

hampered by incomplete articulations of such foci as pneumatology, mystery (and mystical theology) and ‘the functional relation between the Word, or divine nature, and the humanity of Jesus’ (p. 194). There is work to be done in these areas for Torrance scholars, Habets argues. These chapters provide Torrance scholarship with the proper charge not to simply rest on its oars but to continue expanding and refining the valuable contributions of Torrance’s theology.

One minor issue: the volume’s index contains numerous entries which do not refer to the correct page references. The index is accordingly nearly unusable. The volume is an otherwise fine work that will be of interest to all students of Torrance’s thought.

Albert L. Shepherd V
King’s College, University of Aberdeen



Alan P. F. Sell, *The Theological Education of the Ministry: Soundings in the British Reformed and Dissenting Traditions* (Eugene, Or.: Pickwick Publications, 2013), pp. 313, ISBN 978-1620325933. £24.00

This book is a collection of essays and articles produced for other contexts and brought together in one volume under the broad heading of theological education for the ministry. Despite its title, however, it would be of more interest to historians, or theologians, than theological educators. The author views the education of the ministry from the late-seventeenth century onwards through the lens of biographical sketches of ‘some of the principals, professors and lecturers who devoted themselves to that task’ (p. ix). On the one hand this is a resounding success; a tour de force of scholarship considering the contribution of some of the outstanding theological educators of the last 300 years. Sell writes well and concisely, packing a vast quantity of information into each of his chapters and bringing his subjects to life through careful use of biographical material. However, there is also an extent to which the book is a disappointment. The title is somewhat misleading and would more accurately be ‘Theological Educators in

the Ministry' as it does not examine, for example, the nature, content or structure of theological education for the ministry. The subtitle rescues the situation somewhat, while the use of the word 'Soundings' alerts the reader to the fact that this book is not a chronological history, nor an encyclopaedic or exhaustive exploration of theological education. It is, as the back cover describes it, 'a number of insightful vignettes' which give a flavour of the contribution of leading Reformed and dissenting theologians of the eighteenth to twentieth centuries.

In his Introduction, which is Chapter 1, Sell indicates the source of his material, which is diverse. The second chapter is a reworking of a paper first delivered in 2010 to The Friends of the Congregational Library in London, while Chapter 6 is an almost verbatim record of a conversation with Geoffrey Nuttall, Congregational minister, church historian and lecturer. The other chapters were produced for various journals or as chapters in other volumes. The fact that the book is a collection of material, albeit by the same author and linked by an overarching theme of theological educators, gives the book a slightly disjointed character with varieties of style and genre as well as content. There is no central argument or thesis, unless it is to highlight the breadth and quality of training offered by the dissenting and Reformed theological colleges and academies in a variety of educational contexts. While it covers the period in question through consideration of some of the principal actors, it is not a chronologically organised history of the subject matter. It leans heavily towards biography, although Sell includes a discussion of the theology of each of his subjects, locating their thoughts within their wider contemporary context.

What Sell achieves brilliantly is to paint the picture of the diversity of theological education through the eyes of his subjects. He brings to life the theological debate of different eras throughout three centuries of theological education. His portraits of Caleb Ashworth, John Oman and N. H. G. Robinson highlight not only the immense contribution of these men, but also the breadth and depth of their theological understanding. He argues persuasively that Geoffrey Nuttall, although by training a church historian, was also a theologian of some ability and makes clear the value, significance and importance of his legacy. However, the conversation with Nuttall which comprises chapter 6, while a faithful record of the great man's words, would have

benefitted from a greater degree of editing and rewriting. Although chronologically accurate, it seems less cohesive and organised in comparison with his biographical chapters.

Chapter 3 sits slightly at odds with the rest of the book. Although it contains a little biographical material, it is more concerned with the religious philosophy in particular periods and its contribution to theological debate. It is questionable whether there is value in including Reformed educators from Scotland with Reformed (and Methodist) educators from the English dissenting tradition given the very different ecclesiastical and establishment contexts. Historically, unlike England and Wales at least until more recently, Faculties of Divinity in the Scottish universities provided a theological education for ministers from a Reformed tradition and this could have been further explicated. Sell helpfully reminds us that the Free Kirk did not regard itself as a 'voluntarist' church but the Church of Scotland, Free, and that the earlier Secessionists (later the United Presbyterian church) were voluntarist. However, this chapter does give an insightful overview of the Scottish context, albeit over a short period of time. Again the chapter impresses with the breadth and depth of the scholarship outlining both the extent to which philosophical debate raged within Scotland at that time and the manner in which theological education developed.

The final chapter, Chapter 8, again takes a slightly different form. It is an account of the founding of Manchester University and the story of the establishment of the theological department. While it too contains biographical elements, considering the contribution of T. W. Manson, Owen Ellis Evans and John Howarth Eric Hull, Sell does not deal with them in the same depth as the other biographies. Rather this chapter takes an autobiographical stance as Sell reflects on his personal experience of studying theology at the University. Sell paints a picture of rigorous scholarship and challenging demands on theological students; a valuable inheritance indeed.

Given Sell's self-avowed interest in theological education, perhaps there is a need for, and indeed value in, a survey of the history of Reformed theological education, rather than educators. Nevertheless, taking account of the specific lens through which *Theological Education of the Ministry* is viewed, that of snapshots which illustrate

its development rather than a record which charts its history, Sell's contribution is a considerable one. He shines a spotlight on significant contributors in various periods in the history of the dissenting tradition in a way which underlines the important contribution this wing of the Church Catholic has made to the development of ministerial education.

Jane Denniston,
Church of Scotland and University of Glasgow



Laurence A. B. Whitley, *A Great Grievance: Ecclesiastical Lay Patronage in Scotland Until 1750* (Eugene, Or.: Wipf & Stock, 2013), pp . xxiv+334, ISBN 978-1610979900. £31.00

Laurence Whitley's book provides a long-needed historical study of lay patronage in the Church of Scotland. Beginning with the medieval legal structures and the Scottish crown's hoarding of patronage rights, Whitley skilfully depicts the legacy of lay control over ecclesiastical appointments. In particular, he demonstrates how the role of the heritor mapped onto the feudal social structures, something that continued to pervade in Scotland until patronage was finally abolished once and for all in 1874. While patronage served as a crucial point of contention leading to the Disruption in 1843, Whitley's purpose in the book is to demonstrate the fact that the issue had persisted as a point of contention since before the Reformation. In particular, this book focuses primarily on the role patronage played in the ecclesiastical politics of the eighteenth century, foreshadowing the part it would play in the nineteenth.

The first third of the book focuses on the origins of the practice and the transference of rights from abolished ecclesiastical establishments at the Reformation to temporal lordships. Despite resistance to the practice in the Book of Discipline (1560), the settlement of a Protestant state church upheld rights of the 'Just and auncient Patrones' (p. 13). While the Second Book of Discipline (1578) sought to replace the practice with a congregational election, what occurred instead were presentations by the heritor for congregational approval, or, from 1610,