitated, which is copy and which is original” (1993:78).
He illustrates this with Darwin's descriptions of the indigenous peoples at Tierra de Fuego in 1832, where

"Darwin's sailors were outdone by the Fuegians mimicking the sailors mimicking the Fuegians" (op.cit.81).

I would suggest that such meta-mimetic processes can be observed in the Carnival of Oruro, where images of alterity - created to construct a national Bolivian identity - are mirrored in the eyes of the depicted-yet-excluded Other. In order to explain this, let me consider first the more general level of the development of the festivity. I have already mentioned the adaptation of local pre-colonial festivities into the Catholic celebration of carnival.48 I have also discussed the marginality of the indigenous dances performed during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries in Oruro.49 However, the indigenous festivities were not wiped out altogether from Oruro. They were transformed into Catholic celebrations, but maintaining certain “indigenous” features.

By the depicted-yet-excluded Other I therefore mean the Indians (mostly miners) who originally danced in Oruro, but were later excluded from the official celebration of carnival. They are “excluded” because they were displaced and erased from the official celebrations of carnival in Oruro, but “depicted”, because most dances represent the (evil, or savage, or mystical, or hard-working) Indian-Other. Nevertheless, as I mentioned earlier, some of the “indigenous” dressing features were introduced to the

48 See Chapter One.
49 See Chapter Five.
Andes by Spanish colonial agents in the eighteenth century and later appropriated by the natives as their own. Therefore, the use of a bowler hat by a middle class Bolivian girl during carnival may entail a meta-mimetic process through which she imitates a chola whose use of the item constituted once an imitation too.

The use of a Moreno costume could have further implications: It might have originated, as some interpretations stress, as an Andean indigenous imitation of the African slaves during Spanish colony. Its use by an urban middle class man constitutes then an urban cross-cultural imitation of a colonial cross cultural imitation. Furthermore, the use of the remains of a Moreno costume - originally designed for an urban dancer – by a rural dancer during the (alternative) Anata Andina,\(^5\) entails the imitation of an imitation of an imitation. These meta-mimetic processes of the representational activities of carnival could be described and analysed endlessly, but I must also take into account the actual behaviour of the social actors involved. Therefore one must ask not only who the Other is, but also where s/he is and what s/he does in carnival.

Considering general notions of alterity, such as indianness, madness and evil, one could argue that the Other is located within and without carnival, as much as within and without all Bolivians. As I suggested above, most acts of carnival representation refer to the “Indian Other” in Oruro. Therefore there is an “Indian” presence during the carnival celebrations.

\(^5\) An event that can itself be considered an imitation of an imitation of a celebration, because it imitates the dance parade that emerged as an imitation of an indigenous parade.
This is however complemented by the fact that the Indians have been displaced in the celebrations, although they do participate in the *Anata Andina*, which has been included in the official programme during the last few years but for whom the doors of the temple are closed on that occasion. This explains the above reference about the "Indian within and without carnival". The "Indian within and without every Bolivian" refers to a common notion of the "inner Indian" which most people deny, but whose emergence Abercrombie (1992) identifies as the true sin of the dancers. This "inner Indian" often emerges when one drinks excessively (or "drinks like an Indian"), which is a common practice during carnival.\footnote{This will be discussed in Chapter Eight.}

Something similar happens to the inner Madman who eventually emerges after endless sessions of drinking and feasting. However, the Madman within and without carnival can also be identified with specific personages who inhabit the city of Oruro.

* 

There are some characters that do not belong to any of the dance groups, but are recognised by the locals as marginal personages who somehow belong to the city and its Carnival festivities. One such character is Bertha,\footnote{52} a woman in her mid thirties described by a newspaper article as "mentally ill". I have often seen her concentrated watching the dance groups from the tiers, or imitating the dance steps of a particular group during a practice, a *Convite* or the Carnival Parade itself. The first time
she caught my attention was during the *Ultimo Convite* 1998, when she was forced by a policeman to stay away from a *Tinku* dance group that was performing on the *Avenida Cívica*, before approaching the Temple of the Virgin. This is not the easiest place to join a dance group, because special choreographic moves take place there. Bertha did not seem to be too bothered by the policeman's threats and kept on dancing, watching the officer with a naughty smile on her dark and dirty face. She teased him and his dog like a bullfighter teases the bull. She danced around him and eventually managed to cross the border to join in the group, to be soon pulled out again, which seemed to be just a new beginning for her playful dance. Although the policeman seemed to be losing his patience and had to force her out a few times, he did not treat her badly.

I saw Bertha during the Carnival Parade 2000, "leading" a group of *Potolos* (dancers who perform playful and rhythmic movements of the hips). I did not recognise her first, for her movements and her old clothes were perfectly camouflaged with the dance group. I was not sure if the way she mastered the dance steps was due to her detailed observation of the dance groups for several years, or if that particular dance consisted in movements that were easy for her to follow. However, this brought me to think about how many dances performed during Carnival present movements and costumes that would not be considered appropriate in a different spatial and temporal framework. This seems to be very obvious, but I would suggest that it is nevertheless worth of consideration, since

---

52 This is not her real name, and since I did not manage to communicate directly with her to ask for her opinion, I shall keep the anonymity
certain characters who inhabit the city move and dress in a "carnival" fashion throughout the year. The last news I read about Bertha were that she gave birth to a baby girl, apparently as the result of a rape. The Bolivian minister of health (who is from Oruro) volunteered then to be the godfather of the baby, and he chose not to make his decision anonymous.

Another similar character is Freddy,53 a man in his mid fifties whom I first saw during the Primer Convite 1999. I was entering the chapel, heading towards the altar to take some photographs of the devil dancers and the Virgin, when I saw him sitting on one of the benches close to the main entrance of the temple. His dark and wrinkled forehead was damped and I could see the fatigue on his chest. Apparently he had been dancing with the devils. I realised he did not like to be watched, so I moved on towards the altar.

When I was returning to the entrance to take some photographs from the back, I saw him again. He was standing, facing the altar in a serious posture. This time I managed to be discreet and stand facing the altar, looking at him out of the corner of my eyes. I tried to figure out if he was wearing a costume or not, and if he was, what it represented. His long black hair was similar to the wigs of some Devil dancers, but his white jacket, trousers and boots resembled more the angels' costume. Then I saw the sculpture of a white angel behind him, in a niche of the chapel.

53 This is not his real name.
Next time I saw Freddy was during Carnival 2000. It was dark then, but I managed to see from afar some glittering features on his jacket. I was never sure if he formally participated in any dance group, for although his clothes did not fit any of the costumes of the dance groups, neither were they the normal clothes to wear outside Carnival. I never managed to speak to him or to find out anything about him, nevertheless his attitude reminded me of Bertha’s Carnival costume and behaviour outside Carnival, with the difference that Freddy’s involvement seemed to be more serious than Bertha’s. They might be considered then as representatives of playful and serious “madness”.

Guerra Gutierrez (1998) describes some similar “picturesque characters” of Oruro, and he compares them with the legendary Chiru Chiru and Nina Nina discussed in Chapter Two. It is notable that many of these characters are said to inhabit different caves of the Pie de Gallo Hill, home of the aforementioned Robin Hood-like thieves and the Virgin of the Mineshaft. Considering their social marginality and their active participation in the festivity, I would argue that they represent the madness within and without carnival.

* 

We must finally consider the presence of evil, within and without carnival. The image of Wari, as an evil deity, belongs to a general level of the representational processes enacted during carnival. It nevertheless
constitutes a specific case of denial of an “inner evil”, which is probably equitable in this case with the “inner Indian”, given the sinful connotations attributed to pre-colonial religions in the myth of Wari. But the “evil within” is also turned into “evil without” in the dance performances enacted in Oruro. This is particularly clear in the Relato of the Diablada described in Chapter Four, where the seven deadly sins - which epitomise evil, according to the official Catholic discourse - are defeated by the same number of virtues. Arrogance is counter-effected by humbleness, greed by generosity, lust by chastity, rage by patience, gluttony by moderation, envy by charity, and laziness by diligence. This is enacted at the representational level, but one has to ask also about the place of these sins and virtues in the actual behaviour of the individuals involved (dancers and the public in general).

It would seem unfair to describe the behaviour of the local population in reference to the permissive context provided by carnival (most notably characterised by lust, gluttony and drunkenness). However, I would argue that the actual desires underpinning the general behaviour of Bolivian middle class citizens, far from being replaced or transformed, are only enhanced during carnival. Although one cannot affirm that lust, gluttony and drunkenness characterise the everyday behaviour of all middle class Bolivians, they occupy a privileged place in the way people prioritise their free time. I would suggest that if middle class men, for example, are not drinking, eating and having extra-marital sexual relations during the

---

54 See Chapter Two.
weekends, they very well might be involved in one of these activities, while talking about the other two.

Perhaps what is particular about carnival in Oruro is that people engage in drinking, eating and sexual activities in an intensified and more overtly manner. I remember an occasion when I was watching the Sunday Parade, after more than 24 hours of eating and drinking, a gentleman (who is considered a very respectful and respected man in Oruro) stood up and said “Ok, I’m going to watch a porno film now”. And so he did. The ladies who were sitting with us (including his wife) laughed. This kind of behaviour would not be acceptable outside carnival, but that does not mean that men watch pornographic films only during carnival, they just do not admit it so easily during the rest of the year. After all, probably the most common image to observe in Bolivian public places is that of a big breasted woman wearing miniature (if any) underwear in a calendar advertising some kind of alcoholic beverage.

Obviously, the ideas presented above would not be accepted at all through an “indigenous” exegesis. As I mentioned earlier, most interlocutors asserted that they are Catholics, and affirmed their devotion to the Virgin of the Mineshaft. As the official magazine for Carnival 2000 states,

“Although the female dancers lift their skirts up, they never get completely undressed, because they are supposed to be dancing in religious devotion, and because it is not culturally accepted. It is admitted however that eroticism has drifted into promiscuity and alcoholism... What is interesting about the upsurge is the struggle between good and evil, where it is
well known that good will prevail. Something similar happens to the [female] dancers: although they tempt men through their performances, and sometimes even they [the girls] fall into lust, they have no option but to finish their dance at the Temple of the Mineshaft, where the immaculate one waits for their remorseful tears.”

The dancers’ performances are said to halt at the entrance of the temple, where they cross themselves and get on their knees. They are then supposed to confirm their real identities, as faithful Catholics. However, perhaps this is the site where a different kind of performance starts, where the dancers imitate the ideal image they (and the society they belong to) have of themselves. This could be considered as a “front”, according to Goffman’s (1980) theory of the presentation of self in everyday life.

Although such a suggestion would also be rejected by the dancers, it is relevant to consider that their quiet and sober behaviour at the temple stops almost immediately after they leave it, when they get ready to continue feasting for the rest of the season. Could it be possible that representation never ends, and that it is transformed in parallel to the transmutations of the objects it depicts? This is also what I mean by the Other within and without. Is it not the case that the representation of evil constitutes, for example, a depiction of the inner Self as much as of the inner Other? These are questions that I shall address in the following chapter.

***
The pilgrimage of thousands of dancers devoted to the Virgin of the Mineshaft could be interpreted as the transformation of Oruro into a “sacred” place during carnival. All dancers are blessed in the temple, as they cross themselves kneeling in front of the image of the Madonna. The presence of hundreds of Devil Dancers in the chapel does not imply a transgression or contradiction, for they admittedly represent the defeat of evil by the forces of good. Representational activities are supervised by local authorities and blessed by the Virgin, constituting therefore part of the official celebration of carnival. On the other hand, the unofficial-raucous behaviour is generally enacted by the public in the open celebration of carnival in the streets. The chaotic fusion of sounds, shapes, colours and smells contributes to the creation of the collective grotesque body, a topic appropriately discussed by Mikhail Bakhtin.

* 

Eating, drinking and laughing are activities associated with the degradation of the “elevated” which is, according to Bakhtin (1990), an outstanding feature of grotesque realism. In this context, degrading means bringing close to the earth, as a principle of absorption and birth. Degradation is considered in direct relation to the life of the lower bodily stratum, mainly the bowels and the genital organs. Bakhtin asserts that,

“the body is open towards the world through its orifices, protuberances, ramifications and excrescences. It is in the actions performed by these corporeal parts that the body reveals its essence as a principle of growth that surpasses its own boundaries” (1990:30, my translation).
Not surprisingly, the grotesque body is often identified with the earth, as a principle of growth and as the realm where degradation is fulfilled, where we are born, we eat and drink, where we defecate and die. Bakhtin’s idea of degradation as a “bringing close to the earth” is echoed by the opposite concept of “elevation” within the official discourse on the Oruro Carnival Parade. The transformation of pre-colonial non-Christian festivals into the Catholic celebration of carnival has been described as “the worship of flora being elevated to a Marian veneration” (Bullaín, 1970: 42). Thus, elevation is interpreted as a movement away from the earth. This was already pointed out in relation to the mythological narrative, where the elevation of Ñusta or Dawn is related to her estrangement from nature, and the degradation of Wari (the Spirit of the Hills) is enacted through his confinement in the entrails of the earth.¹

Although dancers, musicians and the public in general would usually identify themselves with the realm of good, much of their behaviour may be considered as part of a process of degradation whereby the carnivalesque-grotesque encroaches upon the realm of the “sacred”. This is observed, for example, in the transformation of solemnity into chaos, and in the hyperactivity of the lower part of the body, during the celebration of carnival in Oruro.

**Carnival and Eroticism**

It is commonly accepted that carnival is the period of preparation for lent, the time to give up the excessive consumption of alcohol and red meat. Once I observed a (voyeuristic) male spectator who, while looking up at the scarcely covered buttocks of a

¹ See Chapter Two.
dancer, exclaimed: *Carne Vale!* He was obviously not referring to the Italian “farewell to meat”, but to the erotic connotations of “meat treat”.\(^2\) Although the official discourse stresses the religious aspect of the festival, it cannot deny its overwhelming sensuality.

In reference to the Carnival of Rio – famous for its eroticism - the following comments are included in the ACFO’s official magazine for Carnival 1999:

> “We accept that eroticism and sensuality are part of the *fiesta*. We also understand the *fiesta* as an instance of close encounter with other cultures, such as the Brazilian, but we never achieve their extremes... Although the female dancers [in Oruro] lift their skirts up, they never get completely undressed, because they are supposed to be dancing in religious devotion, and because it is not culturally accepted. It is admitted however that eroticism has drifted into promiscuity and alcoholism... What is interesting about the upsurge is the struggle between good and evil, where it is well known that good will prevail. Something similar happens to the [female] dancers: although they tempt men through their performances, and sometimes even they [the girls] fall into lust, they have no option but to finish their dance at the Temple of the Mineshaft, where the immaculate one waits for their remorseful tears.”

I have seen many dancers crying at the Temple, and I have also been driven to tears by the emotional atmosphere. I will never know if the dancers’ tears were remorseful or not.\(^3\) I cannot explain my own tears either, but I can affirm that I did not cry for remorse, and that as soon as I was outside the chapel I was ready for another cold beer. Although the dancers are always exhausted after their performances, they usually gather to drink immediately after leaving the chapel, and get ready to continue the raucous celebrations.

As mentioned earlier, most dancers whom I interviewed affirmed that they danced in devotion to the Virgin. However, a closer examination of the reasons asserted for

---

\(^2\) In Bolivia, some men refer to women as “meat”.

\(^3\) I will not discuss the anthropological theory on emotions, but it would be relevant to develop research on such a topic, stressing the need to transcend the dichotomies meaning/feeling, mind/body and culture/biology (see Leavitt, 1996).
joining the dance groups will allow us to identify other interests. In relation to the eroticism discussed in this section, it will be pertinent to concentrate on the most erotic dance of the Oruro Carnival: Caporales.

I have already commented that most Caporales interviewees were not fully aware of the symbolic meanings of their performances. When I asked them about the reasons for joining this particular dance, they usually emphasised its rhythm, costumes, elegance and joyfulness. It is also a very physically demanding dance. Some interlocutors admitted that, besides the devotion and the joy of dancing, they also appreciate the fact that they stay fit through their participation in the dance. Both men and women who participate in this dance tend to take a lot of care of their physical appearances. Thus, only rarely would one see “fat people” dancing Caporales.  

An interviewee who danced for Caporales San Simón told me that he once saw some short and stocky girls taking a dance-test to enter the group. He said they were rejected despite being good dancers, and other girls who did not dance so well but were taller and thinner were accepted instead. This dance could be considered the local showcase for displaying the paradigmatic image of the slim woman, publicised in local and global fashion magazines. However, the excessive movements of the hips and the minute size of the skirts do not correspond to the conservative values exalted by the women who read those magazines (and who often are Caporales dancers themselves).

It is notable that the dance most often performed by the (conservative) upper-middle class girls is the most erotic one. This may be explained in terms of a symbolic role

---

4 There are some exceptions, like the fat man discussed in the last section of this chapter.
reversal or, in Eco’s terms (1984), as an “authorised transgression”. Nevertheless, I will focus on the relationship between the (sensual/erotic) performance, the conservative discursive morality, and the actual (non-performative) intimate behaviour. It is very difficult and probably impossible to disclose the actual intimate behaviour, without violating the privacy of the social actors. I will therefore base my argument on some specific cases, always maintaining secret the identity of the individuals involved. However, I must warn the reader that some of the information provided here might offend certain sensitivities.

Although spectators are supposed to keep a distance from the performers, they often approach them, to offer a drink or to have their photographs taken with the dancer of their preference. This generally happens during the periods when the dance groups are forced to halt their performances and wait for the group in front to advance further. However, sometimes spectators join performers while they dance. A Caporal dancer told me that, on Calle Bolivar, the people just enter the esplanade to dance. “The girls go crazy and get involved, they kiss you and give you drinks”- he said.

Once, an upper-class woman who was watching the Entrada with me was shocked, when she saw a man stroking a Caporal girl’s genitals. She said she could not believe that the man simply walked away, and that the dancer just laughed and did not do anything about it. Let us consider here the role of the spectator, as a Bolivian woman watching another Bolivian woman performing the most erotic dance of carnival. She did not seem to approve the open eroticism of the performance. However, I later found out through a completely reliable source that this woman –who was married- was having an affair with a married man, and once gave him oral sex in a taxi. It is
necessary to include such details, in order to compare the (public) discursive morality and the actual (private) behaviour of a spectator.

Considering the distinction between the public and the private, it was clear that the woman did not approve the public eroticism that she observed between the dancer and the man who touched her. However, although her extra-marital sexual relationship was confined to “private places” (motels), she surrendered to eroticism in the very limited and frail privacy of Bolivian public transport. It may be argued that, by performing a sexual act at the edge between the private and the public, she goes beyond the (permitted) public sensuality displayed in carnival, which she disapproved.

This example also enables us to consider the triadic relation between the performer, the character represented and the public. As mentioned earlier, the flirty and sensual figure of Caporales dancers is not just a representation. I would suggest that it might embody the desires and fantasies of the performers. Male and female spectators also get involved with the characters represented, and they sometimes transgress the boundaries between spectator and performer, kissing and touching the dancers.

Despite the general assertion of the dance as a religious devotion, its sensual and erotic connotations cannot be overlooked. Both male and female dancers flirt through their performances, and the (female and male) spectators respond to the dancers’ flirtations verbally, with gestures, or dancing with them. An old friend of mine, who danced as a

---

5 I call taxis “public transport” because, in contrast with “radio taxis”, the drivers may stop and pick up new costumers while they are already carrying passengers, as long as there is room and the new passengers go in the same direction.

6 Nevertheless, such occurrences can result in a massive fight between the male dancers and the transgressors. A Caporal dancer told me about a case when someone of the public touched one of the girls, and the male dancers beat the man up in the middle of the esplanade.
Caporal for many years, provided me with very sincere comments about his participation in the festival. Although his assertions cannot be generalised, his comments are illustrative of the grotesque bodily performance during carnival.

When I asked him about the reasons for dancing in carnival, he said that, for him, the main reason was to have fun, to get endlessly drunk and laid. He told me that the first time he went to dance in Oruro, they were 45 dancers who were thrown out of the hotel after drinking more than 60 litres of alcohol during the first night. Then he explained that it was not the drinking that triggered their expulsion from the hotel, but the fact that they had been running around the place all night, looking for new sex partners.

When I asked him why he stopped dancing, he said:

“Well, you know. I got married, I have three children now. Why in hell would I go to Oruro? When I danced, I knew that there would be at least three girls waiting for me there. I used to leave my underpants at the toll, before entering the city, to pick them up only on my way out, back to La Paz. Now my children and my wife wait for me.”

Eroticism also permeates the non-performative sphere of carnival. Sexual activities are not increased only amongst performers, but also amongst the public in general. Local health authorities are aware of the sexual promiscuity involved, and publish every year warnings about the high risk of contracting venereal diseases. In 1999 the Ministry of Health distributed 100,000 free condoms as a preventive measure against the contraction of sexually transmitted diseases. The authorities also express publicly their concern about the hygiene of the foods consumed in the streets, and about the general

---

7 This seems to be a very small number, considering that the 100,000 condoms were to be distributed nation-wide. In year 2000, 20,000 condoms were distributed in Oruro.
pollution of the city, due to the enormous consumption of food and drink, a topic to which I shall now turn.

**Eating and Drinking**

Some of the most popular local dishes have as a main ingredient cow’s stomach and intestines; such as *Ranga Ranga*, which basically consists of pieces of stomach cooked in a spicy sauce and served with potatoes, *Chinchulines* (fried or grilled plaided guts), or *Tripa Gorda* (deep fried tripes). According to Bakhtin (1990), tripes are semiotically ambivalent figures in popular culture, for they may symbolise life and death through their relation to both the womb and faeces. The act of eating them implies the presence of guts within our own guts. Human and animal intestines are, according to Bakhtin, “gathered in a sole grotesque and indissoluble knot” (op cit.: 200, my translation). The possibility of any residual faecal matter in the animal’s tripes implies its fusion with the contents of the human intestines. Bakhtin suggests that excrements link the body to the earth. The joy of eating tripes may then be interpreted as a contributing factor to the act of degradation, through the fusion of animal and human faeces and the process of bringing the human body close to the earth.

Bakhtin asserts that the boundaries between the animal’s eaten body and the human eating body become blurred, for they are “intertwined and fused in a unique grotesque image of the eaten and eating universe” (op cit.: 199, my translation). I have also observed and experienced an almost dramatic relation between those who eat and those who are eaten. There are some strategic corners, on *Avenida 6 de Octubre*, where people gather before dawn every Saturday and Sunday (especially in carnival season) to

---

8 I would not claim that the dishes described here are typically and exclusively from Oruro, except *Rostro Asado* (see below).
purchase a local delicacy, the *Rostra Asado* or “Baked Face”. The lamb heads,\(^9\) baked during 7 hours in the oven with skin and wool, are kept warm wrapped in tea towels and blankets. The ladies who sell them reach for the heads under the blankets. This movement gives the impression that the heads are taken from under the ladies, who are also wrapped in blankets to stay warm in the freezing early hours. The vendors usually peel and open the skulls for the tourists and other outsiders. The locals are of course very skilled at doing this. Eating *Rostra Asado* involves looking at the face that looks at you while you devour it. Everything is eaten, except the skin and bones, but in order to reach the brains you have to lever open the skull with the help of the jaw. This is a skill acquired only after much practice. People often bring their lamb heads wrapped in newspapers to eat them by the Temple of the Virgin, where the *Alba* rite takes place. I have seen there men hitting their skulls against a kerbstone, in a desperate attempt to eat the brains. The palate feels uncomfortably greasy after eating a *Rostro Asado*, but this is solved with a shot of *Singani* (a grape spirit) or a glass of *Té con Té* (warm spicy tea with *Singani*), that rinses the palate and throat.

*  

In carnival 2002 I felt the (enhanced) fusion of my senses and my mind. As I was approaching the *Plaza del Folklore*, where the *Alba* rite was taking place, the smell of *chicharrón* (deep-fried pork), *anticuchos* (llama heart brochettes), *tripa gorda* (deep fried tripes) and other foods was mixed with the smell of beer on the sticky pavement. I could see at the same time some revellers urinating behind the stalls, which were roofed and framed with blue and red plastic sheets. The electric and candle lights enhanced the

---

\(^9\) According to Guerra (1998), this dish cannot be prepared elsewhere with similar results, because of the salty pastures of the southern area of the department, where the lamb heads come from.
colourful imageries of the stalls which included fire, foods, tins and bottles of drink, vendors, costumed dancers, musicians, and so on.

Needless to say, the musical cacophony of the *Alba* rite provided the appropriate sonorous background for the night. However, the musical backdrop of *Morenadas* was beautifully\textsuperscript{10} enriched with the melody produced by a blind man playing his accordion in the middle of the street. He was sitting on a tiny bench, moving along to the music of his own instrument and listening to the *Morenadas* and to the people passing by. I noticed he felt my presence, as I walked around him a couple of times, listening with headphones to the fusion of his music and that of the *Alba* brass bands. We made brief physical contact, as (apart from the bank note) I thanked him with a soft stroke on his back, to which he responded with a smile.

The music in my head took me to the middle of the *Plaza del Folklóre*, where I kept on recording both the specific notes played by some individual musicians and the general cacophony of the hundreds of brass and percussion instruments. This I did until the morning, when the dancers of the Sunday Parade approached the temple, and their musical rhythm was again fused with the *Alba* rite sonorous chaos. This was the best recording of the *Alba* rite I never made: I had been amused for many hours, listening to the tubas, trombones, trumpets and drums. When I noticed that I never changed the tape, although I had been listening all night to the “recording” through the headphones, I realised that the tape recorder had been on pause all night. After hitting my head against the wall a number of times, and cursing God out loud a few more times, I finally fell asleep on the pavement. A kind lady vendor approached me when I woke up

\textsuperscript{10} Perhaps I should not include such a personal aesthetic judgement, but I cannot find a more appropriate word to describe this.
later, and handed my glasses, which she said I dropped on the floor when I collapsed hours before. She also advised me to eat something and to stop drinking.

*

The enormous consumption of food and alcohol during the festival has as an obvious consequence an enhanced production of bodily fluids and the extraordinary accumulation of organic and inorganic litter. The flow of urine on the streets, mainly under the rows of seats framing the official route of the Carnival Parade achieves pantagruelic dimensions. The creation of the monster is only possible with the tumultuous popular participation. I have had many entertaining conversations while urinating under the tiers. Once I was sprinkled with beer by some musicians who were above me offering a libation to Pachamama or Mother Earth. They laughed and made signs of apology. Then they nodded showing their beer cans, and I laughed and nodded too, confirming I understood the relation between their drinking, their libations and my urinating. It was clear that I was urinating after drinking a lot of beer, and that they were offering beer to the Earth before drinking it themselves, which would later result in their turn to urinate.

*

Thierry Saignes (1993) points out that, besides its role as a privileged communicative medium between human and supernatural beings in the Andes, alcohol permits the emergence of challenges against the established authority and social-hierarchical norms. Robert Randall (1993) agrees with Saignes, stressing the subversive nature of
drunkenness and suggesting certain equivalence between *Chicha* (corn beer) and the Bible during the Spanish conquest. Thomas Abercrombie (1993) asserts that alcohol is the source of great significance and danger in the Andes. What is often interpreted as “alcoholic intoxication due to excessive drinking during *fiestas*” is considered locally as a ritual offer of the body. According to Abercrombie, *ch’allas* (“libations”) address several dieties, and it is not rare to find that the first *ch’allas* are directed to alcohol factories or clay containers used for storing *chicha* beer. He argues that the prosperous and generous *pasante* (“ritual sponsor”) takes at times the place of the gods (ibid.).

All the authors above refer to Andean rural contexts, therefore their assertions cannot be directly assumed for the consumption of alcohol in Andean cities. However, it may be relevant to consider certain parallelism between the elements, practices and meanings incorporated within rural ritual activities and their mimetically transmogrified urban counterparts. Most probably, rural ritual specialists would not take urban practices seriously. Nevertheless, observing the mimetic enactment of an “Andean rituality” in Oruro will probably enable us to identify an alternative, not strictly Catholic (nor “indigenous”) “religiosity”.

* According to Estenssoro (1992 b), the sixteenth century chronicler don Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala asserted that, in reference to the *taquis* (Andean dancing and singing) the danger was not in the dances themselves, but in drunkenness. Poma represented the “idolatrous” *taquis* together with drunkenness, and the Devil holding both a drum and a drunken man. Similarly, Gisbert (1999) compares another drawing of Guaman Poma -
Figure 34. A flying devil holding a *kero* (old Andean libation cup), and another devil playing the guitar (detail of the anonymous painting *La Muerte*). Compare with the drawing by colonial chronicler Guamán Poma de Ayala. Source: Gisbert 1999.
in which the Inca is depicted together with a flying demon, both offering chicha beer to the Sun-God Inti - with a detail of the anonymous painting representing the death of a faithful man and the death of a sinner. The latter canvas - painted in 1739 and exhibited in the Chapel of Caquiaviri in the department of La Paz - contrasts the faithful life of the Catholic man with the sinful life of the unfaithful, including the seven deadly sins that characterise the latter. The detail\textsuperscript{11} shows the Devil holding an Inca libation cup (kero). Although drinking was not always considered a sin as such, drinking "like an Indian" has always been more susceptible to being considered a sin.

* 

The performance of Ch’alla libations is a general practice in Oruro and most of the Bolivian Highlands, particularly during carnival. In urban contexts, it is possible to observe different degrees of (dis)similitude with regards to the rural rites. Probably there are particular social and cultural contexts within the city, where the libations closely resemble the rural ch’allas. However, I will focus here on the quick acts of spilling drink on the floor, which can be observed in the streets, plazas, bars and houses of Oruro.

People usually spill some of their drink, before they have the first sip of it. Some offer the first spill after opening a new bottle, and others just keep on offering their libations while they drink. But whom do they offer these libations to? The general answer is Pachamama, or Mother Earth. There are different levels of perceiving this, but the most common one is that one is just supposed to spill a bit of alcohol (beer, wine, etc.) on the

\textsuperscript{11} See figure 34.
ground, as an act of reciprocity towards the fertile and nurturing Earth. Some people stress the “respect to our indigenous ancestors” while offering a libation, and this is most often and most loudly emphasised when the individuals have already drunk a lot.

I would suggest that the most significant aspect of urban ch’allas seems to be the act of drinking itself. One of the main concerns of the revellers is usually the availability of alcohol. One may find people spilling their last drops of drink, with the hope that Pachamama will shortly supply more alcohol. This could be compared with the dancers’ requests to the Virgin, for another year to dance for her. Some interlocutors refer to this as a relationship of reciprocity, for which they use the word ayni. Although I will not provide a description of the socio-economic, political and cosmological fundamentals of Andean rural ayni, it is necessary to point out a basic distinction from its urban counterpart. In order to understand rural ayni, one must indeed consider the socio-economic, political and cosmological connotations of the Andean concept of community. Whereas, the urban understanding seems to be pretty much based on an individualistic ethos. That is, although the dancers always belong to a group, they engage into an individual devotional relationship with the Virgin. Similarly, the reciprocity most often observed between drinking partners is usually based on an individual level: you buy me a drink and I will buy you another one. In contrast with the rural performance of ritual libations or ch’allas, the only element required for the urban affair seems to be alcohol itself.

* 

---

12 See Chapter Seven.
As it happens with the notion of *ch’alla*, there are different understandings of the *pasantes* ("ritual sponsors"), according to the social context. The role of the *pasante* couple in the dance groups of Oruro has already been briefly outlined in Chapter Three. It may be generally asserted that in urban contexts the *pasante* couple provides the funds necessary for the dance group to perform their different activities (in preparation for and) during carnival. In order to be a *pasante* one must be prosperous and generous, to afford the great expenses. Alcohol is, undoubtedly, one of the most important items that the *pasantes* must provide for the dancers, authorities, musicians and guests.

Considering the central place of alcohol in the celebrations of carnival in Oruro, and Abercrombie’s (1993) comments about the rural libations addressing alcohol factories and the *pasante* taking the place of the gods, what is the role of beer breweries in Oruro? It is notable that beer breweries have always been the official sponsors of the *Entrada* or Carnival Parade. Although the role of *pasantes* is not limited to the provision of alcohol, it might be interesting to consider the possibility of the beer breweries being the *pasantes* of the Carnival Parade as a whole. Their official sponsorship might achieve a “ritual” status through the recurrent *ch’allas* and the urban deification of beer through the omnipresence of beer advertisement in the local imagery of carnival. Do the beer breweries as official sponsors take the place of the gods in Oruro?

*13 There are, of course, contexts in which the notion of “community” is much more important than the one of “individual”, like in the case of the Cocanis and the Mañazos (see Chapter Four).
Religious festivities are, according to Salazar Soler (1993), just an excuse for drinking in the Andes. The Catholic Church regards the importance of alcohol and drunkenness in Bolivian contemporary urban festivities as a serious problem. Alfonso Musigniani, the parish priest of the Temple of the Virgin of the Mineshaft, affirms that the Carnival of Oruro is a religious celebration. However, he regrets that at least in one occasion he had to forbid the admission in the chapel of a huge sign of Taquiña Beer preceding a particular dance group. “Is this a procession for the Virgin or for Taquiña?” - he asked, after seeing the small image of the Virgin behind the sign. Local representatives of the Catholic Church have to remind their parishioners that carnival constitutes the time for preparation, previous to the period of abstinence during lent.

It will be illustrative to review again the etymology of carnival and lent discussed in Chapter One. According to Rudwin (1920), the English ecclesiastical term Shrovetide stresses the Christian origin of the festival, by pointing out a period of preparation for a forty days’ fast through shriving and confessing. But the German terms fastnacht, fassnacht and fasenacht that designate carnival illustrate the mutually opposed meanings attributed to the festivity (ibid).

At first sight fastnacht is understood as “the eve of fast”, but Rudwin points out that this is a popular corruption of the term fassnacht (or vasnacht) - meaning “an evening of carousing, of diligent application to the fass [the cask]” (1920:3) - as the festival is (or at least was in the 1920s) colloquially called. Finally, Rudwin points out that fasenacht (or vasenacht) is a perfectly correct form by which the carnival season was universally known in Germany, up to the turn of the twentieth century. Fasenacht does
not refer to the verb fasten ("to fast"), but to fasen or faseln ("to talk nonsense, to have great fun"), thus denoting an evening of feasting and fooling.

The indiscriminate use of the German terms fasten and fasen to designate carnival is as contradictory as the confusion of “fasting” and “feasting” would be in English, and it illustrates the semantic ambiguity of the festival. Similarly, I have already suggested the use of the Italian terms carne vale to reinterpret carnival through the slang connotations of “meat treat”. This is reinforced by the transforming behaviour and double discourse of social actors during the celebration of carnival. As mentioned earlier, the official Catholic discourse on carnival is often contrasted with recurrent drinking and feasting in Oruro.

I have already mentioned that the open space by the foot of the Temple of the Virgin is transformed through the development of carnival, as the initial solemnity and sobriety of the religious pilgrimage is gradually transmuted into a raucous and chaotic fiesta. This reaches its climax with the Alba rite.

During the Alba rite in 1995, I found myself looking for a space to sleep in the temple. Initially, I tried to be very discreet, as the priest was delivering a sermon in competition with the cacophony of the brass bands outside. Soon I noticed that my discreteness was not necessary, since most (if not all) parishioners were already asleep. Some were leaning their heads against the pulpit in front of them, others were lying on the floor against the walls. I also saw a man sleeping in a confessional booth. He seemed to be comfortable, despite the fact that he was still wearing pieces of a Moreno costume.
When I discovered that the other confessional booth was empty, I took possession of it for a couple of hours.

* 

In his analysis of carnival and popular culture, Bakhtin suggests that Rabelais transformed the cask of Diogenes (the cynic) into a wine cask, as the reincarnation of the free and joyful truth. He also describes one of Rabelais’ most popular characters, *Fat Guillaume*: a fat man whose body adopted the shape of a wine cask because he had to wear two belts, one under his chest and the other one under his belly (1990b:263).

This reminds me of two characters of the Oruro Carnival Parade. One of them is the Moreno dancer, whose costume has the shape of a barrel. There are different interpretations of the Morenada or Moreno dance, but all of them coincide in the general representation of African slaves. Edwin Guzmán (nd) suggests that the slaves’ hard cylinder-like tunic described by Murillo Vacarreza (1980) might have evolved to become the wine cask figure, within which the black man is “magically turned into wine today”. As stated earlier, generally, the Moreno dancer wears a black mask with feathers, a jacket, a barrel-like skirt and boots. He usually holds a rattle and a small barrel in his hands. There is a particular Moreno costume that has the shape of a wine cask. The dancers who wear this particular costume are called *los barrilitos*, or “little barrels”.

---

14 See the section on Morenada, in Chapter Four.

15 Morenada: Origenes de la Danza, an article included in the documents of the Fraternidad Morenada Central Oruro Fundada por la Comunidad Cocanis.
Figure 35. Ancestros (sporting barrel-like costumes). (photograph: courtesy of Oscar Martinez, who told me that the composers Jacha Flores and Gerardo Yañez are depicted here, dancing at the front). Note the image of Gambrinus on the beer advertisement (see also the detail) of the grapes under Gambrinus' barrel and on the dancers' costumes.
The other character similar to Rabelais' *Fat Guillaume* is a member of a *Caporales* Dance Group who in the 1980s used to amuse spectators dancing with a bottle of beer sitting on his enormous beer belly. This personage resembles the figure depicted on the label attached to the bottle sitting on his belly: a fat and joyful *Gambrinus* \(^{17}\) rests on top of a beer barrel, holding two glasses of beer in his hands. Like *Gambrinus*, the dancer embodies the pleasure of drinking, for the bottle of beer resting on his beer-belly, like the beer barrel on which *Gambrinus* sits, contains the liquid that helped to shape his body and his joy.

The rattles used by *Morenada* dancers today are often replicas of beer bottles, a shape that seems to be increasingly worshiped in the Carnival of Oruro. The erection of enormous beer tins and bottles in the main streets and squares of the city seems to replace the official imagery of carnival.\(^\text{18}\) There have been different attempts to “clean” the festivity of undesirable drunkenness and other “degrading” activities, but the consumption of alcohol during carnival increases every year. The official sponsors of carnival 2002, *Paceña* Beer, publicised the slogan *todo con medida, nada con exceso* (“everything with measure, nothing in excess”), in reference to the consumption of alcohol. Nevertheless, there was no measure to drinking during carnival, and the supplies of *Paceña* Beer seemed to never end. The degradation of the “elevated” takes always place in the festivity of *Wari*, the Andean Spirit of the Hills who was identified by Colonial and Republican authorities with the European Devil, and whose name was

---

\(^{16}\) See figures 28 and 35.

\(^{17}\) *The Enciclopedia Universal Ilustrada* (Hijos de Espasa, Barcelona 1924) defines him as the King of Beer. A legendary character, probably linked to the person who discovered the fermented drink. *Gambrinus* is usually depicted with a glass of beer in his hand (see the detail in figure 35).

\(^{18}\) See figure 36.
Figure 34. A Potolo dancer at the Avenida Cívica. Note the giant Beer Tin, advertisement for Paceña Beer, and the Huari Beer sign below.
Figure 37. Huari Beer
later adopted by one of the most popular beer breweries\textsuperscript{19} in Bolivia. The performative exaltation of sober sacredness and the (also performative) defeat of the deadly sins, seem to be contradicted by a counter-discursive embodiment of drunkenness, gluttony and lust in the popular celebration of carnival in Oruro.

\textsuperscript{19} \textit{Huari [Wari] Beer} was the official sponsor of the Carnival Parade until a few years ago (see figure 37).
CONCLUSIONS

The Representative of UNESCO in Bolivia, Yves de la Menorval, and the former National Secretary of Cultural Promotion, Zulma Yugar, justified the declaration of the Oruro Carnival as Cultural Oral and Intangible Heritage of Humanity in terms of the many cultural influences inherent to a long process of collective creativity. They also emphasised the central place of the festival in the lives of the local population, regretting, however, the persistent excessive consumption of alcohol during the celebration of carnival in Oruro.

The notion of cultural heritage is often linked to the protection and conservation of specific and highly valued œuvres of cultural expression. It thus tends to imply some sort of fixation, in relation to a specific context. The introduction of the concept of intangible culture implies a context that is not necessarily materialised in a monumental presence. I have shown in the dissertation how the material presence of hills, rocks, lakes and sand dunes are incorporated into the immaterial realm of dreams and myth, and how the latter affects the construction of carnivalesque imageries in Oruro.

Although I have recurrently referred to the corpus of images (i.e. the imageries) constructed through the performance of the festival, it is clear that this entails a number of other activities and spheres of carnival (e.g. spatial behaviour, temporal perception, musical performances, eating and
drinking), which I have also addressed in the dissertation. Different activities are interwoven in the collective creativity of the local population, which does indeed incorporate multiple cultural influences. However, the introduction of different cultural elements into the dance performances does not, for example, mean that they keep their original significance in the new performative context. The context and its elements mutually condition and alter each other, and this can be observed in the various spheres of carnival celebration in the city of Oruro. Perhaps this can be explained in reference to the relation between drinking and dancing.

Although the authorities in charge of organising the carnival Parade and the official discourse in general stress the need to eliminate drunkenness from the festival, I would argue that the central place of carnival in the lives of the local population is often expressed through collective inebriation. There are therefore different views about the consumption of alcohol, which should also be considered in relation to the ritualised performances of the present and the past.

I have discussed how dance and drunkenness were considered not only a sign of sinful behaviour, but directly related to evil during Spanish colonialism. However, Estenssoro (1989, 1992 a, 1992 b) shows how the colonial attitude regarding dancing and drinking changed, according to the specific period and the different policies of the Spanish Crown and the Catholic Church. The prohibition of music in the colonial society was
almost always directed to a specific group (i.e. the Indians), more than to the attitude itself (Estenssoro, 1989). However, given the impossibility of eliminating the performance of fiestas they were incorporated as useful mechanisms for religious conversion, which entailed that they were to be performed in the streets, to make them controllable. Thus at times the prohibition was directed to the groups (or the Indians) themselves and at other times to the specific traditions (or to “indianness”). I will not develop this any further, for it is only necessary to keep it in mind while we reflect upon the modern celebration of carnival in Oruro.

* 

As I have shown through the dissertation, the Indian performances of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries have been displaced by the urban dancers of the late twentieth century. The critical moment for this change took place after the Chaco War, when far from prohibiting the performance of the Carnival Parade in the central space of the city, the local authorities took part in the organisation of the festival, prescribing the presence of the dancers in the central square. This coincides with the emergence of a new political movement that dominated most of the politics of the second half of the twentieth century: the Movimiento Nacionalista Revolucionario, which had as one of its objectives the incorporation of the Indians into the civil society. Thus Abercrombie (1992) suggests that it was the involvement of some “Indigenist” members
of the elite into the popular devil dance group of the butchers (*Mañazos*) that triggered the division of the oldest dance group of Oruro.

The creation of a Bolivian national cultural identity must paradoxically entail fragmentation, as the multiple socio-cultural realities that coexist in the country are not likely to achieve a consensus about “our culture”. Thus the appropriation of the festival by the upper middle classes illustrates a modern version of the incorporation of “ethnic” elements into the Bolivian celebration of the Catholic faith. However, although there are no relevant numbers of Indian participants in the festivity, the Other that must be controlled and sanitised today emerges from within. We can all dance, drink and celebrate in Oruro, as long as we avoid the danger of achieving the “Indian” excess; that is to drink like an Indian.

One cannot affirm that contemporary drunkenness is equivalent to the “evil rites of inebriation” depicted by colonial chroniclers, but alcoholic excess is indeed the biggest worry of the authorities in charge of organising the festival.

*  

Heavenly and grotesque imageries are created and recreated in the carnival of Oruro, through the performances of the devoted dancers (representing devils and angels) and the open enactment of popular culture in the streets, respectively. Heavenly imageries are constructed through
the incorporation of the dichotomy good/evil into the mythological narrative and the representation of angels defeating devils in the *Relato* or narrated performance of the Devil-Dance. Grotesque imageries are (perhaps more spontaneously) created through the excessive consumption of food and alcohol, which brings upon an enhanced production of bodily fluids and a degrading behaviour, most clearly typified as drunkenness, gluttony and debauchery. Such behaviour gives indeed place to a degradation of the “elevated”, through the popular assimilation of a conduct specifically proscribed in the dramatised performance of the *Relato*.

According to Thompson (1972: 23-24), the conscious confusion between fantasy and reality is a hallmark of the grotesque, but he also stresses that its strength lies in the fact that the grotesque world, however strange, is our real and immediate world. One can certainly confuse fantasy and reality under the influence of alcohol, a state in which strangeness does not necessarily relate to the fantastic or the supernatural, but also to the immediate spatial/temporal context.

Thus the (official) imageries of a struggle between heavenly and infernal beings to control the lives of the local population are to be observed in relation to the encroachment of alternative (carnivalesque-grotesque) imageries upon the spatial and temporal enactment of the festival in Oruro. Although it could be argued that the (representational) struggle between good and evil is a topic of universal interest and worth of its
consideration as a heritage of humanity, the chaotic enactment of the popular-grotesque in carnival is at the very least of an equal significance.

Alternative activities develop parallel to the representational sphere of carnival, according to the specific historical context. I have attempted to illustrate such processes, through which differentiated imageries are created and recreated in the Carnival of Oruro.

***

290
### APPENDIX 1

**Chart: Main events enacted during the celebration of Carnival in Oruro.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EVENT</th>
<th>TIME AND PLACE</th>
<th>PARTICIPANTS</th>
<th>DESCRIPTION AND COMMENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Velada</strong></td>
<td>Saturday evenings at the central offices or private residences of members of the different dance groups (From the eve of the Primer Convite on).</td>
<td>Members of the different dance groups and other institutions linked to the organisation of the carnival celebrations, members of the Catholic Church, and public in general.</td>
<td>A meeting organised by the different dance groups, with the presence of the image of the Virgin. People gather around the Madonna, to pray and sing, “chewing” coca leaves, smoking cigarettes and drinking ponches and te con tes (hot alcoholic beverages).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Primer Convite</strong></td>
<td>In November, First Sunday after All Saints day. In the streets of Oruro, always ending at the altar of the Virgin.</td>
<td>Members of the different dance groups and other institutions linked to the organisation of the carnival celebrations, musicians, members of the Catholic Church, and public in general.</td>
<td>After all dancers have completed the full route of the Carnival Parade in their first official rehearsal, the priest takes the new dancers’ vows, which refer to their commitment to dance for the Virgin for at least three consecutive years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Procesión de Cirios</strong></td>
<td>On the eve of Candlemas, during the first evening of February. From the temple, through the central streets of Oruro, and back to the temple.</td>
<td>Members of the Catholic Church, members of different dance groups and other organisations, musicians and public in general.</td>
<td>A tumultuous procession of candles dedicated solely to the image of the Virgin of the Mineshaft (or “Virgin of Candlemas”). Prayers and ovations are dedicated to the image of the Virgin at different points of the route, where improvised shrines are erected by the neighbours.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Misa en honor de la Santísima Virgen de la Candelaria.</strong></td>
<td>Candlemas, on February the 2nd. In the Temple.</td>
<td>Members of the Catholic Church, members of different dance groups and other organisations, public in general.</td>
<td>Mass for the Madonna, and a procession through specially constructed archways ornamented with silverware.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

1 This chart is based on the official programme for the Oruro Carnival Parade 2000, and it takes into consideration the most important events that take place every year. Some events occur in a slightly different order in different years, but the chart displays the general chronology.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EVENT</th>
<th>TIME AND PLACE</th>
<th>PARTICIPANTS</th>
<th>DESCRIPTION AND COMMENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Elección de la Reina del Carnaval</td>
<td>Before the Entrada or Carnival Parade. In a Social Club.</td>
<td>Members of the different dance groups and other institutions linked to the organisation of carnival, and public in general.</td>
<td>A beauty contest in which the Queen of carnival is elected.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ultimo Convite</td>
<td>Last Sunday before the Carnival Parade. In the streets of Oruro, always ending at the altar of the Virgin.</td>
<td>Members of the different dance groups and other institutions linked to the organisation of the carnival celebrations, members of the Catholic Church, musicians, and public in general.</td>
<td>Last official rehearsal before the Carnival Parade, after which all new dancers confirm their vows to dance for three consecutive years in honour of the Madonna. Some dancers who could not make it for the first Convite may join in the second one.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anata Andina</td>
<td>Last Thursday before the Carnival Parade. In the streets of Oruro, ending at the Plaza del Folklore.</td>
<td>Communities representing the different provinces of the Department of Oruro. This event is organised by the Federación Sindical Unica de Trabajadores del Sur de Oruro (FSUTSO)</td>
<td>Dance parade performed by representatives of the surrounding provinces of the department’s rural areas. Although the Anata Andina finishes at the Avenida Cívica, which is the site of the last set of stalls on the route for the Entrada, the dancers do not enter the chapel. The groups that dance at the Anata Andina are not “dance groups”, but communities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbena</td>
<td>The eve of Carnival Saturday. In the streets of Oruro, mainly the Avenida del Folklore.</td>
<td>Musicians, public in general.</td>
<td>An informal “street party” that usually takes place on Avenida del Folklore (or 6 de Agosto) and the main Square (10 of Febrero).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gran Entrada de Peregrinación</td>
<td>Carnival Saturday, in February or March. In the streets of Oruro, starting form Avenida Villarroel and Avenida del Folklore, and always ending at the altar of the Virgin.</td>
<td>Members of the different dance groups and other institutions linked to the organisation of the carnival celebrations, members of the Catholic Church, musicians, and public in general.</td>
<td>Carnival Parade. A Pilgrimage in honour of the Virgin of the Mineshaft, with the participation of all the dance groups, following the official route that ends at the temple of the Virgin. After the completion of the route, the different groups celebrate parties in different places.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EVENT</td>
<td>TIME AND PLACE</td>
<td>PARTICIPANTS</td>
<td>DESCRIPTION AND COMMENTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alba</td>
<td>Early hours of Carnival Sunday, at the Plaza del Folklore.</td>
<td>Musicians, public in general.</td>
<td>Thousands of people dance, sing, eat and drink by the temple of the Virgin, waiting for the sun to rise while listening to more than a dozen brass bands playing different <strong>Morenada</strong> tunes simultaneously.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corso de Carnaval</td>
<td>Carnival Sunday. In the streets of Oruro, starting form Avenida Villarroel and Avenida del Folklore, and ending at the Plaza del Folklore.</td>
<td>Members of the different dance groups and other institutions linked to the organisation of the carnival celebrations, musicians, and public in general.</td>
<td>A less formal parade that follows the official route, but in which the dance groups may enter in different order. Some dance groups that do not participate on Saturday may do so on Sunday. Dancers may dance without masks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relato</td>
<td>Carnival Monday at the Avenida Cívica (it is also performed at the Entrada).</td>
<td>Members of different dance groups, musicians, and public in general.</td>
<td>Dramatisations performed mainly by the Devil Dancers, the Inca Dancers, and the <strong>Moreno</strong> Dancers in the Avenida Cívica.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cacharpaya</td>
<td>Carnival Monday and the next Saturday after the Carnival Parade.</td>
<td>Members of the different dance groups and other institutions linked to the organisation of the carnival celebrations, members of the Catholic Church (on Monday), musicians, and public in general.</td>
<td>A farewell ritual for the Virgin of the Mineshaft at the Temple (on Monday). A farewell to carnival (on Saturday, a week after the Carnival Parade).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ch’alla y Ticancha</td>
<td>Carnival Tuesday in private houses.</td>
<td>Local families and friends.</td>
<td>Ritual offerings for <strong>Pachamama</strong> or “Mother Earth”, in private residencies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convite y Alcance a los Mallkus</td>
<td>Ashes Wednesday, at the sites of the petrified monsters.</td>
<td>Ritual specialists and public in general.</td>
<td>Ritual offerings for the Spirits of the Hills and Mountains. It should not be confused with the Convite for the Virgin.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EVENT</td>
<td>TIME AND PLACE</td>
<td>PARTICIPANTS</td>
<td>DESCRIPTION AND COMMENTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Corso Infantil</em></td>
<td>A week after Carnival Sunday. In the streets of Oruro.</td>
<td>Members of the different dance groups and other institutions linked to the organisation of the carnival celebrations, musicians, and public in general.</td>
<td>A dance and costumes parade performed by children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Carnaval del Sud y Arenales de Oruro (Entierro del Carnaval)</em></td>
<td>Sunday, Monday and Tuesday after Carnival. In the southern part of the city.</td>
<td>Members of different neighbourhood dance groups, musicians, and public in general.</td>
<td>The celebration of carnival in the different neighbourhoods starts (with different music, costumes, and dance steps). It is also called the “funeral of Carnival”.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 2

Diablada

The following descriptions of the Diablada or Devil Dance are a combination of my own observations and those of Vargas Luza (1998), who enumerates the different characters represented in the Devil Dance:

The Angel (or Archangel Michael), who is both, the choreographic leader of the group and the leader of the forces of good in the representation (Vargas Luza, 1998). His big blue eyes framed by long black eyelashes stand out on the pink mask. His grin produces a half open mouth - which gives room for the dancer to use a whistle – showing the white or silver teeth and the red lips, often surrounded by one or two moles. The long (often blond) hair disappears under the golden or silver helmet. The angel usually wears a cross on his chest and white boots and leggings. The colour of the top and cape varies, according to the group. He holds a wavy spade in one hand and a small shield in the other.

Lucifer (Luzbel), who is the fallen angel commanding the invasion of the earth by the forces of evil (ibid.). In contrast with the fine European strokes of the angel’s mask, the masks of Lucifer, Satan and the Devil Dancers are generally sharp-featured. They exhibit two big horns and bigger noses and ears. The thick lips suggest rage, and the fierce appearance of the mask is enhanced through the enormous canine teeth. The masks are usually black, red or green, but the innovations introduced by the artisans in recent decades gave rise to a proliferation of new
materials, shapes and colours. Lucifer’s mask includes a crown on top, and his richly ornamented cape is much bigger and heavier than that of the *Diablo* or Devil-Dancer. The Devil Dancers also wear a wig, and their masks generally include a lizard and a snake or a dragon on top. A snake or a toad often emerges from the mouth, and some masks include ants, spiders and a condor. The devils, who also wear boots with spurs, leggings, chest protectors, gloves, a sash made out of old coins and a flap, usually hold a snake and/or a trident in their hands.

**Satan**, the second leader of the infernal forces, is also in charge of directing the choreography (ibid.). According to don Tito Aranda, Lucifer and Satan are (as the monarchs of Hell) the main figures through which the institution is presented to the public.

**China Supay**, a female devil who is Lucifer’s faithful helper, tempts men to fall into sin. In the dance, she is the inseparable companion of Lucifer and gives the Devil Dancers time to prepare the next choreographic move (ibid.).

**China Diabla**, who is another female devil going in search of easily tempted women, to make them carriers of sin for humanity (ibid.).

---

1. The features of the devil mask have been developed and transformed through many generations of artisans and dancers. For a detailed account of their development, see Vargas Luza (1998).

2. Vargas Luza (1998) argues that the presence of a dragon in the devil mask emerged in 1939, as the result of the introduction of Hornimans Tea (the logo of which was a small dragon) into Bolivia.
Diablos: these are devils who represent the incautious hearts of those humans who, following Lucifer and Satan, carry the seven deadly sins: arrogance, greed, lust, rage, gluttony, envy, and laziness (ibid.).

Diablesas are sinful women represented by other female devil dancers. In the dance they go forward before the rest of the troop, preparing the space for a new choreographic move (ibid.).

Diablillas and Diablillos are children representing innocent victims of evil, inclined to fall into sin until they become used to it. They are the dangerous evil beings of the future. The children often learn the dance steps from their parents (ibid.).

Jukumaris are Andean mythological beings who kidnap women and girls. In the dance they represent such seizure by pulling female spectators to dance with them (ibid.). Their costume is usually made of artificial fur, resembling a brown or black bear sporting big eyes, ears and mouths in the furry masks.

Bears are a transformation of the Jukumaris, who are also known as Andean bears. Vargas Luza (1998) identifies the brown bear with the Jukumari, to differentiate it from the white (polar) bear.
Condor is another mythological figure introduced (Vargas Luza, 1998) to the myth of Wari, as one of the gigantic creatures sent by the Spirit of the Hills.

Vargas Luza (op cit.) also provides valuable information about the choreography of the Devil Dance, which is summarised as follows:

The Devil Dance represents the invasion of the earth by the forces of evil (Lucifer, Satan and their helpers), in order to exterminate the Christians and perform their rite of gibberish. The apparition of Archangel Michael puts an end to the invasion, when the devils are defeated by the forces of good with the help of the Virgin of the Mineshaft. The representation is divided in two acts and 13 figures.

**First Act**

*Introducción o Paseo del Diablo* (Introduction or the Walk of the Devil): represents the invasion of the earth by the demons, who enter in two single lines on both sides; the red line on the left and the green line on the right. Once they have formed columns, they wait for the arrival of the infernal court, presided over by Lucifer and Satan.

---

3 In reference to the myth of Wari, see Chapter Three.

4 The colours refer to the handkerchiefs that the dancers hold in their hands.
El Saludo (Greetings): Lucifer and Satan are greeted by the devils who approach them in columns on the northern side of the esplanade, while the Chinas, Diablas and Diablillos seem to be retained by the Angel on the southern side.

El Ovillo (the tangle) represents the climax of the devilish euphoria. Lucifer dances alone towards the centre, where he awaits the arrival of the infernal beings to celebrate their conquest; the forces of evil approach Lucifer and dance around him forming a spiral. Once all the devil dancers are formed around Lucifer, Satan and the China Supays surround them all, while the devil Dancers hold their leader on their shoulders, acclaming him with the shout “alarma, arrr arrr” (alarm, arrr, arrr). At this moment Lucifer starts his proclamation, and the second act begins.

Second Act

El Relato (the tale or the narration): this is a long dialogue, or a spoken performance divided in three acts, apparently written in 1818 by the priest Montealegre (Beltrán Heredia, 1956; Vargas Luza 1998). It starts with the speech of Lucifer (or Luzbel) who after proclaiming himself victorious recalls his expulsion from heaven because of his vanity. After a brief dialogue, Archangel Michael defeats Lucifer and Satan. The Angel threatens to bring them both to the temple of the Virgin, but he then realises that the temple must not be profaned by the presence of demons, so he decides to judge all the devils outside the chapel. There he calls the seven deadly sins (arrogance, greed, lust, rage, gluttony, envy, and
laziness), to humiliate and defeat them with the use of counter-sins. Arrogance is counter-effected by humbleness, greed by generosity, lust by chastity, rage by patience, gluttony by moderation, envy by charity, and laziness by diligence. Finally, Archangel Michael calls China Supay, the faithful companion of Lucifer, and the following dialogue begins:

“Angel: And you, serpent who tempted Eve, why are you amongst the devils? What are you, intrigue, doing here? China Supay: (jumping) I am here because I am the major evil-woman of hell… this world attracts me because it is composed by earthly despicable things, by perverse beings who are sometimes worse than demons…not only us devils deserve eternal punishment…man is naturally evil… Angel: And what is your role within this evil group? China Supay: I am carnal temptation, the symbol of human perdition. Do you know what kind of power I have? Don’t you understand that men run after me like crazy? Don’t you realise, oh Beautiful Angel, that I am the greatest helper of Satan? Don’t you see that I am the one that fills hell…? Get away from me pure Angel (flirting), I may tempt you too and bring you down to hell… Angel: You miserable infernal creature, get away from me, because you will never tempt me, never…” (Beltrán Heredia, 1956: 144. My translation).

China Supay is also defeated, which brings the struggle between the forces of good and evil to an end, giving also place to the end of the Relato. The choreographic performances may be presented in slightly different order, according to the different dance groups, but their general characteristics develop according to Vargas Luza’s description, which finally enumerates the last 8 figures of the Devil Dance choreography:

La Estrella o Firma del Diablo (the Star or Signature of the Devil): The Virgin of the Mineshaft is also called Morning Star. Thus, the formation
of a five-point star by the kneeling Devil Dancers signifies the acceptance of their defeat and their signature.

*Las Aspas* (the Sails) signify the winds and pests that carry the sins of humanity. The dancers hold hands forming a windmill figure, and dance counter-clockwise.

*El Tridente* (the Trident): The devil’s astuteness is represented by a trident figure formed by the dancers.

*El Trebol* (the Clover): The dancers form the figure of a double clover, to show their respect to the Angel.

*Cadena de Tres y Paso del Diablo* (Chain of three and Devil Pace): the devils march, rendering homage to the Angel.

*La Maraña* (the Thicket): a figure that signifies chaos and confusion, as a product of human sins.

*La Mecapaqueña*: There is a change in the musical rhythm. Until this moment the bands were playing Diablada, now they play Huayño.

*La Cueca*: In the Andes and surrounding valleys the cueca is often considered to be the national Bolivian dance, which is performed by the Devil dancers in a stylised way as a closing number of their performance, before they enter the chapel.
The following descriptions of the characters represented in the dance are based on the documentation of the Fraternidad Morenada Central Oruro fundada por la Comunidad Cocani. They are followed by a translation of the Relato (a musical dramatisation of the production of wine), based on the same documents.

**Personajes de la Danza Pisa de la Uva** (Characters of the “Pressing of the Grapes” Dance).

**Caporal** (“foreman”) represents the estranged African man who, working as a foreman, controlled and exploited the group of black slaves with the use of a whip. Similarly, he directs the dance group and imposes discipline in the choreography. The dancer wears a bold mask, an embroidered frock coat, a chest protector, a belt made out of old coins, an embroidered tracksuit, boots and a whip.

**Rey Moreno** (“Black” [African] King”) is the representative of the African slaves and has a superior status. The dance steps are differentiated from the Moreno in that they are alternated and light. The dancer’s mask is olive-black, with a crown and feathers. He wears a cape, a chest protector, a belt made out of old coins, an embroidered tracksuit and boots.
Achachi (“Old man”) represents the land-owner of the vineyards. His dance step expresses the insecurity of the steps of old age. The dancer wears a mask depicting a pink-faced old man, a chest protector, a belt made out of old coins, an embroidered tracksuit, boots and a walking stick.

Moreno (“Black Man”) represents the black (African) slaves who used to work in the vineyards pressing the grapes with their feet, to produce the main vice of the Spaniards: wine. The dancer wears a black mask with feathers, jacket, barrel-like skirt, long underwear, boots, and holds a rattle and a little barrel. The group presents two types of Moreno; Ancestros (“ancestors”) dressed in an old-fashion, without jacket and wearing the tube skirt; and Pesados (“heavy”) wearing a shoulder flash and a blow-tube skirt.

China Morena (“Black Lady”) represents the wife of the foreman. The dance step is light and elegant. The dancer wears a black mask with Borsalino hat (bowler-hat), matching top and skirt (pollera), European-style boots, gloves, handkerchief and a little barrel.

Cholita represents the wife or sister of the Moreno. The dance step is light and of its own style. The dancer wears a Borsalino hat (bowler-hat), matching embroidered top and skirt (pollera), embroidered Vicuña shawl, shoes and a rattle.
**Figuras** ("Figures") constitute a decorative complement that exposes its own style in the dance. The dancer wears *cholita* bowler hat with feathers, embroidered top and skirt (*pollera*) and high boots.

**Infantiles** (Children) are apprentices of the different characters of the group, wearing similar costumes to those of the adult dancers.

* The documents of the *Morenada Central Oruro fundada por la Comunidad Cocani* also include descriptions of the narrated and sung versions of the dance. The following are translated transcriptions of some extracts of those documents.

**Pisa de la Uva** (Pressing of the Grapes)

It is equivalent to the Devil Dance’s *Relato*. The performance starts with the satirical verses about the *Caporal* (foreman) pressing the grapes. After pressing, the dancers dance towards the *pasante* couple ("ritual sponsors") who serve the *Moreno* a glass of wine to make him completely drunk. This dance represents the black man, seen by the *mestizos* ("mixed blood") as a barrel with a face where the lips are so big that they seem to be an exaggerated tongue. A satirical character that participates in the *Relato* personifies an old dog with an old man’s mask. He carries a whip, which he uses to make space for the performance of the pressing of the
grapes. The following verses are extracted from the “pressing of the grapes” drama:

First Part

Marcha a la Pisa
(“March towards the Pressing”)

“Let us march Morenos with great joy, looking forward to see the Lord.

Natural (“indigenous”) peoples let us go through, because we, the Morenos, are going to press.

We are little black men who come from Guinea and we bring the roses for the Lord.

Let us sing, let us dance with joy, thanking him for our freedom a thousand times.

The white people make us sweat, thanking them a thousand times we will always press.

Slaves of the Lord, we will conform for we will all die serving the Lord.”

(Extracted from the Documents of the Morenada Central Oruro fundada por la Comunidad Cocani. ACFO, Oruro. My translation).
Second Part

Pisa de la Morenada
(Pressing performance of the Morenada)

Caporal (foreman):
“Mates, oh! Morenos
let us press with courage
in the vineyard of Mary
people work with honour.

Moreno (African slave):
Press, press mate
let us press with courage
in the vineyard of Mary
people work with honour.

All:
Let us all have firm feet
to sing and dance
press, press old black man
with custard apple head.

Chorus:
press, press old black man/with old monkey’s ears.
press, press old black man/with old calf nose.
press, press old black man/with burnt tea forehead.
press, press old black man/with old teapot mouth.
press, press old black man/with old spider hands.
press, press old black man/with old trowel chin.
press, press old black man/with old ox neck.
press, press old black man/with old harp ribs.
press, press old black man/with old barrel belly.
press, press old black man/with old hoe feet.”

(Extracted from the Documents of the Morenada Central Oruro fundada
por la Comunidad Cocani. ACFO, Oruro. My translation).
GLOSSARY*

Achachis, Achachilas. (A) The old ones, grandparents, ancestors. It generally refers to the mountains.

ACFO. (S) The Association of Folkloric Groups of Oruro.

Ahuatiris. (S, A) “Weavers”, Stylised dance (see Chart 2 in Chapter Four).

Alba. (S) Dawn. In the dissertation it refers mainly to the Alba rite performed early on Carnival Sunday.

Alcalde. (S) Municipal Mayor.

Altiplano. (S) The Highlands Plateau in the Andes.

Anata Andina. (A, S) Andean time of playfulness, or carnival.

Anilina. (S) Aniline dyes.

Antawara (Q) Stylised dance (see Chart 2 in Chapter Four).

Anticuchos (Q, SL) Llama heart brochettes.

Arenales. (S) Sand dunes.

Asiruni. (A) The snake-like rock formations in Southern Oruro (For a brief etymological explanation, see footnote 4 in Chapter Two).

Auto Sacramental. (S) “Eucharistic Play”, the narrated performance of the devil dancers.

Barrilitos. (S) “Little barrels”. It refers to the Moreno dancers whose costumes have the shape of a cask.

Borsalino. (S) Bowler hat.

Cacharpaya. (Q) To say goodbye, to let go.

Cacho. (SL) A dice game.

Cala Cala. (A) Place of stones. It is a site near Oruro where rock paintings were found.

Campesinos. (S) Peasants.

* A= Aymara; Q= Quechua; S= Spanish; SL= Local Slang.
Cancha, la. (S, Sl) “The pitch”. It refers here to a big street market in Cochabamba.

Caporales. (S) “Foremen”, a specific character of the Morenada, Saya, Negritos and Tundikis dances, eventually transformed into a distinctive stylised dance.

Carne Vale, Carnem Levare. Probable etymologies of “carnival”, meaning farewell to meat in Italian and Latin, respectively.

Cargamento. (S) The silver offerings for the Virgin, carried previously by mules and, most commonly, by cars or “floats” in the present.

Carrus Navalis. Another probable Latin etymological root of “carnival”, referring to the charts or floats.

Ch’alla. (A, Q, Sl) Ritual libations.

Chicha. (S, Sl) Corn beer.

China Morena. (Q, S) Female character of the Morenada dance.

China Diabla. (Q, S) Female character of the Diablada dance.

China Supay. (Q, S) Female character of the Diablada dance.

Chinchulines. (S, Sl) Grilled-plaited guts.

Chiru Chiru. (Q, A, Sl) Shaggy hair. It refers to the main character of the mythological narrative of the Virgin of the Mineshaft.

Cholo, chola, cholita. (S, Sl) It refers mainly to Andean (mainly Aymara and Quechua) urban migrants in Bolivia, but also to their “representation” in carnival.

Cocanis. (S, Sl) Coca leaf traders, founders of the Morenada Central Oruro.

Cofradía. (S) Association of women, who gather to develop different activities, around the image of the Virgin of the Mineshaft.

Convite. (S, Sl) General rehearsal and rite of promise to dance for the Virgin during three consecutive years.

Cordillera. (S) Range of Mountains.

Corso. (S, Sl) Carnival Sunday dance parade.

Cumbia. (S) Latin American tropical music.

Danzas Estilizadas. (S) Stylised dances.

Diablada. (S). Devil dance.
Diablo, diablesa, diablillos. (S) Characters of the devil dance.

Doctorcitos. (S) A specific dance in which lawyers and penpushers are satirised.

Donde puedo verte? (S) Where can I see you? Popular Morenada dance composed by don Juan Apaza.

Elección. (S) Election.

Ensayo. (S) Practice.

Entrada. (S) The Saturday Carnival Parade.

Extirpación de Idolatrias. (S) The Spanish Colonial Campaign for the destruction of pre-Hispanic religious symbols, beliefs and practices in the Andes.

FSUTCSO. (S) The Union of Peasants of Southern Oruro.

Gambrinus. The King of Beer, (See footnote 13 in Chapter Eight).

GTADO. (S) Abbreviation of the Gran Tradicional Auténtica Diablada Oruro, the oldest devil dance group of Oruro.

Hacendado. (S) Land owner.

Hahuari. (Q) Another name by which Wari was known (See footnote 10 in Chapter Two).

Huari. (Q) Name of a town where ritual offerings for Wari were performed in the past, and site and name of one of the most important Bolivian beer breweries in the present.

Huayño. (Q) a particular musical rhythm of the Andes.

Inti. (Q) The Sun-God.

Jach’a. (Q) “Great”.

Jampatu Q’ullu. (See footnote 1 in Chapter Two).

Jarankarani. (See footnote 3 in Chapter Two).

Jas-Shoni. See Condarco, Men of water?

Jukumari. (A) Andean Bear, mythological character represented in the devil dance.

Kot’suna. (See Condarco).
**Kallawayas.** dance (see Chart 2 in Chapter Four).

**Kantus.** dance (see Chart 2 in Chapter Four).

**Kullawada.** dance (see Chart 2 in Chapter Four).

**Lisuras de locallas.** (See footnote 27 in Chapter Four).

**Lilith.**

**Llajtaymanta.** (Q) “Form the Earth”, name of a local folkloric musical group.

**Llamerada.** dance (see Chart 2 in Chapter Four).

**Luricancho.**

**Mamita.** (S) “Little mother”, a term of endearment used by the locals to refer to the Virgin of the Mineshaft.

**Mañazos.** (SI) The Devil dance group of the butchers, also known as GTADO (see above).

**Mestizo.** (S) Mixed blood”.

**Mesa.** (S, SI) “Table”. It usually refers to the offerings presented in Andean rituals. Its similarity to *misa*, or “mass” (see below) is notable.

**Misa.** (S) “Mass”.

**Mita.** (Q) Forced labour in the mines.

**Macho.** (S, SI) Male, virile, brave, male chauvinist.

**Moqochinchi.** (SI) A soft drink made out of boiled dried-peach and species.

**Morenada.** (S, SI) Dance of “pressing the grapes”.

**Negra** (S, SI) Black woman, woman with dark skin and/or woman of a low socio-economic stratum.

**Negritos.** (S) A dance group representing people of African ascendance.

**Nina Nina** (SI) See *Chiru Chiru*, above.

**Ñufle.** (SI) Alcoholic beverage.

**Ñusta.** “Andean Princess”.

**Orureño/a.** (S) A person from Oruro.
**Pachacamac.** (A, Q) Male Andean deity.

**Pachamama.** (A, Q) Female Andean deity.

**Pasante.** (S, Sl) Ritual sponsor.

**Peregrinación.** (S) Pilgrimage.

**Pijes.** (Sl) People of upper-middle classes, usually wearing expensive clothes (See footnote 8 in Chapter Four).

**Pie de Gallo.** (S) “The foot of the rooster”, name of the hill where the Temple of the Virgin was constructed.

**Pinquillos.** (A) Andean musical wind instruments.

**Pisa de uva.** (S) “Pressing of the grapes”.

**Ponche.** (S) Warm alcoholic beverage.

**Potolos.** (S) Dance (see Chart 2 in Chapter Four).

**Procesión de Cirios.** (S) Candle procession.

**Pujillay.** (S) Dance (see Chart 2 in Chapter Four).

**Q'ara.** (A) “Pealed”, it refers to the “whites”.

**Qucha.** (Q) Lake, or water.

**Quiero la felicidad.** (S) “I want happiness”, popular Morenada tune composed by don Juan Apaza.

**Quirquincho.** (A) Andean armadillo.

**Quwak.** “The snake” (See footnote 7 in Chapter Two).

**Ranga ranga.** (Sl) Popular Bolivian dish made out of cow’s stomach.

**Relato.** (S) The narrated performance of the devil dancers.

**Rodeo.** (S) The ritual invitation for relatives and friends to participate in a specific dance.

**Rostro asado.** (S) “Baked face”, a lamb’s head baked in the oven, one of the most popular local dishes.

**Salsa.** (S) Popular Latin American tropical rhythm.
**Sambódromo.** The auditorium-esplanade built in Rio for the famous Brazilian carnival.

**Saqra danzantes.** (Q, S) Andean devil-dancers.

**Saya.** (Sl) A dance representing people of African origin.

**Singani.** (S) Bolivian grape spirit.

**Supay.** (Q) Spirit of the hills, devil of the mine.

**Tarkas.** (A) Andean musical wind instruments.

**Tarqueada.** (A) Dance performed by people playing tarkas.

**Taquiña.** (Q) A popular Bolivian beer, made in Cochabamba.

**Taypi.** (A) Something in the centre, cosmological centre.

**Te con te.** (S) Warm alcoholic beverage made of tea, Singani and species.

**Ticancha.**

**Tink’a.** (A, Q) Ore-present for the mine owners.

**Tinkus.** (Q) A dance representing the ritual violence enacted yearly in rural Northern Potosí. (see Chart 2 in Chapter Four).

**Tio.** (S) “Uncle”. The devil image in the mines.

**Tobas.** Dance (see Chart 2 in Chapter Four).

**Tripa gorda.** (S) Deep-fried tripes.

**Ulalas.** (S) Flowers.

**Umala.** A province in the Department of La Paz.

**Uracharku.** (A) SEE Condarco.

**Vecino.** “Neighbour”, it refers to the urban migrants who only occasionally visit their communities of origin in the rural Andes (See footnote 10 in Chapter Four).

**Velada.** (S) Night-meeting and mass in honour of the Virgin of the Mineshaft.

**Verbena.** (S) Free and popular festival performed in the streets.

**Villa Kairiri.** A particular community in the province of Umala, La Paz (where the Cocanis claim their ancestors came from).
**Villa Real de San Felipe de Austria.** (S) Name given to Oruro when it was founded in 1606.

**Virgen de la Candelaria / del Socavón.** (S) The Virgin of Candlemas or of the Mineshaft, respectively.

**Waquallusta.** (See footnote 2 in Chapter Two).

**Wari.** (Q) Spirit of the hills.


**Wititis** dance (see Chart 2 in Chapter Four).

**Zampoñeros.** dance (see Chart 2 in Chapter Four).
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Guerra Gutierrez, A. (n.d.) El Carnaval de Oruro a su alcance; Oruro: Queleco.


Murillo Vacarreza, J. (1980). La Danza del Moreno. Essay included within the documents presented by the Fraternidad Morenada Central Oruro, fundada por la Comunidad Cocanis to the ACFO, Oruro.


